A Pragmatically Lavish Recreation: Notes on *The Epic of Everest* as DVD Film Performance

Julie Brown

"[S]urely the best-arranged and executed cinema music we have yet heard."

Iris Barry, *The Spectator*, 20 December 1924

In early 2009, while preparing for the first conference of the Arts and Humanities Research Council-funded Research Network "The Sounds of Early Cinema in Britain", I conducted a quick audit of a number of online library and archive catalogues to try to ascertain where some key resources might be held. Typing "silent film" into the search field of Cecilia <http://www.cecilia-uk.org/>, a resource for locating music collections in archives, libraries, and museums in the UK and Ireland, yielded a couple of conducting scores for silent films in a collection of 44 scores owned by Sir Eugene Goossens and subsequently acquired by Cambridge University Library. Fortunately, the music librarian there had thought to mention these silent film scores in his short blurb about the "miscellany". One was for *Das Wachssfigurenkabinett/Waxworks* (1924), and the other was for a British documentary of the same year, *The Epic of Everest*. A few years later, the BFI National Archive embarked on a restoration of *Epic*, Captain John B. Noel’s record of the ill-fated attempt by George Mallory and Andrew Irvine to climb the world’s highest mountain. Researching and mocking-up an electronic re-fit of the score was one thing; choosing to recreate it with musicians was another, and raised the sorts of questions that exercise film archivists about choosing to restore one film over another and agreeing the resources to do so. In this article, I want to outline my rationale and indicate some of the textual, technical, and practical challenges that influenced my decision to recreate this original score for a large orchestra, and inflicted the performance eventually recorded.

THE ORIGINAL FILM PERFORMANCES AND THEIR CULTURAL IMPORT

Noel’s *Epic of Everest* had a high-profile, eight-week opening run at the New Scala Theatre, London, from 9 December 1924 to 31 January 1925. His company Explorer Films treated its special film with “special music” but *Epic* was also afforded “atmospheric presentation” involving a live, stage prologue featuring music and dance performed by genuine Tibetan monks. Using indigenous musicians as part of the theatrical presentation of a film was rare in London, particularly when the country in question was all-but-closed to the wider world.
Tibetan authorities took cultural offence at the monks’ inclusion and at other aspects of Noel’s film, triggering correspondence with the Royal Geographical Society and the India Office, and causing Tibet, for a time, to cease cooperating with Himalayan expeditions.¹

Mixed programmes of this kind should be seen as integral to the status of such films as cultural artefacts. For The Epic of Everest, the original conductor’s score, a preliminary list of musical pieces, and two pages of a later, more detailed five-page list all survive, and together provide evidence of how the presentation was put together² (Fig.1). A gramophone recording made of the “dancing lamas” while they were in Europe also survives,³ as does a piece of related sheet music, The Mount Everest Suite, Airs of Tibet and Nepal.⁴ Typescripts of two sets of intertitles retained with the score, an early set (referred to here as Titles List 1), and a later one containing the name of distributor Astra-National (referred to here as Titles List 2) aid historical research.

3. Now held by Noel’s daughter Sandra.
4. The Mount Everest Suite, Airs of Tibet and Nepal, collected in Tibet by T. Howard Somervell, arranged for the pianoforte by C. M. Smith Dodsworth.

The musical-theatrical dimension of film presentation runs, to which materials such as these provide access, accomplished a great deal of silent cinema’s cultural work from the mid-teens, partly because of the reviews they tended to receive. These materials are not without their problems, raising difficult textual questions such as what changes were made and when during the run. Nonetheless, they are worth tackling for their promise of enhanced historical understanding. Closer engagement with The Epic of Everest’s cultural importance is facilitated by the recording of the monks and the rest of the theatrical presentation accessible on the BFI DVD.⁵ Both Epic and the previous year’s Climbing Mount Everest, for which original musical materials likewise survive, provide ethnomusicologists and music historians with insights into how Tibet was presented musically in London in 1923-1924.

