

how and why works by French composers became such an important part of the post-Second World War repertory. Finally, Launchbury makes a thought-provoking contribution to interdisciplinary understandings of cultural memory, music, and mediation—and the uses and limits of the archive.

CHRISTINA BAADE  
McMaster University  
doi:10.1093/ml/gct074

© The Author (2013). Published by Oxford University Press. All rights reserved.

*Hans Werner Henze: Tristan (1973)*. By Stephen Downes. pp. xiv + 142. (Ashgate, Aldershot and Burlington, VT, 2011, £35. ISBN 978-0-7546-6655-4.)

Stephen Downes's contribution to Ashgate's Landmarks in Music since 1950 series looks at Hans Werner Henze's *Tristan*, for piano, orchestra, and electronic tape. Any twentieth-century art work, musical and/or otherwise, taking that name can hardly fail to provoke comparison with Wagner's drama. As Downes points out, Henze's work stands in a "tradition" of *Tristan*-alluding twentieth-century works' (p. xii). He ensures, however, that consideration of Wagner does not entirely eclipse other contexts, explaining how this 'single piece can interrogate the styles, expressions, genres, and aesthetics of major conflicting trends in European culture' (p. xii). Moreover, Wagner comes to be mediated by successors, not least Nietzsche and Thomas Mann, in the context of Celia Applegate's 'eternal recurrence of Wagnerian controversy'. (It is no coincidence, one might add, that Mann would prove a continuing preoccupation for Henze, as for instance in his subsequent Third Violin Concerto.) Musical intermediaries, such as another of Henze's bugbears (increasingly so as time went on), Schoenberg, are also invoked. For instance, the work of Thomas Christensen and Michael Cherlin on Schoenberg's Op. 11 No. 1 piano piece is discussed, seen almost as a staging post for Wagner's *Tristan*, as well as Wagner's *Tristan*, to bear the agony of its and his wounds on the road to Henze. Frank Martin's *Le Vin herbé*, whose first German performance Henze heard in 1943, is cited too; it would have been good to hear a little more on this alternative *Tristan* path, given the actual as well as theoretical precedent it may well have set.

And so, 'ambivalent resistance and emulation, pessimistic negation, elegy and mourning,

displacement, allegorical disenchantment, and the use of dark, sometimes horrifically surrealistic distortions all feature' in the 'thirty-minute span' of Henze's response (p. 36). Put like that, even without the name of the work, reminiscences of Wagner's drama seem unavoidable, all the more so when read—even if some of these did not feature on Henze's own particular road of intention, influence, and context—against a backdrop of anti-Wagnerism from the likes of Hindemith, Weill, Brecht, Poulenc, and Shostakovich. The Third Reich, the Second World War, the Holocaust: they of course featured heavily throughout Henze's career, somehow both impeding to and generator of his own *echt*-German, neo-Goethian, even neo-Wagnerian, flight from Germany, be it politically, culturally, or simply in terms of domicile. (He famously drove south one day across the Alps, not leaving his car until he arrived in Italy, settling there for good, albeit with plenty of confrontational visits to home soil to come.) Henze's own earlier oeuvre is also briefly considered in this light, not least the Rimbaud setting, *Being Beauteous*, with its own entirely un-ironic quotation from *Tristan und Isolde*. Alone among Wagner's works, it had always tended to evoke more sympathetic responses from Henze, perhaps on account of its triumph of metaphysics over retrospectively tainted politics, though his *Tristan* of course originated in a period that might well be considered his most overtly political.

The book is divided into four chapters, the first, discussed above, dealing with Henze's work in the shadow of *Tristan und Isolde*, the '*Tristan* tradition', and Wagner more generally. Detailed attention, descriptive and analytical, is offered in the second chapter to the compositional process as later related by Henze and his collaborators, notably Peter Zinovieff; to Henze's sketches; to Henze's principal musical materials (note rows, allusions, and direct quotations); and to 'formal and dramatic structure' (p. xii), that 'and', as in Wagner's celebrated *und*, a telling point. In that respect, Downes discusses and rightly criticizes the claim made by Peter Petersen (*Hans Werner Henze: Ein politischer Musiker* (Hamburg, 1988)) that Brahms, his First Symphony crucial in Henze's aural gallery of quotations, serves as a merely negative, anti-erotic, anti-Wagnerian dramatic 'character'. Subsequent discussion concerning what we might call the work's musico-dramatic tendencies might fruitfully take its leave from here (that is, from both Petersen and Downes).

