# A FOUNTAIN FOR MEMORY:

# The Trevi Flow of Power and Transcultural Performance

Pam Krist, PhD Thesis

School of Modern Languages, Literature and Culture Royal Holloway, University of London 2015

# **Declaration of Authorship**

I, Pam Krist, hereby declare that this thesis and the work presented in it is entirely my own.

Where I have consulted the work of others, this is always clearly stated.

Signed: P.F.Krust

Date: ......25..January 2015......

## **Abstract**

In memory studies much research on monuments focuses on those with traumatic or controversial associations whilst others can be overlooked. The thesis explores this gap and seeks to supplement the critical understanding of a populist monument as a nexus for cultural remembering. The Trevi Fountain in Rome is chosen because it is a conduit for the flow of multivalent imagery, ideological manipulation, and ever-evolving performances of memory, from design plans to mediated representations.

The thesis begins by locating the historical pre-material and material presences of the Fountain, establishing this contextual consideration as contributory to memory studies. It then surveys the field of theory to build a necessarily flexible conceptual framework for researching the Fountain which, given the movement and sound of water and the coin-throwing ritual, differs from a static monument in its memorial connotations. The interpretations of the illusory Trevi design and its myths are explored before employing a cross-disciplinary approach to the intertextuality of its presences and its performative potential in art, literature, film, music, advertising and on the Internet. The thesis concludes with questions about the digital Trevi and dilution of memory.

Gathering strength throughout is the premise of the Fountain as a transcultural vehicle for dominant ideologies – from the papal to commercial, the Grand Tour to cyber tourism – seeking to control remembering and forgetting. Sometimes these are undermined by the social and inventive practices of memory. Discourses of power, often gendered, that draw on Trevi imagery and its potent association with water mythology, are exemplified. These underscore the uncertainties of memory during the production of self-serving suitable pasts. The Fountain is an indicator of ethical implications for future memory as to how the past is shaped to meet present needs. It is always a reflector of the multiplicity of memory practices.

# Acknowledgements

I cannot thank my co-supervisors enough, Dr Ruth Cruickshank and Dr Giuliana Pieri for their academic and personal support. Ruth, with her brilliant inspirations, innovative ideas and constructive criticisms, especially of theory, guided me through the main parts of the thesis and amendments period with a sure touch. I tried to learn that less equals more. Giuliana patiently set the pace and kept a handle on the overall picture, helping with the chapter on art and supervising the final editing for the viva. The Fountain was with the three of us for many years but never ran dry.

Among the many students who aided my research and to whom my thanks also go include: Jana Buresova for commenting on my Interviews Appendix, her cheerful emails and informative time spent over coffee, Fiona Cameron for some additional research for me in Rome and being my 'eyes and ears' in London and elsewhere, Tom Norton for his information, always of relevance, especially about the latest books on Rome and fountains, Stuart Oglethorpe for his thorough oral interview training and Eugene Pooley for invaluable references on fascist plans for Rome.

I am also grateful to the academics who contributed to my adventures across disciplines, some of which were new territory. My thanks go to Ben Earle for enlightening me on music of the fascist era, Rachel Beckles-Willson about the symbolic significance of instruments, Stefano Jossa for art terms, Stephen Gundle on film aspects, John Pinto for his encouraging email correspondence and his wonderful DVD, *Trevi*, and to John Foot for his oral history course which helped with the Interview Appendix. Special thanks go to my interviewees, Fiona, Peter, and Daniela for their time and interest, whilst also remembering lively conversations with Gilberto, an official Fountain guide, and many Romans who gave me their observations. Several people kindly helped with translations, including my co-supervisors. Peter Willig tackled the German material and Guido Giglioni and Simon Trafford some of the Latin inscriptions.

Particular thanks are due to the Institute for Modern Language Research, formerly the Institute of Germanic and Romance Studies, for their postgraduate training courses. The seminars and conferences of their Centre for the Study of Cultural Memory, established in 2010, sustains students researching memory who are not rooted in a discipline but a field of enquiry. The Department of Italian, Royal Holloway, University of London very helpfully awarded me a full bursary.

I received excellent support from many librarians, at the British Library, Warburg, Ashmolean, Winchester School of Art (University of Southampton) and staff at several museums. Above all, I thank the wonderful Inter Library Loan Scheme of Hampshire Library which conjured up books from all over the place, followed through queries and ferreted out old volumes. The little known Postal Scheme at Senate House Library also proved useful.

A special form of thanks, for sorting out the seemingly unsortable, goes to the tech wizards at the RHUL IT Centre, notably Chris Horton. Further recognition is owed to friends whose enthusiasm never waned and grew as the write up neared its end. Finally, my love and thanks to Ray Krist, the coin in my fountain, who made all this possible and to whom the thesis is dedicated. He provided fantastic technical and material support mingled with practical observations so that it has been a very special enterprise.

Pam Krist 2015 Men of every age, have found no better way of immortalizing their memories than by the shifting, indestructible, ever new, yet unchanging, upgush and downfall of water. They have written their names in the unstable element and proved it a more durable record than brass or marble.

Nathaniel Hawthorne *The Marble Faun* 

# CONTENTS

Abstract		3
Acknowled	gements	4
Introduction		10
CHAPT	ER ONE	
Historical 1	Locations and Material Presences of the Trevi	17
Introduction		
	rom Water to Fountains to Trevi	1.0
	On Looking at the Trevi	19
	From Fons to Fountain	22
	The (In)Visible Power of Aqueducts	24
	Shaping of Water in the Roman Cityscape	26
	What's in a Name and a Place?	28
1.1.6	How Many Forms of Trevi?	30
1.2 N	Iaterial Power: Building the Showpiece Fountain	
	Three Papal Billboards	33
1.2.2	Deceptive Presences and Absences	38
1.2.3	Later Constructions: Piazza and Plans	41
1.2.4	Receptacle for Wishes: Coincidental Ritual	43
СНАРТ	ER TWO	
Approache	es to Memory: A Fountain for Conceptual Flexibility	50
Introduction		
	One An Overview: Theories of Memory	
	Presently Surrounded by the Past	53
	Sharing the Memory	5:
	What Past?: Linguistic Turn, Doubts, Signs, Fictions, Discourses	60
2.1.4	After the Turn: Trauma Theory, Remembering, Forgetting	63
2.1.5	After the Turn: Memory and/or History	70
2.1.6	Discursively Reinstating Monuments	74
Da4 7	Free Situating the Tree in (Culture) Manager	
2.2.1	<b>Two Situating the Trevi in (Cultural) Memory</b> Memory Debates: Dichotomies	77
2.2.1	A Place in Memory Terms	78
2.2.2	Towards a Fluid Framework: Afterlives, Observers, Intentions	81
2.2.3	Sharing: Collective Individuals	82
2.2.4	Performances and Practiced Places: The Trevi Theatre for Memory	84
2.2.5	,	86
2.2.7	Shaping the Past	88
2.2.7	Monumental Intentions and Challenges	89
2.2.8	A Slippery Fountain	90
	Moving on with a Fluid Framework	92
∠.∠.10	TYTO YITIS OIL WITH A I THIN I THINGWOLK	12

_		or Illusion: Power, Competitive Memory, Performance	95
Introd	luction		
	3.1 TI	ne Ideological Power of Water	
		The Trevi 'in Waiting': Contra Flows of Memory	96
	3.1.2	The Ownership of Water: Fluid Currency	100
	3.2 TI	ne Flows of Myth in Memory	
	3.2.1	Officially Remembered Images	102
	3.3 TI	ne Social Context of Competitive Memory	
		Transmissions	107
		Traces of a Smokescreen	110
		Illusions and False Places	111
		Choices, Meanings, Intentions: The Trevi Emerges	113
	3.3.5	When Size Matters	114
		erformances on the Fountain	
	3.4.1	Renewal and Decay: Plants and Gods	115
	3.4.2	Performing Gender and Water Power	118
		osting Patriarchal Stories: 'L'Inventrice' and 'Il Conduttore'	
		Monumental Parts	122
		'L'Inventrice' Invented: Trivia's Story	123
	3.5.3	Shaping 'Il Conduttore': Agrippa's Story	127
	3.5.4	Joint and Separate Performances: Remembered Forgotten Statues	129
		ER FOUR	104
A Ve	hicle 1	for Narratives: Art and Literature	134
Introd	luction		
		Narrative for Intended Memory: Visual Text on Stone	
	4.1.1	The Almost Lost Voices of Three Inscriptions	136
	4.2 R	etrospective Memory of Art: Making the Trevi Baroque	
	4.2.1	Presently Assigning Past Labels	139
	4.2.2	, , ,	141
	4.2.3	The Expanding Narrative of a Baroque Trevi: Guidebooks	145
	4.3 Aı	nticipatory Memory: Picturing the Trevi	
	4.3.1	Early Images: From Functional Power to Neglect	148
	4.3.2	Italy as Europe's Other: A Place for the Grand Tour Trevi	150
	4.3.3	Writing the Visual: Deceptive Demotions and Promotions	152
	4.3.4	Piranesi and the Engraved Trevi: Evolving Anticipation	154
	4.3.5	Views of Piranesi's Vedute	159
	4.3.6	Marketing Future Past Memory: Art of the New Fountain	161

4.4 Fu	uture Memory: Literary Nymphs in Search of a Fountain	
4.4.1	Cool Classical Water and Patriarchal (Im)Purity	164
4.4.2	A Well-Versed Nymph: Fountain Poets and the Night	167
4.4.3		169
4.4.4	Intertexts: Dark Memories Travelling	175
	ER FIVE for Narratives: Cinema, Music, Advertising, Internet	186
Introduction		100
	he Filmic Fountain	
5.1.1	Cinema and Memory	188
	In Search of the Screen Trevi	189
	Fascism's Fountain	191
	The Glamorous American Trevi: A Forgetting?	193
	Not So Sweet Life: The Fountain Scene in <i>La dolce vita</i>	199
5.1.6		204
5.1.7	Images for Sale: Sexy Trevi	206
5.1.8	Fellini's Future Trevi: Intertexts, Borrowings, Transformations	209
5.2 (U	Jn)Sound Memory: Water, Music, Film	
5.2.1	Auditory Images	214
5.2.2	'Three Coins', 'Arrivederci Roma'	216
5.2.3	Musical Intertexts and Unsung Memory	218
5.3 T	revi Advertising Trevi: Placing Products in Memory	
5.3.1	Brand New Memory: Commercial Water Nymphs	221
5.3.2	The Fountain in the Desert: Models, Imitations, Simulacra	227
5.4 C	yberspace Trevi: In Memoriam Perpetuam?	
5.4.1	Digital Memory: Remainders and Fragments	231
5.4.2	Future Perfect Promises of Advertising: The Internet Trevi	236
5.4.3	Cyber Wishes	238
Cone	clusion	241
Conc		211
A P P	PENDIX ONE: ORAL MEMORY INTERVIEWS Remembering the Fountain: Personal Stories	246
	Remembering the Fountain. Fersonal Stories	<i>∠</i> 40
A P P	PENDIX TWO: FRENCH TRANSLATIONS	
	Staël, Stendhal, and Yourcenar	257
Bibli	iography	260

## ILLUSTRATIONS BOOKLET (Volume Two)

## Introduction

Seneca's bracing New Year dip in a chilly canal is amongst the many stories associated with the Aqua Virgo aqueduct whose myth-laden water would later feed the 1762 Trevi Fountain. Today, millions of tourists visit and make wishes as they throw coins into the sparkling water. The Fountain has been called 'the world's leading receptacle' for such an act of propitiation but it is much more than this. Its images circulate transnationally in literature, art, film, music, photography, advertising, guidebooks, social media, and on television, the radio and the Internet, from Piranesi's prints to Peroni's advertising. Recent guidebooks show its evolution into a tourist 'must see' and 'top ten' sight for Rome. They refer to Trevi appearances in the films of *Roman Holiday* and *Three Coins in the Fountain*, to the 'wade', 'dip', 'plunge', or 'swim' of Anita Ekberg in the water for Federico Fellini's *La dolce vita*, Charles Dickens's moonlit drive around the Piazza di Trevi, coin-throwing rituals, and also to myths about how the aqueduct was built, the finder of its water and its coolness and purity. The Trevi is described as the most famous fountain in Rome, Italy and the world – but its important place in memory has been overlooked.

As a subject for research, the Fountain offers prolific opportunities to explore memory as well as shed light on the monument itself. In other words, it adds to understandings of the multiple processes of memory, and theories of memory add to understandings of the multivalent Trevi. Why are its images so potent and so exploitable across media and time periods, from myths in classical narratives to digitized fragments in cyberspace? Why does it offer so many interpretive possibilities?

The Fountain presents as a metonym for Rome, or Italy, and as a commodified monument producing clichés about romance and coin-throwing. Yet closer consideration through the prism of memory theories shows that it always inherently reflects the discourse of prevailing ideologies. Its populist image has deflected critical

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The claim about global status is by Henry Canova Vollam Morton, *The Waters of Rome* (London: The Connoisseur and Michael Joseph, 1966), p. 80. In 2013, Italy was fifth of the top ten world destinations for tourism <a href="http://www.mkt.unwto.org/en/publication/unwto-tour">http://www.mkt.unwto.org/en/publication/unwto-tour</a> [accessed 9 September 2013] (p.6)

Guides sampled: *Explorer: Rome*, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed., (Basingstoke: AA Publishing, 1999), *Spiral Guide: Rome* (Basingstoke: AA Publishing, 2006), *Insight City Guide, Rome* (Singapore: Discovery Channel, Apa Publications, 2005), *Eyewitness Travel: Rome* (London: Dorling Kindersley Ltd, 2006), *Travellers Rome* (Basingstoke: AA Publishing, 1995), *Lonely Planet, Best of Rome*, 3<sup>rd</sup> ed. (Australia: Footscray, 2004). References for literature and film are given later.

attention from the dimensions of memory flowing in its performances. As this research demonstrates, it is these which shape the Trevi as a nexus for transcultural remembering. The papal patrons who oversaw its construction as a showpiece fountain built it as part of their pontifical water strategy for sustaining a new transnational religious identity. At the same time they sought, but failed, to control future memory through their designs and iconography. Fountain imagery was already attractive for the narratives of early consumerism and as it evolved into a multi-media vehicle it became increasingly commodified for the performances of power by new political elites. Yet there are many instances of performances at the Trevi that challenge or undermine such hegemony, from the criticism of papal building practices to Fellini's intentions in *La dolce vita* and the throwing of red dye into the Fountain as a political gesture.

The Fountain is distinguished from dry, static monuments by its water, sound and movement, and the coin-throwing ritual, as well as from other fountains with limited interpretive possibilities. A convergence of evolving and changing memories fading in and out of focus multiply in the narratives of illusion generated by the rapidly changing discourses of power surrounding the Fountain. Further reasons that make it an important vehicle for the narratives of memory are the contemporary stories that draw upon earlier ones. These reflect the interweaving of the inventive practices of public and personal remembering. An example from 2012 is the intertextuality in a cartoon for *The* Economist that draws upon the well-known scene at the Fountain in Fellini's La dolce vita (1960). An Italian prime minister, figured as Marcello Mastroianni, tries to pull a reluctant Anita Ekberg, symbol of Italy, out of the dark and turbulent Trevi waters of European fiscal crisis.<sup>3</sup> The black of Ekberg's dress in the film is replaced by the colours of the Italian flag. The intended meaning of the aqueduct water as pure and clear by classical writers and Renaissance poets is undermined by a murkiness connoting impurity and danger. The ambiguous image filters through from Romantic literature into later fiction and into film and other media.

The Trevi has taken a number of physical forms. The functional Medieval and Renaissance Fountain already expressed the exercise of power in limited iconography, records of which exist in a few images. The present monument was first built in the imagination of fountain architects long before it achieved a physical form. Its prematerial presence already conveyed an invented past of Roman Empire by appropriating Aqua Virgo myths and the function of the new Fountain was magnified as a storyteller

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> The Economist (8 December 2012), p. 74. Mario Monti was the Prime Minister.

of mythical pasts for the on-going propaganda purposes of papal Rome. The patriarchal power conveyed in the 1762 Trevi iconography of gendered figures associated with water found expression in changed meanings across new media. The imagery began to interweave with consumerism's increasing commodification and sexualization of the body and to feed into misogynist representations.

In memory studies, the relationship between monuments and memory has often attracted much critical suspicion. As the physical Trevi shows, there is an object involved, but when the word is read or heard or seen, thoughts are already affected in diverse ways by discourses surrounding the monument. The Fountain is always symbolic. Here, attention is drawn across the chapters to the relation between the discursive and the material in memory production. The Trevi is not treated as a discrete object, but illustrative of memory processes as socially active and inventive. This provides the theoretical context for the Fountain and makes it such a powerful critical lens, giving insights into the plurality and diversity of memory as well as into its own symbolic and material manifestations.

Susannah Radstone comments that, 'Research has yet to focus fully on the articulation of memory *across* media – on how memory "travels", as it were, between different media, as well as across and between diverse public institutions and sites.' The thesis seeks to supplement existing critical understandings by its focus on the multivalent interpretations of the Trevi. It achieves this by situating the monument in a cross-disciplinary approach spanning art, literature, film, advertising and the Internet. The concentration is limited to these media due to constraints of thesis length, with photography, radio and television touched upon in passing and pointing the way towards future research.

The images produced in the thematic streams that flow through the research here on the Trevi also shape new memory, as does the accompanying Illustrations Booklet. Luisa Passerini maintains that, 'The subject cannot receive representations without creating new ones [...] cannot communicate without contributing to this multiplicity.'<sup>5</sup> As she cautions, when venturing into 'the universe of memory, one must be aware of the point of departure – which may be very different from that of arrival – and of the position of the travelling subject.'<sup>6</sup> Translation practices also shape new memories:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Susannah Radstone, 'Cinema and Memory', in *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates*, ed. by Radstone and Bill Schwarz (New York: Fordham University Press, 2010), p. 341.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Luisa Passerini, *Memory and Utopia: The Primacy of Intersubjectivity* (London: Equinox, 2007), p. 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Passerini, p. 18.

meanings shift and authorial intentions are lost or reconfigured. The English translations of the international critics contributing to the field of memory research are used in the thesis and the literary quotes are in the originating languages where possible. Latin and German are translated in the text following the quotation; unless otherwise stated, Latin translations are the thesis writer's. French literary passages are translated in Appendix Two.

Questions around who consumes images of the Fountain and remembers and forgets them frequently arose during research and resulted in a small offering to the field of oral memory work, with a brief look at theoretical issues. It forms Appendix One, 'Remembering the Trevi Fountain: Personal Stories', and draws attention to the fissile nature of memory. It also identifies some surprising outcomes about the interweaving of personal and public memory.

Chapter One, *Historical Locations and Material Presences of the Trevi*, explores the material and temporal presences of the Fountain from classical times to the twenty-first century. The Trevi often produces conflicting historiographical interpretations and the context of the text and its production are relevant to its many manifestations. Its physical appearance and supply of water by aqueduct are related to the history of fountains in the changing topography of the Roman cityscape. The Medieval, Renaissance and Baroque Trevi have contrasting functions. Unexecuted designs and partially achieved projects, renovations and plans for city development also serve to perpetuate myths surrounding Trevi water. An account of coin-throwing practices and other rituals concludes the chapter.

An overview of the field of memory studies forms the first part of Chapter Two, *Approaches to Memory: A Framework of Conceptual Flexibility*. It draws widely from critical thinking on how societies and individuals remember and enables the second part of the chapter to set up a fluid framework for new understandings of the Fountain, and of memory. This method shows that the multivalency of Trevi invites an approach which involves theoretical intersections and divergences, resulting in a vibrant nexus of conceptual possibilities.

Part One opens with the emergence of memory as a field of research. It then provides a chronological overview of theories of memory, covering concepts of *Nachleben*, the collective and individual memory dichotomy, linguistic issues, screen

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> English is used for the Fountain's architectural style, apart from *vascone* which conveys largeness of size and is preferable to 'large basin'; also *fontana a facciata* and *fontana-palazzo* are technically more correct.

memory, trauma theory, and the memory and history debate. It considers recent theoretical trends such as the changes in the discourses surrounding monuments, the multi-directionality of memory, and transcultural memory.

Part Two evaluates the theory in Part One to situate the Fountain in a conceptual framework of memory, to be drawn on in the following chapters. The practices of memory as social and inventive inform Part Two. The Fountain is interpreted as a place and space for performative memory, a theatre for memory and a shaper of narratives in discourses of power. Whilst the Trevi appears to 'fit' various theories, it is slippery in its memorial connotations and productive of new interpretations. The thesis moves on with a fluid theoretical framework that highlights the ideological dimensions of Trevi power and transcultural performance

Chapter Three, Fountain for Illusion: Power, Competitive Memory, Performance, looks at Trevi imagery during the long wait for its emergence as a grand fountain. It is first built in the imagination of its designers and then takes physical form between 1732 and 1762 amidst controversy and during three changes of papal patrons. The transmission of memory practices is illustrated by the political power inherent in water and the economic benefits of ownership, as well as the competitive design process and performances connoted by Trevi iconography. The social frameworks of memory shared by designers, architects and patrons shape invented pasts for contemporary purposes. The Trevi becomes a fountain for papal propaganda in a context of political crisis, generating unreliable memory shaped by official culture. Its intentions are often undermined by vernacular protest which adds to interpretations of the Fountain in contra flows of memory.

The traces of former Trevi designs and projects are interwoven in the winning design (1732) of the architect, Nicola Salvi. He exploits the spatial relationship between large monument and small piazza, screens the palazzo behind and employs deceptive hydraulic design to maximize the weak water supply. The myths associated with the numerous Greek deities represented in Salvi's iconography underscore performative gendered storytelling as do the two bas-reliefs: of the aqueduct-building Agrippa, and the peasant girl, Trivia, who reveals the water source. The patriarchal telling on the Fountain of Agrippa's and Trivia's stories evolves in other narratives. The memory weave intensifies – of size, grandness, health, purity, protest, advertisement, ambiguity and performance – and the Fountain's potential for multiple interpretation increases.

Chapter Four, *A Vehicle for Narratives: Art and Literature*, explores the idea of the Fountain as a narrative device pictured in and written into cultural memory. These

media processes differ yet borrow from each other in their evanescent fantasies for changing audiences. New meanings about the performativity of bodies at the Trevi evolve out of the stories of illusion and the sexual politics already associated with it. The four main sections employ overlapping notions of intended, retrospective, anticipatory and future memory to reflect the intertextuality between narratives already circulating Fountain images transnationally.

The attempted control of future memory, as expressed in the papal inscriptions on the monument, and the undermining of these intentions is explored before considering the retrospective invention of the art historiographical term Baroque. This style spreads into other narratives and becomes associated with the monument in the service of mass tourism. Earlier guidebooks reference the Fountain in a limited commercial context; those of the late Grand Tour indicate an expanding elitist activity around the Fountain. Again, its inherent function is to underpin prevailing discourses. Images of the monument, especially in Piranesi's *vedute*, generate anticipatory memory in travellers and non-travellers. As a literary device for poets and writers, the Fountain is available for key narrative moments. Its illusory presence now acquires new descriptors, those of darkness, moonlight, sound and silence, as if anticipating their remediation in film and advertising. Transcultural performativity in cultural memory also increases and the argument builds of the Fountain as a conduit for the flow of political power by new appropriators.

The fifth chapter, A Vehicle for Narratives: Cinema, Music, Advertising, Internet, looks at the diffusion of Trevi imagery as it accelerates due to new technologies and multiple media systems that converge in complex relations with existing media. The imagery becomes widely available yet fragmented in film, music, advertising, and on the Internet. The added ingredient is that of glamour. A selection is made in Chapter Five from the Fountain's numerous film 'appearances'. Its role in the postwar productions, Roman Holiday and Three Coins in the Fountain assists a forgetting of fascism, a contrast to its function in Fellini's later La dolce vita as satirizing consumerism. Importance is attached to his Fountain scene that expands the circulation of sexual stereotypes in transcultural memory and is continually referenced, usually for commercial purposes.

The intertextuality of the Trevi images in film, music and song applies to advertising. The myths about water and Fellini's Fountain scene become invested with new meanings as exemplified in videos promoting alcoholic drinks. The chapter builds on arguments already established, that the Trevi flow of memory and gendered

performance always relates to a contemporary context and to the exercise of power. These arguments apply to digital memory and the narratives of ephemerality that mask its underlying political discourse. The Internet as a medium raises issues about the fragmentation and repetition of memory and the implications for the inventive practices of memory. These implications are taken further in the Conclusion, on the significance of the Trevi in its contribution to an understanding of the political dimensions of memory and how its images flow across multiple media.

# CHAPTER ONE

# Historical Locations and Material Presences of the Trevi

By the middle of the eighteenth century a fountain arose which in ambition and scale transcended anything conceived hitherto. Yet it combined monumentalism with liveliness, and formality with fantasy [...] a palace dissolving into a fountain.

James Lees-Milne<sup>1</sup>

#### Introduction

The purpose here is not to write another historical account of the architectural genesis of the Trevi. It is to explore the time-place location of its images as contributory to an understanding in cultural memory of their appropriation within and across diverse media. This approach offers a context of dates, periods, construction and design that sets out an idea of the materiality of the Fountain whilst showing an awareness of the problematics of historiography. References are made throughout the thesis to events and the temporal contexts of its images. These considerations are best examined before the development in Chapter Two of a conceptual framework drawn from memory studies in which to place the Trevi. Cultural memory can be said always to have these historical components. Following the linguistic turn of the 1970s, trauma studies in the 1990s began to link critical theory with material events and this, as Ann Kaplan notes: 'implicated history, memory, and culture generally'. The term 'historical memory' in critical theory is challenging in its suggestion of a binary opposition between history as a practice which seeks to establish a discernible past and memory studies which focuses on the shaping of pasts in the present. These aspects are addressed in the next chapter.

The issues of interest in contemporary historiography can only be briefly summarized here. They concern the move since the 1970s from grand narratives about

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> James Lees-Milne, *Roman Mornings* (London: Alan Wingate Ltd., 1956), p. 138.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Ann E. Kaplan, *Trauma Culture: The Politics of Terror and Loss in Media and Literature* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2005), p. 35.

events towards perceptions of historical writing as a representational practice.<sup>3</sup> Critical attention focuses on its narratives as discursive rather than analytical. Literary artefacts with language and linguistic protocols shape the writing of history into fictions of factual representations and subjectively chosen texts render difficult an equation of 'truth' with 'fact' so that there can be no value neutral descriptions. Data and records are fragments requiring literary imagination to piece together. The Trevi is often a vehicle for conflicting historical accounts, such as the extent of Gian Lorenzo Bernini's legacy in its design and the evolving definitions of the Baroque linked with the monument. These narrative practices indicate that the practice of history is one methodology amongst others for shaping a past or pasts in the present and seeking to understand the Fountain's multivalenced nature and interpretive possibilities.

Time-space location is relevant when considering the Fountain in narratives inflected by changes in political regimes and technology. Events can produce conflictual accounts: the Trevi inaugurations, issues about design, reactions to mounting costs and the construction delays. Dominick LaCapra suggests that the historical context of the text should be explored critically and that context and text are interrelated. His approach assists with Trevi images in dated artefacts, their site, production and ongoing productivity, as seen in prints by Giovanni Battista Piranesi. This chapter explores the historical and material presences of the Trevi by concentrating on the origins of fountains; mythic water; Roman fountains and their aqueducts; former Trevi designs; spatial and etymological relations with its Piazza; other showpiece fountains; construction of the Trevi and history of the coin-throwing ritual. The account of this materiality points to the competitive nature of designs in the transmission of memory, an aspect expanded in Chapter Three on the Nicola Salvi Fountain and its images of illusion.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> See Hayden White, 'The Fictions of Factual Representation', in *The Houses of History: A Critical Reader in Twentieth-Century History and Theory*, ed. by Anna Green and Kathleen Troup (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999), pp. 214-29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Dominick LaCapra, *Soundings in Critical Theory* (New York: Cornell University Press, 1989), p. 7.

## 1.1 From Water to Fountains to Trevi

## 1.1.1 On Looking at the Trevi

For two and a half centuries the massive figure of the classical Greek god, Oceanus (Okeanos), has issued forth day and night in a shell chariot from his triumphal arch above the waters cascading over rockwork against the background of a palazzo partly masked by columns and statuary. Figures [1, 2].<sup>5</sup> His sculpted drapery swirls around his bare lower torso with one arm, staff in hand, pointing downwards to depict his control over all forms of water. Figure [3, 4]. Oceanus, whose river was believed in classical Greek mythology to encircle the earth, represents the power to sustain all forms of life. The theme of decay and renewal in the design by the architect, Salvi, is represented by erosion deliberately sculpted into the rockwork and bases of columns and by plant forms in the rockwork. Representations of Oceanus's form in water-associated settings frequently appeared across art forms in Greece and then the colonizing Roman Empire, including domestic and public fountains. <sup>6</sup> The significance of water sustenance and its symbolic forms regained attention in the Renaissance and were linked to Aristotle's concept of the self-regulating and life-giving circulation of water.

Two seahorses pull Oceanus's chariot, each led by a Greek Triton blowing a conch shell. One horse is calm, the other rearing up violently, both symbolic of the changing moods of the sea. Figures [5, 6]. Marina Warner defines a Triton as: 'a Merman, fish-tailed dweller of the deep; sportive with mermaids'. The nakedness of these half-men, half-fish, their tails glimpsed above the water, complements that of Oceanus. The forward-moving triad exhibits an idealized masculine physicality of naked power in contrast to the occasional demure display of an uncovered breast by the idealized female statues on the façade, or suggestion of breasts under their ample garments.

Oceanus is flanked on both sides by a niche, each containing a female statue. Health is on the right and Fertility is on the left, both representing the beneficial aspects of water. Figures [7,8,9,10]. Above each is a bas-relief whose style brings a visual

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Figure references are in the Booklet of Illustrations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See John A. Pinto, *The Trevi Fountain* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1986), pp. 227-33. Oceanus is a ubiquitous deity represented on fountains, for example, the sixteenth-century fountain in the Piazza della Signoria, Rome by Bartolomeo Ammannati. Often mis-named Neptune, Oceanus's power symbol is a baton, Neptune's a trident.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> 'Triton' entry, Marina Warner, *The Inner Eye: Art Beyond the Visible*, National Touring Exhibition, 1996–1997, organised by the Hayward Gallery (Manchester: Cornerhouse Publications, 1996–1997), p. 76.

prominence to their stories by projecting sculpted limbs and clothing beyond the edges. In the right hand bas-relief the peasant girl, Trivia, indicates a spring to Agrippa's soldiers at Salone near Rome that becomes the source for the Aqua Virgo aqueduct, later called the Acqua Vergine. Figure [11]. The water at her feet cascades into the lower frame. The bas-relief on the left shows Agrippa, the Roman general, supervising plans in the first century BCE for the construction of the aqueduct whose arches are in the background. Figure [12].

The Fountain façade consists of pilasters, or false decorative columns, with arches, niches, pediment and attic built onto the frontage of the palazzo behind, its windows looking through the columns. Figure [1]. Following the papal return from exile in Avignon (1308–1377), the building of public fountains was the responsibility of the Vatican until final Unification of Italy in 1870. There are three inscriptions on the Trevi, one for each of the three popes who sponsored and built the Fountain: Clement XII, (1730–1740), the commissioning patron; Benedict XIV, (1740–1758), who undertook major restorations of the Acqua Vergine conduits and Clement XIII, (1758–1769), who completed the Trevi in 1762 after its thirty years of construction.

The oblong central inscription of Clement XII under the papal escutcheon on the attic dominates: the pope involved with most of the design and building work after more than a century of Trevi gestation. Figures [1, 44]. It involved inconclusive competitions and intermittent submissions of designs, sporadic funding and controversies from the time of first commissioning by Urban VIII in the early 1600s. The Trevi was then on the east side of the Piazza and functioned as a small but powerful medieval fountain with some added Renaissance iconography. Above the main inscription of the 1762 Trevi, four female statues on the attic announce the seasonal benefits of water: the Abundance of Fruit, Fertility of the Fields, Gifts of Autumn and the Amenities of Meadows and Gardens. Topping the Trevi are two trumpeting Fames above the three-banded papal escutcheon of Clement XII. On looking at the Fountain, there is a profusion of bodies in the iconography – male and female – whose coordination alludes to hidden politics and gendered storytelling.

A major restoration in the late 1980s involved repair to stonework, cleaning and installation of new night-time illuminations that highlight the monumental brightness and clear water. The colours of the Fountain change in sun, cloud, rain or Roman afternoon thunderstorm according to the seasons and range from grey to white to blue,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See *Fontana di Trevi: La storia, Il restauro*, ed. by Luisa Cardilli (Rome: Edizioni Carte Segrete, 1991).

fading in the paleness of dusk, with its floodlit golden colour and brightly illuminated water at night enhanced by the relative darkness of the Piazza. Figure [13, 14]. When sunlit, the south-facing façade contrasts with the dark shadows cast by the nearby buildings slicing across the Piazza. Figure [15].

The moving water of fountains varies in its physical capacity to engage the senses of sight, hearing, taste, smell and touch. This engagement also depends on location, proximity and purity. The acoustics of the narrow medieval streets leading to the Trevi give advance auditory notice of the sound of rushing water magnified by the small Piazza. The sound of Roman fountains generally would have been greater in the eighteenth century due to higher pressure which meant they spouted forth more water with greater enhanced aural and visual display than twenty-first century fountains. <sup>10</sup> Conversely, the Trevi's grand flows of water are achieved through design factors which merit discussion later.

Limited proximity to the Fountain is possible by standing among the rocks on the right by the *fontanina dei fidanzati*. Figure [17]. It adds to the tension of a close yet always distanced physical, aural and visual relationship with the Fountain, a two-way process between a theatre of water and statuary with the public as audience in the circle of downward-leading steps that resembles an amphitheatre. Figure [16]. The Trevi can only retain its sensory engagement with taste in memory as its once famed pure water is now officially undrinkable. Any immersion or tasting is prohibited because of chemical treatment for incrustation from high levels of calcium carbonate salts in Roman water and atmospheric pollution. The *fontanina*, with its two upward-curving jets, is now the provider of drinking water. During the weekly clean the closed water circuit pump of the Fountain stops and the water is replaced and treated, resulting in what may be described as loss of water virginity through chemical control. Historical sources indicate earlier contamination due to papal neglect of the Vergine conduits before the sixteenth-century *renovatio romae* restoration of water infrastructure.

The material presence of the twenty-first century Trevi is one of city-managed

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Personal observations, 2009, 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Katherine Wentworth Rinne, *The Waters of Rome: Aqueducts, Fountains, and the Birth of the Baroque City* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2010), p. 222.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Luciano Belardi, 'Trattamento, condizionamento e monitoraggio dell'acqua di ricircolo e di alimentazione', in Cardilli, p. 205.

Trevi water has circulated by pump since 1937, previously by force of gravity. In autumn 2011, cleaning was on Mondays at 5am and coins collected daily, according to the cleaners' foreman.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> See Rinne, pp. 38-55.

and computer-controlled pumping, undrinkable water, pigeon deterrents, weekly removal of coins destined for charity, their theft, and police surveillance. The last major restoration in the 1980s followed the tenets of the cultural heritage industry of renovation, preservation and illumination as does the present one sponsored by Fendi. Reproductions of the Fountain as artefacts in diverse forms are on sale: souvenirs as analogues of memory. A temporary stall by the *vascone* and shops near the Piazza sell Trevi models in various styles, as do other city outlets. It is represented in pictures, prints, postcards and calendars and on mugs, glasses, plates, ashtrays, chefs' pinafores, tea towels and boxer shorts. A Trevi miniature in a glass ball containing fluid glistens in a blizzard of coloured flakes when shaken, another subversion of the function of water as sustenance.<sup>14</sup>

#### 1.1.2 From Fons to Fountain

The dependency on technology for the public display of fountains in industrial societies no longer links human activity to the primary function of water as a provider of life. <sup>15</sup> According to Norman Neuerberg, it is probable that the drinking water of our ancestors was contaminated and when some sources did not make people ill they were seen as curative; others may have been rich in health-giving minerals. <sup>16</sup> They became venerated as the dwelling place of a deity whom water-users tried to appease by placing valued items in the water. If wishes were fulfilled it enhanced the reputation of the well, or spring, and its deity. <sup>17</sup> An ancient well excavated near Lago di Bracciano outside Rome in 1852 revealed successive layers of votive objects, the topmost one of Imperial coins, then Republican money, copper nuggets, prehistoric bronze objects and finally flint objects. <sup>18</sup> The Romans honoured Fons, the Roman god of springs and son of Juturna, the Roman goddess of fountains, by throwing garlands and coins into springs or wells, a tradition absorbed by Christianity and continued into modern times. <sup>19</sup> The ritualized

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Personal observations, 2009, 2011.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Bryan Hirst traces the history of fountains over three millennia, outlining modern circuit technology in 'Fountains' (HND Dissertation, Kingston University, 1996), pp. 2-4, 7-8 <a href="http://www.waterlandsproductions.co.uk/pages/dissertation.html">http://www.waterlandsproductions.co.uk/pages/dissertation.html</a> [accessed 9 September 2013]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Norman Neuerburg, *Fontane e ninfei nell'Italia antica* (Napoli: Gaetano Macchiaroli Editore, 1965), p. 19.