The cultural and historical significance of The Epic of Everest’s music extends to other areas. Somewhat eclipsed in the 1924-1925 press by the “dancing lamas” was the news that Eugene Goossens Snr (Fig.2) would conduct the film’s orchestral accompaniment. Goossens

---

Footnotes:

⁵. Hansen, op. cit. The DVD release was reviewed in Journal of Film Presentation No.91, 10/2014 pp.139-140.
was head of a family prominent in early 20th-century British musical life, and his position as a renowned conductor in concert and opera halls lent cultural prestige to Noel's venture. Frederick Laurence (Fig. 3), "arranger" of the film's music (as clarified by Goossens in an interview), is little remembered today, though he should be because of his role in London's film exhibition sector in the early 1920s. His partnership with Goossens involved three film events of which The Epic of Everest was the first, followed, in early October 1925, by Noel's presentation of Morozko (Father Frost, 1924) with Goossens conducting an original score by Laurence, and later the same month providing music for the opening night of The Film Society (which included Waxworks).

The part-compiled score and framing music of the Goossens-Laurence Epic presentation therefore represents a formative stage in a short-lived, but notable film-music partnership at the elite end of film performance in mid-

1920s London. It also marks a fascinating point of cultural crossover between Britain's worlds of cinema music and "legitimate" culture.

ACCESS TO SILENT FILM PERFORMANCES

Silent cinema was always a performance, and a restoration from a national archive should try to take into account that aspect of the film artefact whenever special music was produced and/or survives, or a notable first-run presentation could be considered central to the film's early reception. If these survive and can be included in performances, even as extras on a DVD release, then they should be as they were as much a part of the original cultural object as the film copy itself.

Gillian Anderson has been arguing the case for original scores for years. Systematic research by an ever-increasing body of scholars makes it no longer possible to ignore this call, nor the even richer musical and theatrical traditions of silent film. Many talented silent-film musicians are keeping improvisation traditions alive, and Rick Altman's Living Nickelodeon was a practical attempt to draw attention to the great variety of silent-film performance modes and the questions

---

8. My reconciliation of this score with the surviving version of Morozko was performed, Philip Ellis conducting, at the 14th British Silent Film Festival/Sound of Early Cinema in Britain Conference, Barbican Cinema, London, 8 April 2011.
they raise about cinema as a cultural form. Demand for access to more diverse film-performance materials is increasing, along with the number of those who teach, or would like to teach, silent-film sound, music, and performance in British and American university music (and other) departments. The recent wave of books and articles opening up the rich history of theatrical film presentation has transformed approaches to and emphasis on silent-film performance, and it is increasingly important to have available a wide variety of case studies. Recreations of several silent-film scores now exist on DVD, but few have helpful, additional scholarly literature. The Epic of Everest is one of a tiny group of restored films now available with both new and recreated accompaniments, elements of the wider film programme such as prologue material, and even some musical ephemera.

PART-COMPILED SCORE AS QUASI-CONCERT

One reason for making this recreation was to expand the range of historical performance modes available on DVD. The Epic of Everest's compiled score is a perfect candidate for exploring performance with short breaks between component parts. Although bound scores and full sets of parts were sometimes produced and distributed by film companies, cinema musicians routinely played compilations and part-compilations from piles of individual instrumental parts, and often needed to sort out the music on their stands before continuing. In most existing recordings such gaps are avoided.

Though sometimes mentioned by trade-paper commentators as a source of annoyance, this gapped approach was clearly extremely common, and, from a performance point of view, understandable and even suited to certain compilations. The Epic of Everest's part-compiled accompaniment positively lends itself to the technique, and illuminates something about compiled scores in so doing. It is structured largely in a "play until title" style, as both the conductor's score and an incomplete set of instructions among the surviving materials confirm. The instruction "play until cue" appears numerous times in the incomplete music list, apparently the most developed plan.

"Play until title" means that most of the classical music excerpts have no end-point marked. The conductor is alerted to which title card to look out for by a small label quoting its first few words posted at the bottom right-hand corner of the page (see Fig.4). Everything suggests a strategy whereby Goossens played until the next title appeared on the screen, after which he moved to a new section of music, regardless of where he had reached in the previous piece. In 1925, Ernö Rapée condemned such abrupt musical shifts as "brutal", an "antiquated" practice no longer found in "first-class theatres", but the fact that he even mentions the technique suggests it was still fairly widespread. The whole score is not constructed in this way; a few excerpts are treated differently. Moreover, someone (though seemingly not Laurence) added a number of interim synchronisation points to the conductor's score (Fig.4). These don't appear to be formal indications, so are probably conductor's markings, jotted down by Goossens during a rehearsal or early performance. The score is not marked with bespoke film-related metronome markings, though sometimes a tempo change is implied, nor does it provide a record of the film's projection speed.