At the beginning of the second chapter, Apollo and Dionysus, the opposition Nietzsche stole from Wagner, provide an enlightening introductory framework, to which Henze's own psychoanalytical musings, via Goya, offer a fascinating contribution. Chopin and Brahms, as well as Wagner, 'original' and recorded (Birgit Nilsson), are in music and commentary examined and reassembled (in rather more Apollonian fashion, the reader may be relieved to hear, by Downes than by Henze). The path from piano preludes to 'full-bodied, sensual symphonic score' (Henze's own description) is clearly traced, including external punctuations: the deaths of Salvador Allende, W. H. Auden, Pablo Neruda, and Ingeborg Bachmann. Building upon the only other major study, Marion Fürst's German-language monograph (*Hans Werner Henzes 'Tristan': Eine Werkmonographie* (Neckargemünd, 2000)), in which most of the compositional materials in the Sacher Stiftung are transcribed and at least described, Downes's book offers not only a handy reproduction of, for instance, the note-row chart, 'melodic patterns' and their inversions, and Fürst's 'motivic derivations'; it also considers them in a more strongly Wagnerian context, even going so far as to suggest that we witness 'Henze's version of Wagner's "endless melody"' (p. 68). The accent then, even should one disagree, is analytical in the best sense, passing far beyond mere description. Downes also, unlike Fürst, makes use of the sketch version of the piano Epilogue, relating it to the moment of compositional crisis provoked by the death of Bachmann, for so long a crucial collaborator with Henze.

The third chapter is hermeneutical in its concerns, though it also incorporates analytical discussion. Henze's use of tonality is explored, not simply in technical terms—Wagner, Fürst, Schoenberg, and Hans Keller among the roll-call summoned for deeper historical context—but, just as importantly, in terms of what it might mean. For 'the aesthetics of the beautiful' (p. xii), a Downes concern elsewhere, especially vis-à-vis the sublime, proves an especially fruitful concept for this particular Henze work, for many of his other works, and, more generally, for his aesthetics. It connects, moreover, with the earlier, first section treatment of Wagner, Mallarmé, and Debussy (which, as Downes has argued elsewhere, in *The Muse as Eros: Music, Erotic Fantasy and Male Creativity in the Romantic and Modern Imagination* (Aldershot and Burlington, Vt., 2006), calls into question Robin Holloway's argument that Mallarmé provided an escape for Debussy from Wagner).

Mourning in 'an age of horror' takes us into the worlds of Lacan, Žižek, Michel Poizat, and Antonin Artaud, among others, their perspectives in turn leading us back—or perhaps forwards—to the rightly inescapable question of "post-Wagnerian" eroticism" (p. xii). The cry of Henze's *Tristan* and its overcoming, it is intriguingly suggested, come in some senses closer to Roger Scruton's understanding of Wagner's work and its legacy—"a way of psychologically exploring "ritualised and symbolic form"' (p. 119)—than to the understandings advanced by the Leftist intellectuals one might have thought more congenial to Henze. But then, Henze's 'compromises'—and I intend no negative connotation here, either with respect to him or to Scruton—were always a great part of his fascination and his sometimes bewilderingly high level of compositional productivity, a characteristic that would sometimes have encouraged a good number of detractors, not all of them unjustified.

Finally, the fourth chapter, an 'epilogue', briefly considers the work's legacy, in the guise of two later Henze works, the Seventh Symphony and the instrumental *Requiem*. It proves suggestive of how Downes's arguments might usefully be extended, both in themselves and in terms of how we might read some of the other scholars he cites (for instance, Benedikt Vennefrohne, in his treatment of the symphonies, *Die Sinfonie Hans Werner Henzes* (Hildesheim, 2005)). With respect to *Tristan* itself, although there remains much of value in Fürst's book, Downes casts his associative net wider, resulting in a treatment in many respects deeper and certainly livelier.

As is the case with all books in this series, there comes an accompanying CD, in this case Henze's own 1975 radio recording with Homero Francesch and the Cologne Radio Symphony Orchestra for the Westdeutsche Rundfunk, thereafter released by Deutsche Grammophon. A new recording is needed, not only for comparative reasons, but also given that in 1990, Henze and Roderick Watkins made new tapes, said to follow the score's specifications more closely on account of technological advances. It would be a fitting tribute to this book as well as to Henze's memory, were they to inspire new performances, which in turn might help bring about that new recording. Composers' reputations often, though not always, dip once mourning has been completed. One lesson that might be drawn, at least at a certain remove, from Downes's book is that these are both a work and oeuvre that might profitably be considered in the context of

turning mourning to positive and lasting ends. A long tradition of Tristan works would certainly tend to concur. There is more to be said about the context and content, perhaps especially in political terms, of Henze's *Tristan*, but that testifies to the necessity and suggestive quality of this important book.