Nicholas Rhea, 'Wells', p. 1-2 < http://:www.nicholasrhea.co.uk/author/archives> [accessed 27 May 2008]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Rodolfo Amedeo Lanciani, *Ancient and Modern Rome* (Boston: Marshall Jones, 1925), p. 119; Lucia Travaini, 'Il rito e le sue origini', in Cardilli, pp. 227-28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Frances Bernstein, *Classical Living: Reconnecting with the Rituals of Ancient Rome* (San Francisco: Harper Collins, 2000), p. 187.

throwing of a coin into the Trevi in the hope of controlling the future with a personal wish or for the 'guaranteed' return reshapes these remembered beliefs.

Water occupied an important position in the belief systems of ancient civilisations. In climates with limited supplies, the water of continuous springs assumed a central role in religious mythology although sacral rites were also attached to such sources in the wettest of climates. It was perceived as a gift of the gods under the care of designated divinities who dwelt at the source and ensured its quality: nymphs such as the Roman Egeria. When a spring was enclosed, perhaps by an arch form, it was later decorated with statues, mosaics and paintings. The form evolved into a nymphæum, a place dedicated to the local water deity, and became an architectural device of the Greek city inherited by Roman colonisers. Not only did it honour the deity but also enabled its owner to appropriate myths associated with the nymphæum, its source, qualities and performativity. An example is the Callirrhoe Spring in Athens two and a half thousand years ago which the ruler Peisistratus channelled to a fountain-house in the *agora*: the water issuing from the mouths of nine bronze lion heads symbolized his power and control over the life-giving substance. 22

Neuerburg warns against the linguistic legacy from Renaissance architects who re-interpreted and over-used the 'nymphæum' as a prestigious term for their many water constructions at grand villas, making 'fountain' and 'nymphæum' difficult to interpret as they became used interchangeably. One type of fountain is the *fontana a facciata* which, following Neuerburg's definition, has a history over the millennia as having its own source of water. It stands against a wall, like the Trevi, compared to a free-standing circular design as demonstrated by the Four Seasons in Piazza Navona. These designs became increasingly decorative over time.

Water and the origins of early Rome are interwoven in the narratives of its mythology. In the stories about Romulus and Remus, the Tiber ensures the rescue and nurture by Lupa, the She-wolf, of the baby brothers abandoned on its water. Rome developed as a collection of hilltop settlements in its favourable geographical location alongside the river, many with their own natural springs. Water mythology and nymphs

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> On the significance of water, see *The Oxford Companion to Classical Civilization*, ed. by Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth (Oxford University Press, 2004), p. 774.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Classical Greece absorbed water mythology from other cultures, especially Egypt and Persia. See Hirst, pp. 11-13.

The Oxford Companion to Classical Literature, ed. by M. C. Howatson, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989), pp. 111, 415. Callirrhoe is a daughter of Oceanus.

Neuerburg, p. 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ibid., pp. 73-80.

permeate the historiographical discourse on classical Rome. According to one account the goddess Egeria lived in a sacred grove belonging to a group of deities linked to water, the *Camenae* nymphs, who decided to befriend and guide the young community of Rome. The second king of Rome, Numa Pompilius, (715–673 BCE), fell in love with Egeria and visited her at night when she also gave him the principles that formed the Roman constitution. After his death she pined away and was turned into a well or a fountain. Egeria was later worshipped in association with the goddess Diana, protector of women, and the Vestal Virgins were said to draw water daily from the spring at her grove. A myth associated with Juturna is that Jupiter gave her immortality with rule over fountains, springs and rivers. The water of the Aqua Virgo aqueduct supplied her nymphæum in the Forum near the temple of the Vestal Virgins and their adjacent house. These early mythical associations of fountains with life and death, renewal and decay, and purity are carried forward in the symbolic themes of plant life and stored water in the rockwork design of the Trevi and in its iconographical statuary linked to the myths about water carried by the aqueduct.

### 1.1.3 The (In) Visible Power of Aqueducts

Aqueduct technology utilised the plentiful supply of water from springs in the nearby Colline Hills for the growing population of classical Rome and their arches and conduits crossed the Campagna plain into the city to supply public baths, canals, lakes and fountains. Their display of abundance in the *regina aquarum* resulted from a technical inability to turn off the flow of water.<sup>29</sup> The celebration of water as a demonstration of power made its functional purpose secondary, a practice continued by later papal rulers and their fountain-designers.

The aqueducts of imperial Rome were built above and under the ground. Current historiography employs the Latin meaning of aqueduct, 'a system of bringing in water', a narrative of movement rather than previous ones of inanimate stone arch structures.<sup>30</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Bernstein, p. 187.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> OCCL, p. 205. Egeria's ruined *ninfeo* is in the Parco Caffarella.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Ibid., p. 309.

Juturna's temple by the headquarters of the classical Roman water service has a well and her statue. See Bernstein, pp. 25-26 and <a href="http://sights.seindal.dk/sight/323-Spring-of-Juturna.html">http://sights.seindal.dk/sight/323-Spring-of-Juturna.html</a> [accessed 22 January 2010]. *L'Acea (L'Azienda comunale elettricità ed acque)* is modern Rome's water board, owned by the municipality, private and institutional investors.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Trevor A. Hodge, *Roman Aqueducts and Water Supply* (London: Duckworth & Co., 1992), p. 6

p. 6.
 Information from Nadiya Midgley, University College London (2008).

The shortest aqueduct, the Aqua Virgo with its source at Salone, had little power due to a shallow rate of fall and kept cool as it was mostly underground until it reached the northern city walls. The Emperor Augustus's most powerful general, Agrippa (63–12 BCE), constructed the aqueduct to feed his newly developed Campus Martius area near the Pantheon and the Thermae Agrippae, a vast bathing establishment with an outdoor pool. The aqueduct first flowed into Rome on 9 June 19 BCE, according to Sextus Julius Frontinus, the water commissioner for Rome. Its inauguration, he writes in *De aquis urbis Romae* about eighty years later, coincided with the Feast of Vesta, virgin goddess of the hearth and of water. Six Vestal Virgins constantly attended a 'living flame' at her temple in the Forum where there was no cult statue: the eternal flame was the symbol. The safety of the city was believed to depend on the flame and purity of the Vestals. The new aqueduct and its water, through its association with this religious belief and the timing of the event advertised the power of Rome and its rulers.

In his *Natural History*, Pliny the Elder represents early first-century Rome as a rapidly expanding city with hundreds of splendid wells and fountains credited to Agrippa, many of them magnificently adorned with marble or bronze statues and marble columns. Pliny cites his source as the work written by Agrippa to commemorate his aedileship: a narrative device of perpetual self-promotion.<sup>34</sup> At each terminus of an aqueduct was a *castellum* or distribution tank behind a decorative nymphæum or fountain that fed other water features as well as public and private dwellings. It is unknown if there was a grand terminal fountain for the Aqua Virgo in the Campus Martius, further on from the Trevi, but it seems highly probable and can be imagined from the ruins of the Aqua Iulia fountain on the Esquiline Hill.<sup>35</sup>

Ernest Nash, *A Pictorial Dictionary of Ancient Rome*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (London: Thames & Hudson, 1968), pp. 429-33; *OCCC*, pp. 21-22. Agrippa's constructions made Rome the *regina aquarum*. Sextus Julius Frontinus, 'Dies quo primum in urbe responderit, quintus idus Iunias invenitur', *De aquis urbis Romae: The Aqueducts of Rome* [97 AD], revised parallel trans. by C. E. Bennett (London: William Heinemann Ltd, 1969), pp. 350-51, of Clemens Herschel's translation, *Frontinus and the Water Supply of the City of Rome* (New York: Longmans, Green & Co., 1913), p. 15. In 1429, the humanist scholar, Poggio Bracciolini found a12<sup>th</sup> or13<sup>th</sup> century transcription of *De aquis* at Monte Cassino, of a 4<sup>th</sup> or 8<sup>th</sup> century manuscript, Herschel, 'Introduction' and p. xix.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Bernstein, pp. 3, 115; *OCCC*, p. 761.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Pliny, *Natural History*, VIII, XXXVI, 24, pp. 121-23, in *Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from the Sources*, *Rome and the West*, ed. by William Stearns Davis (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912–1913), II, < http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/pliny-natuhist-rome.html> [accessed 15 October 2013] (third extract)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> See Pinto, *The Trevi*, pp.18-19; Henry Canova Vollam fully covers each aqueduct, *The Waters of Rome* (London: The Connoisseur and Michael Joseph, 1966; 2<sup>nd</sup> edn published as *The Fountains of Rome*, 1970).

Reference is frequently made by fountain historians to Frontinus's account of the myth about the discovery of the spring for Agrippa's aqueduct.<sup>36</sup> He claims that:

Virgo appellata est, quod quaerentibus aquam militibus puella virguncula venas quasdam monstravit, quas secuti qui foderant, ingentem aquae modum invenerunt. Aedicula fonti apposita hanc originem pictura ostendit.

[It was called Virgo because a young virgin girl showed certain springs to soldiers searching for water and, when they followed these up by digging, they found a copious supply. A small temple in a place near the spring contains a painting which illustrates this origin of the aqueduct.] <sup>37</sup>

Frontinus makes the association between virginity and purity of water; also the change from past to present tense implies a narrative presence at an existing temple. His mention of a temple depiction showing how the water was found links the deity's approval to the aqueduct construction and it gains the sanction of the gods. Frontinus's story of the virgin girl and the water source is one selected from many myths by official culture for a bas-relief interpreting the story on the 1762 Trevi. Additionally, his use of statistics in *De aquis* presents the Aqua Virgo as provider of the largest volume of water for public uses and structures in the city, an image of power and economic profitability which is appropriated by later political regimes in the architectural design of the Fountain.<sup>38</sup>

## 1.1.4 Shaping of Water in the Roman Cityscape

The flowing form of fountain water can be categorized as the rising jet, the cascading fall, or a combination of these two.<sup>39</sup> Modern fountains often take the shape of a curtain of water that rises and falls with coloured illuminations.<sup>40</sup> Rising jets of water are found in geysers and the spray of ocean waves whereas cascading fountains relate to waterfalls, rivers, rapids, streams and springs, the word 'fountain' deriving from the Latin *fons* or spring.<sup>41</sup> The Trevi has a main falling cascade, with secondary cascades

<sup>39</sup> Hirst details categories of fountain flows and pumping systems, pp. 4-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Amongst others on Frontinus: Cesare d'Onofrio, *Le fontane di Roma* (Rome: Staderini Editore, 1962), p. 225; Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Frontinus, pp. 350-51. Translation assisted by Guido Giglioni, Warburg Institute, University of London (2007).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Frontinus, Table 3, p. 486.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Marilyn Symmes has illustrations in *Fountains: Splash and Spectacle: Water Design from the Renaissance to the Present* (London: Thames & Hudson, 1998).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Fons, fontis (masc.) spring, source, water; (fig.) origin, fountainhead; fontanus (masc. adj.), fontana (fem. adj.), Collins Latin Dictionary & Grammar (Glasgow: HarperCollins Publisher, 1997).

and small jets among the rocks that keep the water turbulent to mimic the ocean. Its combination of falling and rising jets illustrates all forms of water display in nature.

The flow of aqueduct water to the Fountain is weak due to the gentle gradient from its low-lying source. Its powerful display results from the architectural contrivance of a long cascade and its other water displays falling into the *vascone* sunk below ground level. It was probably more spectacular at times due to difficulties in controlling water pressure before electric pumping and calmer at others when its conduits were damaged or water siphoned from the aqueduct. The historical context of solving water flow problems is that of hydro-technology skills established in Italy. *Fontanieri* experts in ornamental water mythology and the required hydraulics for its manifestations had been leaders throughout Europe during the Renaissance in the art of spectacle. The origins of their work filtered through memory across millennia from classical predecessors, and in Latin and Arabic manuscripts by Alexandrian physicists and mathematicians. <sup>42</sup> An influence from the mid seventeenth century was the widely-read and translated *Les Raisons des forces mouvantes* on water illusion by Salomon de Caus, the peripatetic fountain-builder and hydraulics engineer who also worked in Italy. <sup>43</sup>

Rome has maintained its association since classical times with the building of fountains. Many well-known ones are in squares where locals and tourists gather round them as in the Piazza di Trevi, Piazza Navona and the Piazza di Santa Maria in Trastevere. The recent Fountain of the Acquedotto Alessandrino (2005) by Cristina Tullio in the Piazza Romana near the Parco di Tor Tre Teste has multiple rising and falling jets illuminated by different colours at night when it is backgrounded by the floodlit aqueduct arches. <sup>44</sup> Figure [18]. The Fountain at the Ara Pacis Museum by Richard Meier (2006) has multiple upward jets and a repeating waterfall effect.

Throughout Rome the small *nasoni* drinking fountains display their ownership in the acronym SPQR, *Senatus PopulusQue Romanus* [the Senate and the People of Rome]. Some fountains assume significance like the eroded talking statue of the god, Silenus, nicknamed *il babuino* because of his ugliness. Satirical comments attached to his statue in post-Reformation papal Rome would be answered by another popular talking statue, sometimes Marforio, and became known as *pasquinati*. The Trevi has

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Simon Schama, *Landscape and Memory* (New York: Knopf, 1995), p. 277.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> See Caus's technical designs in *Les Raisons des forces mouvantes* (Paris: Chez Hierosme Droüart, 1624).

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.0galenet.galegroup.co.catalogue.ulrls.lon.ac.uk/servlet/MOME?dd=0&locID>[accessed 3 April 2010]</a>

<sup>44 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.comune.roma.it">http://www.comune.roma.it</a> [accessed 15 October 2011]

also been employed for similar political comment. <sup>45</sup> *Il babuino* disappeared during the Unification era as many Roman fountains have done over time to reappear, be relocated, or sometimes vanish permanently. <sup>46</sup> Its removal meant the lost opportunity for critical political comment but the talking statue reappeared later in the fashionable street now named after him, reduced to silence again by the anti-graffiti surface behind the god. In the Rome of moving fountains, that have been likened to *ballerine*, the Trevi also changed sites within its piazza, assumed different shapes and functions and was threatened with relocation. <sup>47</sup> Further instability of place suggests itself in contestual images implicated by the etymological derivations of 'Trevi'.

#### 1.1.5 What's in a Name and a Place?

Unlike most Roman piazzas with fountains whose names differ, for instance, *la barcaccia* in the Piazza di Spagna, the Trevi takes the name of the place that evolved into the Piazza di Trevi. A piazza is the most architecturally recognisable feature of an Italian city and a metonym for public space where people can gather and in this respect Fountain and Piazza images interweave by sharing the same name. <sup>48</sup> There has been much debate on the etymology of 'Trevi', perhaps the most sensible proposal being a derivation over the centuries from *trivium* and then *tre vie*. <sup>49</sup> Three streets, the *trivium* of classical Rome, probably underlay three later streets which converged on the space where a medieval fountain was constructed. John A. Pinto chooses *Via delle muratte*, *Via del lavatore* and *Via della stamperia* which recall the trades of masons, washerwomen and printers, whereas for Armando Schiavo they are *Via Poli*, *Via dei crociferi* and also *Via delle muratte*. <sup>50</sup>

There are speculations that 'Trevi' derives from the three spouts of the medieval Fountain or, as Schiavo believes, from its location in the 'Trevi' or 'Treve' quarter or

<sup>46</sup> The Ponte Sisto fountain has a history of removal, vanishing and reappearing. See Morton, *Waters*, pp. 172-76.

<sup>47</sup> Francesco Venturi and Mario Sanfilippo, *Le fontane di Roma* (Silvana Editore, 1996), pp. 135-46.

<sup>45</sup> See thesis, p. 98.

Eamonn Canniffe defines the piazza as a rhetorical device for controlling populations and enhancing the power of rulers, *The Politics of the Piazza: The History and Meaning of the Italian Square* (Ashgate: 2010), p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Armando Schiavo, *La Fontana di Trevi e le altre opere di Nicola Salvi* (Rome: 1956), p. 66.

*rione*. <sup>51</sup> Giorgio Vasari called the Fountain 'Trievi'. <sup>52</sup> Another possibility is a derivation from Trivia, the name possibly first given by a seventeenth-century essayist to Frontinus's maiden. <sup>53</sup> Cesare D'Onofrio's speculation ranges geographically and historically to include Roman dialect variations of the medieval and sixteenth-century Latin place name of *trivium*, 'Treio, Treyo, Treggio, Tregli (e lo Treglio), Treo, Trevi', and names of villages and sites near the Salone spring. <sup>54</sup> A recent claim to the etymological truth comes from Matthew Sturgis who argues that 'Trevi' is the derivation of a place name near Salone from the ancient Italic word, *trebium*, meaning homestead or hamlet. <sup>55</sup>

Moreover, Trivia is a name given to the goddess Diana, worshipped at a shrine where three roads met or crossed whence she derived her title 'Trivia' from *trivium*. <sup>56</sup> The Roman Diana, as a force for good, contrasts with the Greek goddess Hecate, a force for evil, who was worshipped where one road met another. <sup>57</sup> She is sometimes represented in triple form, perhaps looking along three roads. High up on the corner by the present day gelateria is one of Rome's many shrines of the *madonne agli angoli delle strade*, supported by two angels, who also gazes along the three roads. Figure [19].

Partially visible from the Piazza on the left side when facing the Fountain, is the church of Santa Maria in Trivio, the latter word being the modern spelling of *trivium*. In the medieval era *trivio* indicated the three liberal arts: grammar, discussion and rhetoric. The later meaning of *da trivio* applies to 'down and out' people who live on the street: a woman at a crossroad, *una donna da trivio*, is *una donna di strada*. <sup>58</sup>

The word Trevi shifts about linguistically: Frontinus's anonymous peasant girl becomes Trivia; three roads are layered upon a possible *trivium*; images of the medieval Fountain show three outlets; there are the Trevi *rione*; a homestead at Salone; many dialect variations with the letters 'tre'; a nearby church with a similar name, and a term

<sup>52</sup> Giorgio Vasari, *Le Vite* [1568], 2<sup>nd</sup> edn, ed. by Gaetano Milanesi (Florence: Sansoni, 1878), p. 208.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Schiavo, p. 66.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Joannes Chifletti (1697) in *Thesaurus antiquitatum romanorum*, ed. by Joannes Georgius Graevius (Publication details: Lugduni Batavorum, early 1700s), 4, cols. 1785-94 (col. 1788, para. 2).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> D'Onofrio, *Le fontane*, pp. 228-29.

Matthew Sturgis, *When in Rome: 2000 Years of Roman Sightseeing* (London: Francis Lincoln, 2011), ref. p. 178. D'Onofrio, *Acque e Fontane di Roma* (Rome: Staderini Editore, 1976), p. 530; *Le fontane*, p. 229.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> *OCCL*, p. 187-88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Ibid., p. 261.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Nicola Zingarelli, *Lo Zingarelli minore: vocabolario della lingua italiana* (Zanichelli, 1994), p. 1041.

describing poor street people. The phrase for street corner prostitutes challenges the myth of a classical goddess of crossroads as the protector of women. The word 'Trevi' attached to the Fountain leaves an evolving etymological issue that accords with the multivalency of its images. Linguistic possibilities surrounding its origins circulate in the merging of name and place and acquire significant resonance in the number 'three' of film and song ('Three Coins in the Fountain' and the song of the same name) and in Fountain design, as seen in Chapter Five. There is further instability of place surrounding notions of the Trevi in the revolving and evolving clusters of images built in the fountain imaginary of designers, as Chapter Three explores, and also the number of material fountains that have taken the name of Trevi.

### 1.1.6 How Many Forms of Trevi?

Following cyclical decline and restorations, the Aqua Virgo survived the end of the Roman Empire due to its proximity to the city and mainly underground conduits. Longer aqueducts with more overground arches were more easily destroyed by invaders, earthquakes or neglect. The restoration in the eighth century terminated the Aqua Virgo in the present Piazza di Trevi, and the first known Fountain was built there to serve the drinking and work-related needs of northern Rome. These functional requirements replaced the classical water displays of the Campus Martius and the medieval edifice became essential as the city expanded.<sup>59</sup>

City government was responsible from the mid fourteenth century for maintenance of the Trevi in the *rione* of the same name, and the papacy undertook design changes, renovation and construction. The division of labour applied to all fountains until Unification in 1860–1870 when the papal contribution ceased. According to Francesco Venturi and Mario Sanfilippo, control of water display promoted papal authority over civic authority in showpiece fountains like the Trevi: 'le mostre terminali sono compito esclusivo della massima autorità civica e i pontefici ne avocano a sé la costruzione, proprio per sottolineare la signoria papale, indiscussa dalla fine del XIV secolo. Rinne describes a more conflictual context both local and international, of the Vatican eroding civic dominance over public infrastructure to regain power lost during the Avignon years during which period the city authorities had

61 Venturi and Sanfilippo, p. 47.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, pp. 5-27. Agrippa's engineers turned the conduit westwards at the Piazza and may have pre-determined a fountain location here.

<sup>60</sup> Rinne, p. 38.

taken over fountain works.<sup>62</sup> There was a need for the Vatican to counter the prestigious Ottoman restoration of the water supply in Constantinople after neglect by its former papal rulers.

The Fountain inaugurated in 1762 is the present form of the Trevi, its earlier manifestations existing only as images in maps, woodblock prints, copper engravings, sketches, city records and diary entries. 63 These imagined edifices each had a terminal castellum, settling tank and distribution point for other fountains, purgatoio basins for wool-making and *lavatoio* troughs for laundry, with a drinking facility for humans and animals. 64 They metamorphosed, over more than a century of abandoned or delayed projects and restorations, into the 1762 Trevi. An early representation of the medieval Trevi is on Taddeo di Bartolo's map of Rome (1414) showing three spouting outlets. <sup>65</sup> The placing of the image amongst the key topographical representations of monuments of Rome indicates its functional significance until the Acqua Felice and its mostra, or showpiece fountain, was built in 1587. Leon Battista Alberti, assisted by a papal architect, Bernardo Rossellino, was partly responsible for the small scale alterations to the medieval Fountain in 1453, according to Giorgio Vasari. 66 The art historian claimed to be gathering material for a revised and enlarged edition of his popular Le vite de' più eccellenti pittori scultori ed architetti (1550). He mentions the inscription and coat of arms: 'la fonte in sulla piazza de'Trievi [sic], con quegli ornamenti di marmo che vi si veggiono, ne'quali sono l'arme di quel pontefice e del popolo romano.'67 A woodcut print of the Alberti Trevi in a 1643 Franzini guidebook represents it as a crenellated castellum with three spouts pouring into a basin. <sup>68</sup> Figure [20]. The city government's arms, bearing the legend SPQR, flank the papal escutcheon on both sides at a slightly lower level with the larger pontifical inscription beneath. The dominant papal symbolism is a possible visual comment on the conflict between the city authorities and the Vatican seeking to restore control over the water supply.

The endeavours of papal regimes from the mid sixteenth century onwards for about two hundred years sought to endow Rome with a water distribution system of

62 Rinne, p. 41.

<sup>63</sup> Detailed in Chapter Three.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Rinne, p. 171.

Some 15<sup>th</sup> to 18<sup>th</sup> century maps showing the Trevi are in Pinto, *The Trevi*, Figures, 15, 18 (Taddeo di Bartolo), 19, 24, 25, 28, 31.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Vasari, pp. 538-39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Ibid., p. 539.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> About this time Bernini started demolishing houses to enlarge the Piazza for his Trevi.

aqueducts, water pipes, drains, sewers, conduits and fountains. The work on the city's infrastructure in the early seventeenth century resulted in street widening to improve access to the papal summer residence of the Palazzo del Quirinale. It stimulated plans for a grand new Trevi *mostra* at the foot of the hill with Gianlorenzo Bernini as architect for the commissioning pope, Urban VIII. Sketches and engravings depict the new Fountain with unfinished foundations and large basin at its relocation from the east to the north side of the Piazza<sup>69</sup> Figures [21, 22 and 23].

Pinto observes that the re-siting in the early 1640s changed the urban and political relationships of the Trevi compared to its earlier location which faced the city and was hidden from the Quirinale. Bernini demolished houses behind the old site to improve the view from the hilltop palazzo so that his Trevi became spatially linked to a papal gaze from the attic of the Quirinale towards the Piazza, across the top of the Fountain westwards to the Vatican; the attic could also be seen from the Piazza. The new physical orientation endorsed papal supremacy over a fountain that was no longer visually connected to its city but to its ruling elite. A photographic image (1986) shows the trumpeting Fames amongst the rooftops in a view from the Quirinale, the presidential palace since Unification, the Vatican on the horizon. In 2011 the highest part of the attic could still be glimpsed from the Piazza, flying Italian and European Union flags. Figure [24]. The relations of power have changed from religious to secular in the exchange of gazes.

The unfinished Bernini Trevi was demolished in 1732 by Salvi in order to build the present Trevi on the same site for Clement XII. The papal view of the Fountain acquired a local dimension in the power struggles between Clement XII's family, the Corsini, and the Conti, another pope-producing family who lived in the Palazzo behind the Fountain. The munificence of the Corsini pope seemingly resulted in a large, grand *fontana a facciata* but this covered the entire frontage of the Conti building, removed some of the fenestration and directed the occupants' views through Salvi's columns and redesigned windows onto their competitor's water. The design was approved ahead of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Explored as narratives of art in Chapter Four.

Pinto, The Trevi, p. 43.

Dorothy Metzger Habel, *The Urban Development of Rome in the Age of Alexander VII* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), p. 61, citing her photographic source as Bruno Brizzi, Antonio Casanova and Gemma Cortese di Domenico, *Il Palazzo del Quirinale* (Rome, 1986), Fig. 39, p. 144. The Trevi attic is still visible, according to a Quirinale attendant and a *cuirassier* during the thesis writer's visit: the Quirinale attic was closed for restoration (2011).

Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 134. The palazzo houses the *Istituto nazionale per la grafica*, a museum of graphics and pictorial images of Rome for exhibitions, research and data bases.

Conti plans for a new Trevi and took away most of their control of the Fountain and placed it in Corsini hands. Salvi remodelled the windows so that each storey has its own style; the windows, usually shuttered, signify a potential for opening to offer glimpses of life in the Palazzo. Four windows were lost behind the statues and bas-reliefs. The Corsini papal escutcheon and trumpeting Fames atop the monument possibly added to the irritation of living behind a noisy Trevi. Rather than Forsyth's 'palace dissolving into a fountain' described in this chapter's epigraph, the Fountain as a site of conflict undermines the intended spectacular 'billboard' for Corsini advertising. Salvi's design established a discourse of architectural contestation in a climate of political struggle between powerful Roman families, both of whom wished to possess a Trevi Fountain.

Like all *fontane a facciata* the Trevi is not a free-standing monument but, unlike most façade fountains, it has an independent forward-projecting central group of Oceanus with the Tritons and seahorses above rockwork. Use of a façade on building frontages was an architectural deception already used throughout Rome and is seen in Michelangelo's design two centuries earlier for the Palazzo dei Conservatori in the Piazza di Campidoglio.<sup>73</sup> The fontana a facciata concept was utilized on a grand scale for the Trevi and is visibly part, yet not part, of the Palazzo behind it. The two sides of the disjunction are potentially touchable (but not with police present) as the Fountain is flanked by narrow streets, another reason it appears abruptly in its setting and is afforded a dramatic quality. The Salvi Trevi, like its two *mostre* predecessors the Paul V and Moses, is a *castellum* pumping station with a large façade. The key differences lie in an architectural design productive of visual tension by frontage against the wall of an occupied palazzo, now a museum and suggestive of new hidden performativity and by a design interwoven with politically charged connotations. Like the two earlier *mostre*, the physical emergence of the Trevi promulgated papal power in European politics but it became more powerful both as image and as monument.

# 1.2 Material Power: Building the Showpiece Fountain

## 1.2.1 Three Papal Billboards

At the time of constructing the Trevi (1732–1762), papal Rome was competing in European power stakes without its own army, colonies or a trade-based economy

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Salvi intended to continue the façade by wrapping it round the corners, as in Michelangelo's design. Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 191.

against emergent nation states possessing these resources. The church militant had replaced itself with a pan-European power structure influencing these states to act on its behalf during its transition into an organization of art-glorifying papal princes.<sup>74</sup> Christopher Johns observes that the early Counter Reformation papacy was forced: 'to become more subtle in its attempts to have a decisive impact on European politics, and to this purpose the institution turned to art, culture, and scholarship as vital components of the pontifical strategy'. 75 One aim of the Council of Trent (1545–1563) was the reinvigoration of architecture to regain ground lost to Protestantism. In this Catholic context some key monuments were built, like Bernini's Fountain of the Four Rivers and the Trevi, which presented as pagan in concept whilst masking the propaganda intentions of the papacy. The Salvi Trevi belongs to the final phase of its grandiose building programmes exploiting the built environment of public architecture for propaganda and its iconographical theme of water and nature reflects contemporary questioning during the Enlightenment about scientific issues that also reached Rome. The historical events in which the papacy was involved before and during construction include the Wars of Spanish Succession (1701–1714), the last Crusade of the Holy League in the early eighteenth century and the end of the Seven Years War (1756– 1763), although the idea of a grand Trevi had a lengthier gestation.

Alexander VII (1655–1667) had called upon concepts of theatre and stagecraft to bolster the image of Rome and the Church within the European arena. The ambitious objective was celebration of the city as cultural capital to accommodate pilgrims as well as Grand Tour travellers with a taste for historical and contemporary architectural drama. His family palace in the larger and grander Piazza Colonna, a few streets away from the medieval Trevi, was proposed as the more appropriate setting for a new Acqua Vergine *mostra*. Carriages and admiring pedestrians could then circulate in a display of *grandezza* in the open space around a large fountain. In this further instance of instability of place implicating the future Trevi, the scheme was to replace the existing small Colonna fountain and build a *mostra* incorporating the column of Marcus Aurelius. The Acqua Vergine's water had been used as a precedent of such glorification

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Christopher M.S. Johns analyzes the changing role of the papacy in using art as a tool of diplomacy in *Papal Art and Cultural Politics: Rome in the Aged of Clement XI* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1993), pp. 192-95.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Johns, p. 23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Habel, pp. 2-3.

Hellmut Hager, ed., cites Chigi Codex (H, 11, 22), folio 223, Vatican Library, in Exhibition Catalogue, *Architectural Fantasy and Reality: Drawings from the Accademia nazionale di San Luca in Rome, Concorsi clementini, 1700-1750*, V, *Concorso clementino of 1706* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University, 1982), p. 54. The three fountains in the large Piazza Navona vie for attention with stalls, street artists, crowds and shops.

by Bernini's Four Rivers in the Piazza Navona which siphoned off large amounts of the slow-moving water. <sup>78</sup> It increased the flow for the design aesthetics of rushing water over rockwork but reduced the amount at the terminal *castellum* of the unfinished Bernini Trevi and decreased its display potential. The Four Rivers was effectively the aqueduct's showpiece fountain for almost a century and the grand new Trevi existed only in images of unexecuted designs.

Large fountains played a significant part in papal endeavours to improve the Roman water supply and restore some aqueducts. <sup>79</sup> There had also been a burgeoning of fountains in a cityscape of display in which the wealthy who built a private fountain were required to build one for the city. The new underground water piping and fountain outlets also required surface structural improvements of new pavements and roads to protect them and enable access. Architecture, urban design and planning culminated in a phase of fountain building that benefited the late arrival of the new Trevi. 80 On the other hand, the public fountains may have shone out in a context of dirt, ruins and detritus. Challenging the perceptions of spectacle and salubrity, Maurice Andrieux describes a culturally atrophied eighteenth-century Rome. 81 It is a city of contrasts, sumptuous palaces and slums, lethargy, and a high murder rate, its inhabitants living on the handouts of a Church dependent on contributions from Catholic Europe, a city rife with papal nepotism and decaying monuments as well as new projects. Andrieux makes an exception for its fountains; all are 'a delight'. There are flashes of 'Baroque brilliance' like the Trevi Fountain and the Spanish Steps yet the streets are filthy, vagabonds roam and the Tiber is full of rubbish. 82 It could be said that political expediency at home and abroad and the emulation of the fountain politics of papal predecessors were factors in the creation of the first three showpiece fountains whose spectacle magnified the cityscape of contrasts.

The Moses and the Paul V *mostre* were constructed in the late sixteenth and early seventeenth centuries. Like the Trevi, their façades front unseen modern pumping stations where their aqueducts terminate and onward piping feeds other fountains: the legacy of the classical *castellum* design. Other *mostre* are the Fountain of the Naiads (1901) in the Piazza della Repubblica, the Fountain of the Nuova Acqua Vergine

<sup>78</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 49.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Rinne, p. 219.

In 1594 the Aqua Vergine supplied about thirty public fountains; by the mid seventeenth century about fifty more were fed by renovated or new aqueducts. See Rinne, p. 4.

Maurice Andrieux, *Daily Life in Eighteenth Century Papal Rome* (London: Allen & Unwin, 1968).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Ibid., on fountains, pp. 20-21.

(c. 1800s) on the slopes of the Pincian Hill overlooking the Piazza del Popolo, and the Fountain of the Heroes in the Piazzale degli Eroi inaugurated by Mussolini (1940), none of which is a *fontana a facciata*. Increased water consumption by the city since the mid twentieth century is met by reservoirs. The Trevi and the later Nuova Acqua Vergine on the Pincian Hill, continue to feed, amongst others, fountains in the Piazza del Popolo, Piazza della Rotonda and the Piazza Colonna as well as street fountains like le tartarughe, il facchino, la barcaccia and il babuino. The water for the Trevi still arrives through its original and frequently restored conduits from its Salone source, rediscovered in the mid 1500s. 83 The vast Piazza del Popolo has a central obelisk fountain visually disconnected from its peripheral fountain architecture, the bulk of the Pantheon dwarfs the obelisk fountain in the Piazza della Rotonda and the relatively small Piazza Colonna fountain fails to compete with the Marcus Aurelius column. The design and iconography of these fountains resonates with the practice of power. Yet none is linked like the Trevi to the political mythology associated with the aqueduct: the young girl who demonstrates a spring of pure water to the soldiers of Agrippa and whose aqueduct supplies it for the glorification, leisure pursuits and health of Augustan Rome.

The first papal *mostra*, the Fountain of Moses in the Piazza San Bernardo, was constructed between 1587 and 1588 by Giovanni Fontana and Domenico Fontana after restoration of the Acqua Felice provided the expanding metropolis with additional water. Figure [25]. It also supplied new fountains for the Capitoline and the Quirinale Palace. 84 Three outlets gush into a small basin beside a pavement and busy road. The monument is in a row of buildings on a large piazza with traffic pouring round the car park in the centre. The fountain's central arch contains a squat figure representing Moses draped in a toga, his attire and biblical presence at variance with the design concept of the pagan nymphæum which in turn competes with the Catholic inscription. As the two lateral arches flanking it are of equal size they fail to accentuate Moses as triumphal. Each contains a sculpted relief of biblical mythology, Aaron leading the Israelites to water and Joshua taking them across the Jordan with dry feet. The oversized papal inscription relative to the monument, topped by a prominent crucifix, dominates with its self-promoting declaration of the munificent provision of water.

The second *mostra*, the Paul V on the Janiculum Hill, known as *la paolina*, was built between 1611 and 1612 by Giovanni Fontana and bears the pope's name as a statement of ownership in his inscription. Figure [26]. It was the largest edifice in the fountain building programme of the early 1600s and enabled many new papal fountains

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Rinne, p. 22.

Morton lists the fountains, *Waters*, p. 127.

to be built, for example, in St Peter's Square and the Vatican Gardens where the water supply was poor until the restoration of Trajan's aqueduct for the Paul V. The large vascone and open central arch design were added later by Carlo Fontana who also submitted designs for the Trevi. 85 Like the Moses and the Trevi, it has recently been brightly restored. Water flows through five small cascades in lower arches just above the vascone and the rushing water from the pumping station is uncannily visible through the statue-free open central arch that reveals the overgrown garden behind. 86 Water punctuates its façade architecturally and dominates the minimal iconographical decoration so that the fountain emphasizes its own technological presence as a powerfully functioning deliverer of water. The central arch is flanked on either side by an empty arch of identical size and these are each flanked by an empty smaller one. The design echoes the Moses with its three equally-sized arches and a dominant papal inscription with a crucifix atop. In its lofty but peripheral location west of the Tiber, in a park setting of spatial openness and without a piazza, the Paul V is on a less frequented tourist track. The main road runs round the vascone, confining visitors either to its brim or the pavement opposite where the panoramic city view competes for attention and requires turning away from the monument.

In summary, the Moses and Paul V fountains are not the central focus of place. Simon Schama includes the two fountains in his comments on seventeenth-century hydraulic endeavours that: 'as ensembles of stone, light and water remained inert [...] fountains [that] sat importantly on their Roman hills, devoid of any real kinetic animation [...] Together they all spoke of authority, not mystery'. <sup>87</sup> The stories told by the two *mostre* are of ideological power through the controlled shaping of water in fountain form. They share the propaganda endeavour of the Trevi but differ in their compromised designs, locations and conflicting associations (or lack of them) with water mythology. Unlike the Trevi, they do not attract multiple interpretations, nor do they set markers in the popular imagination due to iconographical inconsistencies. <sup>88</sup> The Trevi is constantly renewed in the storytelling of water-associated myths through its display of water power and co-ordinated iconography in a small piazza.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> A selection is in Pinto, *The Trevi*, pp.78-86.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Personal observation, 2009.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> Schama, p. 289.

A story about the Moses statue is that his sculptor, Prospero Antichi, committed suicide because of papal criticism and public reception as a laughable figure. See Morton, *Waters*, p. 129.