"Re-fitting" the score electronically facilitated a smooth version of this style of accompaniment, such that a change of music could generally closely match its correspond-
The transition between a section of Joachim Raff’s symphony and the return of the Tibetan Chant (c.27.40-27.55 on the DVD) is perhaps closest to how such moments might originally have sounded, because reaching a suitable stopping point in the Raff meant ending once the corresponding title had disappeared and the next sequence had actually begun. Though the “play until title” approach had the potential to be a bit rough, it could also be harnessed to alter the balance of aesthetic priorities between music and image. The Goossens-Laurence accompaniment did precisely this, and served two functions as a result. Laurence’s choices generally work well as “suitable music” for Noel’s moving pictures, that is, as an appropriate contemporary accompaniment to the types of scenes at hand. Various programmatic works are refunctioned: for instance, Borodin’s In the Steppes of Central Asia provides an excellent accompaniment to the yak caravan in the Himalayan foothills. The choice of much Russian music in the first half of the film draws the Tibetan scenes into the orbit of a vaguely Western Orientalist representation typical of both cinema and opera. The excerpt from Henri Rabaud’s majestic La Procession nocturne serves expressive and structural functions for the images of mountain peaks at sunset, and for the titles’ recounting of mystical Tibetan beliefs. Book-ending the accompaniment and providing the frame to Noel’s titular “epic”, La Procession nocturne creates “epic feeling” in a manner characteristic of later Hollywood underscoring. With some exceptions, the music also works to add “suitable” rhythm, pace, and drama. With long sequences created by powerful lenses trained on specks on the mountain, the film sometimes struggles to create the drama it aims for. Even non-programmatic works provide pace and interest, and help convey the upbeat sentiments of heroism and accomplishment of the titles. A specially-composed theme (“Tibetan [sic] Chant”) recurs whenever the monasteries are in sight, indicating further concern with expressive “fitting”.

At the same time, their accompaniment seems partly judged to serve as a pleasant evening’s music in its own right: a quality concert with moving picture backdrop. Goossens and Laurence do not seem to have prioritised

---

close fitting, but instead conscientiously married suitable music selections with a concern for creating a kind of concert. Most of the excerpts originally started at the beginning of a piece or movement and ran for a substantial portion of the whole without being cut to fit the film closely. The accompaniment draws for the most part on big concert-hall pieces, though Goossens's score was dominated by piano-conductor parts from salon orchestra arrangements.

**PRAGMATIC LAVISHNESS**

Long before the film print was restored, I had studied the messy surviving conductor's score and worked out—with the aid of Soundtrack Pro software—potential resynchronisations with an existing c.90-minute print as part of a British Academy-funded research project on "film fitting" in Britain. Nevertheless, recreating the music for the BFI's DVD involved a number of practical constraints, some of which, ironically, led to its comparatively lavish production.

- The recording was only possible with the involvement of an orchestra prepared to take it on for no payment; fortunately, the Cambridge University Chamber Orchestra (CUCO), under Andrew Gourlay, was willing and able to be involved. CUCO's 48-piece chamber orchestra was nevertheless at or beyond the upper limit of plausible sizes for Goossens's orchestra in 1924–1925; he is likely to have had between 14 and 20 players. The instruments used in the specially-composed sections, the fact that the surviving score includes excerpts from numerous salon orchestra arrangements, sheer economics, and the pit size at the New Scala Theatre all support this theory.

- This had benefits, however. As no original individual orchestral parts survive, using a larger band enabled me to adapt full orchestral scores and parts, many of which were freely available on the internet. A band of 14–20 would have necessitated rearranging many pieces for salon orchestra as these versions are difficult to obtain, yet budgetary and time constraints made it impossible to do so. As the surviving conductor's score is an archival manuscript, it could not be used for a real performance either, so I prepared a practical conducting score from the electronic mock-up, adding in numerous interim visual cues to enable a conductor to stay reasonably in synch with the film.