MARK BERRY

*Royal Holloway, University of London*

doi:10.1093/ml/get075

© The Author (2013). Published by Oxford University Press. All rights reserved.

*Music in the USA: A Documentary Companion.*

Ed. Judith Tick with Paul Beaudoin. pp. xxxviii + 882. (Oxford University Press, New York and Oxford, 2008, £26.99. ISBN 978-0-19-513988-4.)

Tick and Beaudoin's companion is a monument to Tick's dedication to the subject as a musicologist. Drawing upon the narratives of the insiders and outsiders of American music stretching over 460 years, it dives into the 'unruliness' of musical culture in the USA. In their display of experiential accounts, a large part of these texts speak to us *en vivante*.

The editors had the arduous responsibility of presenting an adequate, clear, and representative selection. (There is no information regarding the precise editorial roles of Tick and Beaudoin. Since the introduction is unsigned, I will assume that 'me' and 'my' refer to Tick.) Providing non-invasive notes, which could have provided more substance, is no simple task, either. The overall experience derived from these 159 chapters is that of a long journey through diverse stories within overlapping time-frames. Roughly defined periods shrink in equal proportions: 1540–1770 (the Colonial period: 90 years); 1770–1830 ('progressive trends': 60 years); 1830–80 ('arrival of American popular music': 50 years); 1880–1920 (stability: 40 years); 1920–50 ('a high point'/ 'synergy': 30 years); 1950–75 ('intersections of social change, media, and technology': 25 years); 1975–2000 (postmodernism: 25 years). The succinctness of earlier periods yields an uneven unfolding of the larger narrative; after a mere 110 pages, we are in the middle of the nineteenth century. But what is vital are interconnections, rather than differences; the chapters team with cross-referencing and multi-contextualization: Whitman linked with Gershwin; Sessions and Dika Newlin with Schoenberg; Bernstein with Copland, Gershwin, and African-American music; Muddy

Waters with the Rolling Stones and Charlie Parker; Chuck Berry with Count Basie and Jimi Hendrix; Laurie Anderson with Cage; black spirituals with rap; contemporary jazz with neoclassicism; John Williams with Wagner; Glass with music theatre, Boulanger, Ravi Shankar, and Buddhism; 'regional accordion' with immigration, mobility, and hybridization; Michael Jackson with Astaire; Sergei Eisenstein with Prokofiev, Tolkien, and Adorno; Cowell with turntable-scratch music. The editors favour so many excerpts with multiple subjects, who tend to have hybridized personalities, that one wonders if space constraints end up eclipsing truly egalitarian treatment.

American themes such as control versus non-control, cross-cultural and ethno-racial diversity, adaptation, and migration are established without much ado (see, for example, John Fanning Watson's polemical tract regarding religious debates on undisciplined hymn singing, and Tick's comment that '[w]ords also travel through sound to experience' (p. xxxiii)). The motifs of energy, travel, and journeying recur throughout the anthology, which is addressed to the 'Mind-Traveling Reader'—a term borrowed from the 1634 travelogue of William Wood. The editors' intention 'to harness the formidable energy of primary sources' is directed at students, teachers, and music lovers, who are invited to "mind-travel" into the many worlds of American music' (p. vii). Nonetheless, the epic journey of a thousand voices/texts jollying around is so open-ended that any 'centre' vanishes too easily. Indeed, the companion is 'fueled by territorial expansionism' (p. 270), making the transcontinental journey bumpy with both pleasant and disorienting morsels. Several chapters, containing 'sidebars', can be confusing or disruptive in their fast-forward and backward jumps—such as two texts from 1931 and 1983 placed in the same chapter. Still, when the contexts and connections are established effectively, they instigate a sense of congruity. Coherence and fluidity are usually difficult to achieve in anthologies, in which texts are often approached as a tourist outing. Documentary histories in this subject include J. Heywood Alexander's *To Stretch our Ears* (New York, 2002) and Bill F. Faucett and Michael J. Budds's *Music in America* (Hillsdale, NY, 2009). Despite the potential inadequacies of documentary histories—arguably, an abused genre—Tick and Beaudoin, although providing their version of What to Read in American Music, do not force-feed us What to Think about It. Indeed, Tick asks early on: 'What