Another contrast between the Trevi and all the other Roman *mostre* is its present location in a pedestrianized zone. Previously people and vehicles mingled as they had near the earlier forms of the Fountain. A duel at the Bernini Trevi between two noblemen after they had tried to overtake each other's coach resulted in house arrest by papal police. <sup>89</sup> The location of the Trevi in a small piazza has always allowed for the performative aspects of place whatever the traffic arrangements. In the 1970s there was a zebra crossing between the shops and the *vascone*. <sup>90</sup> The present traffic-free area facilitates an interpretation of a theatre with an audience seated on the steps and milling behind, or of a classical amphitheatre. The Fountain seems potentially in a more spatially connected relationship with its present audiences in the absence of traffic yet is perhaps more distanced by the deceptive offer that is still a denial of accessibility.

## 1.2.2 Deceptive Presences and Absences

According to Robert Harbison, Bernini's architectural domination of early 1600s Rome used up most of the available building space in the centre so that any successor had to fit a design into a smaller or awkwardly shaped location to become an 'imaginer of grandeur'. The Piazza di Trevi remained one of these small areas even with Bernini's demolitions. His new site and Fountain filled the gap between the two wings of the Conti's Palazzo overlooking the Piazza but the *palazzo-fontana* outcome, when a building dominates a fountain, meant the spatial limitations of the site could not be used to grand effect. The constraining factor disappeared when the building acquired a continuous flat frontage covering its side of the Piazza and made a *fontana-palazzo* possible. The challenge of its large size in a small setting could then be utilized to make visual impact an outcome of spatial limitation.

As noted earlier, Salvi seeks to dominate the Palazzo through his design. The entablature appears to run behind the half-column pilasters giving an illusory three-dimensional effect. This is contrasted and emphasized by the forward stance of Oceanus as he emerges from the only triumphal arch on the Fountain to exercise his power over water. Figure [3]. By rebuilding and enlarging the *vascone* at a lower level, Salvi had created a strong fall of water for his project that would otherwise have been compromised by the weak flow of the aqueduct. The architectural adaptations of a small

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> The Moderate Intelligencer, Burnley Collection (date unclear; possibly 27 January 1648).

Herschel Levit, *Views of Rome: Then and Now* (New York: Dover Publication, Inc., 1976), Figure 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Robert Harbison, *Eccentric Spaces* (Cambridge, MA: The Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press, 2000), p. 72.

place containing a display of water power creates an illusory location which commences with auditory anticipation in the narrow streets, followed by visual surprise upon sudden arrival in front of the water spectacle.

The Fountain took thirty years to build before entering the service of its patrons: the frequent victim of erratic papal financing sources which included taxes and the lottery. The basins for wool-making and laundry at the old Trevi had been demolished by Bernini who constructed a separate basin for washerwomen at his re-located site in front of the palazzo. Puring construction of the Salvi Trevi the laundry was moved to a new fountain nearby at the foot of the Quirinale hill. Visitors on the Grand Tour and those who gathered in Rome for the famous annual Carnevale could see a grand, worker-free Trevi gradually emerging as a modern edifice in keeping with aspirations for a cityscape with a consciously reinvented classical style of architecture. Alternatively, the visitors might see a Rome of striking contrasts between wealth and poverty emphasized by beautiful fountains. The architectural style of these would be designated many decades later as 'Baroque', the term frequently associated with the Trevi in art historiographical and travel narratives and amongst the many descriptors that attach themselves to the Fountain, which the later chapters of this thesis explore.

The architectural details of the Trevi now do not look far removed from Salvi's winning design (1732). <sup>94</sup> Figure [27]. Some iconographical details differ since Health and Fertility now stand where Salvi intended to place statues of Agrippa and Trivia. Their bas-reliefs do not feature in the design but are represented on a scaled-down working wooden model made about the same time for Salvi by Carlo Camporese. <sup>95</sup> Decades of competitions and other design submissions for successive popes variously included the city's goddess, Roma, and obelisks, columns or views through the central arch like that on the Paul V. The illusory connotations of these designs and their interweaving in cultural memory are a focus of Chapter Three. Salvi told a story on his Fountain of global and local water mythology, a story of the power and control of moving water that employed the concept in accord with papal endeavours to further their power at home and abroad. His philosophical intentions as expressed in his

\_

<sup>95</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, Figure 128, p. 176.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Rinne, p. 171.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Ibid., p. 176.

Born in Rome (1699), Salvi was a poet and member of Rome's literary societies, then a philosopher and mathematician, and finally architect; apprenticed to Antonio Cannevari (former architect to a Portuguese king and then Clement VI). See Hereward Lester Cooke, 'The Documents Relating to the Fountain of Trevi', *The Art Bulletin*, 38 (1956), 149-73 (p. 157). Salvi's other work lacks the grandness of the Trevi; for details, see Schiavo.

writings and *Ragioni filosofiche* on the iconography for the Fountain are held in State and Vatican records along with records and payments of the work undertaken before and during construction. <sup>96</sup> Chapter Three details how Salvi followed papal design requirements to cover the Palazzo frontage and to represent ancient religion. <sup>97</sup>

One source mentions Salvi calling the Fountain his *unicogenita*. His dedication to its construction probably caused his increasing ill-health and early death in 1751 due to continual work on site. A caricature depicting a bent figure by the artist, Pier Leon Ghezzi in 1744, seven years before Salvi's death, mentions his health in the handwritten text beneath: 'e sta molto male'. Figure [28]. The architectural commentator, Francesco Milizia, observes that working in the damp conduits weakened Salvi's delicate health so he became disabled by paralysis and fever. These images of an ailing architect whose illness was caused by the unhealthy structures of the Acqua Vergine contrast ironically with its myths that tell of water purity and with the wording of the main papal inscription, supervised by Salvi, which pronounces the aqueduct's water as 'salubritate' [giving healthy benefits].

In addition to the powerful water flow created by hydraulic design, the technological necessity for a large amount of rockwork symbiotic with aesthetic design generates another deceptive presence. The stone boulders provide additional ballast on top of an unseen wide trench filled with heavy stones to act as a balancing weight against the unstable wall of the Palazzo behind. The wall was leaning backwards away from the Piazza due to hasty construction by the Contis who intended

The Salvi documentation was cross-checked in Pinto, *The Trevi*, D'Onofrio, *Acque*, Cooke, and Cardilli who cite sources as: Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale Roma (cod. V.E. 850 for a 1740 letter to Cardinal Corsini and memorandum on Trevi design), Archivio dello Stato di Roma (for money spent), and the Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana (Cod. Vat. Lat. 8235 for Salvi's *Descrizioni* and *Ragioni filosofiche*).

Pinto's Appendix 1 is mainly referenced in this thesis for construction records, Appendix 2 for Salvi's writings, *The Trevi*, pp. 261-78, 279-86; Cooke translates the *Ragioni filosofiche*, 169-71, quoted in Pinto, *The Trevi*, pp. 220-23. Also see D'Onofrio, *Acque*, pp. 584-93 and *Le fontane*, pp. 263-69; Cardilli, pp. 232-35. She cites D'Onofrio, *Acque*, for Archivio dello Stato di Roma documents on construction work under 'Presidenza degli acquedotti urbani, 1728-1753', pp. 239-43.

<sup>97</sup> Thesis, 3.2.1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> 'la solea chiamar egli la sua unicogenita' appears in a defence of Salvi's design for publication, possibly attributable to his brother, Luigi Salvi (Pinto, email 14 April 2013), Biblioteca Apostolica Vaticana, Cod. Vat. Lat. 8235 (1762), fol. 12 verso (1986 location). See Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 220.

Francesco Milizia, *Memorie degli architetti antichi e moderni, Opere complete* [1768], 9 vols (Bassano: 1785), 5, p. 335. He describes Salvi as: 'di cuor sincero, di buona legge, di spirito vivace, e reflessivo.' p. 336.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> See Pinto, *The Trevi*, pp. 172-89 for construction details; Cardilli, p. 205.

to build their own Trevi on the same site ahead of the Corsinis. Changes to the content of the iconography occurred after Salvi's death and before the final inauguration in 1762: the goddesses Health and Fertility that replaced Agrippa and Trivia and also the three-tiered replacement of the continuous cascade caused by damage during installation of marble statues. The monument was constantly 'on the move' in its early physical manifestations, a sign of future restorations and plans to alter its surroundings.

#### 1.2.3 Later Constructions: Piazza and Plans

The building practices associated with the Trevi relate to other edifices in the Piazza and medieval streets nearby adding diverse architectural designs to historical memory. The church of SS Vincenzo and Anastasio was built in the Piazza by Martino Longhi *il giovane* in 1650 for use as the Quirinale parish church and depository for papal viscera. Salvi's four centrally placed Ionic style columns echo five short classical columns with Ionic decoration on a building opposite the Fountain. These were removed in medieval times from ancient Roman monuments and used for its porticoes until bricked in due to papal disapproval of the performances deemed unsuitable in its shadowy recesses. <sup>101</sup> In 2011 the columns formed part of the shop front of a store belonging to United Colours of Benetton, the physical layers of contemporary commodification interwoven with the legacy of Greek decorative design, physical traces of classical Rome, and the political planning decisions of the Vatican.

The Hotel Fontana, also opposite the Fountain and previously a convent, accommodates tourists in the former cells of nuns. From a film history perspective, a shop to the right of the Fountain is where Audrey Hepburn has her hair cut in *Roman Holiday* (1953). 102 Just off the Piazza is the church of Santa Maria in Trivio, re-built in the sixteenth century on the sites of earlier religious edifices. A few streets away in the opposite direction is the renovated Trevi Cinema, now the Cinema Sala Trevi 'Alberto Sordi', named after the famous actor who died in 2003. As part of the Cineteca Nazionale, with library and research facilities, the Sala Trevi hosts new work as well as borrowing from the National Film Archive. On display in the basement are the ruins of the Vicus Caprarius, a street or quarter of imperial Rome served by the Aqua Virgo, which were uncovered during renovation of the cinema.

1

Richard Krautheimer, *Rome, Profile of a City 312-1308* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980), pp. 277-78.

Roman Holiday, dir. by William Wyler (Paramount, 1953). See Chapter Four.

Urban planning has always influenced physical accessibility to the Piazza di Trevi. Its topographical layout, as mentioned earlier, reflects a pattern of roads converging on the residential and work area that relied on the medieval Fountain. Bernini's Trevi resulted from the opening of roads to the Quirinale and the need for a grand Fountain. Expansion programmes in the late eighteenth century then left the Piazza in an urban backwater, the latest *mostra* spectacle not on display as intended. The location escaped plans to correct this aspect and match the size of the space surrounding the Fountain to the aspirations of successive rulers for restructuring the *centro storico*: projects driven by cycles of imperialist posturing.

The idea of the Trevi as the centre of a traffic hub emerged in a project (1813) by the architect Giuseppe Valadier during the Napoleonic occupation. The proposed demolition of buildings around the Piazza was to create a larger area for horse-drawn vehicles. In the post-Unification era, Piazza and Fountain featured in plans for a new road leading to the Pantheon and a *galleria* radiating out from the nearby Piazza Colonna, with suggestions once more to relocate the Trevi there. The *passaggio coperto* concept of the commercialized *galleria* had already found expression in Milan, Naples, Genova and Turin and, in the context of Rome as the new capital city of Italy, political elites sought to acquire status through architectural display.

For the ambitions of fascism, the Trevi was proposed as a traffic hub that would display the classical in the service of *romanità* and require demolition of the buildings in front. The reconfigured fascist ingredient, possibly deriving from the Valadier plan, was the circulation of large scale motorized traffic. Narrow medieval streets were incompatible with movement, noise and machinery, key tenets of fascism and the contradiction materialized in what is now termed the *sventramento* of vast areas of the historic city centre in order to install highways depicting *grandezza*, like the Via dell'Impero. Leading architects for the regime planned 'una rettifica di fronte' for the

Galleria Colonna 1872–2003: Una storia nel cuore di Roma, Exhibition Catalogue (Rome: Museo di Roma, November 2003– January 2004), pp. 17, 23, 29.

Ferdinand Boyer, 'Le Panthéon et la Fontaine de Trevi dans les projets romains de Napoléon', *Études Italiennes*, 1 (1931), 210-16 (pp. 214-15). The project was abandoned as were many of Napoleon's other grandiose plans for the city.

Details of *Il piano regolatore* (1931) and the planned demolition around the Trevi are detailed by Antonio Cederna, *Mussolini urbanista: Lo sventramento di Roma negli anni del consenso* (Rome, Bari: Laterza & Figli Spa, 1980), p. 80 and Figure 23, p. 146.

Spiro Kostof, *The Third Rome: 1870–1950, Traffic and Glory*, Exhibition Catalogue, (University Art Museum, Berkeley, 1973), pp. 8-22.

Piazza di Trevi with 'nuovi alzati architettonici' and a 'leggiadro portico' in place of the medieval one. 107

The 1762 Fountain was at risk from the fascist perception that ancient structures were useful to retain as an expression of empire but not those from the recent past of the 1700s onwards. Monuments could be seen as 'an asset, a hindrance, and a challenge' and many edifices that did not promote fascism disappeared during the fast pace of the *sventramento* in the 1920s and 1930s. <sup>108</sup> Jeffrey Schnapp observes that the regime produced: 'an aesthetic overproduction – a surfeit of fascist signs, images, slogans books, and buildings – to compensate for, fill in, and cover up its forever unstable ideological core' which made these camouflaging media more than instruments of propaganda and social control. <sup>109</sup> The plans for the Trevi feature in this ideological context as a subject of debate in articles with the rejection of proposed changes to its spatial surroundings appearing to come from conservative elements in fascist architectural groups. <sup>110</sup>

The impact of Salvi's design that consciously employs spatial awareness of the closed-in characteristics of the location has been preserved but the efforts to change these emphasize the unpredictable futures of famous monuments with propaganda potential. Whilst political regimes planned new futures for the Trevi, performances of ritual behaviour with their unknown mythical origins spanning millennia began to take place in and near its water. These performances have their own historical memories: of sipping Fountain water, smashing drinking glasses, lighting candles and, above all, of throwing coins.

## 1.2.4 Receptacle for Wishes: Coincidental Ritual

'Se a Roma vuoi venir fra poco tempo butta un soldo qua dentro e vai contento' is a local refrain identified in 1949 about a guaranteed quick return by purchasing control of the future through the mediation of the Fountain.<sup>111</sup> Before coin-throwing became

. .

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Cederna, p. 80.

Kostof, p. 22. A parallel can be drawn with Napoleon III's Haussmanisation of Paris.

See Jeffrey T. Schnapp, 'Epic Demonstrations: Fascist Modernity and the 1932 Exhibition of the Fascist Revolution', in Richard J. Golsan, ed., *Fascism, Aesthetics and Culture* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1992), pp. 1-37 (p. 3).

Arturo Bianchi, 'La Sistemazione di Piazza Trevi', outlines the issues (in response to another article, 'Per salvare Piazza di Trevi'), in *Capitolium*, 9 (December 1925), 563-71. <a href="http://www.periodici.librari.beniculturali.it/visualizzatore.aspx?anno=1925-1926&id\_imma=1925

Citation by Travaini, 'Il rito' from Elledici, 'Pesca "miracolosa" a Fontana di Trevi', *Quotidiana* (9 September 1949), in Cardilli, pp. 227-28 (p. 227).

established, a ritual of making a wish when sipping its water from the hand evolved in guidebooks and articles during the latter part of the nineteenth century, as interpreted in an 1873 print for the French newspaper, L'Illustration. Figure [29]. 112 Three figures in dress of the period stand by the *vascone* rim, the man sipping water from the hand of an elegantly-dressed woman with her female companion looking on.

The Baedeker travel guides of 1869 and 1879 mention that: 'the superstitious partake of the water of this fountain, and throw a coin into the basin, in the pious belief that their return is thus ensured. 113 For the 1909 edition 'the superstitious' were again described as taking a draught of water and performing the coin ritual. 114 By 1930, the advice is amplified to take the water and then throw 'a coin backwards over the head into the basin'. 115 As water-sipping is now prohibited, the ritual exists only in the narratives of contemporary guidebooks and travel writers, and in prints as for L'Illustration. Another ritual no longer performed is the smashing of new glasses at night after lovers drink water in them from the fontanina, a ritual that also offered a guaranteed reunion. 116 Figure [17]. The small fountain may have attracted another night-time ritual of lighting candles in its recesses. 117 Darkness and illumination as narrative ingredients enhance the suspension of disbelief and are associated with the literary, filmic and commercial performances at the Trevi, as will be noted. Gaston Bachelard claims there is a powerful association lent by images of water to ritual in the fluidity of cultural imagination; water can be envisaged as clear, reflective, bright, cleansing, dark, deep and violent. 118 The power expresses itself in the rituals of sipping from hands, smashing of glasses, drinking water at night, the fire of candles it can potentially destroy, and the throwing of projectiles like coins that sink.

Whilst coin-throwing in the Fountain may have started in the late nineteenth century by design or by chance, it is a reshaping of ritual behaviour across millennia as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> L'Illustration, 4 January 1873, source confirmed, Mary Evans Picture Library (email, 30 September 2011). The identification here of the artist's signature as Helen Paterson is highly probable, according to Tom Schaefer, Helen Allingham [Paterson] Society (email, 7 October 2011). Article still untraceable.

Karl Baedeker, Handbook for Travellers: Central Italy and Rome (Coblenz: Karl Baedeker; London, Williams & Norgate; Paris: Haar and Steinert, 1869), p. 114; ibid., 1879 edn [n.p.] [n. pub.], p. 145 <a href="https://www.archive.org">https://www.archive.org</a> [accessed 15 September, 2012]

Baedeker, *Handbook*, 15<sup>th</sup> edn (London: Allen & Unwin, 1909), pp. 184-85.

Baedeker, 16<sup>th</sup> edn (London: Fisher & Unwin, 1930), pp. 204.

<sup>116</sup> Morton, Waters, p. 85.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>117</sup> R. Wünsch, 'Der Abschied von Rom an der Fontana di Trevi', in *Strena Helbigiana* (Lipsia: 1900), pp. 341-46 (p.341). Translated for thesis by Peter Willig, independent translator (2012). Gaston Bachelard, Water and Dreams: An Essay on the Imagination of Matter [1942], trans. by Edith R. Farell (Dallas: Pegasus Foundation, 1983).

an act of appearement by throwing coins into springs or wells inhabited by deities. 119 It may also have been coincidental that the afore-mentioned 1852 excavation at Lago Bracciano had revealed layers of coins. 120 The pagan rituals suggest the taking over of Trevi space by the people using it and a challenge to the intended Christian propaganda.

The appearance of the coin ritual is analyzed in 1900 by the aptly named R. Wünsch [Wish] who claims the late nineteenth-century German community of visiting artists, writers and archaeologists in Rome started throwing a coin over the shoulder with the back to the Fountain on the evening before leaving the city. 121 Wünsch describes myths and customs of turning away from locations of water deities whilst making an offering to avoid punishment for catching sight of them. The ritual centres, he suggests, on the Trevi and its nymph as the latest expression of the tradition, so as not to know where the symbolic wish landed. Romans laughed at the practice, he continues, and it may have had local origins, but was probably contrived by German academics with awareness of ancient rituals, or could have started by chance with a tourist throwing a coin. 122 The solemn evening ceremony was intended to dissipate the pain of departure from Rome the following day by guaranteeing a return, to replace Goethe's 'ohne Hoffnung der Rückkehr' [without hope of returning]. 123

The coin, says Wünsch, must be a soldo of the last pre-Unification pope, Pius IX, as a link to pagan religious coin offerings; one with the king's secular image rendered any wish ineffective. 124 The advantage of coins is they sink immediately and convince the donor the offering is accepted. Wünsch concludes that the several interpretations he details are all possible. They add to the multivalency of the Fountain: the coin-throwing ritual has local origins; the ceremony develops after contemporary excavations; the German community builds a new myth on past ritual, or it starts by chance at the Trevi, and the ingredient is added of night-time as an enhancer of the impact of the illusory performance. The Catholic ideology explicit in the German ritual performance of throwing a papal soldo contrasts with the practices of mass tourism when coins of many denominations are thrown into an array of water receptacles. 125

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Bernstein, p. 187.

Lanciani, Ancient and Modern Rome, p. 119; also Travaini, 'Il rito', in Cardilli, pp. 227-28.

Wünsch, p. 345. This style is followed in *Three Coins in the Fountain* (1954).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>122</sup> Ibid., p. 345.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Ibid., p. 342.

Ibid., p. 342.

Diverse locations are observed by the thesis writer, from garden centre fountains to ends of piers. The coin-free British Library Fountain had the temporary presence of one from a predictable source (2008).

The act of coin-throwing seeks to establish a tactile link by proxy between monument and participant, as at all wells and fountains where similar ritual performances take place. Yet once thrown, the material object is instantly lost to touch and present only in its absence: it achieves the opposite effect of distance and is lost amongst others, adding to the inaccessibility of the seemingly accessible Fountain. Coin-throwing could be read as a collective gesture tailored generationally and personally for the individual thrower:

I'd been told when I was younger that's what you do if you throw money into a fountain. Any fountain, even wells, I was told. If you drop money into water you had to do it with your back to the water. But that was something I'd learnt as a little girl. So I did it. 126

The Trevi became the place 'to be seen' in the postwar decades for film stars, politicians and celebrities who paid obligatory visits and threw in coins, mostly with their backs to the water. Amongst the many visitors were Miss Australia (1950), President Nixon (1957) and the English model, Sabrina (1958).

The ritual performance has sometimes been undermined by throwing the coin haphazardly or with intent to steal or harm; sometimes other objects are thrown: 'si possono osservare i ragazzini che cercano di recuperare quel che hanno gettato i turisti compreso anche qualche bottone.' During restoration in the 1980s many of the thousands of coins thrown each day were intentionally aimed at the people working on the monument and the façade was damaged. The sparkling coins in the clear water are visually on offer and have encouraged the illegal removal of the money destined for Caritas, the Roman Catholic charity:

there was uproar in 2002 when newspapers reported that an officially unstable man by the name of Roberto Cercelletta had been conducting dawn raids of the fountain for more than 30 years and netting up to  $\[ \]$ 500 [sic] a day. He used to have a lie-in on Mondays, allowing the Caritas team to wade in.  $\[ \]$ 130

CCTV was installed in the Piazza to prevent further theft. In 2003 a court ruling determined that coins were voluntarily discarded so removal by the public did not count

Lonely Planet, Best of Rome, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (Footscray: Australia, 2004).

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>126</sup> See Interview, Appendix One, 'Remembering the Trevi Fountain: Personal Stories', p. 247.

<sup>127 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.europeana.eu</a> has Trevi photographs, pictures, films and videos; also <a href="http://www.archivioluce.com">http://www.archivioluce.com</a>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Attilio Battistini, *Villeggiatura alle fontane di Roma, con 9 disegni di Domenico Purificato* (Rome: Trevi Editore, 1979), p. 15.

Travaini, in Cardilli, p. 228.

as theft. *La Repubblica* reported in 2005 about four official Trevi money collectors who had siphoned off large amounts for themselves. <sup>131</sup> In 2011, Cercelletta, also known as D'Artagnan, re-surfaced with his 'musketeers' to claim their rights to the Trevi proceeds. <sup>132</sup> It followed exposure by an *Italia 1* television documentary of their continued plundering with the alleged complicity of the police. New legislation followed that made unofficial removal of coins illegal. They are, along with their symbolic wishes, now the property of the city with their collection administered by Caritas. The act of throwing is now a form of financial transaction with the authorities; a simultaneous challenge yet endorsement of *Senatus Populusque Romanus* as the Trevi is funding AIDS care and food for the poor. A further irony is that the money distributed by a Catholic aid agency is raised from pagan ritual.

A pre-euro analysis of the coins revealed a large number of foreign denominations as if the power of wishes might be enhanced by matching coin and nationality of the thrower. Recent estimates in euros vary:  $\[ \in \] 3,000 \]$  a day,  $\[ \in \] 14,000 \]$  a week, or  $\[ \in \] 80,000 \]$  a month. In the context of global economic problems the Trevi's earnings in 2012 were perhaps indicative of hopes for improved personal finances. The value of the euros thrown in was 20–30 per cent higher than in 2011, more than expected after the anti-theft legislation. Is

Coin-throwing practices are fluid and recent references suggest extension of the Fountain's wish-granting ability: one to return, two for marriage, three for divorce. Also, only a few metres away from its water, the railings of SS Vincenzo and Anastasio are the physical props of the new performative activity of *lucchetti d'amore*, padlocks whose keys started being thrown into the water in early 2009. Figure [30]. The authorities removed them; new ones appear and disappear. There are numerous credits for the origins of the ritual which is a global phenomenon. One claim is that it started in

Numerous uploads on <a href="http://www.youtube">http://www.youtube</a> [accessed 10 June 2012]. There was already a by-law forbidding entry to Roman fountains.

Luigi Tomasuolo, 'Le monete da Fontana di Trevi donate dal comune di Roma alla Croce rossa italiana', in Cardilli, pp. 230-31.

<sup>134 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.whatsonningbo.news.com">http://www.whatsonningbo.news.com</a> [accessed 12 May 2011];

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/">http://www.telegraph.co.uk/news/</a> [accessed 12 May 2011]; 'The Greatest Capitals of the World' series, 'Rome', ITV, 22 April 2010.

James Bone references official statistics, 'Lucky fountain coins it in as cameras stop thieves taking a dip', *The Times*, 25 July 2012, p. 30.

Matthew Sturgis, *When in Rome: 2000 Years of Roman Sightseeing* (London: Francis Lincoln, 2011), p. 247; former official Trevi guide, Gilberto Vallauri (2009); Francesco da Mosto, *Italy: Top to Toe*, BBC4, 29 August 2013 and Pinto's film, *Trevi* (1988).

Personal observations, January 2009, November 2011. The railings arrived in 2008 according to Pinto (email, 22 September 2011).

Italy with Federico Moccia's book, *Ho voglia di te* (2004) in which the lovers lock a padlock onto the third lamp-post on the Milvio Bridge and throw the key into the Tiber, a ritual promoted by the film of the same title and included in video promotion clips on the Internet. As Romans and tourists came to mimic a performance of (in) fidelity, stall holders selling padlocks and chains arrived and also thieves looking for scrap metal. The city authorities started removing the metal ware as railings and lamp posts bent and collapsed and the collective expression of love personalised by individually tailored padlocks, like the coins of the Trevi with their incontestable 'locked in' futures, became symbolic wishes for removal.

Myths have their own historical memory in which their interpretations evolve and those circulating around coins became linked to a wish to create a future through the mediation of the Fountain. The action of the individual coin-thrower shapes a future perfect memory, momentarily different, the performance belonging to a shared social practice surrounding the fulfilment of wishes. As the following chapters note, it has become associated with commodified romance in cultural memory; the nineteenth-century reshaping of a timeless ritual practice anticipates the appropriation of the Fountain for marketing purposes.

In bringing to a close the exploration of the locations and material presences of the Fountain, it can be seen that these components implicate history, memory and culture. Reference is made throughout the thesis to events and the temporal contexts of texts and myths surrounding the monument. It is a vehicle for historical accounts that reflect changes in ideology and technology: the aqueduct built by Agrippa brings a myth of virginity into Augustan Rome, and the 1762 Trevi replaces its medieval functional form to convey papal propaganda in a display of power and spectacle. In Aleida Assmann's words, 'not only fictive events create myths but also historical events in their transformation into collective memory.' 140

1.

Dir. by Luis Prieto (Warner Brothers, 2007). Promotional videos show padlocks, and a key thrown in the Tiber <a href="http://www.hovogliadite.it">http://www.hovogliadite.it</a> [accessed 21 December 2012]. In Florence keys were thrown into the Arno from the Ponte Vecchio. On the Cinque Terre coastal footpath between Manarola and Riomaggiore keys of padlocks on railings by the Via dell'amore were thrown in the sea. <a href="http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Love\_padlocks">http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Love\_padlocks</a> [accessed 14 February 2011]. Padlocks are reported on the Pont Neuf in Paris.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;In Rome, a New Ritual on an Old Bridge', <a href="http://www.nytimes.com">http://www.nytimes.com</a> [accessed 15 January 2009] typifies media coverage. The ritual appears to occur world-wide.

Aleida Assmann, 'Transformations between History and Memory', 75, 1, *Social Research*, (Spring 2008), 49-73 (p. 68).

This chapter indicates that historical representations contribute to an understanding of the Trevi in cultural memory when references are made to events, dates and periods as well as its material construction. The small Piazza and large Fountain possess a mutually enhancing spatial relationship produced by Salvi's hydraulic skills, his deceptively powerful design and also his iconography that conveys gendered storytelling. The Trevi becomes a place of performance in the form of ritual behaviours involving material objects which have their own sociocultural history.

The Fountain is conceptualized as a vehicle for the narratives of ideology throughout the thesis. Since the earliest plans for its construction, and presaged in the myths associated with its aqueduct, the Trevi has been used as a host for multiple narratives across media and, without according it human agency, has arguably shaped related discourses in turn. The foretaste given by this chapter of the plurality and diversity of its images indicates the need for a flexible conceptual framework for remembering the Fountain, which is undertaken in the following chapter.

## CHAPTER TWO

# Approaches to Memory: A Fountain for Conceptual Flexibility

Depending on its circumstances and point in time, society represents the past to itself in different ways.

Maurice Halbwachs<sup>1</sup>

No memory can preserve the past. Cultural memory works by reconstructing, that is, it always relates its knowledge to an actual and contemporary situation.

Jan Assmann<sup>2</sup>

Memory is active, forging its pasts to serve present interests.

Susannah Radstone and Bill Schwarz<sup>3</sup>

#### Introduction

As an area of increasing interest throughout Western societies in recent decades, the so-called 'memory boom' generally attaches significance to a past perceived as contrasting with a turbulent present. Terrorism, warfare, genocide and famine, alongside commodification and rapidly changing technology including the Internet, provide a global context for contemporary perceptions of a present characterized by impermanence. The opening up of issues left dormant, repressed or unanswered reflects the limitations of grand historical narratives on slavery, the conduct of wars, the Holocaust, diasporas and colonialism.

Memory has emerged internationally in this context as a flourishing field of debate and study across a range of academic disciplines with contributions from literature, architecture, film and media studies, history, cultural geography, politics,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Maurice Halbwachs, *On Collective Memory* [1925], ed. and trans. by Lewis A. Coser (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992), pp. 172-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Jan Assmann, 'Collective Memory and Cultural Identity', trans. by John Czaplicka, *New German Critique*, 65 (Spring 1995), 125-33 (p. 130).

Radstone and Schwarz, eds, *Memory*, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> See Radstone and Katherine Hodgkin, 'Introduction', in *Memory Cultures: Memory, Subjectivity and Recognition*, ed. by Radstone and Hodgkin (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006), pp. 1-22.

philosophy, the visual arts, sociology, psychology, and the sciences. Since the 1980s it has functioned within what is usually referred to as an interdisciplinary framework, at conferences, in publications, journals and explicitly in the names of the growing number of memory study centres.<sup>5</sup> It is often noted that memory studies is difficult to define because of its multiple discourses and shifts of meaning in the borrowings from disciplines such as neurology, psychology, sociology, and linguistics. Many of these are addressed throughout this chapter in which the borrowings are seen to inform a productive conceptual 'mix'.<sup>6</sup>

The conceptual designations attached to memory are numerous and include: cultural, collective, individual; personal, private, public; forgetting and remembering, renewal and loss; a palimpsest; repressed, screened, traumatic, contested, postmemory, nostalgic; also as fragmented, unreliable, fictitious, ritual and, more recently, episodic, transcultural, travelling, mediated, remediated, and multidirectional. Recent trends that are useful for exploring the Trevi seek a fluid and heterogeneous methodology, offering transnational contexts 'where history, culture and memory are complementary and intersecting'. The term transnational is taken here to mean the dynamics of memories as a process moving transmedially between cultural, social and national borders. 8 The concepts of transnational and transcultural overlap in memory studies. The title of this thesis refers to the transcultural performance of the Trevi. Transculturalism is understood as looking at memory from a global perspective which challenges previous concepts that only discrete or homogeneous cultures or social groups are bearers of memory within national borders; memories are mobile, histories are co-implicated and 'most locales are deeply transcultural'. <sup>9</sup> The turn towards transcultural methodology in memory studies reflects a similar trend in the humanities and social sciences.

\_

Overlapping and interwoven theoretical strands typify the nature of the field of memory

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> For example, in the UK (2013): Centre for Research in Memory Narrative and Histories, University of Brighton; Centre of Media, Memory and Community, University of Gloucester; Centre for the Study of Cultural Memory, Institute of Modern Languages Research (formerly the Institute of Germanic and Romance Studies), University of London; Centre for Memory Studies, Warwick University, and The Memory Network, University of Roehampton. ACUME, Bologna, is a pan-European endeavour. Other European projects are mentioned later.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Michael Rossington and Anne Whitehead 'Introduction', in *Theories of Memory: A Reader*, ed. by Rossington and Whitehead (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2007), pp. 1-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Information leaflet, IGRS (2011): IMLR *Cultural Memories* publications promotion (2014).

<sup>8</sup> Soc Ingrid Fell on forms of mediation (Permanhering agrees Time, Space, and Cultures).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> See Ingrid Erll on forms of mediation, 'Remembering across Time, Space, and Cultures: Premediation, Remediation and the "Indian Mutiny"', in *Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural Memory*, ed. by Erll and Rigney (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2009), pp. 110-38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> See the dialogue entry by Michael Rothberg in *The Transcultural Turn: Interrogating Memory Between and Beyond Borders*, ed. by Lucy Bond and Jessica Rapson (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2014), pp. 31-33 (p.32).

studies, perhaps an appropriate reflection of its subject. How these concepts afford theoretical spaces for the images of the Trevi Fountain is the focus of this chapter.

The aim in Part One is to offer a critical overview of conceptual approaches which leads towards proposing a memorial space for the multivalent interpretive possibilities of the Trevi. Part Two then draws on the overview to place the Fountain in a fluid theoretical framework. Later chapters consider the cultural ways of remembering through this critical lens: the diverse interpretations of the Trevi from the classical to the Baroque and the modern in the narratives of art, literature, film, music, advertising, and the Internet. The subject of the thesis invites a cross-disciplinary perspective to allow for the movement, plurality and diversity of images.

## Part One: An Overview: Theories of Memory

In the search for a framework, the overview considers contributions from Walter Benjamin and Aby Warburg in the early twentieth century of traces from the past in the present; Sigmund Freud's concepts of memory including the 'screen' in the same period; the 'linguistic turn' originating in the 1960s and 1970s and the implications of poststructuralist thought for memory studies in subsequent decades; the re-discovery in the 1980s and continuing influence of Maurice Halbwachs's work on collective memory from the 1920s and 1950s; Pierre Nora and memory sites in the late 1990s; trauma theory and its contribution to the growth in memory research; the work of Paul Connerton on ritual performance and Michel de Certeau on spatial relations; LaCapra's accommodations in the memory and history debate, Marianne Hirsch's stress on agents and specific contexts; and Marita Sturken's view of cultural memory as an active and inventive social practice. 10 Theoretical elements from these approaches are absorbed into present research trends related to performative, transcultural, multidirectional and digital memory that allow for a cross-disciplinary framework. Also of key significance for the Fountain is the return to critical discourse of monuments and memorials in debates about their new dialogic and transnational dynamics.

However, the overview of memory studies is not meant to suggest that concepts of memory develop along a timeline. They are presented here as interwoven strands of several chronologies converging, diverging and intersecting. Space and time do not permit following theories of memory from Aristotle (the object as an analogue of

1

 $<sup>^{10}\,</sup>$  References are given as each theory is discussed.

memory) through to modernity, or the legacy of the spatial metaphors used by Locke (the 'storehouse') and Hegel (the 'pit') which surface for instance in Nora's memory sites and Certeau's places and spaces discussed later.<sup>11</sup>

## 2.1.1 Presently Surrounded by the Past

For Warburg and Benjamin, whose work is produced in the context of the early decades of the last century, the symbolic past lives on around us and is discoverable. It informs historical understanding as the present is haunted by the past. Their critical work overlaps and differs. <sup>12</sup> Benjamin's concept of traces involves material and social aspects and the possibility that historical activity can be recovered and recorded, as he sees a direct correspondence between trace and actuality. By digging into the minutiae of historical traces, the implication is that the first sediment of a memory layer can be discovered. Memory is retained by objects not just humans. Traces can also be repressed by societies but remembered, for example, in ritual movements. Thus memory works through mimesis and indexicality: through mimicking and recording. Mimesis is demonstrated through the body's imitation of acts once essential to survival, such as stone-age drawings that form the memory of the hunt. Such practical activity is repressed in later societies but the discoverable traces remain. Photographs are an indexical form because the object leaves traces on film and paper. In Benjamin's terms, they catch the moment and transport it into the future and the object has to be, or have been, in the world for a trace to be possible: an object speaks through its traces. 13 Recovery of their historical meaning might come in a sudden moment of recognisability, or be analysed and filtered in a more deliberate manner. Benjamin conceptualizes traces as possessing an after-life in the historical imagination, in the symbolic margins of the imaginary past that exist outside the individual, waiting to be discovered. In his words, 'Geschichtliches "Verstehen" ist grundsätzlich als ein

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> The histories of memory theory, including the classical perspective, are discussed by Rossington and Whitehead, p. 4, and Jennifer Richards, also in *Theories of Memory*, pp. 20-24. 
<sup>12</sup> Christian, J. Emden compares these in "Nachleben": Cultural Memory in Walter Benjamin and Aby Warburg', *Cultural Memory: Essays in European Literature and History*, ed. by Eric Caldicott and Anne Fuchs (Bern: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 209-24.