- A very late agreement to include this recreation on the DVD put me under immense time pressure, and securing mechanical and synchronisation rights for four concert works as a priority led to a couple of idiosyncrasies:
  
  1. I used the original chamber instrumentation for Prokofiev's Overture on Hebrew Themes even though I suspect it was adapted for more instruments. Rearranging an in-copyright musical work complicates clearance.
  
  2. There is no DVD "extra" of Eugene Goossens Jr's informal orchestral arrangement of his piano piece "Old Chinese Folk-Song". Again, licensing an arrangement suggested by annotations on the piano score could have been complicated; a commercial recording of the original is freely available.

- The DVD format itself proved a considerable constraint on presenting a recorded version of this film performance, and gave rise to one important performance decision.

  1. Though evidence in the surviving score suggests that, after the three-part "Prelude" to Part I, the opening title cards ran in silence, to avoid any suggestion of DVD mechanical...
fault, we synchronised the third element of the “Prelude” to the opening credits and titles.

- Even though a principle goal was to provide DVD access to prologue and prelude materials, we could not achieve a mediatised performance of the full programme. *Epic* is restored as a continuous film of c.90 minutes. The alternative soundtrack format does not facilitate running the DVD picture as a two-part film performance with a dramatic cut in the middle. Nor can the Prelude items be placed in their programme order: here they are “extras” to be accessed separately.

The DVD also robs the music of a live performance’s potential for variation: it fixes one synchronisation - and freezes one “best fit” performance - though this probably changed even during the first run.\(^\text{15}\)

In the case of *The Epic of Everest*, there were many givens because the musical recreation was only agreed by the BFI at a stage when they had already taken relevant decisions about the film restoration. Projection speed had been fixed at 18fps, so there was no possibility of engaging in the sorts of temporal give-and-take that Carl Davis, David Gill, and Kevin Brownlow employed in relation to the restoration work on Rabaud’s original score for *Le Joueur d’échecs (The Chess Player, 1927)*.\(^\text{16}\) Moreover, Titles List 1, which apparently corresponds to the New Scala Theatre performances, provides evidence that some sequences might have run a bit faster. For instance, from 00:10:02 on the DVD, timings are as in Fig.5.

Taken at face value, this suggests an average frame rate of c.23fps, though more evidence is needed to confirm this. For instance, do the typescript numbers include the corresponding titles or refer only to the moving pictures; were a few frames later cut in each instance?\(^\text{17}\)

For the print restoration the c.90-minute surviving copy provided the reference order. In the first half of the film, the order is broadly consistent with Titles List 1 and in the second half with Titles List 2, though much of the overall footage and many of the title cards on these early lists are clearly lost. The restorers nevertheless found and included a title card saying “And they were cheered...”. These words appear in neither titles lists, but do appear in the score along with a musical excerpt with no number (now called 8a), pasted in after the score’s initial construction. When this happened is unclear, especially as the words do not appear in Titles List 2. Otherwise, the


\(^\text{16}\) “I am often in a situation where I say, 'Here is a piece of music where the metronome mark by the composer is clearly indicated. But if I want to trim it so that it meets the next station point, I've got to cut about eight bars.' On the other hand, David [Gill] may say, 'Well, why don't we keep the eight bars and I'll slightly slow the film down.' That sort of stuff. Totally subjective... You hurt both the film and the music if you're too rigid.” Carl Davis, quoted in Russell Merritt, “Opera without Words: Composing Music for Silent Films, An Interview with Carl Davis, Kevin Brownlow and David Gill”, Griffithiana, 40-42, October 1991, p.170.

\(^\text{17}\) I am preparing a more detailed account of this for publication elsewhere.
score bears traces of both titles lists throughout, and was evidently initially conceived for a longer film overall. For the recreation this meant reconciling it with the shorter, slightly differently-ordered, restored print.