Walter Benjamin, 'A Small History of Photography', on <a href="http://traumwerk.stanford.edu:3455/MichaelShanks/1164?view=print">http://traumwerk.stanford.edu:3455/MichaelShanks/1164?view=print</a> [accessed 24 November 2008], p. 243; also, 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction', *Illuminations*, trans. by Harry Zorn, ed., with Introduction, by Hannah Arendt (London: Random House, 1999), pp. 211-43 (pp. 219-20).

Nachleben des Verstandnen zu fassen.' ['Historical "understanding" is to be grasped, in principle, as an afterlife of that which is understood']. 14

In contrast, material details are of central importance for Warburg in finding the past in cultural manifestations. The use of *Kultur* in his early twentieth-century sociocultural context is different from its present usage which also encompasses the popular and the everyday and not only the dominant forms which Warburg's *Kultur* implies. This also applies to Benjamin's perception of culture, accompanied by his frequently expressed disdain for modernity. Changes of vocabulary reflect changes of direction in discourses of memory. Warburg's concept of a *Nachleben* is the past in the present through continuous transmission of material images up to the present day. His illustration is *Nympha*, the mythological young woman who appears variously across the centuries as Venus, Fortuna, Flora, Victoria, Chloris and other deities in classical Greek and Roman art. The following passage illustrates Warburg's use of her image as a metaphor for continuity in the transmission of symbolic transformation:

on a Greek sarcophagus the motif of the nymph appears as a mænad killing Pentheus; on a wall-painting in Pompeii, the nymph is personified by Medea; on [sic] Botticelli's Primavera, she returns as personification of spring; she is present on a wide range of seventeenth- and eighteenth-century paintings; in the twentieth century, the nymph is the central figure on a French postage stamp, a female golf-player on an advertisement for a local golf club in Hamburg, and she finally appears on a sheet of toilet-paper with the name 'Hausfee'.<sup>17</sup>

Issues arise from Warburg's and Benjamin's work regarding the past. The image awaiting discovery depends on the differing abilities of researchers. Also, the concept of *Nachleben* suggests a point in time when 'death' of the originating image occurs and 'after-life' begins but there is no allowance for the dynamics of onward transmission and gaps and discontinuities. However, the questioning of earlier theoretical positioning has its own contextual framing, an instance being the frequent criticism of Halbwachs's work on generational memory, for later discussion.

Benjamin and Warburg pay attention to the details of cultural expression and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Benjamin, *Passagen-Werk*, in *Gesammelte Schriften*, 5, ed. by Rolf Tiedemann and Hermann Schweppenhäuser (Frankfurt am Main: Suhrkamp, 1991), pp. 574-75, cited and translated in Emden, "Nachleben", p. 213.

Observed by Liliane Weissberg, *Cultural Memory and the Construction of Identity*, ed. by Dan Ben-Amos and Weissberg (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1999), p. 16. Emden, "Nachleben", p. 214.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Aby Warburg, *Ausgewählte Schriften und Würdigungen*, ed. by Dieter Wuttke, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (Baden-Baden: Korner, 1980), trans. by Emden, in "Nachleben", p. 215.

representation and to their manifestations in symbols and tradition but they offer different approaches to an after-life of symbols: for Benjamin as sudden moments of comprehension in the historical imagination and for Warburg as onward transmission in *Kultur*. <sup>18</sup> The value of their work for memory studies lies in the connection between past and present in traces and, significantly, of memory that can lie outside the individual. Nora would go on to suggest that there is a two-fold nature to historical memory: the material inscribed in space, time, language or tradition which also has a life of its own. Benjamin's and Warburg's further significant contribution to memory theory concerns the disjunction between original intentions in the production of images and their interpretations in the present. They bring memory out of the biological framework in the late nineteenth and early twentieth century of a racial memory and into a cultural one, which is a starting point for discussion of Halbwachs's concept of a collective past.

## 2.1.2 Sharing the Memory

Memory perceived as a social phenomenon external to the individual can be traced from Aristotle through Augustine, Spinoza, Montesquieu, Leibniz, Comte, and Nietzsche to Durkheim and was noted in the last section as a key theoretical legacy of Warburg and Benjamin. The debate about societal memory reappears several decades after the work of Halbwachs, who first used the term 'mémoire collective' in his Les Cadres sociaux de la mémoire (1925) and provided a full definition in Mémoire et société, published posthumously in 1949 and republished as La Mémoire collective (1950). The rediscovery of the work in the 1980s, with new translations, has informed the subsequent rise and growth of memory studies. For Halbwachs, building on Durkheim's theory of societal memory and the need of groups for continuity with the past, the location of social frameworks of memory lies in collective time and space and these primarily mediate the construction of personal memory. In addition to their cultural and social milieu, individuals also construct the past collectively from the lieu, a concept that

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Emden, "Nachleben", p. 210.

This follows Colette Wilson's history of Halbwachs's term, in 'An Introduction', *Photography and Cultural Memory*, Exhibition Catalogue for the Conference, *Forgetting to Remember: Remembering to Forget*, University of Kent (2008), p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Maurice Halbwachs, *The Collective Memory* [1950], trans. by Francis J. Ditter, Jr and Vida Yazdi Ditter (New York: Harper and Row, 1980).

appears later in the work of Nora (1996) and Certeau (2002), amongst others, of the spatial creation of memory.<sup>21</sup>

Groups develop, says Halbwachs, a common image of their pasts which is transmitted between generations. These groups are based on families, neighbourhoods, professional and political affiliations, associations and nations, resulting in the creation of numerous collective memories for the individual:

The group not only transforms the space into which it has been inserted, but also yields and adapts to its physical surroundings. It becomes enclosed within the framework it has built. The group's image of its external milieu and its stable relationships with this environment becomes paramount in the idea it forms of itself, permeating every element of its consciousness, moderating and governing its evolution.<sup>22</sup>

The relationships persist in the act of individual recall when groups break up. Halbwachs's observation about the transformation of a space in which a group finds itself into its own image is a recurring theoretical notion in this thesis with regard to political elites. It underscores the on-going appropriation and manipulation of Trevi images in the evolution and diffusion of dominant ideologies. These shift and change and can be challenged or undermined.

An issue about Halbwachs's frameworks is the time limitation of collective memory, as he sees history taking the place of shared memory when it disappears in the generational sense.<sup>23</sup> Also reflecting the focus on the centrality of the group in social memory, Connerton addresses the conceptual gap of how collective memory is conveyed and sustained beyond generations.<sup>24</sup> He builds on Halbwachs's notion that individuals and groups constitute identities by recalling a shared past of common, often contested, norms, conventions and practices: 'It is not because thoughts are similar that we can evoke them; it is rather because the same group is interested in those memories, and is able to evoke them, that they are assembled together in our minds.'<sup>25</sup> The

<sup>25</sup> Ibid., p. 37.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Nora, *Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past*, vol 1, 'Conflicts and Divisions'; *Realms of Memory: The Construction of the French* Past, vol 2, 'Traditions' and vol. 3, 'Symbols' (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996-1998), (the seven volume *Les Lieux de Mémoire* reduces to three for the English edition); Michel de Certeau, *The Practice of Everyday Life*, trans. by Steven F. Rendall (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002). <sup>22</sup> Halbwachs [1950], p. 130.

A criticism by Jan Assmann amongst others, 'Collective Memory', pp. 125-33.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Paul Connerton, *How Societies Remember* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990), pp. 38-39.

physical aspect of repetitive bodily practice is central to understanding memory and has been generally overlooked, Connerton argues, because of the privileged position of the written text: although it can be observed that his visual acts necessitate being described in print. He refers to a study of the performative gestures of a group of Italian immigrants in New York; maintaining the activity is made possible by the performers' knowledge of a transmitted communal lexicon, automatically performed, of at least one hundred and fifty items.<sup>26</sup>

Social memory, suggests Connerton, is found in ritual performance requiring habit and therefore bodily automatisms. 'Incorporated practices' are movements that impart these signs and 'inscribing practices' are the replacements of performative experiences by secondary sources. <sup>27</sup> Connerton emphasises the physical sustainment of shared memory in commemorative and everyday behaviours: an interweaving of group and individual memory. The merging is constitutive of on-going memory. It differs from Marxist definitions of the past as the invention of tradition by ruling classes, defined by Eric Hobsbawm as: 'a set of practices, normally governed by overtly or tacitly accepted rules and of a ritual or symbolic nature, which seek to inculcate certain values and norms of behaviour by repetition, which automatically implies continuity with the past. <sup>28</sup> Connerton appears somewhat apolitical in not allowing for contextual changes influencing the production of memory, for social dynamics, changes of meaning or for the multiple interpretations that interest Certeau. <sup>29</sup>

Memory as an active practice is central for Certeau who conceptually blends individual performance and shared spatiality: the focus is on place, space and the everyday, and culture is understood as a set of signifying practices.<sup>30</sup> The place is stable but the space has intersections of mobile elements, of the movements used within it so that space becomes a practiced place: the street geometrically defined by urban planning is transformed into a space by walkers.<sup>31</sup> He concludes that there is a palimpsest of memory layers, a 'piling up of heterogeneous places' shaped by histories and symbols.<sup>32</sup> Between the two oppositions of place and space there are changing relationships and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Connerton, *Societies*, pp. 79-80. David Efron traces these gestures in the oratory of classical Greek and Roman times, in *Gesture and Environment* (New York, 1941).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Ibid., pp. 72-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Eric Hobsbawm and Terence Rangers, eds, *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), pp. 1-2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> See Neil Jarman, 'Commemorating 1916, Celebrating Difference', in *The Art of Forgetting*, ed. by Adrian Forty and Susanne Küchler (Oxford: Berg, 2001), p. 177.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Certeau, pp. 117-202.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Ibid., p. 117.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Ibid., p. 201.

transformations: 'Stories thus carry out a labor that constantly transforms places into spaces or spaces into places.' Patrick O'Donovan comments on how Certeau closely links memory and agency so that: 'multiple ruses, the *manières de faire*, practiced by individuals within the vast social space are of decisive cultural significance and occupy a particular place within any system of memory: [...] as passing manifestations of an enduring *mémoire sans langage*.' Also, Certeau's observer apprehends the innumerable sets of tactics that exist in the present only through a kind of investigative fiction: 'The framework in which a given research mission is carried out is the effect of an imaginary projection [...] within which any written analytical record captures only fragments of the phenomena under observation.' What matters is the active process of working through culture that constitutes everyday life and not the ways of preserving, recording and transmitting it. 16

Collective behaviours under capitalism are central to Lefebvre's notions of the production of space (1974) and everyday life (1947–1981).<sup>37</sup> Space is not an inert container of social relations, a discursive field, but an instrument of state planning and control as well as an arena of political struggle and creativity.<sup>38</sup> For Lefebvre, the physical, the mental and the lived simultaneously comprise the dimensions of space. Spatial practices are everyday physical routines that produce social life, including individual, embodied social rhythms and collective patterns of movement in urban spaces. The word 'everyday' connotes repetitive, fragmentary and trivial aspects that constitute material life under capitalism. Thus, the everyday invites an understanding of the connections between consumer culture, urbanization and state power and how such relations change, both positively and negatively. Lefebvre sees the city as the work of citizens to which they have a right, the denial of which makes the urban a space of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Certeau, p. 118. On the concept of a 'non-lieu' and how it never completely erases the place it replaces, see Marc Augé, *Non-Places: Introduction to an Anthropology of Supermodernity*, trans. by John Howe (London and New York: Verso, 1995).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Patrick O'Donovan, 'Common Culture and Creativity: Forgetting and Remembering in the Cultural Theory of Michel de Certeau', in *Cultural Memory*, ed. by Caldicott and Fuchs, p. 316; Certeau, on ruses and memory without language, p. 40.

p. 316; Certeau, on ruses and memory without language, p. 40.
 O'Donovan, p. 316 summarizing Certeau, p. 41. An apt observation on a research thesis.
 Ibid., p. 317.

<sup>37</sup> See Rob Shields, *An English Précis of Henri Lefebvre's 'La Production de l'espace'* (Brighton: Urban and Regional Studies, University of Sussex, 1988). Also Chris Butler, *Henri Lefebvre: Spatial Politics, Everyday Life and the Right to the City* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Chris Butler, p. 5.

political contestation.<sup>39</sup> Moreover, his focus on the politics of space relates to the manipulation of memory surrounding the Trevi, as seen in Part Two. Connerton's and Certeau's notions of memory systems as informed by the everyday and by collective spatial performativity reflect, in part, Lefebvre's concepts of the production of space and of everyday life.

The theoretical gaps left by Halbwachs on generational transmission of collective memory, and by Warburg on meanings of cultural objectivation, are addressed by Jan Assmann. 40 He situates Halbwachs's observations in a wider societal framework of the abilities of groups to shape images of themselves and the political role of institutions in influencing these: an ideological perspective. Warburg saw a mnemonic energy in objects, ranging from high art to everyday objects whose meaning is accessible across millennia but without accounting for discontinuities. What counts, claims Jan Assmann, is the 'concretion of identity' or the relation to the group; the capacity to reconstruct formation of meaning and its transmission; organisation through institutions and bearers of cultural memory, and obligation or the norms that structure the cultural supply of knowledge. 41 He focuses on collective memory as using its own already culturally determined images within prevailing political contexts, a recurring observation in the thesis.

Recent decades have seen integrative theories of collective and individual memory replacing perceptions of their binary opposition, the latter often perceived as Halbwachs's legacy. Amongst the contributors to Acts of Memory (1999), Hirsch considers personal and public perceptions of Holocaust photographs and Gerd Gemünden analyses nostalgia and identity in unified Germany. 42 Mieke Bal draws together the strands of the collective and the individual and emphasizes the interaction between past and present as the 'stuff of cultural memory'. 43

Compared to the intersections or meeting points of the individual and the collective noted above, their relations of 'reciprocity' as proposed by phenomenology evoke mutuality and sharing. In seeking to ascertain if there is a primary agent for

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> For an overview of 'le droit a la ville', see Chris Butler, pp. 143-44.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Jan Assmann, 'Collective Memory', 125-33 (pp. 128-29).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Ibid., pp. 128-32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Marianne Hirsch, 'Projected Memory: Holocaust Photographs in Personal and Public Fantasy', pp. 3-23; Gerd Gemünden, 'Nostalgia for the Nation: Intellectuals and National Identity in Unified Germany', pp. 120-133, in Mieke Bal, Jonathan V. Crew, and Leo Spitzer, eds, Acts of Memory: Cultural Recall in the Present (Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1999).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Bal, Acts of Memory, pp. vii-xvii.

remembering, Paul Ricœur (2005) does not prioritize the collective over the individual or vice versa since he finds them in a reciprocal relationship. <sup>44</sup> The individual has memory and is in a social setting of relationships. How does self identity derive from collective thought, asks Ricœur? The construction of memory as possible only in the group is too deterministic for him so that Halbwachs goes too far by saying that the influences we obey remain unperceived. Ricœur interprets him as indicating, but not following through, that it was in the personal act of recollection that the mark of the social was initially sought and then found. <sup>45</sup> The critique follows more than half a century after *La Mémoire collective* (1950) and during the rise of memory studies. Again, changes of interpretation reflect changes of context and direction in discourses of memory.

## 2.1.3 What Past?: Linguistic Turn, Doubts, Signs, Fictions, Discourses

A major influence on discourses of memory was the linguistic turn, with its origins mainly in France in the 1970s. It gave rise to challenges and uncertainties across disciplines in the humanities and contributed to the significance attached in the 1980s to Halbwachs's theories in an increasing climate of doubt about how to conceive the past. The linguistic turn was the paradigm shift brought about in critical theory by poststructuralism; the seeds of the shift sown by structuralist theory in the 1950s and 1960s. Memory was amongst the categories re-evaluated by many poststructuralist challengers to critical orthodoxy in literary studies in order to postulate the slipperiness of language: that the text is a network of signifiers that cannot produce definitive meaning. The considerable impact of poststructuralism on the emergent field of memory studies derived from its challenge to theories of stable meaning, language and identity. <sup>46</sup> The following overview is necessarily limited by constraints of thesis length.

Structuralism developed from linguistics and influenced disciplines in the humanities and social sciences, including anthropology, philosophy, literature, psychology and history.<sup>47</sup> It modelled its field of enquiry on the method and reasoning of scientific logic applied to a world constructed through language, where unity can be found in apparent disunity as the text 'knows itself'. By considering a sign within the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Paul Ricœur, *Memory*, *History*, *Forgetting* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Ibid, p. 123. Halbwachs's chapter, 'Collective Memory and Historical Memory', in *The Collective Memory*, pp. 50-84, is critiqued by Ricœur, pp. 393-97.

Elizabeth A. Clark, 'Preface', *History, Theory, Text: Historians and the Linguistic Turn* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2004) covers key aspects, pp. ix-xx.
 See Peter Barry, *Beginning Theory*, 3rd edn (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2009), p. 265.

system of signs upon which it depends, structural layers are revealed; the signifier in its context is a sign which carries a cultural meaning and is part of a structure. The literary structuralism of the 1960s involves the application of Saussure's concept of language according to which meaning is based on difference, where the signifier, for example, 'fountain', refers to the concept or signified 'fountain'. It divides itself from another signifier like 'mountain' on the plane of sound and 'spring' or 'cascade' on the plane of meaning. The referent, the fountain itself, is of no importance.

The structuralist concept of text was widened to include the non-literary, for example, advertisements, paintings and film. Roland Barthes included *Le Guide bleu*, the widely-used guidebook, in *Mythologies* (1970) to decode ideological connotations in language that masks the past. Signs could also be used in a 'knowing' way' as conventions could be broken but the break depended on the prior existence of the rule. The main tenet of structuralism is that the individual units of the text or story being analysed have a relational meaning and not a substantive one. Thus content is irrelevant and, as Terry Eagleton suggests, if the structure of relations between units is preserved, it does not matter which items are selected as they are replaceable. The narrative is concerned with making sense about itself so that structuralist methodology reveals the oppositional relations between linguistic conventions. Its mode of analysis need not mean destruction but the undoing of signification within the text to make the unseen deep structures visible.

The implications for memory are that structuralism's system of signs is without sociocultural contextualisation. It cannot account for renewal or change. In Eagleton's words, it is 'hair-raisingly unhistorical'.<sup>54</sup> Structuralism ignores material and political influences and the diverse locations of those who consume narrative, both inside and outside academia. The significance of structuralism for this overview of memory lies in its attention to the structure and conventions of language, that literature is one signifying practice amongst others and that signs may be used in a 'knowing way'.

..

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Ferdinand de Saussure, *Cours de linguistique général* (Paris: 1916).

This overview draws on Jonathan Culler, *Literary Theory: A Very Short Introduction* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2000), pp. 57-58.

Roland Barthes, 'Le Guide bleu', in *Mythologies* (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1970), pp. 136-39.

Terry Eagleton gives fashion examples, eg expensive crumpled fabrics, in *Literary Theory: An Introduction*, Anniversary Edition (London: Blackwell Publishing, 2008), p. 47.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Eagleton, pp. 82-83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Barry, pp. 38-48.

Eagleton, p. 95.

Poststructuralism denies any certainty about knowledge. If structuralism sees signs as constituted by difference, then poststructuralism sees them as mutually dependent so they are always linked to one another in never-ending, intertwining chains of differentiation and deferral of meaning. An infinite number of slippery signifiers is envisaged instead of a relationship between one signifier and one signified and these two categories are also interchangeable and transformative. Meaning can be scattered or dispersed along a chain of signifiers: 'so that it cannot be easily nailed down, it is never fully present in any one sign alone'. Each word in a text holds traces from the word just gone with future modification by those yet to come resulting in a fluid sense, for example, Trevi Fountain. The world is textual to the point where signs are independent of the concept they are supposed to designate and disunity is found in the apparent unity of the text, an inversion of the concept of deep and discoverable structures in structuralism. Meaning is destabilized, resulting in what can be described as 'linguistic anxiety'. See

The implications of poststructuralism for memory studies, as for historiography, are that the past is impossible to portray. It cannot be pinned down. Traces of the past, following Derrida, are found in the present and the future in the sense that memory is an account; it is discursive, always already textual and a signifying system. <sup>57</sup> Claims of objectively determined truth, grand narratives and the notion of the unified self are expressed as fictions. Textual narrative is characterized by multiple meanings and if the past is conceived as constructed fictitiously in the present neither did it exist nor can any stable memory of it. In these terms, the Trevi exists only as discourse.

Another challenge in the 1970s to the prevailing paradigm of historical certainties came from Michel Foucault. His new historicism, arising from poststructuralism, focuses on ruptures, gaps and shifts of meaning that challenge the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Eagleton, p. 115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> A view expressed by Barry, p. 62.

See Annette Kuhn, 'A Journey Through Memory' in *Memory and Methodology*, ed. by Radstone (Oxford: Berg, 2000), pp.179-96 (p. 189). Thesis constraints prevent taking these concepts further. The phrases 'past, present and future memory' and 'always already', the latter with a provenance preceding Derrida, are frequently found in the narratives of memory studies. His much debated, 'There is nothing outside of the text' is in *Of Grammatology*, trans. by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976), p. 158.

history of ideas as governed by the quest for origins and precedent. 58 History should not be construed as a repetition of sources but as a discourse that rewrites. <sup>59</sup> Language does not refer to objects and what we see is not what we say; discourses of power linked with social practices and institutions seek to control human activity by constructing the very problem they purport to resolve. Words seduce us into believing that, for instance, madness is identified as already existing before the ways in which it is discussed.<sup>60</sup> It is these aspects that interest Foucault, not the accuracy of representation. His analysis of Velázquez's La Meninas is of the painting as a representation of classical representation as the links between signs and the objects they signify are broken. Representation in this sense means a rupture with the past and what is not chosen for representation is politically more important because it does not have a role in the development of a social practice or institutional aim. <sup>61</sup> Foucault promotes the querying of what seems a 'given' as he sees it as the result of a political discourse that shapes what is taken for granted. 62 In summary, all memory is fictitious for Foucault and the past cannot be portrayed; historiographical narrative is a form of literature and politically determined discourses control social life. The impossibility of portraying any past as other than fictitious raises ethical considerations, as La Capra points out, about accounting for traumatic events and attempting to learn from these 'in the present in a manner that opens possible futures.'63

## 2.1.4 After the Turn: Trauma Theory, Remembering, Forgetting

When the 1990s saw increased attempts to bear witness to repressed memories of the Holocaust, the new direction provided a strong and continuing theoretical focus on trauma in the academic study of memory. Critical connections were made with historical pasts and the text no longer considered in isolation. The earlier meaning of the

<sup>59</sup> Foucault, *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, trans. by A.M. Sheridan Smith (New York: Pantheon Books, 1972), pp. 137-44.

Michel Foucault, *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Social Sciences*, n. trans., (New York: Pantheon Books, 1970).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Foucault, *Madness and Civilization*, trans. by Richard Howard (London: Routledge, 2001).

See Peter Burke, *Eyewitnessing: The Uses of Images as Historical Evidence* (London: Reaktion, 2001), p. 174. The term 'representation' was absorbed into common currency across the humanities in the late 1960s. The interdisciplinary journal *Representations* started in1983. The MA course 'Representations of Italy', Royal Holloway, University of London, was taken by the thesis writer (2004-2006).

Foucault influences fields such as gender studies, not previously seen as having a history. See Culler, pp. 8-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> LaCapra, *History in Transit: Experience, Identity, Critical Theory* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 2004), p. 122.

Greek word *trauma* was of a wound inflicted to the body. The change of meaning to one of damage inflicted on the mind being of early twentieth-century origin and linked to the mechanized nature of industrialisation, genocide and warfare.<sup>64</sup> It belongs to the debate that views modernity as disastrous, a premise often associated with Benjamin of a break with a homogeneous past.<sup>65</sup>

Consciousness at the collective level is mirrored at that of the individual in Sigmund Freud's essay, *Beyond the Pleasure Principle* (1921), on treatment of hysterical patients with shell shock that seeks to return to a causative event in order to discharge the trauma. <sup>66</sup> According to Freud, extreme trauma results from a breach in the protective shield of consciousness particularly when the subject is unprepared for disruptive stimuli. He distinguishes emotional disturbance from ordinary trauma such as birth and death which can be resolved through social ritual. His shell-shocked patients experience violent dreams and flashbacks of traumatic events which are otherwise repressed. Freudian psychoanalytical therapy seeks to free the victim emotionally from the event through 'the talking cure' which depends on language to bring forth from the unconscious the previously unknown aspects of the experience in order to dispel it. <sup>67</sup>

The Freudian focus on the conscious mind as the locus of the primary self and understood through the workings of the unconscious is reversed by Jacques Lacan who identifies the unconscious as the location of the self.<sup>68</sup> The unconscious is not characterized by chaos but found to be structured like language and as linguistically sophisticated as the conscious part. Lacan builds on and inverts the Saussurian concept of the signifier and the signified. A signifier may be attached to a great many signifieds or chains which also have traces of other surrounding signifiers, an activity which is described as the 'sliding of the signified beneath the signifier', making them inaccessible. Therefore attempting to arrive at truth or the self through language is impossible for Lacan and all our discourse is a slip of the tongue; language is slippery and ambiguous.<sup>69</sup> The text no longer refers to any reality but to its own clusters of signifiers. Lacanian memory is always unstable, unknowable, inaccessible. The ethical

<sup>64</sup> For historical background of the concept, see Rossington and Whitehead, pp. 186-91.

<sup>69</sup> See Eagleton (2008), p. 146.

<sup>65</sup> Exemplified in Benjamin's, 'The Work of Art', pp. 211-43.

<sup>66</sup> Sigmund Freud, Beyond the Pleasure Principle, 1921, in Theories of Memory (2007), pp. 200-201.

Halbwachs thought an acceptable past could alleviate an uncomfortable present through a desire for this past. See *La Mémoire collective*, ed. by Gerard Namer (Paris: Albin Michel, 1997), pp. 133-34, cited and translated by Wilson, Exhibition Catalogue, p. 9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Jacques Lacan, 'The insistence of the letter in the unconscious' (1957), reprinted in *Modern Criticism and Theory*, ed. by David Lodge (London: Longman, 1988), pp. 79-106.

implication for trauma theory of the poststructuralist perspective was that therapy based on language could not work through the traumatic event and achieve a positive outcome.

The Freudian idea of *Deckerinnerungen* or screen memory often features in memory studies. Freud argues that screen memory provides a defence against repressed elements by providing associated but less important details. It maintains the fiction of a stable identity with the screen as a site of mediation, blurring the distinction between the authentic and the substitution; memories are masked but they can be retrieved through therapy. From the Lacanian perspective, memory is not held behind a screen and there is no reference point to which to return after a trauma, memory is irrecoverable. This understanding of traumatic memory as impossible to describe challenges the contention that memories are masked but can be retrieved.

In a later work, Freud maintains that defensive and idealizing memory in the adult is a remodelling of childhood memory, 'analogous in every way to the process by which a nation constructs legends about its early history.' However, a state would have an ideological purpose in screening or remodelling past events through the creation of legends promoting its political objectives, whereas an individual would not. National monuments after the First World War that commemorated the deaths of soldiers sought to glorify and justify the actions of the victorious nation states. Collective memory as an extension of individual psychological processes, as screen memory, is not employed in the thesis. The Trevi is defined as a propagandist vehicle rather than a screen.

Concepts that are borrowed from other disciplines and built upon in memory studies generate new interpretive possibilities but also require recognition of their provenance formed in one field before transportation to another. In Luisa Passerini's work on the intersubjectivity of (individual) memory she suggests that: 'All our memories are screens [...] as traces of something they reveal and hide at the same time.' What registers on the screen is: 'not directly the sign of a piece of memory, but the sign of an absence, and what is repressed is neither the event nor the memory nor even single traces, but the very connection between memories and traces.' It is a criticism of

Freud, 'The Rat Man' [1909], in *Case Histories II*, 15 vols, trans. by James Strachey, (London: Penguin Books, 1979), 9, p. 87.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Freud, 'Screen Memories' [1899], in *The Standard Edition of the Complete Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud*, 10 vols, trans. by James Strachey (London: Hogarth Press, 1962), 3, pp. 301-22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Lacan, pp. 79-106.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Luisa Passerini, *Memory and Utopia: The Primacy of Intersubjectivity* (London: Equinox, 2007), p. 17.

memory studies that the social dynamics of collective memory cannot be an effect or extension of individual memory; societies do not remember in analogous ways.<sup>74</sup> The notion of memory followed in the thesis is of the integrative nature of collective and individual memory as a social, active and inventive practice influenced by political dimensions.

The significance of individual memory as bearing witness to the unimaginable and unaccountable was emphasised by survivors who began to write and publish their experiences of the Holocaust. Early accounts include I sommersi e i salvati (1988) by Primo Levi and *Days and Memories* (1990) by Charlotte Delbo. They describe the survival of a traumatic past in the present for those who remained to testify to an event that had eliminated most of its own witnesses. Judith Woolf considers fictive shaping and memory in Levi's later Se questo è un uomo and La tregua that also bear witness to his Holocaust experience. 75 'Nulla resta di lui', writes Levi about the child Hurbinek, 'egli testimonia attraverso queste mie parole.' Overlooked until the 1980s are the hundreds of yizker-bikher, memorial books devoted to the lives and deaths in Jewish communities in Eastern Europe and which continue to be published both collectively and individually.<sup>77</sup>

The research by The Fortunoff Video Archive Project for Holocaust Testimonies at Yale University (c.1990) also influenced the field of trauma studies. 78 The nature of trauma and subsequent testimony is stressed by Shoshana Felman and Dori Laub as a continual effort to know what cannot be known. The incomprehensibility of the violent event triggers language and writing as part of seeking to come to terms with the unimaginable that exceeds present frames of reference. The act of bearing witness in this way is seen as more important than veracity of the account. Art and literature are proposed as perhaps the only witnesses to a crisis within history which cannot be precisely articulated by victims: 'art inscribes (artistically bears witness to) what we do not yet know of our lived historical relation to events of our times.<sup>79</sup> Felman and Laub

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Amongst others, Wolf Kansteiner, 'Finding Meaning in Memory: A Methodological Critique of Memory Studies', *History and Theory*, 41, 2 (2002), 179-97 (p. 179).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Judith Woolf, *The Memory of the Offence* (Market Harborough: Hull Italian Texts, 1995),

p. 39. <sup>76</sup> Primo Levi, *Se questo è un uomo* (edition includes *La Tregua*) (Torino: Einaudi, 1999),

See Jack Kugelmass and Jonathan Boyarin, From a Ruined Garden: The Memorial Books of Polish Jewry (New York: Schocken, 1983), pp. 1-6.

Shoshana Felman and Dori Laub, Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis and History (New York and London: Routledge, 1992). Project details, p. 187. <sup>79</sup> Felman and Laub, p. xx.

seek to access what they perceive as the untellable nature of the traumatic through literature and film. Their examples are Camus's *The Plague* (1947) as a literary monument to witnessing, his *The Fall* (1956) as betrayal by the witness and Claude Lanzmann's *Shoah* (1985) based on filmed testimonies of Holocaust survivors speaking in the present, of past events. <sup>80</sup> For Felman and Laub these works exemplify a changing relationship between narrative and history so that the purpose of the former as testimony is an act of rethinking that changes history by bearing literary witness. <sup>81</sup> The privileging of action above authenticity impacted considerably on both non-therapeutic and therapeutic work across many disciplines by privileging feelings rather than the evidential. Hirsch develops her theory of postmemory by building on work from the 1990s about False Memory Syndrome and the transference of experiences to non-participants in these events; this connects with historical memory and re-enforcement by generational, individual and community memory. <sup>82</sup>

A view of non-Holocaust trauma as unaccountable comes from Cathy Caruth who finds an enigmatic core with a voice; it witnesses a truth that cannot be fully known or comprehended because it has, she maintains, a language that 'defies, even as it claims, our understanding.'83 Caruth reflects a Lacanian influence, that the unconscious can be viewed as operating like a language, as does the work of Felman and Laub. LaCapra argues against Caruth's portrayal of traumatic memory as incomprehensible because it suggests 'an aesthetic of the sublime' beyond reach.<sup>84</sup> Expressing this critique as part of his espousal of a new historiography capable of showing awareness both of language and of talking about the past, La Capra maintains there is a need to work through traumatic memory in order to bear witness but also to influence the future. He differentiates between historical trauma such as slavery and genocide and Caruth's structural trauma of personal losses. By her blurring of these conceptual boundaries LaCapra maintains all traumas could be seen as difficult to work through therapeutically. His response to Lacanian-influenced interpretations of trauma and bearing witness is to raise political and ethical issues about memorialisation in writing, images, stone and other diverse cultural forms that will in turn shape perceptions of the future. In other words, LaCapra's view is that there is a need to learn

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Felman and Laub, pp. xvii-xviii.

<sup>81</sup> Ibid., p. 95.

Hirsch, *Family Frames: Photography, Narrative and Postmemory* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, c. 1997), p. 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>83</sup> Caruth, *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative and History* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1996), pp. 3-5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> LaCapra, *History in Transit*, pp. 116-23.

from whatever shapes the past is given and to bring lived history back into the debate. As he comments elsewhere: 'there is an important sense in which the after-effects – the hauntingly possessive ghosts – of traumatic events are not fully owned by anyone and, in various ways, affect everyone.' 85

LaCapra's 'ghosts' permeate the development of trauma theory which increasingly brings issues connected to memory into the political and ethical arena.<sup>86</sup> They link to arguments put forward by Michael Rothberg, that the multidirectionality of memory should be considered rather than the recently prevailing approaches of competitive remembrance and victimhood relating to events of extreme violence, the Holocaust, slavery, genocide and occupations. 87 Traumatic events, he argues, should receive attention in relation to each other, not as separate histories but as collective memories of seemingly distinct events that are however not inseparable: public articulation of memory by social groups crosses into the identities of other groups. Issues surrounding one event will trigger memory about another and the emergence of Holocaust memory as a unique event is challenged by the inflection of the memories of other violent events that seem unrelated. 88 Memories follow differing pathways and are negotiated transculturally. The turn towards employing transculturalism and the issues it raises is examined by Lucy Bond. 89 She considers that the tropes inherited from Holocaust discourse that manifest themselves in the public memorial culture of 9/11 result in overlooking other memorial constellations. She argues the ethical case for paying attention to less visible points of connection to 9/11, to the forgotten memories. The discourse of a 2010 volume of articles on the memory of trauma in a global age concentrates on the move from national to transnational perspectives of collective memory, concentrating on victimhood in diverse locations and its correlations in transcultural memory. 90

0

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>85</sup> LaCapra, *Writing History, Writing Trauma* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2001), p. xi.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Post-traumatic stress disorder was belatedly recognised (1980) by the American Psychiatric Association as a manifestation of the Vietnam War, see Rossington and Whitehead, eds, p. 199. 1990s feminist theory widened definitions of war-related trauma to include sexual and physical abuse and other traumatic events.

Michael Rothberg, *Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonialization* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2009).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>88</sup> Rothberg, 'From Gaza to Warsaw: Mapping Multidirectional Memory, *Criticism*, 53, 4 (2011), 523-48 (pp. 523-26).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Lucy Bond, 'Intersections or Misdirections? Problematising Crossroads of Memory in the Commemoration of 9/11', *Culture, Theory and Critique* (2012), 53, 2, 111-28.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> See Aleida Assmann and Sebastian Conrad, *Memory in a Global Age: Discourses, Practices and Trajectories* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010).

Ricœur's influence in the early 2000s assisted another direction being taken in memory studies, of the reciprocity of forgetting and remembering: the memory of a traumatic episode can be kept in reserve, that is, it can be recalled and not entirely forgotten. <sup>91</sup> Fundamental to the ethics of memory for Ricœur are the two key phenomenological questions he maintains should always be asked: '*Of what* are there memories? *Whose* memory is it?'<sup>92</sup>

Sometimes the construction of official memory can move ahead too fast when there is a superfluity of memory held by groups and individuals as in the attempted erasure of memory by post-Communist governments and the Spanish law of historical memory that are at variance with social memory about trauma. As Raphael Samuel observes, memory is not a passive receptacle, storage system or an image bank of the past, but rather: 'an active, shaping force; that is, it is dynamic – what it contrives symptomatically to forget is as important as what it remembers.' Connerton's seven main categories of attempts by institutions to impose collective forgetting are repressive erasure; prescriptive; constitutive in formation of new identity; structural amnesia; annulment; planned obsolescence and of humiliated silence. He first category, of some relevance to the Trevi as discussed in Part Two, entails covert encryptions with the organisation of a space offering iconographic programmes and historical master narratives of values and beliefs written into the architectural script; other narratives are forgotten or partially overlaid.

Benedict Anderson makes a link between a 'narrative of the past' and the formation of identity by emerging Western nations that seeks to exclude disadvantageous episodes, especially the traumatic ones. 96 Such narrative, he argues, relies on socially shared mechanisms through which the imagined nation achieves its new status. This process implies that a collective memory is formed although Anderson does not use the term. A narrative of the past is not divorced from the past but reconfigures memory of old spaces and chronologies. European settlers in the Americas initially utilized these and then broke with them through revolution and by establishing their own stories about the past. Links were maintained with earlier narratives but

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Forty, pp. 1-18.

<sup>92</sup> Ricœur, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Raphael Samuel, *Theatres of Memory: Past and Present in Contemporary British Culture*, 2 vols (London; New York: Verso, 1994), 1, p. x.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> Connerton, 'Seven Types of Forgetting', *Memory Studies* (2008), 1, 59-71 (p. 59).