Among the alterations made to the film over time, the most important from the point of view of the musical recreation are the loss of the infamous "lice-eating" scene, and the repositioning of footage first presenting the mountaineers. The "lice-eating" scene was removed because of the offence it caused the Tibetans. The cut meant that "Airs from Nepal and Sikkim", composed by T. Howard Somervell, was robbed of much of the footage to which it pertained: only 27 of the 90 seconds referred to in Titles List 1 survive. Because a thin sliver of this music between two weighty movements of Borodin's Symphony would sound extremely peculiar, we omitted it entirely, and favoured the "concert" aesthetic by bringing forward the Borodin. The result was rather dramatic music emphasising the sequence commencing "And in contrast to all this, the cold purity of the snows of Chamolhari puts to eternal shame the dirt of Phari". This is unsatisfactory in a different respect, and might be rethought for another performance.

Titles List 1 shows that Noel initially placed most mountaineer "character" introductions shortly after the Phari scenes; group shots of mountaineers and porters appeared a little later. By contrast, Titles List 2, whose changes are mostly already pencilled into the earlier script and seem to represent a revised view on the ordering, consolidates most introductions much earlier, more or less immediately after the opening sequence. Words scribbled into the conductor's score reveal traces of both (Fig.4), suggesting that the re-ordering probably occurred during the New Scala run. After these revisions, the introductions are accompanied by the relaxed and atmospheric In the Steppes of Central Asia.

The restored film has the introductions in two groups, reflecting neither Titles List, though it is closer to List 1. From the point of view of the musical recreation, it would have been interesting to try positioning the introductions according to Noel's List 2. With all the introductions at the beginning and so little relevant footage remaining, the question is whether the dramatic Borodin first movement should stay at all. There would be more of In the Steppes of Central Asia at the beginning, though the concert-like character of Part I would be substantially altered because the Borodin Symphony would dominate less. Perhaps Laurence and Goossens had started to wonder about the desirability of the whole Symphony, given the late insertion of an un-numbered cue for a second excerpt from Erich Korngold's Die tote Stadt.

There is much more to say about decisions made in reconciling the conductor's score with the restored version of the surviving film material of The Epic of Everest. However, this would risk over-emphasising the accompaniment's weaknesses, which are sometimes a product of difficult decisions taken in relation to material that seemed to serve the cultural functions of both film and concert music. Yet this mediated performance of a complex audio-visual palimpsest succeeds, I think, not only in animating and dramatising the film in a way that is generally in character with its ambitions. It also sheds considerable light on certain of the historical meanings created by this important film, now beautifully restored.
La epopeya del Everest (The Epic of Everest), película del capitán John Noel del 1924, ha beneficiado recientemente de una lujosa restauración por parte del British Film Institute. Encargó también una nueva partitura para la proyección de la película en salas y su difusión en streaming. Sin embargo, los elementos musicales y técnicos que se habían sido proyectados en su difusión original (en Londres, del 9 de diciembre del 1924 al 31 de diciembre del 1925) han sido reproducidos para la edición DVD/Blu-Ray. Las motivaciones de esta iniciativa vienen expuestas aquí. Entre ellas, destaca la notoriedad del jefe de orquesta y la importancia de sus actividades en el ámbito del cine londinense a inicios de los años 1920, la naturaleza habitual del acompañamiento que evoca más bien una música de concierto y el hecho de que la película permite a los geógrafos a la vez que a los historiadores del cine, de la música de películas y de la cultura de tener acceso a todos los elementos que entran en juego en la proyección en sala de un cuadro de viaje de los años 1920. Entre esos elementos se encuentran suplementos como una grabación original de los siete "lamas" tibetanos que habían sido traídos a Londres en traje tradicional, un prólogo exótico mezclando música y danzas indígenas. Las proyecciones del film en su conjunto tuvieron repercusiones políticas y culturales más amplias de lo previsto por el número ejecutado por los lamas que se consideró como una afrenta a la cultura tibetana. Volviendo a la partitura, cabe mencionar los distintos desafíos que suponía recrearla. Cuando algunas secuencias lúdicas fueron o habían sido desplazadas a otro lugar que aquel mencionado en la partitura, ha sido necesario arbitrar entre la preocupación de asociar cada música a la secuencia a la cual estaba destinada o proponer un conjunto musical coherente, confrontando los argumentos musicales e históricos a favor de una de esos dos opciones.