<sup>95</sup> Ibid., (pp. 60-61).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 2006 edn), pp. 187-206.

through deliberate choices of memorialising desirable aspects and forgetting inconvenient episodes.

In summarizing the overview of trauma theory, it has been seen that it absorbed the questioning of the nature and capacity of language and of stable meaning as a legacy of the linguistic turn. Early trauma studies generated challenges that brought new historical and ethical perspectives into the field of memory whilst acknowledging the problematics of language. Gradually, significance was accorded to the act of witnessing the many pasts of individuals and communities in the present. Since the 1990s and the growth of trauma studies, the relationship between past, present and future has been a productive focus of critical attention. It is succinctly summarized by Bal: 'cultural memorialisation is an activity occurring in the present, in which the past is continuously modified and re-described even as it continues to shape the future.'97 Yet the question is raised again about the extent to which the future is determined. Also, the continuing focus on trauma could be said to reduce the opportunity for reflection on a wider range of memory's personal and public dimensions. As Radstone and Schwarz comment, elevating trauma into a general theory of the unspeakable and unrepresentable applicable to different forms of memory should be approached with caution.<sup>98</sup> Traumatic memory and history are often polarized and obscure the politics of remembering: history and memory are better considered as 'awkward' allies.

## 2.1.5 After the Turn: Memory and/or History

A further challenge arising from the linguistic turn is the on-going memory and history debate in which there is an uneasy accommodation, as previously observed. From the 1960s into the late 1990s, the former prevailing assumption of historiography was being undermined: that meaning relates to an ascertainable external reference point in the past. The problem of subscribing to the objectively-orientated Rankian tenet of *wie es eigentlich gewesen* [as it actually happened] was that if language did not refer to reality, how could historical research correspond with what had happened. The questions raised were often about the need for a 'baseline historical reality'. <sup>99</sup>

The major contribution to the memory/history debate comes from Nora's work in the 1990s which centres on his regret for the disappearing fund of memory and the

<sup>97</sup> Bal, p. vii.

Radstone and Schwarz, 'Introduction: Mapping Memory' in *Memory*, pp. 1-9 (pp. 8-9). See Iwona Irwin-Zarecka, *Frames of Remembrance: The Dynamics of Collective Memory* 

<sup>(</sup>New Brunswick, N.J.: Transaction Publishers, 1994), p. 15.

nature of what remains. Halbwachs keeps memory and history apart whereas Nora perceives them in a continually changing relationship and finds the differences incompatible: 'Memory [...] remains in permanent evolution, open to the dialectic of remembering and forgetting [...] History, on the other hand, is the reconstruction, always problematic and incomplete, of what is no longer. This connects with Halbwachs's idea of memory as collective and formed outside the individual. A key difference is that, when generational and group memory fades, history takes over for Halbwachs whereas for Nora it becomes history-memory. It is replaced by different forms of remembering as *lieux de mémoire* and they take the place of the vanished milieux de mémoire, settings of everyday experience based on tradition and custom. According to Nora, the qualification for a *lieu de mémoire* is the ability for on-going image renewal and sedimentation of new meanings yet continual metamorphosis. 101

The traditional *milieux* for Nora are swept away by the rigours of history and industrialisation, an echo of Benjamin's view of modernity as disastrous and a rift with a preferred past. Nora queries the role of history in the postmodern era of late capitalism; history is a discipline increasingly organising a new past, offering false memory and making itself a substitute for imagination. His work, Lieux de mémoire, is an attempt to rescue sites that contain the remnants of memory-history using an alternative historical methodology for writing about French national history and identity. Nora's opening paragraph to the English translation, *Realms of Memory*, concludes: 'Memory is constantly on our lips because it no longer exists', which resonates with regret for a lost French past and polarizes an opposition between memory and history, making the former anti-history. 102 The nationalistic dimension to the subjectively selected sites by his numerous contributors flavours the enterprise.

In the aftermath of Nora's propositions, Aleida Assmann suggested a relationship between memory, history and identity in that the tension between history and its representation are marked by a memorial dimension. <sup>103</sup> In her discussion of the dynamics of remembering, Ann Rigney offers a redefinition of a memory site which is

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> See Nora, 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire,' Representations, 26, (Spring 1989), 7-25 (p. 8).

Ibid., 'Between Memory', 7-25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Nora, *Realms*, 1, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Aleida Assmann, Erinnerungsräume: Formen und Wandlungen des kulturellen Gedächtinesses (Munich 1999), p. 145, cited in translation by Emden, 'History, Memory, and the Invention of Antiquity: Notes on the "Classical Tradition", in Cultural Memory and Historical Consciousness in the German-Speaking World since 1500, ed. by Emden and David Midgley (Peter Lang: Bern, 2004), pp. 39-68 (p. 41).

not static but 'a self-perpetuating vortex of symbolic investment' – a metaphor strongly suggestive of Trevi imagery. <sup>104</sup> A challenge to theories of memory sites as static was an aim of the project, 'The Dynamics of Cultural Remembrance: An Intermedial Perspective' at the University of Utrecht (2006 to 2010), which emphasized the liquidity, mobility, travelling, mutability and directionality of collective memory. The project examined memories that crossed borders, their sharing and shaping, and the social and political dynamics involved in the contestation and/or acceptance of particular stories. It also looked at which memories mobilized and travelled between communities. <sup>105</sup>

Nora's concept of French memory and history was followed by Mario Isnenghi in Italy. <sup>106</sup> One criterion for identifying *luoghi della memoria* was their evaluation in political terms, mostly in the context of post-Unification disunity. <sup>107</sup> The contributors to his two volumes are criticized for dealing with memories of places, rather than places of memory, as descriptive profiles anchored in historical representation without consideration of memory concepts so that their function in the Italian collective imagination is unexplored. <sup>108</sup> In a later article, Isnenghi criticizes his former balance between memory and history and wishes to redress the balance more in favour of history to tackle the subject of political disunity in Italy. <sup>109</sup>

Nora and Isnenghi, amongst others, contributed to perceptions of the pending 'death' of history whereas historians like LaCapra favoured the linguistic turn as a reinvigorating element, precisely because of the attention it paid to the self-referential quality of language. A refurbished discipline, he argued, could acknowledge the historian's place in the present as driving constructions of the past, by focusing on discontinuity, gaps, absences and contradictions in texts instead of the search for continuity. Also, ideologically-loaded grand narratives should be avoided and contexts that are unknown or multiple recognised. Importance should be attached to the site of

Ann Rigney, 'Plenitude, Scarcity and the Circulation of Cultural Memory', *Journal of European Studies*, 35.1 (2005), 11-18 (p. 18).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> <a href="http://www.let.uu.nl/cultural-remembrance/memoryonthemove/index.htm">http://www.let.uu.nl/cultural-remembrance/memoryonthemove/index.htm</a> [accessed 10 May 2012].

Mario Isnenghi, ed., 2 vols, *I luoghi della memoria: simboli e miti dell'Italia unita*, 1; *I luoghi della memoria: strutture ed eventi dell'Italia unita*, 2 (Roma: Editore Laterza, 1996, 1997). 'Presentazione' lists *luoghi*, 1, pp. vii-xii.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> Ibid., 'Conclusione', 1, p. 561. Same 'Conclusione', vol. 2.

Mario Caciagli, 'Molta memoria dei luoghi e pochi luoghi della memoria', in *Polis: Ricerche e studi su società e politica in Italia*, 13, 2 (1999), 303-12.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>109</sup> Isnenghi, 'Italian *luoghi della memoria*', in *A Companion to Cultural Memory Studies*, ed. by Astrid Erll and Ansgar Nünning (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2010), pp. 27-35 (p. 31).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> LaCapra, Soundings in Critical Theory (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1989), p. 205.

the text's production and its productivity and attention paid to the gap between a writer's intentions and what the text means to readers. A text read as a source of information only ignores these aspects and that it is an event in its own right and functions to rework reality. The interaction between text and context is what counts for LaCapra, 'the importance of providing a close, critical reading of contexts themselves.' Also, he writes elsewhere, that a concern for language does not compromise the requirement for 'exhaustive research', a 'thorough knowledge' of the relevant literature, and 'meticulous care' in documenting one's claims. LaCapra's perspective contrasts with Certeau's mentioned earlier concerning research as an imaginary projection in which any written analytical record only captures fragments of observed phenomena.

Certeau seeks a history that neither denies the real in the past nor social considerations. The location of individuals in the present or groups of individuals who develop an institutional discourse and the space in which it flourishes interest him, reflecting Halbwachs's social frameworks of memory and groups. 114 Themes of absence and loss mark Certeau's work, that is, the reality of what was once no longer exists and is absent in the gap between a historian's ideas and the documents. Historiography for Certeau is a form of mourning, a burial rite that exorcises loss of the past through insertion into present discourse. 115 Ricœur is amongst other contributors to the accommodation between history and memory. He privileges the latter as the foundation of the former in that there has to be testimony before there can be an archive: 'we have nothing better than memory to signify that something has taken place, has occurred, has happened before we declare that we remember it.'116 Sturken is representative of the theoretical trend towards seeing memory and history as relational rather than oppositional, her work on the Vietnam Veterans' Memorial of significance in developing a conceptual framework of 'tangled memory' in which to place a monument. 117 Part One concludes with a look at the changing discourse on monuments

LaCapra, *Representing the Holocaust: History, Theory, Trauma* (Ithaca: New York: Cornell University Press, 1998), p. 40.

LaCapra, 'History, Language, and Reading: Waiting for Crillon', *The American Historical Review*, 100 (1995), pp. 805, 808.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Certeau, p. 41.

<sup>114</sup> Certeau, pp. 117-18.

See Clark on Certeau, pp. 119-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Ricœur, p. 194.

Marita Sturken, *Tangled Memory: The Vietnam War, the AIDS Epidemic and the Politics of Remembering* (London: University of London Press, 1997), pp. 4-5.

before giving an indication of the critical contributions employed in Part Two for devising a theoretical framework in which to situate the Trevi.

### 2.1.6 Discursively Reinstating Monuments

Monuments were often relegated to the narrative margins by twentieth-century historians and philosophers who saw them as destructive of the memory which their designers sought to convey. 'What is the use to modern man of this "monumental" contemplation of the past?' asks Friedrich Nietzsche when considering historical permanence. 118 Lewis Mumford echoes his query by proclaiming the 'death of the monument' and the classical legacy as the 'blight of ancient Rome' so that a city is: 'a mass of dead buildings, duly armoured in stone [...] and becomes a burial ground.'119 Barthes claims that monuments are privileged by the narrative that masks ideology so that 'l'humanité du pays disparaît au profit exclusif de ses monuments'. 120 Lefebvre maintains that monumental architecture obscures the action of capitalist power and finds this in the dominance of the façade that emerges in the arena of papal Rome. 121 Robert Musil famously declares that monuments are 'invisible'. 122 More recently monuments have regained critical attention not as failures but as productive of new historical dialogue. The Emanuele II Monument, *Il vittoriano*, in Rome is a popular subject attracting diverse interpretations: a political monument, the altar of the fatherland, a teller of imperial history, a forger of national identity and a forgotten edifice. 123

Nora regrets the embodiment of memory in a monument as displacing what it seeks to remember with its own form so that its new vocation is to record and delegate the responsibility of remembering to the *lieu de mémoire*. Such edifices derive their significance only from 'their very existence' and could, he argues, be placed elsewhere

Nora, *Realms*, 1, p. 13.

Friedrich Nietzsche, *The Use and Abuse of History* [1874], trans. by Adrian Collins (New York: MacMillan, 1985), pp. 14-17.

Lewis Mumford, *The Culture of Cities* (London: Secker & Warburg, 1940), pp. 434-35.

Roland Barthes, 'Le Guide bleu', *Mythologies* (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1970), p. 137.
 Shields, pp. 28, 30.

Robert Musil, *Nachlass zu Lebzeiten in Gesammelte Werke*, ed. by Adolf Frisé (Reinbek: Rowohlt, 1978), 2:506-9, cited by Andreas Huyssen, 'Monumental Seduction', in *Acts of Memory*, ed. by Bal, Crew, and Spitzer, p. 192.

Catherine Brice, *Il Vittoriano: monumentalità pubblica e politica a Roma* (Rome: Istituto per la storia del risorgimento italiano, 2005); Bruno Tobia, *L'altare della patria* (Bologna: Il mulino, 1998); Anna Notaro, 'Telling Imperial Histories', Leverhulme Project, 1995–1997); David Atkinson and Denis Cosgrove, 'Urban Rhetoric and Embodied Identities: City, Nation, and Empire at the Vittorio Emanuele II Monument in Rome, 1870–1945', *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 88, 1 (1998), pp. 28-49; John Dickie, 'La Macchina da scrivere: The Victor Emmanuel Monument in Rome and Italian Nationalism', *Italianist*, 14 (1995), pp. 261-85; George McDonald, *Il vittoriano dimenticato* (Rome: 1979).

without altering their meaning; presumably not outside France. Peter Carrier criticizes Nora in that a single monument could never express the memories of all members of a nation as they have their own meanings of a site, especially in the context of the increasing transnational nature of memory cultures. He prefers a definition of post national 'dialogic sites of memory' to describe the rhetorical construction and debates linked to monuments. In these respects he updates Nora on the ability of monuments to act as political catalysts for new narratives, possibly those of failure, consensus or reconciliation. The afore-mentioned University of Utrecht project also emphasizes the mutability in the transcultural travelling of memory sites.

Andreas Huyssen criticizes the disdain and critical rejection that often characterizes the discourse surrounding monuments and seeks to restore their reputation as worthy of enquiry. 127 Germany was in the grip of a monument mania in 1998 and the proliferation of Holocaust memorial sites, according to Huyssen, was producing Musil's invisibility: the opposite of what was intended to be redemptive. 128 Alteration of appearance can make monuments visible according to Huyssen and create new meanings in memory. Christo and Jeanne-Claude wrapped the Reichstag in Berlin (1995) in polypropylene one hundred years after its construction and five years after German Unification. 129 The public celebrated by coming in their thousands and critics suggested a monumental work of architecture had become a sculpture and new political myths were generated. Monumental memory and monumental forgetting were both present, says Huyssen, because the wrapping revealed what was hidden when the monument *was* visible. It created a 'new layer of public memory' and the covered Reichstag was seen as a popular symbol of the fragile German democracy whereas the unwrapped edifice was not because it represented pre-Unification ideology. 130

The image appeared on souvenir items, in the popular media and on the Internet. Monuments of the future might only exist in mediated images, argues Huyssen, so that monumental seduction' is no longer built up with 'real built space'. <sup>131</sup> He overlooks the

<sup>125</sup> Nora, *Realms*, p. 18.

1.

Peter Carrier, Holocaust Monuments and National Memory Cultures in France and Germany since 1989: The Origins and Political Function of the Vel d'Hiv in Paris and the Holocaust Monument in Berlin (New York: Bergbahn Books, 2005); 'Places, Politics and the Archiving of Contemporary Memory in Pierre Nora's "Les lieux de mémoire", in Memory and Methodology, ed. by Radstone, pp. 37-57.

Huyssen, 'Monumental Seduction', pp. 190-207.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>128</sup> Ibid., p.192.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Christo previously wrapped the Pont Neuf, 1984.

Huyssen, 'Monumental Seduction', p. 196.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> Ibid., p. 206.

materiality of the Reichstag in that its renewed image could not exist without the hidden physical structure and previous memory of it. His interpretations of the wrapping event however point to a changing discourse surrounding monuments as vehicles for ideology in new media contexts such as cyberspace.

In contrast, the physical aspects of the *Erinnerungslandschaft* [memory landscape], according to Rudy Koshar, possess the mnemonic qualities not only of architectural landmarks and monuments but also of street names, public squares, historic sites [...] townscapes or natural landscapes'. 132 He echoes Benjamin by seeing the physical environment as steeped in memories. Monuments have an enduring symbolic continuity within the new context of German Unification and the meanings of places, spaces, buildings and monuments like the Brandenburg Gate are collectively recognised by large numbers of individuals. Elements of the memory landscape can be used in 'strategies', says Koshar, to make new symbolic physical structures from meanings that already exist, of which the construction of monuments is typical. 133 Imperial Germany's programme of building huge monuments drew upon past symbolism in the attempt to create national loyalty to a young emerging state and a past serving its political elites in times of rapid change, a reflection of Anderson's approach. The fountain-building programmes of papal Rome, the architectural style an inheritance of biblical and imperial classical sources in the service of post-Reformation Catholicism, accord with Koshar's political memory landscape but not with its recency.

Another area of debate concerns the convergences and divergences between definitions of memorials and monuments, the latter seemingly an obvious choice of category for the Trevi. According to Arthur Danto, we erect monuments so that we shall always remember and build memorials so that we shall never forget: 'we have the Washington Monument but the Lincoln Memorial. Monuments commemorate the memorable and embody the myths of beginnings. Memorials ritualize remembrance and mark the reality of ends.' His monuments make heroes and triumphs, victories and conquests perpetually present and part of life: 'The memorial is a special precinct, extruded from life, a segregated enclave where we honor the dead. With monuments, we honor ourselves.' Alternatively, memorials and monuments converge for James

<sup>132</sup> See Rudy Koshar, *From Monuments to Traces: Artifacts of German Memory, 1870–1990* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000), p. 9.

<sup>133</sup> Irwin-Zarecka, following Erving Goffmann, defines collective meanings and memories associated with monuments and physical sites as 'shared framing strategies and devices'. Groups and individuals establish a range of meanings for books, buildings, or films with a number of possible but limited meanings, p. 4.

Arthur Danto, 'The Vietnam Veterans Memorial', *The Nation* (31 August 1986), 52-55.

Young and the latter do the memorializing as sub-sets of memorials in the form of material objects. 135 It leads him to see all memory sites as: 'memorials, the plastic objects within these sites as monuments. A memorial may be a day, a conference, or a space, but it need not be a monument. A monument, on the other hand, is always a kind of memorial.' A famous lieu de mémoire could be a memorial. According to Ricœur, Nora gradually changes from an assured tone to one of irritation in his research because his memory realms are themselves taken over by commemoration. 136

The discussions above on the changing discourses surrounding monuments and the overview in Part One of the interwoven strands of memory research show that a flexible theoretical framework is required for the multivalent Fountain. The main influences derive from Benjamin, Certeau, Connerton, Halbwachs, Hirsch, LaCapra, Ricœur, Rothberg, Sturken, and Warburg. In Part Two, their approaches to memory are drawn upon to form the framework in which to locate the Fountain in the following chapters, as a vehicle for the expression of papal propaganda and capitalist ideology and as a host for narratives of art, literature, advertising and Internet.

## Part Two: Situating the Trevi in (Cultural) Memory

## 2.2.1 Memory Debates: Dichotomies

A brief outline is offered first of some methodological difficulties in memory studies. The overlapping contradictions that pervade much research can be seen as 'faultlines' but these in themselves designate a dynamic and evolving field of enquiry that is not a discipline but labelled as an interdisciplinary practice. 137 Drawing upon a plurality of methodological practices can become an easy eclecticism, the term 'screen memory' is one instance, and the origins of intellectual paradigms are often unclear as mentioned previously. This caution is relevant to the multiplicity of Fountain images that invites a wide range of interpretive opportunities.

The recent emphasis by most memory researchers, for example, Connerton, Bal, Hirsch, Sturken, Annette Kuhn, and Radstone is on perceiving collective and individual memory as active and integrative, not as oppositional. Previously, there was an implicit division of labour between those studying individual memory and those who studied collective memory which contributed to the isolation of perspectives and the need for a

 $<sup>^{\</sup>rm 135}\,$  James E. Young, The Texture of Memory: Holocaust Memorials and Meaning (New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press, 1993), pp. 1-8 (p. 4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>136</sup> Ricœur, pp. 401-11.

Discussed by Radstone and Schwarz, eds, *Memory*, pp. 5-7.

more inclusive picture.<sup>138</sup> The danger of dichotomies was the setting up of boundaries that limit or prevent the interchange or interweaving of ideas. Individuals can have interwoven strands of memories about the Fountain from film, advertising, holidays and travel, forming a complex tapestry of collective and individual memory. The 'threads' may be determined in part by existing social frameworks, for instance, on how to perform the coin-throwing ritual and then rewoven into new memories.

A legacy of poststructuralism is the challenge to dichotomies: oppositional relationships are forms of linguistic conventions which can be deconstructed to demonstrate how two apparently opposing terms are co-implicated. Moreover, the narratives of memory are perceived as fictitious, one form of many discourses constructed through the inexact tool of language. Whilst dichotomies imply a closing down of memory and pasts, pragmatic use can be made of the poststructuralist recognition of the slippery nature of memory as a concept and of the language used to describe it.

An example of dichotomous limitation, memorial and/or monument, relevant to the Trevi, is given at the end of Part One. The overlapping potential, as suggested by Young, who defines all memory sites as memorials and the plastic objects within these sites as monuments, privileges the notion of memorial. It avoids the legacy of art historiographical discourse that frequently constructs a limiting opposition between the two terms. The Fountain might be seen in Young's terms as always a kind of memorial relating to Greek and Roman religion, imperial myths, post-Reformation Catholicism, Agrippa, Trivia, and the aqueduct: a grouping of related multiple memorials. Young's definition displaces the oppositional relationship of Danto's monument *or* memorial and offers wider interpretive opportunities. The words 'monument' and 'fountain' also possess a hidden dichotomy. The former generates a dry, silent, static image: the moving signification of flowing water is lacking. A fountain arguably is always more than a monument whilst also possessing its memorializing function: a vehicle for memory with implied movement and sound.

## 2.2.2 A Place in Memory Terms

The widely-used terms of cultural, collective and individual memory reflect a range of complex, shifting meanings. Halbwachs saw the collective memory of a community as

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> A view expressed by James V. Wertsch, *Voices of Collective Remembering* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), pp. 33-34.

Examples of the dichotomy abound in Anthony Blunt, *Guide to Baroque Rome* (New York: Harper and Row, 1982).

part of its shared cultural background in contrast to historical memory that considers duration and continuity within communities. 140 Aleida Assmann advocates replacing the term collective memory, because it has given rise to many misunderstandings, by four distinct terms: individual, social, political, and cultural as bearers and performers of those memories and that they are all collective sources and performers of these categories of memory. 141 Cultural memory is a 'term in search of a meaning' for Wertsch. 142 His preference is cultural 'remembering' because of the process of action and the dynamism involved whereas 'memory' implies permanency: 'remembering is [...] inherently situated in a sociocultural context'. 143 Connerton uses the terms 'social memory' involving acts of transfer that make 'remembering in common' possible. 144 Memory or remembering is debatably another (linguistic) dichotomy but the terms are useful interchangeably in appropriate contexts. Remembering defined as a dynamic process adds to the vibrancy of a conceptual mix. Radstone and Schwarz take cultural memory along with social and public memory as cognates of collective memory. 145 The terms private, personal, and shared are also used in the narratives of memory studies. Transnational, transcultural, multidirectional, global, remediated, mediatized, and digital memory are terms reflecting recent trends. The phrase 'memory work' for research using recorded interviews, variously called oral history, memory or remembering, focuses on personal, sometimes group, memory. Kuhn's definition of interviews is 'memory talk'. 146

Kuhn sets out to undercut critical assumptions about the authenticity of interview material which should be interpreted, interrogated and mined for its meanings and possibilities as 'a conscious and purposeful staging of memory'. Much Italian research, for instance, Alessandro Portelli's work, is historically and politically focused. He explores what happens to an experienced event and the interventions required in gathering and interpreting material as it gathers symbolic, legendary and imaginative

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Halbwachs [1950], pp. 78-84.

Aleida Assmann, 'Four Formats of Memory: From Individual to Collective Constructions of the Past', in *Cultural Memory*, ed. by Emden and Midgley, pp. 19-38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>142</sup> Wertsch, pp. 11-13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> Ibid., p. 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>144</sup> Connerton, Societies, p. 39.

Radstone and Schwarz, eds, *Memory*, p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>146</sup> Annette Kuhn, *An Everyday Magic: Cinema and Cultural Memory* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2002), p. 20.

Kuhn, in *Memory and Methodology*, ed. by Radstone, p. 186. Much of Kuhn's research explores photographic memory.

qualities.<sup>148</sup> He also maintains that, for the interviewee, personal truth may coincide with collective imagination.<sup>149</sup> Oral history for Portelli is a literary genre: narrative is important and not the testimony itself. As Radstone puts it, personal memory can operate as a form of cultural text and the challenges in the recording of oral remembering and subsequent use in research make it a much debated as well as productive field of memory work in terms of the tension between intersubjectivity and events.<sup>150</sup> It goes towards meeting criticisms of research that draws attention to the visual and discursive objects of memory but not reception by consumers. A small offering by the thesis writer to the field of enquiry, accompanied by a look at theoretical issues is in Appendix One, 'Remembering the Trevi Fountain: Personal Stories'.

A set of terms is required that takes account of cultural memory processes relevant to the multivalent Trevi and the intertextuality of its mediated images within, across and between a range of narratives. Hirsch and Valerie Smith's, and also Sturken's, definitions of cultural memory are theoretically helpful in forming an integrative notion of memory as individual, collective and cultural. Hirsch and Smith see cultural memory as the product of fragmentary personal and collective experiences articulated through technologies and media that shape even as they transmit memory: 'Acts of memory are thus acts of performance, representation, and interpretation. They require agents and specific contexts.' The theoretical positioning interweaves the individual and the collective, location, agency and meanings. Significantly, it makes memory active, a function of relevance to the images of the Fountain that circulate in constellations of mediated memory. Sturken foregrounds the performative aspects of memory as a sociocultural activity: 'Cultural meaning does not reside with the text of a particular object, [...] so much as it is produced in the act of "consumption", wherein the viewer/citizen engages with its meaning.' Memory for Sturken:

is a social and individual practice that integrates elements of remembrance, fantasy, and invention [...] it can shift from the problematic role of standing for the truth to a new role as an active, engaging practice of creating meaning. <sup>153</sup>

See Radstone, 'Working with Memory: An Introduction', in *Memory and Methodology*, p. 10.

-

Alessandro Portelli, 'The Peculiarities of Oral History', 12, *History Workshop Journal* (1981), 96-107.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Ibid., p.11.

p. 10.

Hirsch and Valerie Smith, 'Feminism and Cultural Memory: An Introduction', *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society*, 28, 1 (autumn 2002), 1-19 (p. 5).

<sup>152</sup> Sturken, p. 258.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>153</sup> Ibid., p. 259.

In summary, the images from the written and spoken narratives of memory discourse are as contestual, contradictory and inventive as memory itself. A definition of cultural memory for the thesis is required that accounts for the variable, flexible and multi-layered nature of memory and the shifting terrain of changing social frameworks, political and group affiliations and performances associated with the Trevi. When the terms memory or remembering are linked in the thesis to the Trevi they connote active and social practices, an interweaving of the collective and the individual as part of cultural memory. The view is taken that terms applied to memory all have a cultural component and that all cultures have a memory, for which the umbrella term 'cultural memory' is used.

The following sections assess how far the critical concepts considered in Part One can place the Fountain in a theoretical framework of memory. Amongst these, although not in this order, are the changing sociocultural locations of the observer, collective and group memory, the 'collective vs. individual' polarity and its accommodations, the transmission of memory, ritual performance, remembering and forgetting, spatial relations and everyday practices, discourses of power, the slipperiness of language, and past, present and future memory.

## 2.2.3 Towards a Fluid Framework: Afterlives, Observers, Intentions

The overview of theories of memory commenced with the legacy of Benjamin. In his terms, the Fountain is a collection of symbols from antiquity transmitted into Renaissance and Baroque forms in the cityscape of Rome with their loss of iconographic authenticity intensified by modern media. For Benjamin, the popular and everyday were a result of the rupture with the past and of the commodification he attributes to modernity whereas for Certeau the practices of the everyday are vehicles for continuity and change in the transmission of memory.

Arguably, Benjamin allows for pre-existing memory traces rather than their renewable multivalency because of his focus on detection of a symbolic past awaiting discovery by the individual. A key difference between Benjamin and Warburg is that for the former the fleeting traces of the past lie in the subjective location of the historical imagination whereas for the latter the focus is on observable material objectivity. The earlier Trevi Fountain for Warburg would exist in its traces, in prints, maps, inscriptions and competition designs and for Benjamin in key moments of historical imaginings. He leads towards an acknowledgment that the past does not exist stably in memory: it belongs to the present where it is articulated and remembered by observers whose

historical locations change.<sup>154</sup> The Trevi as a destabilizing agent, often challenging and undermining intended meanings for posterity, is a recurring theme of the following chapters. The value that both Benjamin and Warburg bring to memory studies is of a disjunction between what is originally intended and subsequent interpretations, of bringing the past into the present so that a symbol can be perceived as possessing an afterlife.

However, the interpretations of the Fountain statuary as purely symbolic diverges from the interpretation in this thesis of the Trevi iconography as expressing gender politics in its idealized male and female forms. Patriarchal discourse conveys ways of seeing the world in its own terms and reflects dominant social structures of inequalities and oppression about gender. The binary division of male and female in representations associated with the Trevi continues, although with differences in the articulation of meaning about bodies, in the commodified performances of film and advertising that appropriate the monument and in which the sexualized female form becomes particularly valorized.

A nuance of irony is discernible regarding the gender of the Trevi itself for research whose subject is memory, when memory itself has been idealized in representations of the Titan goddess Mnemosyne, the personification of memory in Greek mythology. <sup>156</sup> The linguistic gender of the Fountain and of memory adds further shades of irony; both are asexual in English, yet female when researching *la fontana* and *la memoria* in Italian and other Romance language texts, and when in Rome.

## 2.2.4 Sharing: Collective Individuals

Whereas Benjamin and Warburg bring a cultural perspective to the study of memory, Halbwachs's legacy is the social property of memory, its shared frameworks and formation in group settings. He can seem potentially more integrative than usually portrayed of the collective and individual: 'society can live only if there is sufficient unity of outlooks among the individuals and groups comprising it.' The shared memory of groups is a perspective from which to explore how the Fountain informs political memory through the manipulation of its imagery by dominant groups.

<sup>157</sup> Halbwachs [1925], p. 182.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>154</sup> See Veel on Benjamin: 'Topographies of Memory: Walter Benjamin and Daniel Liebeskind', in *Cultural Memory*, ed. by Emden and Midgley, pp. 231-51.

Discussed by Øystein Gullvåg Holter, 'Social Theories for Researching Men and Masculinities', in Michael S. Kimmel, Jeff Hearn, and R. W. Connell, eds, *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities* (California: Sage Publications Inc., 2005), pp. 15-34 (p. 17).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>156</sup> A well-known representation is Dante Gabriel Rossetti's oil painting, *Mnemosyne* (1881).

Halbwachs's concept of generational memory is difficult to position theoretically for the Trevi. The visitors to commemorative monuments might come from a nation, community or group where generational remembering is relevant because of traumatic associations, as for the families of Holocaust survivors. Tourists in the Piazza di Trevi only fleetingly form a wider community. The visitor may, or may not, draw upon mediated memory informed by filmic and literary images and guidebook narratives and also tour guides, friends and family in the visual performative ritual of coin-throwing and wishing, or they may mimic the performative behaviour of others. An interviewee in Apppendix One refers to her experience of generational memory and how it influenced the way in which she threw a coin over her shoulder at the Trevi. <sup>158</sup>

The transmission of collective memory is a concept central to an awareness of the manipulation of Trevi imagery by dominant groups who share the same ideological frameworks. <sup>159</sup> As discussed in Part One, Jan Assmann's means of transmission that seek to correct the limitations of Halbwachs's social frameworks of memory, are the concretion of identity or the relation to the group, the capacity to reconstruct formation of meaning, the organisation through institutions and bearers of cultural memory, and the obligation or the norms that structure the cultural supply of knowledge. <sup>160</sup> These means of transmission accord with the shaping of imagined pasts for present needs of political elites who have variously appropriated the images of the illusory Trevi and its myth-carrying water as a vehicle for their ideological positioning: from papal patrons to artists, writers, film-makers, and advertisers. As quoted from Jan Assmann for the second epigraph to the chapter, 'No memory can preserve the past. Cultural memory works by reconstructing, that is, it always relates its knowledge to an actual and contemporary situation. <sup>2161</sup>

Connerton's 'act of transfer', when individuals and groups constitute identities by recalling a shared past of common, but often contested, norms, conventions and practices, also builds on Halbwachs's social frameworks. Heavilies Means of transmission and acts of transfer offer conceptual insights into the sociocultural mechanisms of on-going ideological appropriation and reshaping of Fountain images in the promotion of new political identities. These practices become particularly relevant at times of crises, during the papal Rome of the post-Reformation, the royalist and fascist eras, and also in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Appendix One, p. 247. Quoted in full, thesis, p. 46.

Jan Assmann, 'Collective Memory'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>160</sup> Ibid., pp. 128-29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>161</sup> Ibid., p. 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> Connerton, *Societies*, p. 39.

postwar Europe when memory is valorized in these contexts because identity is problematized.<sup>163</sup>

### 2.2.5 Performance and Practiced Places: The Trevi Theatre for Memory

Connerton (1990) also draws attention to the sustaining of shared memory by repetitive bodily practices in commemorative and everyday behaviours: an interweaving of group and individual memory. Performative acts associated with the Fountain are mediated widely. They appear in the literary work, amongst others, of Anne-Louise Germaine de Staël, Nathaniel Hawthorne, and Marguerite Yourcenar, numerous films including *Three Coins in the Fountain* and *La dolce vita* and in advertising as for Peroni and Martini. The act of coin-throwing at the Trevi, following Connerton, is the imitation of a once fundamental bodily act, to appease the gods of past imaginations who controlled places of life-giving water, using contemporaneously relevant objects. Chapter One describes how the coins and wishes ritual replaced the sipping and ablutary performances of the late nineteenth century and became increasingly relevant to the imagined promises of consumerism. The 'guaranteed' return is to a conspicuously consumerist city.

The Trevi ritual is not enacted by members of a definable group such as mourners at a commemorative monument who may maintain a shared individual and collective identity before, during and after a visit. Connerton's notion of a learned cognitive awareness of the bodily automatism required for a collective ritual performance relates to those Fountain visitors who already know or learn what to do at the Fountain's edge according to a timeless myth associated with water. The bodily signs are Connerton's 'incorporating practices', a repertoire of movements held in collective memory on performance at water sources. His 'inscribing practices', when visual information is imparted from a secondary source, apply to the paintings, prints and films of the Trevi held in personal and public memory and provide a useful focus on its function as a vehicle for mediated narratives, particularly on those of art.

The importance of the *lieu* is another legacy of Halbwachs that feeds into Certeau's definition of 'space as practiced place', of individual performances and shared spatiality of the everyday that invites interpretations of the Fountain. <sup>165</sup> The place of Piazza and Fountain is stable but the space, as transformed by shop owners, local

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>163</sup> A point made by Kansteiner when drawing attention to the interrelationship between memory studies and identity politics, p. 184.

<sup>164</sup> Connerton, Societies, pp. 72-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> Certeau, pp. 117-202.

residents, workers, spectators, tourists, coin throwers, film-makers, passersby and even researchers, has intersections of mobile elements. <sup>166</sup> Certeau links memory to performance in the multiple ruses carried out by individuals within the social space as part of any 'system of memory', an enduring memory without language. <sup>167</sup> What matters for him is the negotiation of access to culture, the process of 'working through culture' that is a feature of everyday life. <sup>168</sup> Certeau privileges the notion of performative space created by shared individual behaviours that inform memory systems rather than the ways in which culture may happen to be preserved or transmitted. On the one hand, his term of palimpsest as a 'piling up of hetereogeneous places' shaped by histories and symbols is invited, with an early written layer in the pile contributed by Frontinus on the water-carrying myths of the aqueduct. On the other hand, whilst the accumulation of palimpsest layers intimates the possibility of a discoverable originating layer, the multiple constellations of images that come in and out of focus indicate that the Trevi is more a vector or nexus of the cultural signification of its own images rather than a palimpsest.

Certeau and Connerton enable the thesis to build on a definition of the Fountain as a place of performance. The movements of people and of water in the stories being told about the Fountain are constantly transforming place into 'space as practiced place', into a stage with the sense of enclosure configured by the surrounding buildings of the small Piazza. Lefebvre might identify political potential in the production of Trevi space, exemplified by the attempts of official culture to control the demolition of houses, unfinished projects, traffic re-routing, re-siting of labour, restoration and banning of social activities, as well as creative potential in the everyday practices of coin-throwing and wishes, protests and commemoration, as seen in following chapters.

Well-known contributors to the field of memory studies, including Aleida Assmann, Hirsch, Rigney, Portelli, and Leo Spitz, promote the concept of performativity in a collection of articles linked to a unitary and interdisciplinary framework of performing the past. <sup>169</sup> Their theoretical positioning is that all remembrance is performative through a set of acts at the level of speech, movements, gestures and art. Judith Butler's notions of gender performativity in which gender is a

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Certeau, p. 117.

O'Donovan, in *Cultural Memory*, ed. by Caldicott and Fuchs, p. 316.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> Ibid., p. 317.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Karin Tilmans, Frank van Vree, and Jay Winter, eds, *Performing the Past: Memory, History, and Identity in Modern Europe* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010). Also, see Winter, 'Introduction', pp. 11-23.

cultural construct, further an understanding of the literary and filmic, mostly heterosexual, performances at the Trevi: 'The action of gender requires a performance that is repeated.' This is not an expression of gender, the repetition is a re-enactment and re-experiencing of already socially-established meanings and the action becomes instituted in public space through stylized repetition. The Trevi performances may be said to start with the shaping of its gendered iconography by a patriarchal set of constructs of male and female bodies. However, if gender is seen only as discursive, this overlooks power as politically sanctioned through institutionally practised mechanisms of control using a medium such as architecture. 171

### 2.2.6 'Lieu' and 'Luogo'

Like Certeau, Nora focuses on the concept of place. His sites of memory initially seem particularly relevant to the Trevi as they thrive because of: 'their capacity for change, their ability to resurrect old meanings and generate new ones along with new and unforeseeable connections.'172 Their purpose is: 'to stop time, to inhibit forgetting, to fix a state of things, to immortalize death, and to materialize the immaterial....all in order to capture the maximum possible meaning with the fewest possible signs.<sup>173</sup> Nora's lieux de mémoire of the historical imagination replace the milieux de mémoire of memory-history based on tradition; a contrast with Benjamin for whom the past is present in the historical imagination. 174 Leaving aside the French identity of Nora's sites, the Fountain in its several physical forms might be conceptualized as evolving from a milieu into a lieu, a source from medieval times of water for everyday use and work until the eighteenth-century grand edifice that becomes memory-history. As a *lieu*, it could fit Nora's definition of a 'distorting mirror, twisting its own themes in ways that define its significance', although this turns the Fountain into an active agent. <sup>175</sup> The concept of a memory site in Nora's terms fails to describe the rhetorical construction and debates surrounding monuments. However, the notions of resonance of the moment and renewal of images adds significantly to concepts of memory as an on-going activity in new contexts in that a (successful) memory site is always updating, evolving and

<sup>170</sup> Judith Butler, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* [1990], (London: Routledge, 2007 edn, with Prefaces (1990 and 1999)), p. 191.

Butler addresses political power in *Bodies that Matter: On the Discursive Limits of 'Sex'* (New York: Routledge, 1993), p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>172</sup> Nora, *Realms*, 1, p.15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Ibid., p. 15.

A contrast with Benjamin, for whom the past is present in the historical imagination.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Nora, *Realms*, 1, p. 15.

reshaping. Conversely, Nora's renewed *lieu* conveys a regretted loss of the past, another echo of Benjamin.

The political dimension of state boundaries within which memory realms exist for Nora, Isnenghi and other similarly-orientated theorists imposes the limitations of a framework of national specifity. It cannot account for transculturally remembered symbols, myths, events, personalities, dates, structures and monuments. This is illustrated by a contribution about the Eiffel Tower to Nora's *Realms* from Henri Loyrette who traces its representations since construction through (French) film, art and poetry. 176 It was a symbol of iron manufacturing built for the 1889 Exposition as a one hundred year old daughter of the Revolution; a First World War combatant with a radio signals tower; Second World War French Resistance fighter with sabotaged elevators during Nazi occupation; post-war brothel for American troops; Citroën advertising billboard; place for demonstrations and suicides and a useful subject for cartoons. For the bicentennial of the Revolution it commemorated itself as the memory of an entire century. The Tower changed from a symbol of Paris into one of France. It is not Loyrette's remit to detail the prolific imagery of the monument outside the country. The idea of nationalistic memory sites sits uneasily with that of monuments like the Trevi that travels without borders and accrues inflections of differing ideologies and meanings. The concept of a Nora memory site accommodates new myths like those of the *lucchetti d'amore* in the contemporaneous and resonant moment of their arrival in the Piazza but does not account for the transnational appearances of Trevi imagery and physical replications in new geographical locations. 177 However, the recent updating of *lieux* that focuses on the transnational travelling of memory sites and the dialogic aspects of memory sites, including monuments, reinstates the usefulness of the concept.

The Fountain was not included by Isnenghi and his contributors in their politically-charged Italian memory sites. The irony of defining it as an Italian *luogo* would be its historical positioning in the papal Rome that pre-dates Unification, a problematic subject for definition. Perhaps the Fountain's everyday image is too populist and therefore disregarded as lacking the required political dimension or 'invisible' like Huyssen's perception of the Reichstag before it was wrapped. Mediated fame has placed the Fountain, like the Eiffel Tower, in transcultural memory without national borders.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Henri Loyrette, 'The Eiffel Tower', *Realms*, 1, pp. 348-76.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> See Thesis, 5.3.2.

### 2.2.7 Shaping the Past

Much attention has been directed towards the commemorative aspects of monuments following the rise of trauma studies. The ways in which societies seek to remember traumatic events monumentally, such as the Vietnam Veterans' Memorial in America, are often contested. The physical form the Trevi should take was challenged for decades in the transactions of power between changing papal incumbents. The shaping of images from an imagined classical imperial past interwove and overlapped in differing designs with varying emphases on myth, splendour and decoration, and also affordability. The contesting of memory in the designs can be viewed as the attempted forging of suitable pasts for identity-building without references to uncomfortable events and explicitly for a show of power, demonstrated by other monumental displays like Bernini's earlier Fountain of the Four Rivers in the Piazza Navona.

Part One rejected Freud's analogy between an adult's defensive remodelling of memory and a nation idealizing memory to mask traumatic historical events which reflected his earlier work on individual screen memory. The analogy is inapplicable to the Fountain as it is not a remodelling that masks or represses earlier adverse events during post-Reformation Catholicism. The function of the monument is overtly propagandist. Of more theoretical relevance, following Foucault, is that what the Fountain does not represent is politically significant because of what is forgotten through non-representation. The collective memory of the outcomes of European wars and Crusades and the papal need for suitably distanced pasts is considered in the next chapter on the Trevi as a vehicle for illusory practices. Anderson's viewpoint is applicable when narratives of the past provide a protective function for new political classes seeking to alter the memory of unacceptable pasts and in which monuments, as he maintains, have a part to play.<sup>179</sup> There is an implication of hegemonic power in the knowingly-constructed and self-protecting stories on the Fountain façade.

The approach followed here seeks to focus on forgetting and remembering as reciprocating concepts. It avoids the inferences of dichotomous or unitary phenomena and proposes one of reciprocal relationships. The Trevi partially fits Connerton's category of a repressive instrument for controlling memory rather than erasing it. The organisation of its space offers an iconography of past imperial power and historical

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> John Bodnar explores the contestual discourse about the Memorial between official and vernacular power, the latter winning, in *Remaking America: Public Memory, Commemoration and Patriotism in the Twentieth century* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992).

Anderson refers to monuments, pp. 9-10; p. 185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Connerton, 'Types', p. 59.

master narratives in the architectural script. However, these narratives do not overlay previous ones or seek to repress or replace any of them. The propaganda functions of the Trevi are repressive in the sense of only allowing the expression of the politically dominant memories promulgated by official culture. Anderson's narratives of the past relate to the stories of Roman Empire told on the Fountain façade which constitute attempts by a ruling elite to construct a new international political identity – as if the once militant papacy was finding a new means of demonstrating a military prowess by proxy.

Manipulation of societal memory requires effort and the impact of cultural constraints on the construction of pasts is variable. <sup>181</sup> The Trevi is continually appropriated as a monumental agent in endeavours by political classes wishing to shape pasts to their advantage. Intentions may not be fulfilled when there are inappropriate attempts to engage the Fountain's potential to convey ideology. A misrepresentation of fascist objectives is exemplified by *La Fontana di Trevi* (1941), a film directed by Fernando Cerchio for the Istituto Nazionale Luce (1941) and explored in Chapter Five. Referring again to Wolf Kansteiner, crises of memory tend to coincide with crises of identity when emphasis is laid on the value of memory as identity becomes problematic. <sup>182</sup> Perhaps the Fountain design, by drawing heavily on an imagined imperial past of the exercise of power and control over Rome's politicized water, creates on-going potential in its architectural narratives for interpretive possibilities at times of ideological turbulence: a subject relevant to some Hollywood films in the 1950s in which the Trevi 'features'. <sup>183</sup>

### 2.2.8 Monumental Intentions and Challenges

A recurring observation so far is of the Fountain as a vehicle for dominant ideologies. It is arguably the propaganda monument *par excellence* exploited by papal and then subsequent powerful groups that appropriate and reshape its images. Young's observation is pertinent in that monuments by themselves are of little value, 'mere stones in the landscape', that 'take on lives of their own, often stubbornly resistant to the state's original intentions'. <sup>184</sup> Ideological objectives can be subsequently challenged or undermined. The ways in which monuments, and the Fountain, are remembered

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>181</sup> See Andrea Cossu, 'Memory, Symbolic conflict and Changes in the National Calendar in the Italian Second Republic', *Modern Italy*, 15, 1 (2010), 3-19 (p. 4).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>182</sup> Kansteiner, p. 184.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>183</sup> Chapter Five discusses films indicated here.

Young, Texture, p. 2.

differ from the intentions of their builders who thought that the edifices would be perceived in their terms and fixed for posterity in a 'seemingly land-anchored permanence' of memory. 185 Papal self-aggrandizing intentions on display at the Trevi gave way to the secular performances of the everyday and of pagan rituals, a 'place and space' for personal display with water-sipping and then coin-throwing so that the inscriptions on the façade became merely decorative. For the Trevi, contemporaneous moments that are resonant and specific are politically opportunist. The inauguration day of the Aqua Virgo aqueduct, the choice of the Roman Salvi as architect, the *Trevi rossa* event when red dye was thrown in the water to protest about the Rome Film Festival and the soccer World Cup for advertising, are some of many examples for later exploration.

From the new historicist perspective as exemplified by Foucault, the *Trevi rossa* event challenges the hegemony of an institution like the film industry and a monument as different or deviant should be celebrated as a vehicle for challenging an institutional practice that seeks to control human activity. However, change is viewed by Foucault as unlikely given the power of the state. Trevi representations, and presumably this thesis, would belong to prevailing discourses already determining their interpretations. The material form of the Trevi might be illustrative of his 'rupture with the past' as it is a classical representation of classical representation: a vehicle for the ideology of discursive practices. Again, the inference is that the past is impossible to portray, historiographical narrative is one form of literature and that discourses change. All memory is fictitious for Foucault. However, rupture implicates closure and does not allow for traces and reshaping of imagined pasts. These are more easily accommodated by Halbwachs's view, expressed in the first epigraph to the chapter: 'Depending on its circumstances and point in time, society represents the past to itself in different ways., 186

## 2.2.9 A Slippery Fountain

As Part One notes, the legacy of poststructuralism for memory studies is a discernment of the slippery nature of language: a network of interrelated signifiers in the textual weave means that a final, definitive meaning is not possible. In these terms, the narratives of history and memory studies, and the thesis, are all forms of fictive writing. Images of the Fountain frequently invite the poststructuralist concept of a moving

Young, Texture, p. 3.

Halbwachs, On Collective Memory, pp. 172-73.

signifier with many signifieds. It is interesting that the etymological debate about the Fountain's name, as explored in Chapter One, implicates 'Trevi' as a moving signifier. The words 'Fountain' and 'Trevi' could be said to scatter meaning along an infinite chain of signifiers and signifieds that jostle and slide into and under one another. The weave of the chain might include water, coldness, aqueduct, cleansing, purity, health, monument, memorial, screen, religion, philosophy, myth, power, coins, money, wishes, desire, glamour, gender, ambiguity, renewal, loss, decay, sound and silence.

A measured recognition of the poststructural legacy, of the unreliability of language and fluidity of meaning, assists in evaluating the historiographical, art, literary, filmic, musical, advertising and Internet narratives associated with the Trevi. As a narrative device it appears at key turning points in filmic and literary storytelling that shape and renew intertexts with enhancers such as moonlight, night-time and darkness. The term 'Baroque' for the Fountain's architectural style purveys further linguistic ambiguity of deceptive splendour that interweaves with future narratives of glamour and commodification. The Fountain is made a generator for its own fictions in the structuralist sense of the knowing use of its images: the ambiguous encounters in and by its myth-carrying water.

However, consideration of context is required to situate the Fountain. If the text took priority, the archival documents relating to the Trevi, for example, although unlikely subjects for poststructuralist analysis, could produce an infinite play of significations of indeterminacy and relativity. Only the internal nature of the text and the meaning attributed to one image as valid as the next would be relevant, the deconstructed text itself forming another closed text. The Salvi documents require consideration of their context, the eighteenth-century perception of the past and their political site of production in papal Rome, as well as awareness of the textual language employed.

The linguistic construction of past experience raised by trauma theory does not initially appear applicable to the Fountain. The discourse of trauma studies often concerns the memory spaces of memorials and monuments associated with violent events that caused an extreme disruption of the everyday. The Trevi does not generate nightmarish dreams and painful flashbacks of an event or events that exceed normal registration, apart from individual disasters in the Piazza. As shown by the research

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Thesis, 1.1.5.

Appendix One, Interview One, concerning a missing student, pp. 246-47.

into bearing witness considered here, part of the value of trauma theory in memory studies is its poststructuralist inheritance of questioning language and the bringing of the past into the present, of allowing the remembrance of past events in the present to be acknowledged.

#### 2.2.10 Moving on with a Fluid Framework

Locating the Fountain in terms of theories of memory reflects the challenging complexity of the field. Notions that underscore the following chapters include attentiveness to the politics of memory, the gendered performativity surrounding the remembered Trevi and its mediated transmission, the sociocultural location of the enquirer, the dynamics of the contemporary as constantly in a state of flux and to memory as a social practice. Acts of performance, representation, and interpretation require agents and specific contexts, and memory as an active practice integrates elements of remembrance and invention. <sup>189</sup> As a research subject, the Trevi adds to understandings of the multiple processes of memory, and theories of memory add to understandings of the multivalent Trevi.

The framework is (appropriately for a fountain subject) fluid in that no one theory quite fits the cultural production of Trevi images. The critical approaches selected are necessarily eclectic, used partially and in combinations, with their provenance identified as far as possible within the loose critical structure they constitute. Major influences are acknowledged: from Benjamin on bringing the past into the present; Halbwachs on group memory; Connerton on ritual performance; Certeau on the everyday, space and place, and palimpsests; Aleida Assmann and Jan Assmann on communicative memory and ideological transmission; Huyssen on mediated monuments and Young on their interpretive opportunities, and Hirsch and Smith, and Sturken on memory as active and inventive. These theoretical influences are foremost among others drawn upon.

Memory theorists frequently employ the terms of 'representing' and 'reconstructing' the past whilst emphasizing it is not a fixed absolute. The second and third epigraphs for this chapter use such phrasing. Also, the term 'past' is semantically difficult. The framework evolving here offers the idea of a process, of a shaping and inventing of imagined pasts. In other words, a remembering enacted in the present that

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>189</sup> Hirsch and Smith, p. 5; Sturken, p. 258-59.

is a forging of memory in both senses of the word, as the third epigraph to the chapter conveys: 'Memory is active, forging its pasts to serve present interests.' 190

Sites of memory add to the conceptual mix if Nora's orientations are widened to become more dialogic and transcultural. His resonance of the contemporary moment relates to the politics of remembering and the many attempts to determine memory for posterity through appropriation of the Fountain. A recurring aspect is the undermining of intentions for future memory which raises the ideological issues of forgetting and remembering, contested memory, and the political dynamics involved when particular stories are told at the expense of others. Ideology is taken to mean a system of interconnected symbols and beliefs by which a culture seeks to perpetuate itself through discourses of ritual and persuasion, for which the Trevi is an outlet.

The memory-related practices associated with the Fountain suggest a spatially dispersed nexus of circulating images that bounce off one another, shaping new memory. This notion avoids the limiting binary concepts of individual and collective memory, or history and memory, and creates hybrid opportunities for remembering the Fountain. The value of hybridity lies in the potential for interpretation of its imagery in the narratives of art, literature, film, music, advertising and cyberspace. The intertextuality within and across media, for which the Fountain becomes a host, is a notion borrowed from the literary field. It enables an approach that invites research informed by other disciplines and conducted at their intersections, whilst remaining rooted in the field of memory studies: what is termed cross-disciplinary. The term 'disciplinary' attracts prefixes and debate over practices.

Attention is paid to the nature of the language in the texts through which the Fountain is narrated whether in history, art, literature, music, song, film, photography, guidebooks or on the Internet. This is balanced by paying equal attention to the contexts of these narratives and the interdependency of text and context. The question of whether the Trevi's digitized representations belong to a new form of memory frequently appears alongside other theoretical positions in the thesis.

<sup>191</sup> Reference was made in inaugural addresses at the IMLR launch (December 2013) to emerging cross-disciplinary and interdisciplinary research between humanities and sciences. <sup>192</sup> Clodagh Brook and Giuliana Pieri discuss the implications for Italian Studies in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> Radstone and Schwarz, *Memory*, p.3.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;Interdisciplinary Italy: Disciplines, Inter-disciplines and Transmediality', *Lingua e cultura italiana nei mass media*, Supplement 21, ed. by Marco Gargiulo (Rome: Aracne, 2014), pp. 13-31. Also, see *The Practice of Cultural Analysis: Exposing Interdisciplinary Interpretation*, ed. by Mieke Bal (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999).

In summary, a flexible framework for placing the Trevi is proposed, one in which occasional 'rewiring' switches on its potential conceptual energy. The hybridity in the approach taken generates a diverse conceptual mix informed by appropriate eclecticism. The Fountain also invites the metaphor of a critical lens through which to observe the refracted narratives of cultural memory that are attracted to it, a lens that also reveals the remembering that makes it iconic by the on-going intermedial reshaping of its images. There is a need to be mindful that the Fountain is not the agent doing the forgetting or remembering: it is the host or vehicle for narratives that appropriate its imagery. The collectively transmitted memory by groups with transnationally shared social frameworks, the changing discourses of power, and cultural memory as an inventive practice spanning backwards and forwards situate the Fountain as a vehicle for the illusory practices of political power and performance.

## CHAPTER THREE

## Fountain for Illusion:

# Power, Competitive Memory, Performance

Society, in each period, rearranges its recollections in such a way as to adjust them to the various conditions of its equilibrium.

Halbwachs<sup>1</sup>

#### Introduction

The convergences and divergences offered by the approaches to memory in Chapter Two show how no single theory or mix of theories can encapsulate the elusive workings of the Trevi Fountain. Chapter One also indicates that there are challenges when situating the Fountain in historical contexts and accounting for its material presences. The key notions of the theoretical framework for the thesis are the tissues of interwoven collective and individual memory and their transmission by groups; memory as an active practice acquiring meaning in the present; and the political dimension to memory that shapes its own self-serving myths. The notions contribute, across all the chapters, to an understanding of the Fountain as a vehicle for illusion and the associated discourses of power and performance.

The imagery of the iconic and populist Trevi offers insights into the manipulation of memory through the telling of selected stories and overlooking of others across the millennia. Before achieving a material presence, the pre-symbolic idea of the Trevi was alluring for appropriation as a host for ideological narratives in design images transmitted in cultural memory which continued to circulate with evolving meanings in changing contexts. As an eighteenth-century spectacle, the Fountain increasingly became a vehicle for illusion in the practice of attempted persuasion by deception.

Previous reference has been made to the remembered classical myths

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Halbwachs, *On Collective Memory*, p. 182-83.

surrounding the Acqua Virgo aqueduct that were pictured in designs by fountain architects for papal patrons requiring a replacement Trevi. The myths portrayed in this medium circulated until the early years of the eighteenth century and the connotations held in collective memory by dominant groups of the storytelling water of the aqueduct continued to shape a future Trevi for their political purposes. The monument emerged slowly from their shared social frameworks of memory and eventually took the form of illusory performance and spectacle in Salvi's winning design of 1732. Figure [27].

These aspects relate to the Trevi in projects and competitions, the power of water and its economic benefits, the transmission of myth in memory both official and vernacular, and the social and institutional contexts of competitive memory within a powerful Roman Academy. The new monument that slowly emerges is evaluated in this chapter as a purveyor for papal propaganda. Its iconography is linked to patriarchal notions of the human body, concluding with their interpretations in the bas-reliefs of Trivia and Agrippa and their *Nachleben* performances. The following premises strengthen. Firstly, that the myth-making water associated with the Trevi always links to a prevailing and underlying, sometimes explicit, ideological discourse of power in search of its own myths. Secondly, that the gendered performances of its iconography prefigure future ones across contrasting and converging media which are attracted to them for the expression of their own illusory and sexual practices. The Fountain is always a cross-disciplinary nexus of cultural significations that shift around and slip into and under each other, as unreliable and infinitely inventive as memory: it consistently invites the metaphor of memory as an elusive process.

## 3.1 The Ideological Power of Water

## 3.1.1 The Trevi 'in Waiting': Contra Flows of Memory

The architectural aesthetic of theatrically grand building works in papal Rome fostered by Alexander VII (1655–1667) generated a cityscape dimension in which the imagined Trevi continued its historical record of belonging amongst unrealized ambitions. <sup>2</sup> It remained the functional medieval edifice enhanced architecturally by Alberti, important for its drinking water, watering of horses and as a workplace for laundry and cleaning wool. Numerous designs for a successor were produced when the monumental glorification of Rome restarted with the audience-orientated urbanism of Clement XI

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Habel, pp. 2-3.

(1700–1721).<sup>3</sup> Following restoration of the Acqua Vergine conduits and its improved water power, designers and architects were again invited to submit proposals. The Trevi was one of three major schemes, the others being the renovation of the Porto di Ripetta on the Tiber and the Spanish Steps that, like the Trevi project, escalated in significance until built by a new pope, Clement XII (1730–1740).<sup>4</sup> Designs for a new Trevi in the meantime emerged and disappeared sporadically due to lack of funding and disagreements over designs.

Plans for monuments can be overturned by alternative proposals. Official culture seeking to promote itself through monumental shaping of the past may resist any weakening of control by what it regards as the inappropriate plans of vernacular or unofficial culture about the shaping of the past, as these detract from its self-preserving ideological aims. During the long wait for a new Trevi, conflicting visions of the past in its designs for changing papal patrons fluctuated in diverse political contexts from the late Renaissance until the early Enlightenment. Favoured but transient themes ranged from obelisks to Roma, the city goddess.

Vernacular objections to some projects are discernible in the written narratives of unofficial culture which refer to Bernini's building materials, Paolo Benaglia's design and papal taxes levied for construction. Following La Capra, on the significance of text and its context, the elite narrative voices conveying popular objection are those of diarists and architectural commentators like Francesco Valesio and Francesco Milizia.<sup>6</sup>

The objection to Bernini's plan arose from his proposal to demolish the ancient tomb of the patrician Cecilia Metella on the Appian Way in the 1640s and use the stones for his new Trevi. The architectural disregard for the material presences of antiquity was common in the destructive building practices of papal Rome and ironically inconsistent with the expression of a classical past in new designs. The ancient tomb merited attention in public memory for its preservation in some way. The existence of a Bernini design for the Fountain is also the subject of some contestation in the narratives of fountain historians: one project shows a large square basin and a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Habel, also Johns on the changing face of Rome.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Johns, p. 171.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Sturken, pp. 1-17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Francesco Valesio, *Diario di Roma*, 6 vols [1700-1742], 3-6 [1704-1742], ed. by Gaetano Scano (Milan: Longanesi & C., 1977-1979); Milizia, *Memorie*, 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> D'Onofrio describes the papal plan, based on Bernini's proposal, and the opposition incurred, *Le fontane*, p. 237.

central arch framing a view of gardens behind, surrounded by trees, and is attributed to Jan Miel by Pinto and to Bernini by D'Onofrio.<sup>8</sup>

The Trevi project commenced by Benaglia in the late 1720s was cancelled after attracting derisive criticism, according to Valesio. The disdainful narrative voice in his diary entry refers to Benaglia as 'un certo scultore napoletano' who had roused local opposition. He is further derided as: 'un uomo ardito ma di poco o niun sapere nella sua arte, ed egli ha di già fatto il modello, veduto da molti'. The entries contain numerous references to the construction of Salvi's Fountain in its first ten years until Valesio's death in 1742. He notes that unfinished columns were targeted for complaints in *pasquinati* messages pinned to them about papal funding from taxes on lottery winnings. They echo a *pasquinato* protest that targeted Urban VIII in the early 1640s when he raised a tax on wine for funding Bernini's Trevi: 'Urban, poi che di tasse aggravò il vino, ricrea con l'acqua il popolo di Quirino'. The subjects of the criticisms, the papally owned lottery and the cost of wine, implicate instruments of official control over everyday hope and illusion as already associated with the Fountain.

The posted messages intimate future expressions of public objections to plans for the Trevi: in articles written in fascist Rome about the regime's plans for structural alteration of the location; the red dye thrown in the water as a protest in 1967 about the Vietnam War and its mimicking by the *Trevi rossa* event in 2007 about the city's expenditure on the film festival which, in the pre-viral era, resulted in a proliferation of Internet *pasquinati* emails posted on newspaper websites. <sup>13</sup> The Trevi continues to appear and disappear as a publicly contested site over official actions that impinge on personal well-being – one taken to ironic extremes by the coin thief, Cercelletta – and producing contra flows of memory.

Hegemonic power is often placed under pressure from diverse political challenges, many revolving around struggles to produce new spaces or preserve old ones. The significance attached to building particular public monuments depended on how successive incumbents of the Vatican viewed the plans of predecessors. In the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 46; D'Onofrio, *Acque*, pp. 534-36.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Valesio, 4 (4 July 1728), p. 966.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Ibid., p. 966.

Ibid., 5 (5 September 1733): 'In occasione di qualche dilazione fatta nel pagamento di coloro che hanno vinto al lotto, sono stati attaccati alcuni cartelli allusivi alla perdita fatta dalla Camera: alle colonne non ancora terminate della fontana di Trevi', and at other locations, pp. 628-29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Schiavo, *La Fontana*, p. 107.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> <a href="http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it">http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it</a> [accessed 11 February 2008]. Other events are detailed later.

context of political rivalry between the families of papal princes the Trevi was used in transactions of power. Previous designs were discarded and new competitions, with interim designs rejected, drew upon images held in cultural memory and shaped them to meet changed political requirements. Arguably the clash between dynastic papal cultures allowed for a lengthy shifting but competitive focusing and refocusing on the contours of circulating memory to determine the physical form of the new monument, until brought to a rushed conclusion by the Corsinis.

The imagined Trevi was being appropriated as an ideological vehicle for religious narratives about empire past and present in designs: the obelisks, triumphal arches and mythological Greek and Roman deities mentioned earlier. The context for this imagining according to Peter Sherlock is: 'an early modern Europe replete with deliberately created memories and invented commemorations designed as responses to the Reformation, with its attendant loss of an established narrative for the past.'14 This does not accord with the view taken in this thesis that new nations reinvent rather than lose narratives about their pasts. Anderson's notion of reinvention, or invention, by nations is widened here to include the belief system of Catholicism that was seeking to re-establish itself with a new Western, if not global, identity. At the time of designing and starting to build the Fountain the forging of suitable pasts was central to the ongoing invention of Rome's political and religious identities in the late post-Reformation era. The popes and designers of the Trevi Fountain drew upon perceived myths of a distant past, as their predecessors had done, and future rulers of Rome would attempt: for example, in the iconography of the three earlier Baroque fountains in the Piazza Navona and the Emanuele II Monument of the nineteenth century.

Continuing to follow Anderson's approach in part about a new nation's manipulation of the memory of old spaces and chronologies, the difference in the narratives conveyed by the Trevi designs and those of other Baroque monuments is their intersection with very old spaces and chronologies. There is, debatably, a knowing attempt in their aesthetics to memorialize the desirable aspects of the Roman Empire, although not necessarily a knowing forgetting of two millennia of inconvenient episodes: the disputed papacies, schisms, invasions and occupations of Italy, the Avignon years of papal exile and the major Crusades, the final, minor one as recent as the early 1700s. Kansteiner's view is relevant again, that when crises of memory

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Peter Sherlock, 'The Reformation of Memory in Early Modern Europe', in *Memory*, eds Radstone and Schwarz, pp. 30-40 (p. 40).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Anderson (2006), pp. 187-206.

coincide with crises of identity, memory is valorized where identity is problematized.<sup>16</sup> The metaphor of a monumental mask like the Trevi façade as preventing or remodelling memory of events also presents itself, a subject for later discussion.

Designers of large public monuments like the Fountain shared social frameworks of memory in which the official culture of Catholicism promoted myths that reflected its own dogma, such as Frontinus's *puella virguncula*. A sculpturing of Rome's mythical past is configured in iconography representing classical deities in charge of the world's water that furthered papal transnational ambitions by association. The illusory performance of controlling the natural world and the physical health of humanity provided the link to domination of spiritual health. Hydraulic mastery had practical virtues for rulers wanting to display a concern for public salubrity by the provision of water that in turn provided them with a flow of income and narratives of power and performance.

## 3.1.2 The Ownership of Water: Fluid Currency

The long fall of water down the Trevi cascade and the gushing jets in the rockwork generate an exaggerated sense of energy, movement and sound. As Chapter One describes, the design continues the *fontanieri* tradition of artistic contrivance dependent on architectural skill to deceive. Counteracting the weak flow of water in the Acqua Virgo conduits is shown in Bernini's earlier design for the Fountain of the Four Rivers where the illusion of power is achieved by running the water over and through the rockwork beneath the raised obelisk. The deceptively produced power in the movement of Trevi water adds to its illusory effects: the Fountain is not what it seems. As a *fons* for interpretive opportunities it no longer refers to the natural everyday world of water it strives to imitate but to its own images of controlled power. When the Fountain stops playing, its signification does not diminish or shut down but adds to its productivity as a literary and filmic narrative device. The Fountain increasingly becomes a generator for fictions by the knowing use made of its images, including that of its silence.

Illusory effects associated with principles of creation in the hydraulic architecture of fountains intended for display was a prominent style amongst *fontanieri* competing for the custom of princes from the Renaissance onwards. These rulers had, as Schama points out: 'a professional interest in the revelation of cosmic harmonies, the laws which disclosed the stable, self-regulating circularities governing the universe [...]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Kansteiner, p. 184.

and might provide the prince with the potent weapon of metaphysical knowledge.' <sup>17</sup> Water was always a profitable commodity in papal Rome, becoming 'the currency of cardinals', as termed by Rinne, with a small elite owning the majority of sources and their by-products for lucrative sale, such as run-off water from fountain basins and working troughs. <sup>18</sup> The power of water-based illusion had acquired economic benefits and, on the threshold of capitalism, the new Fountain in the service of a hegemonic political class prefigured the future commodification and promotional use of its water. The monumental interpretation by Salvi of the pure and life-giving circulation of water would be of use to later powerful groups requiring strategies for the marketing of products, especially those with a fluid component such as lager, drinks and showers.

Rome's two earlier *mostre*, the Paul V and the Moses, the former with minimal iconography and the latter with its disliked statue, were quickly built. Arguably, because of these attributes of poor design, they are, in Nora's terms, unable to 'capture the maximum possible meaning with the fewest possible signs' and lack the necessary productive dynamism for image renewal. <sup>19</sup> The sinking design of the leaking *La barcaccia* Fountain in the Piazza di Spagna is variously interpreted. It can be a boat cast up after the flooding of the Tiber in 1598 onto the hillside that later became the Spanish Steps; a ship of the papal navy quelling the flames of battle; the remains of an ancient vessel discovered in a nearby lake or linked with Keats's death (who lived in the house overlooking *La barcaccia*) and his chosen epithet: 'Here lies one whose name was writ in water'. <sup>20</sup>

The elusive future Trevi presented and re-presented itself in the elitist fountain imaginary of architects and patrons, the images fading away and re-emerging in shapes and sizes according to the preferences and priorities of patrons. The interpretive opportunities afforded by perceptions of a classical past were constantly moving and adapting whilst the precarious material presence of the new Fountain faltered. Conversely, Elizabeth MacDougall calls into question assumptions about the direct influence of the past on design by arguing that the decorations for new fountains were not based solely on ancient prototypes but were also the result of invention by

<sup>17</sup> Schama, pp. 277-78.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> By the 1600s about 80% of Rome's water supply was appropriated by cardinals, nobles, monasteries and charitable organizations. See Rinne, pp. 181-92 (p. 181).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Nora, *Realms*, 1, p. 15.

Morton recounts these stories, *Waters*, pp. 112-16.

designers.<sup>21</sup> Her query draws nearer to the possibility that cultural memory was successfully reworking its own images in a new political context of a widening market requiring the expression of wealth through display. The productiveness of competitive design memory combined with delays debatably allowed for an increase in the potential of imagery focusing on water and perpetual virginity. These key ideological components were concomitant with propaganda requirements in the stylistic aesthetic of monumental *grandezza* for the papal design competitions. A selection of designs that aptly illustrate the working of memory processes is offered in the following section.

## 3.2 The Flows of Myth in Memory

## 3.2.1 Officially Remembered Images

In a monument-conscious Rome of ruins and sporadic building programmes and the renovated water infrastructure of the previous century, the new Trevi was being built in memory by the medium of design drawings without referencing a material presence, a reflection of Huyssen's future virtual monuments that are only constructed on the Internet.<sup>22</sup> As mentioned earlier, the projects continued to resonate with the inventive practices of memory in the forging of very distant pasts in the contemporaneous present. For more than a hundred years the official Fountain existed only in the unexecuted designs associated with a constellation of myths that circulated until, and after, construction began.

A drawing, attributable to Giacomo Della Porta (c. 1590), one of Rome's prominent fountain designers and builders, is for a *mostra* to replace the Alberti Fountain. Figure [31]. Its *grandezza* is depicted by numerous columns, elaborate arches and a large *vascone*. Its architectural style and iconography depicting water mythology are echoed in an equally complex anonymous design in the early 1640s for Urban VIII concerning the same site just before demolition by Bernini. Figure [32]. The intertextuality of the two drawings travel into future designs, and into Salvi's winning one of 1732. Figure [27]. The popularity of such symbolism peaked in the two competitions held between 1704 to 1706 and then 1730 to 1732 with other projects submitted in the intervening years. Perceived pasts of Rome and Greece interweave in reshapings of the classical: obelisks, triumphal arches, water spouts, Trivia, deities,

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Elizabeth MacDougall, 'The Sleeping Nymph: Origins of a Humanist Fountain Type', *The Art Bulletin*, 57 (1975), 357-65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Huyssen, 'Monumental Seduction', p. 206.

Roma, water nymphs, the aqueduct and its source. There is often an overload of visual information as the weave intensifies so that it conversely reduces the impact of the intended message of authoritative power.

The theme of the first papal competition or *Concorso clementino* held at the Accademia di San Luca from 1704 and 1706 was the siting in a fountain of a column or obelisk shipped to Rome from the conquests of the Roman Empire in Egypt.<sup>23</sup> The obelisk was a political design requirement for several earlier fountains, in the Piazza of St Peter's, Piazza Navona and the Piazza del Popolo. Many designs show Catholic symbols on tops of obelisks apparently triumphing over pagan antiquity without contemporary awareness that the obelisk itself was a religiously worded artefact.<sup>24</sup> Often Greek and Roman symbolic figures mingle at their bases. <sup>25</sup> The configured idea of the Trevi with a central obelisk, also found in later designs that re-introduce the theme, brings interpretations of past pagan civilisations into the present of Rome. Egyptian, Greek and Roman religious symbols jostle pictorially with those of Catholicism and reflect the customary practices of the papacy to express a dominant spirituality by absorption of other religions. The designs demonstrate the political use of classical mythology in post-Reformation art to strengthen religious identity. Examples of Christian symbols appropriating classical artefacts are the statues of St Peter on top of Trajan's column and St Paul on the Marcus Aurelius column. They express the power of Rome by self-reference to its legendary roots, to its former empire of powerful militarism, its Egyptian province and to the Greek religion that it assimilated. The design traces carry forward in the attempted colonization of future memory through the agency of the Fountain 'in waiting'.

The popular candidate for a Trevi with a Roman column, the pink granite Antonius Pius (161 CE), was excavated near the Piazza but severely damaged when the shed protecting it caught fire.<sup>26</sup> One elaborate design (1706) shows a stairway snaking upwards in twelve coils around the column to a square viewing platform, echoing externally the internal staircase inside the column of Marcus Aurelius in the Piazza Colonna near the Trevi. Figure [33]. The attribution of the design is another contestation

Morton details obelisks, claiming thirteen were re-used in papal Rome; six in fountains, eg the Pantheon and Four Rivers, *Waters*, pp. 266-81.Ernest Nash has illustrations, *A Pictorial Dictionary*, pp. 130-62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Johns, p. 182. Obelisk hieroglyphs could not be translated pre-Rosetta Stone (c. 1800) and perceived as decorative symbols on tombs.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Pinto groups twelve designs, *The Trevi*, pp. 70-85.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Lisa Vogel, *The Column of Antonius Pius* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1973).

in the narrative of fountain historians, Pinto favouring Bernardo Borromini, nephew of the architect Francesco Borromini, and D'Onofrio electing Bernardo Castelli, a Borromini relative.<sup>27</sup> A statue, either of Christ or the commissioning pope, Clement XI, tops the column, the latter's escutcheon appearing at the base among the naked female statuary in rocks above a tiny basin with small spouts so that the minimal role played by water weakens it as a moving signifier. The function of water is outweighed by the many pasts layered into the drawing and reduced to one of decorative value.

The drawings for the *Concorso* of 1704 to1706 at the San Luca give no indication of the two uneven and separate wings of the palazzo behind their fountains or the gap between them bridged by the unfinished Bernini Trevi that they would replace. The physical environment was determining the limitation of the site and size of the monument. The three winning designs presented are for the 'Second Class of Architecture Project for a Public Fountain Celebration' and produced during the period of renewed interest in the Trevi. The competition ran in conjunction with another for which no known visual images survive: the design specification required a wall fountain, not a free-standing monument. The new requirement opened up future potential, for the next and final competition, of a large façade with domination of the palazzo when it eventually acquired a uniform frontage. The competitions introduced a proto-capitalist element as Trevi designers strove for the winning place in the prestigious and competitive market of fountain construction.

Benaglia's Fountain of the Virgin of the Rosary in the 1720s was the last project to reach some form of a material presence, whether in workshop or on site is unclear, before Salvi started his construction in 1732. It was abandoned in its early stages by the new pope, Clement XII. Amongst the stucco models, according to Valesio, is the Virgin as the central figure.<sup>31</sup> Trivia (he uses her name) points towards her with one hand and with the other to water issuing from some rocks, a unicorn beside her and on the other side is Roma in armour, a sow with piglets beside her. It is all framed, Valesio adds sarcastically, by two oak trees so that the sow can feed from acorns. There is a physical trace of Benaglia's Trevi on the Salvi monument in the legacy of the Fames that the

<sup>27</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 70; D'Onofrio, *Le fontane*, p. 540. See Illustrations Booklet index, p. 3, Figure 33, confirming Pinto's attribution.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Hellmut Hager groups *Concorsi* designs in *Architectural Fantasy and Reality: Drawings* from the Accademia nazionale di San Luca in Rome, Concorsi clementini, 1700-1750, Exhibition catalogue (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University, 1982), pp. 53-63.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Ibid., pp. 53, 61. Hager's titles are in English. The three drawings are in pen and wash, p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Ibid., on the wall fountain requirement, p. 54.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Valesio, 4 (5 July 1728), p. 966.

former architect had started sculpting for his project.<sup>32</sup> These were transferred to the attic after he died: a form of Benaglia memorial.<sup>33</sup> The statue of the Virgin in Santa Maria Sopra Minerva may be another physical trace of his elusive Trevi.<sup>34</sup> The French sculptor, Edme Bouchardon refers in a letter of 3 September 1731 (spelling errors unedited) to Benaglia as: 'un sculpteur des plus mauvais qu'il i eut, sous Benoît XIII. Depuis la mort de ce pape, on a esté si mécontent de cette ouvrage que lont a fait cesser ce dit sculpteur.'<sup>35</sup> Benaglia's Trevi is present in its traces as are the earlier edifices that exist only in written and visual images, interwoven into the tissue of memories, partially remembered and partially forgotten.

There are fewer extant or documented designs for the next *concorso* held between 1730 to 1732 than for the previous one: more present absences with unknown contributions to the fountain being built in memory. The known images circulate in the texts of fountain historians, on Internet databases and in exhibitions. The Trevi competition was referred to as one of the most important undertakings in Rome by Bouchardon who was among the foreign entrants. Salvi may have won the competition by default for local political reasons, his Dutch friend, with the italianized name of Luigi Vanvitelli, having been first considered.

The idea of the Fountain continued to build as an attractive host for architecturally performative narratives of power. On the drawing board, circa 1730, the space in front of the new uniform frontage of the Palazzo begins to fill variously with fountains possessing arches, deities, Trivia, and central figures. The last include: Neptune, Roma, and Tuccia, one of the Vestal Virgins whose task in mythology was to carry water in a sieve from the Tiber to the Temple as proof of her chastity. Salvi's earlier submission shows how designers start to utilize the entirety of the Palazzo frontage. Figure [34]. The obelisk and column reappear in some drawings. One depicts a section of ruined overground aqueduct taking a central position with trees in the garden of the palazzo viewed through an arch; a possible Trivia figure stands in a

<sup>32</sup> Valesio, p. 966. Pinto, *The Trevi*, has criticisms of Benaglia, pp.59-60, 96-97.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> D'Onofrio details Benaglia's work before and after Salvi's Trevi started, *Acque*, pp. 544-48.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> See D'Onofrio on statue's location, *Acque*, p. 548.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Alphonse Roserot, *La Vie et l'œuvre d'Edme Bouchardon en Italie, Gazette des Beaux-Arts*, 40 (July 1908), pp. 17-37 (pp. 30-33).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Pinto groups known designs, *The Trevi*, pp. 100-119.

Roserot, p. 30. Rosario Assunto details the community of foreign artists and competitive nature of design competitions, *Specchio vivente del mondo: artisti stranieri in Roma, 1600-1800* (Rome: De Luca, 1978).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> D'Onofrio, Acque, p. 550.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Ibid., *Acque*, Figures 674; 676, p. 553. Salvi submitted several designs, Schiavo, p. 22.

foregrounded fountain with three small spouts.<sup>40</sup> Compared to the designs of 1704 to 1706, the imagery of the competition is more emphatic in representing the ideological power of water as underpinning the presentation of the Fountain.

Salvi combines fountain and palace so that the former dominates and makes the Trevi a *fontana-palazzo*. Figure [27]. His design successfully meets a political requirement showing the power of water ownership in the context of the rivalry between the Conti owners of the Palazzo and the Corsini pope in control of the waters of Rome. None of the other known designs celebrates as cohesively the association of myth and water resulting in a self-referential and self-celebratory Fountain. Its themes show an awareness of written texts over millennia, the grand projects for the old site and earlier designs.

The water mythology in Salvi's winning design refers to a nexus of its own images and offers on-going possibilities for appropriation of this power. It contrasts with an earlier design in which he partially utilizes the Palazzo frontage. Figure [34]. Roma is the central figure but isolated inside a central niche, disassociated from a lower, small cascade that is flanked by two grand curving stairways. The palazzo façade and fenestration dominate the limited iconography. Grandness is transferred to the Conti palazzo without visual connection between cascade, basin and iconography and fails to underscore the intended meaning of water as Clementine power.

The images of the Trevi in competitions and other design submissions reflect the inventive processes in the production of cultural memory when it is competitive. There is a layered multiplicity of remembering and forgetting in the flow of myth for an imagined *mostra* over time, not only in the designs submitted but also in the writings of contemporary commentators that generates new but related memory. The drawn out project becomes a site of conflict over construction plans, disliked projects – and attributions in the later narratives of Trevi historians, Cooke, D'Onofrio, Pinto, and Schiavo. The designs once grouped together for competitive display are now gathered in clusters of numbered, titled and indexed figures in academic textbooks, art exhibition catalogues and on Internet databases. They are arranged according to new selective and changing interests, as shown by this text and the accompanying Illustrations booklet. Competing images of the Trevi in cultural memory multiply and evolve over time to meet needs incurred by changes in power structures. The anticipation of a future Trevi

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, Figure 70, c.1730, citing 1986 source: Berlin Kunstbibliothek, Hdz. 1015.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> The re-siting of images is explored in thesis, 4.3.4.

that would compete in the market place of illusory practices such as the purveying of dreams through the selling of holidays and alcoholic drinks resonates in the interpretations of myth in eighteenth-century projects. Attention now turns from designs to designers and their groupings in the institutional contexts of power.

## 3.3 The Social Context of Competitive Memory

#### 3.3.1 Transmissions

Groups of artists, sculptors and designers developed and shaped culturally 'desirable' Trevi images for their plans with lapses like Benaglia's that failed to connect with the contemporary present. The understanding of institutions as bearers and transmitters for cultural memory and of the norms that structure the cultural supply of knowledge is a significant dimension of the theoretical framework for situating the Trevi. 42 It is a perspective that helps to underscore the significance of the political contexts of the groups attracted by the on-going enterprise.

The leading fountain architects, sculptors and patrons in the Rome of the seventeenth to eighteenth centuries, and in other cities, formed changing groups over time within established power structures. Expanding on Halbwachs's theory of shared memory, the Rome group designing the Trevi was enclosing itself within social frameworks of memory that it constructed to transform the space in which it found itself into its own image. 43 It was within this space that the idea of the Trevi was transmitted. The exterior environment and the relationship which the group experienced with it was permeating the idea that it had of itself, the environment including the everyday one of the physical traces of classical Rome, and accumulating representations.

The style of the arches and bas-reliefs on the Arches of Constantine and Titus resonate on the Trevi. Traces of the ruined nymphæum of the Agua Iulia are to be seen on all three Baroque *mostre*, in the arrival of water through triumphal arches and, in the instance of the Trevi, a statue of Oceanus. A circular form of his face had appeared horizontally for centuries on what was probably once a Cloaca Maxima sewer cover which then became the upright Bocca della Verità. It later acquired the myth of biting the hand of someone telling a lie when inserting a hand in his mouth.

Many sculptors who were restorers of classical statues in their workshops referenced their work from ancient examples which were studied to rediscover stylistic

Jan Assmann, 'Collective Memory', 125-33.
 Halbwachs, [1950], p. 130.

secrets. 44 Designers and architects continued to transmit some of Bernini's legacy of water rushing over rockwork and of earlier architectural styles such as Michelangelo's false frontages on monuments: an economy of grandness. 45 Many were members of the powerful Accademia degli Arcadi and of the Accademia di San Luca under papal patronage. 46 Nowhere, observes Johns, was the cosmopolitanism of early eighteenthcentury Rome more apparent than in these two institutions. 47 Salvi was already a member of the Arcadi, as was his friend Vanvitelli, with admission to the San Luca in 1732. His chief sculptor, Giovanni Battista Maini, had held the powerful annual position of Principe at the San Luca. Previous members included Bernini, Francesco Borromini, Pietro Da Cortona, Carlo Fontana, and Piranesi; popes, as honorary members, controlled the output of art through their patronage and competitions at the Accademia as for the Trevi. 48 The Fountain project was being produced by an elite group for its papal patrons who were seeking to supervise and control the official supply of cultural knowledge through the institutional practices of an academy.

The San Luca developed from its origins as a university for painters and sculptors in the late sixteenth century, soon admitting architects with equal status and rights who were specialists in their fields and in competitive designing. According to its website, the Accademia's prestige during the seventeenth century reached an apex amidst increasing international recognition and membership of foreign artists.<sup>49</sup> On the other hand, the ease with which the profession of painter could be followed may have been one of the reasons for the growing art market and attractiveness of Rome. 50 A link between the San Luca and the Academie Française allowed for the exchange of ideas so that French painters, architects and sculptors spent periods of time in Rome and could also be elected *principe*. 51 The transmission of memories within similar cultural

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Germain Bazin, *Baroque and Rococo*, trans. by Jonathan Griffin (London: Thames and Hudson, 1964), p. 24. An example is the Renaissance restoration of the Laocoön statue,

c. 40 BCE.

45 As for the Palazzo dei Conservatori, Piazza di Campidoglio, two centuries earlier. Examples in James Ackerman, The Archaeology of Michelangelo (London: Penguin 1995).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Information on the renamed Academy, still near the Trevi is on

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.Accademianazionaledisanluca.it">http://www.Accademianazionaledisanluca.it</a> [accessed 20 July 2009] <sup>47</sup> Johns, p. 204.

Francis Haskell, *Patron and Painters: Art and Society in Baroque Italy* (Yale: Yale University Press, 1993), pp. 17-18. Membership from the 1500s to 1700s is on <a href="http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/ItalianAcademies">http://www.bl.uk/catalogues/ItalianAcademies</a> [accessed 10 May 2012]

<sup>49 &</sup>lt;a href="http://accademianazionaledisanluca.it">http://accademianazionaledisanluca.it</a> [accessed 20 July 2009]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Patrizia Cavazzini describes Rome's international importance for artists, *Painting as* Business in Early Seventeenth-Century Rome (Pennsylvania: The State University Press, 2008), p. 1. 51 Hager, p. 5.

groupings allowed for an early crossing of transnational boundaries by Trevi images into the official cultures of other European nation states, as reflected by Bouchardon's comments on the importance of the Trevi project and the foreigners competing.<sup>52</sup>

Projects for the architectural embellishment of the city became increasingly competitive during the papacy of Clement XI who used the Accademia as a testing ground for the development of ideas at a time of political threats to papal authority. From 1702, the competitions carried his name forward during the century and into the next as the *Concorsi clementini*. The awards ceremonies took place in the prestigious Palazzo dei Conservatori on the Campidoglio in front of patrons and their entourages. The academicians were distancing themselves from the artisans' guilds and confraternities to which they had belonged and decreasing the social distance between themselves and princely patrons in the aristocracy and wealthy citizenry. 53 The Trevi enterprise in this context is one of increasingly elitist endeavour. The combination of political interests and ownership of artistic excellence was a powerful combination for seeking to establish intended meanings for posterity through the San Luca's output and controlling the contributions of outsiders like Bouchardon, for instance. As Patrizia Cavazzini notes, the institution presented a one-sided view of the art world in Rome.<sup>54</sup> The academicians demonstrated that power resides in the exercise of political authority through art. When a project like Benaglia's fell short of ideological impact it could be terminated although not the memory traces.

The fluid grouping of architects and sculptors constituted the sociocultural context in which designs could be adapted to the changeability of power structures. Fluctuating approval and disapproval of plans, new popes and policies, and budgetary concerns frequently interrupted and challenged the Trevi 'in waiting'. The knowing use of images of empire and water mythology in cultural memory was shaping a suitable past for present needs but was contingent on future commitment. Self-serving interests had produced earlier *mostre* like the Moses and the Paul V in short periods of time in less contested places. Salvi's design shaped a *fontana-palazzo* that met his patron's requirements and enabled the spectacular performance required not only of a *mostra* but of a theatre, a performance he had practised earlier.

<sup>54</sup> Cavazzini, p. 156.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Roserot, p. 30.

Hager, p. 1. The San Luca's objective was renewal of art through membership of painters, sculptors and architects; also teaching classes and competitions.

# 3.3.2 Traces of a Smokescreen

Salvi created a gigantic macchina pirotecnica (1728) in the Piazza di Spagna that anticipates his winning design for the Trevi by four years. Firework masques in eighteenth-century Rome celebrated special occasions and this was for the wedding of a Spanish prince and Portuguese princess in July 1729, according to Rome's indefatigable diarist, Valesio, who describes his visits to the edifice in the evening and then its daytime destruction. 55 The sense of a false and temporary illusion for momentary consumption resonating with the ephemerality of theatre design is depicted in an oil painting by Giovanni Paolo Pannini. Figure [35]. He shows four levels of seating for spectators, a large crowd in front of the edifice and a fountain from which people are dishing out its contents. The statues are in positions similar to those on the Trevi: a deity in a central arch is flanked at a lower level by a figure on both sides and a rearing horse and four statues crown the attic. Clouds at the base are suggestive of Bernini's style of rockwork, or perhaps the smoke from exploding fireworks. A print by F. Vasconi shows similar details but has larger, puffy clouds. 56 According to the architectural critic, Milizia, the construction is unusual in that surfaces are: 'rappresentate [...] con quattro facciate ai lati di architettura in rilievo, e non dipinta.'57 It suggests a depth of field also seen in the bas-reliefs of the future Trevi. Valesio describes the vast edifice as straddling the Piazza di Spagna with a lot of seating for spectators of the exploding façade; the event, he says, lasted three quarters of an hour and 'vi fu al solito la fontana di vino', possibly Pannini's fountain, and a 'popolo infinito' attended.<sup>58</sup>

A *macchina pirotecnica* stands in for an architectural façade; a *papier mâché* construction attached to wooden scaffolding with painted canvasses, the whole enterprise designed for destruction by fireworks. As Anna Notaro observes, it is a part of the urban landscape for the limited time of the anticipated celebration, the product of an ephemeral architecture creating an imaginary city within the city. <sup>59</sup> In contrast to the monumental edifice it depicts, it is not intended to endure but to be burnt. Its mediated images in eighteenth century prints, engravings, sketches, paintings and diaries, are remediated in future academic texts, on Internet databases and commercial art poster

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Valesio, 4 (3 and 4 July 1728), pp. 964-65.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Cardilli shows Vasconi's print (source cited: Gabinetto delle Stampe, 1991), p. 32.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Milizia, 5, p. 252.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Valesio, 4 (4 July 1728), pp. 964-65.

Anna Notaro, 'Telling Imperial Histories: Contests of Narrativity and Representation in Post Unification Rome 1870-1911', 1999, Leverhulme Research Fellow, 1995-1997, Royal Holloway, University of London. <a href="http://:notarofam.com/annawork/paisano/">http://:notarofam.com/annawork/paisano/</a> [accessed 5 October 2013]

websites. The *macchina* performance is a dress rehearsal carrying forward memory traces for Salvi's future architectural project of the Trevi. Past, present and future interweave in a brief smoky and noisy process: the temporary edifice reduces to ashes but the burning of symbolic antiquity could be said to signify not mere destruction but a phoenix-like regeneration of illusion, spectacle and myth in cultural memory. They are key ingredients for the Trevi 'in waiting'.

The images of evanescence, their inherent, ungraspable nature, the smokiness swirling around the façade, the puffs that cover, reveal then disappear, and the physicality of the edifice that seems reduced to the uncertainty of a void of destruction, are all apt metaphors for the unreliable functioning of memory. The machine is not the ephemeral monument, as defined by Küchler, into which members of a society symbolically dispose of what they no longer need or wish to remember, or a confirmation of what everybody already knows. It falls into the category of a monument designed to vanish yet continue its existence in social frameworks of memory.

Salvi's firework machine is perhaps the ultimate screen, mask or façade, with the power to appear, disappear and reappear in memory. Its illusory quality is enhanced communally and individually at the moment of destruction by a Lethe-like fountain of wine inducing illusion and forgetfulness; without a nearby spring of Mnemosyne for the restoration of memory. Its stylistic image presages the Trevi façade to come, of a classical past mediated by eighteenth-century pictorial interpretations. The image of destruction arguably anticipates the future interpretation of decay and renewal by water, not fire, in Salvi's project.

#### 3.3.3 Illusions and False Places

Whereas the fireworks machine might be interpreted as a mask of illusion without attachment to a building, there are two sides to a monumental façade that suggest an inherent instability. The false frontage has a Janus-like function of facing two ways, towards the outer world and inwards to its host building so that the layered structures are suggestive of future beginnings and endings. The frontages on the three Baroque

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> Forty's introduction to Küchler, *The Place of Memory*, pp. 53-72, in *Forgetting*, ed. by Forty and Küchler, p. 5.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Forty, pp. 2-8.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> In Greek mythology, the water of Mnemosyne's pool in Hades counteracts the forgetfulness induced by drinking from the river Lethe. At the Trophonios oracle, spring water from Lethe was drunk before that of Mnemosyne. See Pausanias, *Guide to Greece*, [c. 250–270 CE], trans. by Peter Levi (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd, 1971), p. 394; *OCCL*, p. 583.

mostre each have a 'behind the scenes' host housing the terminal of the conduit. A basement door in the Palazzo a few metres up the Via della Stamperia to the right of the Fountain indicates access to the inner workings of the Trevi whilst it simultaneously prevents revealing their hidden activities. Figure [36]. From inside the Palazzo museum there is a view over the Piazza through the infrastructure on the attic where thick metal rods support the winged Fames and Clement XII's escutcheon, the rushing water now pouring away from the viewer. These are the backstage props holding up the iconographical actors for their performances of water mythology. <sup>63</sup> Photographic images of their erosion and replaced segments generate a discombobulating contrast with the ostensibly solid structure of the Trevi viewed from the front.<sup>64</sup> The inherent instability of the backwards leaning palazzo, solved by Salvi's use of a counterbalancing ballast of stones at the base, is also at variance with the seemingly stony Trevi stability. 65 The inference of the hidden precariousness is that the façade could move up and down like a fold out scenery page in a children's storybook. The instability and insubstantiality of the Fountain adds to its interpretive possibilities as a moving signifier.

The false frontage design invites the descriptor of 'screen'. Anderson's notion of memory relates to the Trevi myths which are given sculpted form in its iconography: that the style of monuments which plays a part in the ideological manipulation of memory by powerful political classes seeking new identities has a self-protective propaganda function. A large fountain designed to offer interpretations of very distant pasts, whilst symbolically expressing Enlightenment scientific enquiry about the circulation of water, demonstrably restricts access to more recent memory. As frequently observed in the field of memory studies, what is forgotten is as important as what is remembered. Attempts at collective oblivion can be mainly deliberate, purposeful and regulated practices but, as Connerton points out, they require effort. They may also fail and serve only as reminders of the very past that present rulers seek to repress or destroy. Perhaps the larger and showier the protective remodelling of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> Closed during thesis writer's 2011 visit to Rome. Information from retired official Trevi Guide, Gilberto Vallauri (2009); Palazzo Museum staff (2011); also

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="https://www.moviemaps.org/locations/1xd">https://www.moviemaps.org/locations/1xd</a> [accessed 10 October 2013] (90% rotation of aerial image)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> Cardilli details restorations chronologically in, 'Manutenzioni e restauri (1766-1984)', Cardilli, ed., pp. 99-104.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> Pinto, The Trevi, p. 174.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Anderson refers to monuments (2006), pp. 9-10; p. 185.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Connerton, 'Types', pp. 59-71. Also Lowenthal, in *Forgetting*, ed. by Forty and Küchler, p. xi.

memory on a monument the more it may attract appropriation of its imagery while simultaneously revealing the effort of the endeavour to control memory.

## 3.3.4 Choices, Meanings, Intentions: The Trevi Emerges

The system of papal design competitions finally resulted in a decision about which myths of imperial pasts to configure on the Fountain. Diverse gazes are now brought to bear on the façade and its papal discourse has been partially submerged in layers of later memory during the commodification of the Fountain. Unfamiliarity with, or unawareness of, the dialogic components of a previous discourse can sentence public memorials to silence if their iconography no longer conveys any allegorical intent and new interpretations fail to emerge, for instance, the Reichstag until the Christo wrapping. The renewal of Trevi narratives in cultural memory has avoided this outcome of monumental silence. It is the host for continuing interpretations in the mediation of its images, many of which carry forward the patriarchal design aesthetics of the eighteenth century into the present commodification of the body.

The intended meanings of a project can also be reshaped during and following construction not only by its designer but also by others. Building work ceased at the Trevi in 1741 due to shortage of funds and disagreements between Salvi and Maini over the style of the Oceanus group and, according to Valesio, they began to tear down the temporary models of the figures. 68 The Trevi was again a site of conflictual performance. The emerging edifice, as planned by its commissioning pope, architect and chief sculptor, was continually vulnerable to revisions following their deaths: the three creators who had given a material presence to the Fountain. Clement XII died in 1740, Salvi in 1751, and Maini in 1752. The central cascade of the Fountain was damaged and redesigned with three tiers: a memory trace of the former three spouts for water delivery of the functional Trevi. The change could be said to formalize the natural flow of the first cascade so that it exaggerates the illusion of human control of water power. The 'seemingly land-anchored permanence' of monuments that appears to guarantee the durability of an idea, suggested by Young, is vulnerable to the processes of memory: a notion also applicable to the parts of the whole of a monument.<sup>69</sup> The first cascade, like earlier forms of the Trevi, can exist only in its pictorial and written images.

Salvi repeated the presences of Agrippa and Trivia on the Fountain by designing temporary statues below their bas-relief stories but his statues were replaced by those of

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Valesio, 6 (15, 30 March 1741), p. 451.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Young, *Texture*, p. 3.

Health and Fertility before the final inauguration in 1762. Changes to the iconography and the cascade, with inscriptions in contrasting styles were driven by the differing ideological objectives of the two successive popes after Clement XII. <sup>70</sup> Benedict XIV, (1740–1758), oversaw improved water delivery and renovation of the conduits and Clement XIII, (1758–1769), the aesthetics of new statuary design and completion of work. Their aims placed more emphasis on control, both material and ideological, of the salubrity of water. The iconography interpreting the illusory ideals of the three popes is assisted by the relations of size in the Trevi space and place.

#### 3.3.5 When Size Matters

The spectacular effect of Salvi's monumental creation resulted not only from his use of the enlargement of the Palazzo frontage but also the spatial relationship between Fountain and Piazza. The small size of the latter contrasts, for example, with the vastness of the Piazza Plebiscito in Naples which makes its central fountain unnoticeable. The space is usually devoid of public activity and this is confined to the colonnades on the periphery. The Trevi is Rome's largest *fontana a facciata* in one of its smallest and most irregularly shaped squares with rising ground on the right hand side. Salvi comments about adapting his plan to exploit the physical imperfection of the site so that it: 'servisse in alcuna maniera per adornamento di tutta l'Opera [sic].'72 His inclusive design allows for the symbiosis of Fountain and physical environment of the Piazza. Like the deceptively powerful delivery of its water, the Fountain acquires the visual impact of a physical presence greater than its size by the placement of its mass in an enclosed location which in turn appears smaller than its actuality.

The knowing performance of a self-referential and self-congratulatory theme about the circulation and control of water entwines with the reciprocal relationship of illusory size between Fountain and Piazza. Spatial and symbolic relationships change over time. The deceptive size of material presence adds to the multivalency of the Fountain and its function shifts in the production of differing myths. It becomes a host for appropriation by popes, royalists, artists, authors, researchers, film directors, photographers, advertisers and protesters attracted by the spatially ambiguous location

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> Inscriptions are discussed in Chapter Four.

Nicholas Dines, 'Contested Claims to Public Space: The Re-Imaging of Naples and the Case of Piazza Plebiscito', in *Italian Cityscapes: Culture and Urban Change in Contemporary Italy*, ed. by Robert Lumley and John Foot (Exeter: Exeter University Press, 2004), pp. 114-26.

Pinto (1986) confirms the source as Vatican Library Codex Lat. 8235, 23 (email, 14 April 2013). See *The Trevi*, p. 168, pp. 285-86.

and historical associations for their own illusory performances. As Huyssen comments, size can also be important when linked to a significant political issue.<sup>73</sup>

The imbrication of Piazza and Fountain invites the observation that: 'co-existing elements in the same place may be distinct and singular, but that does not prevent us from thinking either about their interrelationships, or about the shared identity conferred on them by their common occupancy of the place.' Piazza and Fountain are a stable place and the space has intersections of mobile elements, of the movements used in it so that the space is a practiced place, in Certeau's terms. The place constructed by planners and designers is continuously transformed into new space, and often contested. Tourists perform the rituals of throwing padlock keys and coins, authorities take them away, photographs are taken, young Romans meet friends, locals pass through, cleaners work in the still water, protests like the *Trevi rossa* event occur, swimmers plunge in, thieves take coins, police remove trouble-makers, football wins are celebrated, celebrities and politicians visit, film crews come and go, the New Year is celebrated – and researchers linger. The renewal of performative activity in front of the Fountain appears in part to reiterate the interpretation of regeneration and decay in the sculpted life of its statuary and also the plant symbolism.

# 3.4 Performances on the Fountain

# 3.4.1 Renewal and Decay: Plants and Gods

Numerous sculptures of trees, bushes, plants and flowers feature in the rockwork.<sup>76</sup> The huge urn with ivy and a fig tree at its base symbolizes stored water, and the oak tree, grapevine, other plants and flowers that of renewed life.<sup>77</sup> Real plants can be seen growing in their stony counterparts. Figure [37]. Some of the sculpted reptiles are present in their absences like the two snake heads that once issued jets of water by the urn or are partially present such as the eroded section of a lizard. The effects of weathering and pollution over time are layered upon Salvi's intentionally designed

<sup>76</sup> Giulia Caneva and Angela Dinelli identify nineteen sculptures, 'Analisi della iconografia botanica e della flora ruderale', in Cardilli, ed., pp. 191-200 (pp. 194-97).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Huyssen, 'Monumental Seduction', p. 194.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> Augé, p. 54, commenting on Certeau, p. 173.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Certeau, p. 117.

A myth about the urn is that Salvi placed it in his line of vision between his workplace and the shop of a barber he disliked.

erosion in the rockwork and at the bases of some columns; the restoration in the late 1980s has been eroded in turn, now being restored again in the always already projection of sculptural shaping. The architectural ambiguity disrupts chronological time and the timeless sound of moving water that signifies both decay and renewal enhances the contrast. Yet in this setting of stony containment the water portrayed as symbolic of renewal seeks ultimately to destroy its host physically: an outcome ironically implicit in the erosive life of all fountains.

Thus the Fountain as a material object appears to prophesy its own demise self-referentially by the actions on it of corrosive water, pollution and natural erosion. The iconographical narrative on the Trevi of the benefits and drawbacks of water gestures backwards and forwards across millennia to global water concerns. Its numerous restorations since 1762 reflect choices about cultural heritage made visible in contemporaneous contexts and with implications for restorative undertakings. The chemical treatment of Trevi water since the late twentieth century has slowed down the erosion that was intended by Salvi to be a feature of the Fountain. Continual preservation adds to ethical issues about what constitutes cultural heritage in that: 'protective and restorative devices mantle the past in the machinery of the present.'

Salvi's interpretation of the attrition of time introduces a significant note of discordance by the representation of erosion at the base of a column: water can renew as signified by the oak growing out of the eroding rocks, but what is constructed by humans ultimately decays. Salvi appears to undermine his intentions to convey cyclical decay *and* renewal. Moreover, in the rockwork lies the sculpted escutcheon of Mons. Gian Costanza Caracciolo di Santo Bono, one of the *Presidente delle acque* for Rome during the Trevi's construction. Figure [38]. The fluid, draped shape appears to be swept along by time and the symbol of his erstwhile power in the form of a lion is slowly wearing away. The heraldic animal has a less threatening stance, now more dormant than rampant, with the raised paw and the erect tail detached from the body signifying a shifting loss of ideological power that undermines Santo Bono's sculptural intentions for posterity. The Trevi produces its own internal erosion. During the 1980s, the restoration of some rockwork boulders revealed that decay was advancing underneath their masks of travertino filled with rubble consisting of chalk, bricks and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> See Jan Assmann on heritage, value and identity, 'Collective Memory, p. 133.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> David Lowenthal, *The Past is a Foreign Country* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997), p. xxiv.

*pozzolana* [rough fragments of volcanic rock]. <sup>80</sup> The boulders were in need of chemical treatment and protection. The multi-layered erosion on the two hundred and fifty year old Fountain invites the phenomenological notion that all renewal is loss.

Alternatively, Salvi may have represented a past he valued and to which he felt connected, as indicated in his writings about what is now termed the classical. He refers to the ancient gods, 'le quali [...] racchiudevano sempre o utili insegnamenti di morale filosofia, o recondite spiegazioni di naturali cose', to find answers to contemporary Enlightenment questions about nature and the atmospheric circulation of water. He made explores the ideological dimensions and invention of the term 'classical' resulting from the interplay between history and memory of Rome and Greece that becomes embedded in the collective European imagination, especially from the 1750s onwards but starting in the Renaissance. The value of classical mythology to official culture is the display of power and strengthening of political identity – to show power by representing roots in the past, as discussed earlier regarding Christian symbols topping classical columns.

According to Lowenthal's well-known definition, the past increasingly becomes a 'foreign country' from the late 1700s, available for reconstruction in the present from which it differentiates, whereas previously the present was perceived as a continuation of the past as indicated by Salvi. Salvi arise about interpreting historical concepts of memory, as required for this research seeking to place a 1762 fountain with mediated traces across the millennia in twenty-first century memory terms. Salvi and his contemporaries did not divide their pasts into categories of the classical, medieval, Renaissance, and Baroque, a subject for Chapter Four. The question of historically differing ways of remembering memory is partly met by conceiving it as an inventive activity in which the present sociocultural location of the observer is always pivotal: memory is shaped in the act of consumption.

In the context of scientific enquiry during the Enlightenment, the Trevi is an architectural text narrating the power of water as a life-generating source. The interest in the workings of nature that spread into Rome during the early decades of the eighteenth

.

Maria Grazia Chilosi, 'L'Uso delle malte e dei metalli nella construzione e nella decorazione', in Cardilli, ed., pp. 149-55.

<sup>81</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, pp. 279-86 (p.283).

Emden, 'History, Memory, and the Invention of Antiquity', in *Cultural Memory and Historical Consciousness*, pp. 39-68.

<sup>83</sup> Lowenthal, *The Past*, p. xvi.

century impacted on all fields of learning alongside a re-evaluation of past cultures.<sup>84</sup> Salvi writes about Oceanus as the major god of the water encircling the world with his constant stream in a symbiotic relationship of decay and new forms. He imagines him entering as if before an audience: 'dalle nascoste vene della terra, e fattosi visibile al Popolo sulla Fontana di Trevi' and in control of water as a continuous source of life:

una Potenza non limitata [...] parte della materia creata, dove porta seco, distribuisce, e rende vivide le nutritive parti necessarie alla produzione delle nuove forme, e rattemperando il soverchio calore, che le distrugge, può chiamarsi l'unica perenne causa del di loro mantenimento'.85

Oceanus's attendants, the Tritons, with their calm and agitated sea horses are partially submerged in the water that symbolizes the ocean and underscore the power of nature. The iconography also informs an interpretation of gender politics, of idealized female forms on the Trevi façade and the idealized male statues of the Oceanic triad playing out a role of power in front of the choreography of female statues.

## 3.4.2 Performing Gender and Water Power

The limitations of the iconography on the Fountain's older *mostre* predecessors, the Moses and the Paul V, have already been noted and reference made to their lack of necessary dynamism for image renewal. They do not generate the storytelling ability of Salvi's iconography about fictive mythical power increasingly required by a propagandist edifice for a papacy of power-broking using art patronage as a vital tool of diplomacy. The iconography on the other two *mostre* does not transmit gendered images of differential power relations.

The forms given to the Trevi statuary convey allegorical and ideological assumptions about the use of the human body. Health, in the niche to the right of Oceanus, is balanced by Fertility to his left. Figures [7–10]. Both female statues allegorically relate the beneficial effects of the Acqua Vergine and its classical myths. he the Trevi coins, they symbolically offer promises of well-being held in future memory as does all the statuary through its associations with the productivity of water. Health wears a laurel crown and holds a spear in one hand with a libation cup in the other from which a snake is drinking. The snake is a symbol linked to Hygiea, Greek

85 Ragioni filosofiche, Pinto, The Trevi, p. 283.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> See Johns on science, p. 196.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Sculpted by Filippo Della Valle.

goddess of health and to her father, Asclepius, the god of healing whose cult allegedly arrived in classical Rome during an outbreak of plague. Recounts vary about the snake's ability to cure plague; one version mentions a snake from the temple of Asclepius travelling to Rome on a ship, a temple being built where it landed on the Isola Tiberina and the plague then subsiding. The two vanished snake spouts by the urn made the symbolic links between curing the plague, religion and the venerated Tiber. Fertility holds a cornucopia from which she plucks grapes and on the ground is an overturned vase of water nourishing plant life, a mutual mimetic sculpting of the power of water in Trivia's bas-relief above, in which the Salone source flows for collection in a vase by the figure who might be Salvi or an architect. Figure [11].

The allegorical claims conveyed by the male and female statuary convey a central paradox concerning gender. Following Warner, the allegorical body of a woman perceived as a perfect vessel, a container of fixed meanings, contrasts with the reality of a woman's changing body; there is a difference between the symbolic order and the actual order of patriarchal society in which there is a strong unlikelihood, verging on certainty, of women being allowed to practise what the allegorical figures represent. <sup>89</sup> All the female statuary is virginal: Trivia, Health and Fertility; the two Fames; the Abundance of Fruit, Fertility of the Fields, Gifts of Autumn and Amenities of Meadows and Gardens statues on the attic, are situated in a Rome that is not a city of perpetual agricultural abundance and good health, or virginity presumably. <sup>90</sup> It is more a city of squalor, dependent on its everyday existence on handouts from Catholic Europe.

Whilst Warner's critique relates to the eighteenth-century representations of women in the Trevi statuary as signifying the gap between symbolic and un-idealized order, the allegorical male statuary on the monument also indicates a statement of control by the institutions of Rome when the majority of male citizens had little claim to power. The dominant, centrally placed Oceanus symbolically controls the water supply of the world and therefore life on earth, the Tritons calm the seas, and Agrippa with his architect and slaves are depicted as building the aqueduct to nurture Rome with Oceanus's life-giving water. They signify a distanced world of plenty in collective

<sup>88</sup> Bernstein cites Naphtali Lewis and Meyer Reinhold, 'Anon. On Famous Men', 12.1, *Roman Civilization*, Sourcebook 1, p. 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> OCCL, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn, pp. 13, 291.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Warner, *Monuments and Maidens: The Allegory of the Female Form* (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1985), pp. xix-xxiii; p. 332.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Salvi documents describe the attic statues as 'Vergini', Vatican Library, Cod. Lat. 8235, Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 286.

memory and, like the female statuary, their idealized forms bear no relation to the city's inhabitants experiencing a problematic water supply despite some improvements.<sup>91</sup>

A difference between the images of idealized female and male bodies lies in the portrayal of gendered power. The male bodies are made to express their power in representations of strength, energetic movement or implied nakedness. The Tritons are only partially immersed in water and Oceanus is about to lose the drapery just covering his genitalia. Unlike the demurely posed female statuary on the façade, the forward-moving Oceanic triad and its horse-driven power re-enforce the notion of man as prime mover. This performance of gender illustrates the power usually considered central to the notion of hegemonic masculinity, an ideal that is made to seem legitimate and unquestioned, changes over time, and to which other genders are subordinated. <sup>92</sup> Although Trivia performs as the discoverer of water, this activity is placed in the context of Agrippa's power, of his soldiers, his eagle standard above and his kneeling architect collecting water beside Trivia. All the male figures on the Trevi control the female figures representing the seasons, health and abundance, which depend on the supply of water brought to them by masculine endeavour in the sculpted assertion of contemporary gender politics.

This reading of gendered roles on the Fountain has the capacity to fuel misogynist readings of stories in literature, film and advertising that employ the Fountain as a narrative device. The Fountain is not misogynist in itself, but conveys gender essentialism where both male and female genders are (over)performed. Butler maintains that essentialist notions of masculinity or femininity conceal how gender is performative and restrict gender configurations to dominant frames of masculinity and femininity and compulsory heterosexuality. Although the male characters are overtly sexualized in the Trevi iconography, this is reversed in media interpretations, as portrayed by the eroticized Sylvia in Fellini's Fountain scene for *La dolce vita*.

From a Benjaminian perspective the Trevi deities could be defined as ones who have: 'lost their authenticity and become manifest in the form of names,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Rinne details topographical changes to Rome's infrastructure after restoration of the Acqua Vergine conduits, pp. 49-55.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> On hegemonic masculinity, see Chris Beasley, *Gender and Sexuality: Critical Theories, Critical Thinkers* (London: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2006), pp. 1-8, p. 251; Máirtín Mac an Ghaill,, ed., *Understanding Masculinities: Social Relations and Cultural Arenas* (Buckingham: Open University Press, 2000), p. 2; Kenneth MacKinnon, *Representing Men: Maleness and Masculinity in the Media* (London: Arnold, Hodder Headline Group, 2003), pp. 9-10, p. 115.
<sup>93</sup> Butler, p. 192.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> *La dolce vita*, dir. by Federico Fellini (UK distributor: Columbia Pictures, 1960).

allegorical attributes and emblematic imagery, and as such they form a considerable part of the cultural imagination.'95 Employing Benjamin's concept of historical understanding as an afterlife of that which is understood, the statuary on the Trevi is packed with the afterlives of deities, their authenticity lost in a pseudo-classical overlay of stylistic imagery and dominated by the inscriptions of authority. The loss of authenticity would be seen as intensified by later images produced in literature, art, film, photography and tourist guidebooks, with coherence of the classical gods disappearing in order to sustain these later historical imaginations. An example would be the misnaming of the Trevi Oceanus in guidebooks as the Roman god, Neptune: the overlay of a more recognizable deity situated in a discourse of localized importance. 96

Benjamin's idea of *Nachleben* calls attention to the reshaping and inaccuracies of images in the historical imagination. However, the apolitical and asexual afterlives of his deities do not relate to the ideological and sociocultural contexts that drive forward, often randomly, the knowing use of images in the transmission of memory. The representations of bodies in the iconography lend themselves to the future false enchantment of glamour in sexualized and commercialized performances by, and in, the Trevi water that continue to proliferate.

The patriarchal stories of Trivia and Agrippa in their bas-reliefs build on its function as a host for narratives and they take forward the connotations of gendered politics on Salvi's Fountain. Over the centuries Trivia is named, appears in Trevi designs, acquires a home, a father, a style of clothing, becomes a peasant, and achieves a material presence to tell Salvi's account of her as the mythical finder of the aqueduct water. Agrippa's story takes forward the configurations of ideology, the reassertion of the exercise of power associated in memory with the military success of Rome's imperial pasts.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>95</sup> Benjamin, *Gesammelte Schriften*, 1, pp. 354-55, trans. by Emdem, 'Nachleben', pp. 211-12. <sup>96</sup> Amongst many: *Eyewitness Travel: Rome*, 6<sup>th</sup> edn (London: Dorling Kindersley Ltd, 2006), p. 159; *Insight City Guide, Rome*, 4<sup>th</sup> edn (Singapore: Apa Publications GmbH & Co., 2005), p. 93. *Spiral Guide, Rome*, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (Basingstoke: AA Publishing, 2006) has 'Neptune, or Oceanus', p. 124.

# 3.5 Hosting Patriarchal Stories: 'L'Inventrice' and 'Il Conduttore'

#### 3.5.1 Monumental Parts

A relievo or relief may be defined as a sculpture that projects from a background surface rather than standing freely. 97 According to the degree of projection, a relief is alto, mezzo or bas, as in bas-relief. The carved figures are part of, yet not part of, the structure as they appear to move like actors away from the background of a stage but are grounded, thus compounding the stylistic illusion of a monument like the Trevi. The designers of reliefs on Western monumental architecture intend that their interpretations for patrons in figurative, sometimes non-figurative styles, will act as future aide*mémoires* of specific events they found significant. The stories they tell relate, although not always, to those of the host monuments. The bas-reliefs at the base of Nelson's column interpret his victories in a commemoration of British naval supremacy as part of the overall expression of imperial power in Trafalgar Square, including equestrian statues of military leaders on plinths and lions by fountains. 98 Such sculpted manifestations reflect Aristotle's theory of memory as invested in objects. Analogues of memory are increasingly popular in media that attempt to tell history through objects, for example, the programme by the British Museum, History of the World in a Hundred Objects (BBC Radio 4 series, 2010) and the novel, The Hare with Amber Eyes, by Edmund de Waal (2010) in which the collection of netsuke objects become his carriers for family memory. The relationship between objects and memory is challenged by the designing of ephemeral monuments deliberately made to disappear, yet continuing to endure and mutate in collective memory, like the *macchina pirotecnica* and its memory traces on the Trevi.99

Salvi was surrounded in Rome by designs that included classical, and neoclassical, bas-reliefs. Those on the Arch of Constantine depict a bear hunt, the Emperor Marcus Aurelius entering Rome in triumph, a sacrifice to Apollo, and the Emperor distributing gifts of money. The stories of Agrippa building the Virgo aqueduct and Trivia revealing its water source acquired material presences in their bas-reliefs on the Fountain as interpretations of accounts written seventeen centuries earlier. Their design

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> The Oxford Dictionary of Art <a href="http://www.books.google.co.uk">http://www.books.google.co.uk</a> [accessed 28 October 2014] (p. 582)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>98</sup> In contrast, the statue-free fourth plinth hosts contemporary performances.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Forty, *Forgetting*, ed. by Forty and Küchler (Oxford: Berg, 2001), pp. 1-18 (pp. 2-8).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Nash, Illustrations, pp. 104-12.

images appear in other contemporary media: Salvi's documents; Valesio's diary; as terracotta figures on a wooden model; in temporary paintings on the Fountain and in sketches, prints, and oil paintings produced during construction which depict the transient Trevi. <sup>101</sup>

## 3.5.2 'L'Inventrice' Invented: Trivia's Story

The word denoting Trivia's multiple presences is interwoven with the name of the aqueduct, incised in stone on the main inscription: AQVAM VIRGINEM, a trace of her presence in earlier Trevi inscriptions that exist only in prints and guidebooks. Trivia is the visual interpretation on the Fountain of patriarchal notions of perpetual virginity, seemingly secular in appearance yet integral ideologically for pagan and Christian belief systems that envisage idealized woman and water as pure. She evinces an ironic disparity, together with the other female statuary, between their mythical purity and the activities of washerwomen, some of whom were reformed prostitutes at the earlier Trevi and other working Roman fountains. As Rinne puts it, 'fountain basins bristled with social implications during the seventeenth century.' He labours of the washerwomen remain as a memory trace in the name of the Via del lavatore nearby where they were re-sited by Salvi: a sign of the ordering by official culture of everyday life and control of space and, in Lefebvre's terms, possibly a denial of workers' rights to the city or an opening for new creative everyday practices.

The bas-reliefs were depicted in the medium of chiaroscuro and then painted in oils by Antonio Bicchierari for pegging on the Fountain. <sup>104</sup> As standard practice during construction it enabled assessment of the visual impact of intended iconography before replacement with sculpted versions. In her bas-relief, later sculpted by Giovanni Battista Grossi, Trivia points towards a spring of water issuing from the ground. It flows beyond the frame within which she is surrounded by Agrippa's soldiers, the legion standard symbolic of his power and control placed above them. Figure [11]. The performances link her story to that of the general in the other bas-relief and vice versa, their bodies facing towards each other. The female who provides Rome with water evokes the city's foundational myth of the Tiber waters keeping alive Romulus and Remus with the

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> Agrippa and Trivia bas-reliefs are not in Salvi's winning design: only their intended statues. Figure [27].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>102</sup> Rinne, p. 171.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>103</sup> Ibid., p. 171.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Invoice, Item 87, *Archivio di Stato Roma*, 71, 345 (8 June 1744), cited in Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 274.

further fluid implication of nurture by the Lupa's milk. The Trivia myth of water provision gains in power, as does the Trevi, by the link to another life-giving substance that also fosters the city's well-being. At Trivia's feet, the kneeling figure holding a jug by the water source is similar to the one with a scroll kneeling in front of Agrippa: he does not wear a helmet and has the same hair style and sandals. It could be a reference to an architect, perhaps the knowing use by Salvi of his own image and an ironic attempt on his part to appropriate the story of power being told, or to architects in general which includes himself by implication in the ambitious constructions of empires.

An early placing had been given to Frontinus's as yet unnamed young girl in the afore-mentioned ornately styled designs by Della Porta (c. late 1500s) and an anonymous contributor (c. 1640). The former places the seated *puella virguncula* with unicorns, symbolically associated with female purity, healing sickness and the rendering of poisonous water drinkable, in a bay flanking the main arch. Figure [31]. It contains the city goddess Roma whose image in statue form was manipulated across the Roman Empire as a potent religious and political symbol of its capital city, the idea of the goddess connecting a powerful past to a new empire expanding its dominance. The power of sexually attractive virginity that Roma represented was a productive narrative ingredient for the telling of patriarchal stories. Della Porta underlined his intention by placing her with the *puella* in the same drawing. An ornate Trevi in a similar Mannerist style appears on a 1625 map by Giovanni Maggi in anticipation of a future project that never materialized, leaving conflicting memory traces.

In the 1640 anonymous design, a large statue of the young girl dominates in the central triumphal arch above a cascade; by pointing towards the water she anticipates the similar action of the future Oceanus. <sup>108</sup> Figure [32]. In the right niche is the Roman goddess, Diana, whose virginal status weaves the powerful water of empire with the myth of the maiden and the papal Acqua Vergine. In the left niche is Hercules, another design intertext that references the river bearing his name near the Salone source but not

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>105</sup> See Odell Shepard, *The Lore of the Unicorn* [1930] (London: Senate, 1996). The mythical animal in Medieval and Renaissance depictions is only tamed by a virgin with whom it is frequently portrayed: an example of the sexual politics surrounding the Trevi 'in waiting'.

Mary Beard and Michael Crawford analyse Roma's political usefulness, *Rome in the Late Republic*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co. Ltd, 1999), pp. 36-37.

Stefano Borsi, *Roma di Urbano VIII: La pianta di Giovanni Maggi, 1625* (Rome: Officina Edizioni, 1990), Figure p. 57 (bottom left, edge of frame); pp. 60-61.

Gesturing downwards to water by statuary emphasizes the cascade flow.

mingling with its purity, as imagined by Pliny the Elder. The monument is crowned by Roma and the Lupa suckling Romulus and Remus. These earlier images of the *puella* pointing towards water and other intertextual references to virginity open up future interpretive possibilities as they become interwoven in layers of similar, but not identical, strands in design submissions. About a century later, in Valesio's description of Benaglia's Fountain project, Trivia – now named – is said to point upwards with the right arm to the Virgin Mary and with the other down to the water: an image of paganism made to endorse Catholicism. It foreshadows its crossing into a future medium as the filmic image of Ekberg, one arm raised and the other lowered under the splashing Trevi water for Fellini's *La dolce vita*.

Trivia may have first acquired personalization in a mid seventeenth-century essay in Latin for a section of articles on the Acqua Vergine in Graevius's *Thesaurus*. The name 'Trivia' absorbs the nuances of the sacral and virginal status of the goddess, Diana, to whom she is linked in the essay. Chapter One comments on the speculative attempts of fountain historians about the naming of the Trevi; the word Trivia may have become interwoven etymologically with a place where *tre vie* met. Her layered appellation arguably made her a more powerful ideological tool for appropriation in design projects for patrons whose belief system held perpetual virginity as a central tenet. Papal Rome's attempts to reconfigure the old spaces of empire for propaganda purposes in the medium of architecture could be assisted by a monument with a resident Trivia converted from a pagan *virgo* into a christian *vergine*. Her name, both in sound and as written word, also relates alliteratively to 'Trevi'.

By the time of the Fountain's construction, the mythical discoverer of water had become 'la Vergine Trivia' mentioned in Salvi's documents, Valesio's diary and documents of the *Archivio di stato romano*. The diffusion of the description across different narratives adds to the interweaving of memory tissues in which a nameless Frontinus *puella virguncula* circulates with her status sometimes dependent on translation. Two twentieth-century English editions omit translations of *virguncula*: Bennett's and Herschel's readers experience a virgin-free text and meet a young girl. Any popular versions of Trivia's myth in circulation outside the groupings of fountain

<sup>109</sup> Pliny, ed. by Jones, VIII, 31, XXXI, 42, pp. 402-03.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Valesio, 4 (4 July 1728), p. 966.

Joannes Chifletti (1657), in Graevius, 4, cols. 1785-94, (col. 1788, para. 2).

Two more instances, Pinto, *The Trevi*, Note 87, p. 274; p. 281.

Thesis, p. 26, has Bennett's parallel text, pp. 350-51. His translation (1969) is based on Herschel's (1913), p. 15.

builders, artists, diarists or in official publications cannot be known: apart from an unfavourable aspersion by Salvi which will be commented on later.

In addition to the acquisition of a name, the artist Pier Leone Ghezzi reconfigures a ruined building on a hill as Trivia's home in a 1744 sketch titled *Casa della Vergine Trivia*. Figure [39]. The depiction results from Ghezzi's visit to the Salone pumping station at the source of the aqueduct with Nicola Giobbe, chief mason and contractor for the Trevi then under construction. Such images can suggest themselves, arriving unbidden from memory. Ghezzi's interpretation 'integrates elements of remembrance, fantasy, and invention' in building on an imagined past for Trivia. It was, however, coincidental with the shaping of her physical appearance already manifesting itself in a bas-relief as the Fountain achieved a material form.

Interpretations of the apparel Trivia should wear are made by Salvi in his iconographical explanations. For the statue he wanted for the niche beneath her basrelief, now occupied by Health, Trivia was to be simply dressed: 'in sembianza di giovinetta vestita con abito semplice, puro, e confacente ad una verginella rustica ritrovata accidentalmente in campagna.' Salvi maintains in his writings that she should be similarly dressed for the bas-relief as a: 'pastorella, (che tale *forse* doveva essere) si conviene, additando con una mano al Popolo l'acqua, e con l'altra al petto, *pare*, che voglia esprimere esserne essa stata l'Inventrice.' [my italics]. The use of *forse* and *pare* indicates a hesitation on the writer's part, almost an awareness of fluid meanings. The narrative voice is firmer in linking Trivia with the citizens of Rome as future worthy viewers of his monument. He uses 'Popolo' on numerous occasions in his writings and also refers to 'Spettatori'. 117

Salvi emphasized that his was the right approach regarding Trivia's sexuality: 'avvertendo particolarmente di lasciare ogni pensiero della supposta o sognata Vergine Trivia, che nulla a [sic] che far nel caso nostro.' The derogatory comments either refer to an imagined or dreamt of figure lacking in suitable credentials for a performance at his new Trevi, perhaps a popularized Trivia image in circulation, or

115 D'Onofrio, Acque, p. 586.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Sturken, p. 258.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Ibid., p. 590.

Denis Reidy, British Library, suggests that capitalization of Spettatori and Popolo reflects a writing convention of emphasizing political relationships between emperor, or state, and people (Senatus PopulusQue Romanus) and, later, church, state and people. By capitalizing Inventrice and other words, eg Mare, Ninfa, Natura, Salvi signifies the importance of his own work (email, 21 November 2014).

D'Onofrio, *Acque*, p. 586.

were an observation on Benaglia's recently discredited project. Such versions could not reflect Salvi's intentions to interpret water mythology on a grand fountain façade that should symbolically display idealized woman for his patron.

Salvi's Trivia brings the idea of a peasant girl into the contemporary urban present of a Rome whose ruling elites were politically aware of a secularizing Europe. As a motif, she could be manipulated for conveying Enlightenment questions and her image used to harness and interpret the contemporary significance of the salubrity of water. Trivia is the first secular nymph required to attend the Fountain, whose performance tells stories about gendered power relations already shown in earlier design images and now in sculpted form. The performance of these relations by Trivia, as modestly clothed woman linked to water, purity, innocence and renewal, contrasts with later ones in commodified contexts by glamorous women, revealingly dressed, and eroticized bathing bodies in film and advertising. Trivia is the female *inventrice dell'acqua*, represented in Salvi's patriarchal terms, a mythical girl used as a papal propaganda tool together with the masculine *conduttore* of water resources, Agrippa. 119

# 3.5.3 Shaping 'Il Conduttore': Agrippa's Story

The bas-relief of Agrippa's story depicts him supervising construction of the Aqua Virgo aqueduct in full military kit which was the apparel intended for his statue in the niche below where Fertility now stands. Figure [12]. He points sternly, beside a kneeling figure subserviently showing him a scroll, towards the aqueduct. The figure is similar to one in the Trivia bas-relief and, as speculated previously, a possible reference to Salvi or architects generally. Salvi draws upon images of Agrippa in cultural memory and their material presences in the present of his Rome. The general, for instance, appears on the Ara Pacis (17 BCE) in non-military clothing, portraying civil rather than military power. Salvi selects images that are military in aspect from the existing classical medallions picturing the general, adding to the attraction of the Fountain as a narrative host for the power of empire, past, present and future. Agrippa has: 'un ritratto cavato dalle medaglie [...]. Il suo abito sarà di armatura romana con quegli ornamenti, che possono convenire ad un gran capitano, e ad un genero d'Augusto.' Salvi's choice links to the hegemonic masculinity expressed in his representation of power in Oceanus, of an ideal that is legitimate and unquestioned about man as prime mover.

<sup>119</sup> Italian wording from Salvi's 1740 letter to Cardinal Corsini, Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 280.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Ibid., p. 280.

Chapter One noted that in the narratives of historical memory Agrippa is usually interpreted as one of classical Rome's most powerful generals: Emperor Augustus's right hand man and constructor of public works in the city and throughout the Empire. The visual word 'AGRIPPA' has been present in the everyday life of Rome's *centro storico* over millennia in the inscription under the pediment above the entrance to the Pantheon. The glorification sought for Rome by Agrippa's building programmes is said by Pliny to have embellished the city with statues and fountains that purveyed the power of Augustus. As *Pontifex maximus*, bridge builder to the gods, the Emperor was responsible for public building works as were the popes who followed and used the same title.

Agrippa's classical image in collective memory could be renewed for display as a contemporary symbol of power in his classically styled bas-relief story not only because of his identification with a militarily dominant empire but also the construction of aqueducts, specifically the one feeding the Trevi. His mythic story could take shape on this brand new and internationally important screen as a reminder of the previous track record of the recent church militant now seeking new directions in an attempted reassertion of the exercise of power. Myths of past great leaders are useful to present and future leaders at times of crisis and Agrippa symbolized the successful control of conflict and control. Additionally, he was a key part of state machinery supporting one ruler, an emperor, and not a republican regime. Agrippa's elitist myth sculpted on the Fountain endorses the legitimacy of a single head of state as *Pontifex maximus* which is also expressed in the papal inscriptions and is an apt political choice from the many imperial pasts for configuration in the service of eighteenth-century pontiffs. It underscores the availability in memory of the Trevi as a vehicle for the expression of ideology.

As a narrative device Agrippa's image continues to offer diverse interpretive possibilities across media: in performances of Shakespeare's *Anthony and Cleopatra* and for readers of the novel *I, Claudius* by Robert Graves (1934). In film, his representations have flourished in the context of a popular pre-occupation with classical Rome. In the 1976 BBC TV serial adaptation of *I, Claudius* (with repeat transmissions,

<sup>121</sup> Pliny is an early contributor to positive Agrippa narratives, VIII, XXXVI, xxiv, pp. 121-23, ed. by William Stearns.

Pliny, ed. by Stearns, pp. 121-23. Agrippa built the first Pantheon, Hadrian the second, retaining the general's name on the pediment that appropriates his image of military power.

the latest in 2013), Agrippa is an old man whereas in chronological time he is young; in the 2003 joint British-Italian production, *Imperium: Augustus*, he appears in flashbacks to the dying Emperor, and in the 2008 Rome series of the joint BBC/HBO/RAI production he is a dependable henchman for Augustus. The fluctuating attentions of media processes loosely reference the intertexts, the illusory production processes of filmic and written narrative themselves projecting the invented Agrippa forwards, sometimes with Trivia as will be seen next, into future memory.

### 3.5.4 Joint and Separate Performances: Remembered Forgotten Statues

The bas-reliefs, like the statuary, reflect a gap between idealized gender and everyday actualities of Roman life. In Agrippa's story it lies in the seemingly easy building of an aqueduct at his command and the slave labour required. In Trivia's story, the gap is found in the depiction of an idealized young girl based on sexual stereotypes who is happy to show the Salone spring to soldiers yet probably someone unlikely to trust herself to their company.

The myths of Trivia and Agrippa and the aqueduct circulate across media according to differing representational practices. Their images appear together on an anonymous and undated print for Graevius's popular *Thesaurus* in the section about the Acqua Vergine. 123 Figure [40]. As mentioned, the publication includes the essay which names Trivia and is in circulation before the final Trevi design competition. The print shows a winged deity attaching another print to a block of stone. In this *mise en abîme* that seeks to tell a story within another story. Trivia indicates the Salone spring to Agrippa's soldiers and, with the same sweeping action, the hill behind with a temple. On the same stone beneath the attached print are images of both sides of an oval gemstone. The obverse pictures the face of a stern and victoriously laurelled Agrippa and the inverse shows the temple with two arches, the statue of a female deity inside the largest and two genuflecting worshippers in the smaller one, with the arched aqueduct beneath. The print within the print of Trivia could be said to symbolize past memory, the Agrippa gemstone showing the temple and aqueduct providing a link to future memory, and a spectator looking on in the present.

A Latin inscription on a crumbling block of stone identifies the subject of the whole print as AQVA VIRGINES. Two winged putti playing near the disproportionately large, reclining male spectator in classical drapery in the foreground,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> The print faces column 1785, Graevius, 4.

surrounded by instruments of learning. He holds a scroll in one hand and a bound book in the other featuring both gemstone images, with another book on the ground beside opened scrolls. He gazes at the layered narratives on the wall as if it were a façade like the Trevi for the illusory performances of memory. Trivia is required to enact in the print medium the role of stereotypically gendered female in the service of a powerful man assisted by another idealized female, the deity in the temple depicted on the inverse, or subordinate and less viewed, side of Agrippa's gemstone. The goddess lends her stamp of approval to his building of the aqueduct.

In the literary medium, Nathaniel Hawthorne's 1860 travel novel borrows Trivia's and Agrippa's stories to merge their myths in a pleasant and lively description of the daytime Trevi and its Piazza. As a narrative practice, inserting the interlude exaggerates the dangerous episode that will later unfold at night beside the Fountain:

which draws its precious water from a source far beyond the walls, whence it flows hitherward through old subterranean aqueducts, and sparkles forth as pure as the virgin who first led Agrippa to its well-spring, by her father's door.

The narrative voice stresses purity and sexual status, gives Trivia a male parent and the task of leading the general to the water source. Hawthorne imagines it as a well by her father's front door, leaving the reader in doubt as to where his daughter might live. In the medium of film, the bas-reliefs can be manipulated to tell different stories as visual fragments unmoored from their originating location and not indicative of the Fountain as a whole. In an episode of Francesco da Mosto's television series, *Shakespeare in Italy*, the eighteenth-century bas-reliefs are fleetingly employed in close-ups as historically inaccurate metonyms for the republican Rome of Julius Caesar. <sup>125</sup>

Images of Agrippa and Trivia as standalone statues in the niches under their basreliefs statues exist only in Salvi's writings and in prints of the time. They were present
during construction in their temporary forms and for the first inauguration in 1744
carved in wood but replaced with the permanent statues of Health and Fertility by the
time of the final inauguration in 1762. Salvi uses Frontinus's writings on Trivia and
Agrippa as his source for the architectural interpretation of both statues and bas-reliefs:
'Da questo passo di Giulio Frontino nel suo commentario degli acquedotti si cavano i

Nathaniel Hawthorne, *The Marble Faun* [1860] (London: Penguin Classics, 1990), p. 144.

BBC4, 3 May 2011.
 D'Onofrio, citing Cod. Vat. 8235, c. 47, *Acque*, p. 261.

quattro soggetti di scoltura da introdursi nella fontana di Trevi. 127 He continues: 'In quanto alle due statue, parlando in genere, la grandezza di esse, doverà essere quella stessa, che si vede dipinta nella fontana.' The paintings or models of the temporary statues were present for many years as a façade on the façade. They are evocative of physical destruction, like Salvi's *macchina pirotecnica* and the temporary models of the Oceanus triad that he and Maini

tore down and rebuilt, their memory never completely erased as the processes of destruction leave traces in new memory.

Other traces of the temporary Agrippa and Trivia statues are present in the medium of copperplate prints. They are depicted in niches below their respective basreliefs, for example, in Giuseppe Vasi's print, *Chiesa di S. Maria in Trivio* (1756). Figure [41]. The Veduta in prospettiva della gran Fontana dell'Acqua Vergine detta di Trevi, Architettura di Nicola Salvi (1751) by Piranesi also shows them but a later print run in the 1770s after the final inauguration features Health and Fertility and the changed cascade design, with the other details unaltered. His other print, Veduta della vasta Fontana di Trevi anticamente detta l'Acqua Vergine, from an oblique angle, makes it difficult to identify the statues. Figures [42, 43]. The context of the text invites attention as the re-issue of the *Veduta in prospettiva* was presumably up-dated for marketing purposes. An anonymous print for Morton's *The Waters of Rome* (1966) shows the temporary statues and is placed inside the front cover and the end cover. The intended statues of Trivia and Agrippa can appear and disappear as if coming in and out of focus, their ghostly *Nachleben* presences in early prints that were sold separately or in books and collections. Many of these are now on databases and more widely available, including Vasi's 1756 print with the statues. Figure [41]. They add to the shifting narratives of illusion surrounding the Fountain, as Chapter Four explores.

As Young points out, the ways in which a monument is remembered always differ from the intentions of its builders and designers who think they will endure. <sup>128</sup> New promoters of official culture dispensed with Trivia and Agrippa and installed the statues of Health and Fertility as symbolic of physical and spiritual well-being. The design changes expanded and endorsed the religious and political notion of salubrious Trevi water: no longer functional but conveying power. Health and Fertility connote an even more distant mythological remoteness in the portrayal of water power. The

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>127</sup> From Salvi's 1740 letter to Cardinal Corsini, Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 280.

Young, Texture, p. 3.

goddesses in support of the Greek Oceanus reinforce the symbolic sanctification of the water supply and add to the choreography of deities drawing attention to the supposed benefits of water brought by rulers to Rome. The ideological opportunities widened by Health and Fertility raise the possibility that their substitution for Trivia and Agrippa resulted from purposeful and regulated manipulation of memory.

The Trivia and Agrippa bas-reliefs belong to the overall performativity of the iconography which presages new Trevi myths generated in changed political contexts of a sexualized society and commercialized bodies – of romance, glamour, and life-changing wishes bought with money. Already a vehicle for patriarchal representations of male and female bodies in designs before its physical emergence, Salvi's Fountain has Trivia and Agrippa perform the differential power relations of their synchronized stories in their bas-reliefs as *Inventrice* and *Conduttore*. The idealized Trivia is the creative source of life and guide in the service of man and the idealized Agrippa is the masculine provider and constructor. In future narratives associated with the Trevi, changes in gendered roles are mediated by art, literature, film, advertising and the Internet and are carried forward in the transmission processes of cultural memory.

The premise of the Fountain as a conduit for practices of power and performance strengthens. The imagery surrounding the emergence of the 1732 monument shows how it was first built in memory. The competition designs for the project grew in relevance nationally and internationally and evolved until a physical form took shape. The Trevi was acquiring a transcultural identity in the shared frameworks of competitive memory held by designers and papal patrons whilst they appropriated it as a propaganda vehicle of supremacy and power in the complex arena of post-Reformation politics. The water-based illusion of the Fountain also generated economic benefits which have continued to be exploited up to the present-day context of late capitalism.

Prints of the emerging edifice and contemporary written observations depict an ephemeral structure and iconography – a monument on the move – with a lengthy transience. Memory traces of statues, replaced iconography and destruction of models demonstrate how erasure of memory is only partially possible and generates new memory. The Trevi becomes a metaphor for the functioning of memory, of its unreliable yet inventive aspects. As a nexus of its own circulating images, the multivalent Fountain offers increasing possibilities for interpretation. It underpins the

discourse of hegemonic institutions as a narrative device, but can challenge official culture by its presence in vernacular opinion and as a site of conflict and contested memory.

The newly-built Trevi is increasingly appropriated as a generator of fictions by papal patrons, their designers, architects and academies, but also diarists and critics. It functions as a co-ordinate of images for the illusory practices of storytelling: about size, beauty, grandness, power, deception, health, purity, abundance, protest and renewal, but also decay and loss. It contributes to the practices of cultural memory that carry forward sexual stereotyping, as reflected by the gender politics expressed in the iconography. Trevi images are rendered more emphatic by its large material presence in a confined space, the theatrical dimensions adding to the potential for performativity.

Illusion, political power and sexualized performance are key notions employed in the following chapters where the Fountain is explored as a vehicle for intertextually related narratives in the mediated production of cultural memory. Firstly, in art and literature, and then in film, music, advertising and the Internet. 'Questa Fontana è superba, grandiosa, ricca, e tutta insieme d'una bellezza sorprendente. Si può francamente dire, che in Roma non si è fatta in questo secolo opera più magnifica', wrote Milizia soon after it was built. <sup>129</sup> At the time there was no designation of the style he described. Subsequent art historiographical narrative invented the term 'Baroque' to classify the art of illusory sensations, a term resonant with Milizia's adjectival embellishment. The next chapter includes an evaluation of the relevance of the Baroque for the Trevi, after first reading what is written on its façade.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>129</sup> Milizia, 5, pp. 334-35.

# CHAPTER FOUR

# A Vehicle for Narratives: Art and Literature

The fissure that opens up between experiencing an event and remembering it in representation is unavoidable [...] a powerful stimulant for cultural and artistic creativity.

Huyssen<sup>1</sup>

#### Introduction

In the eighteenth century an increasing dimension of subjective engagement with the Trevi Fountain in art correlates with the emergent medium of printing and is later compounded by association with a sensuous architectural style. Constellations of transnationally travelling Fountain images in nineteenth- and twentieth-century art and literary narratives are generated by changes in print technology which enable an increase in circulation. Representations in literature and art begin to filter into memory through multi-media processes arising from the new technologies of capitalism that turn the Trevi Fountain into a marketing tool. As a name it is already more than a mere marker of place; as a narrative device it accrues meanings according to changes in presentational practices. The metaphor of 'a vehicle for narratives' reflects the stress placed in the thesis on not perceiving the Fountain as an active agent. Narratives are attracted to, and seek, the Fountain to appropriate it as a vehicle, carrier, agent, conduit, purveyor, transmitter and host – in the non-human sense – for the multiple activities its imagery fosters and accommodates.

The exploration of the Fountain in memory continues to build on the contention that its illusory imagery attracts and underpins the practices of prevailing ideologies. The idea of the Fountain constantly invites metaphors of the shifting functions of memory so that a further contention is its presaging of future shaping of the past. This chapter and the following one study these aspects across the media of art, literature, film, music, advertising and the Internet. One of the central areas of attention in cultural memory studies, as previously noted, is the role of media in memory-making and the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Andreas Huyssen, *Twilight Memories* (New York: Routledge, 1995), pp. 2-3.

ways in which memories take shape in the public arena.<sup>2</sup> If new media refashion prior forms – the mediation of mediation – so that all mediations could be termed remediation, then the process invites the premise of intertextuality and the shaping of texts by other texts.<sup>3</sup>

Notions of memory as intended, retrospective, anticipatory and future are used in this chapter for researching the Trevi in art and literature. Whilst these are conceptually helpful indicators they can be challenging because the dynamic processes of remembering are porous so these notions will be treated as fluid and overlapping, coming into and out of focus as does memory. Attention is given to the intersections, divergences and the intertextuality between the narratives of old and new memory in art and literature that circulate Fountain images transculturally. The first section looks at how the creators of the Trevi wanted posterity to remember their intentions in inscriptions and how these became overlaid with new memory. The following section explores the retrospective invention of the remembered Trevi as Baroque, as well as the evolution of the term situated in the narratives of art historiography and recent guidebooks. The third section considers anticipatory memory generated by art narrative for late Grand Tour travellers, and non-travellers, exemplified by Trevi vedute and oil paintings. In the final section on future memory, the intertextuality in the writings of Anne-Louise Germaine de Staël, Nathaniel Hawthorne, Marguerite Yourcenar, John Secondari and other authors presages future borrowings by the narratives of film, music, and advertising. The added literary devices, of a moonlit or night-time Trevi to accompany its attendant water nymphs, inflect the intermedial shaping of future stories.

Who produces and who consumes these images and narratives are questions that continually arise. The dynamics of remembering and forgetting processes are necessarily characterised by ever-changing foci. The discourses of art and literature surrounding the Trevi offer examples of a new social order unfolding its power in correlation with the development and spread of emergent media and technologies.

<sup>2</sup> See Erll and Rigney, *Mediation*, p. 2.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Jay David Bolter and Richard Grusin, *Remediation: Understanding New Media* (Cambridge, MA: The Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press, 1999), Glossary, pp. 65, 273. Erll relates remediation to memories of the Indian Mutiny, in 'Remembering', pp. 110-38.

# 4.1 A Narrative for Intended Memory: Visual Text on Stone

## 4.1.1 The Almost Lost Voices of Three Inscriptions

A contrast can be drawn between the textual images in the narratives of art and literature which evolve and borrow from one another, and are not present on the Fountain, and that of the written text in the three papal inscriptions. The physicality of words sculpted onto stone as a narrative layer shares the unpredictability of entrusting future memory to the 'seemingly land-anchored permanence' of monuments. 4 Memorial intentions of designers are reshaped by material and ideological considerations beyond their control as seen in material changes to the Fountain project following the deaths of Salvi and Maini. The narrative voices of inscriptions are generally those of patrons like Clement XII and likewise vulnerable to changes in memory practices.

The display of visual text that seeks to control public memory in perpetuity has been practised over millennia. Rulers have been pre-occupied with how the remembrance of their cities should be narrated so that inscriptions have appeared, and been made to disappear by new ruling powers, since the founding of early city states. The Trevi inscriptions can be compared to what Connerton terms 'covert encryptions' that organise a visual space with historical master narratives written into the architectural script and subscribe to ideology at the expense of other narratives. The Fountain's stony texts offer their claims as acts of state glorifying a succession of papal providers of water. Their partially forgotten narratives can be more appropriately defined as the never remembered practices of the church militant, and significant because of their non-representation. The Trevi inscriptions underscore the need for protection against unwanted collective memory in the formation of new political identity.

The three papal patrons of the Fountain wanted posterity to remember them as purveyors of munificence and the separately placed Latin inscriptions correlate with their involvement in construction. The statements of self-congratulatory achievement compete verbally in differing vocative styles and tones as transactions of power, each

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Quote from Young, *Texture*, p. 3.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Alison Cooley, 'The Life-Cycle of Inscriptions', and 'Inscribing History at Rome', in *The Afterlife of Inscriptions: Re-using, Rediscovering, Reinventing and Revitalizing Ancient Inscriptions*, ed. by Alison Cooley (London: Institute of Classical Studies, University of London, 2000), pp. 6-7, 7-20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Connerton, 'Types', pp. 60-61.

claiming ownership. The authors' intentions are partially forgotten and their sculpted words serve new memory-makers of capitalism as glittering decorative shapes (the brass font has been cleaned) and are an integral part of a commodified Trevi promoting tourism. In the century following construction, attitudes towards inscriptions changed as travellers began to expect them as a decorative part of the topography.<sup>7</sup>

The main inscription for Clement XII, the commissioning pope, dominates the attic. Figure [44]. Like the changes made in the temporary iconography, the final inscription was altered, according to Valesio, its intended meaning quickly subject to modification:<sup>8</sup>

#### **CLEMENS XII · PONT · MAX**

#### **AQVAM VIRGINEM**

#### COPIA ET SALVBRITATE COMMENDATAM

#### **CVLTV MAGNIFICO ORNAVIT**

#### ANNO DOMINI MDCCXXXV · PONTIF · VI

[Clement XII, The Great Bridge Builder
The Water of the Maiden
Commended for its plentiful flow and its health-giving properties
Ornamented it with magnificent refinements
AD 1735 in the sixth year of his pontificate]. 9

For those who did not understand Latin, a visual reading could be one of appraising the inscribed shapes as the communication of prestige. Words might be recognised as part of a political process; the shapes of power. For those who understood the elite lingua franca of Europe, it transmitted the self-congratulatory and authorial narrative voice of official culture underscored by the powerful attributes of the new Fountain. Its linguistic appropriation in Latin emphasized papal jurisdiction of water for the benefit of the populace. It also continued the practice over millennia of using inscriptions as a stamp of ownership on monuments erected through patronage. Archival memory, in the form of handbooks on the history, style, choice of wording and font, was available for

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Colin Cunningham discusses the British context, 'The Rise of Topography and the Decline of Epigraphy?: Architectural Inscription in the Nineteenth Century', in *Inscriptions*, ed. by Cooley, pp. 143-62.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Valesio describes the temporary inscription alterations, 29 August 1735, *Diario*, 5, p. 808.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Translation assisted by Simon Trafford, University of London (2008).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Johns, p. 23.

monument designers, patrons and inscribers.<sup>11</sup> Past styles could be selected, copied, reshaped and invested with meaning for the contemporary moment, a convention followed by future rulers: the fascists mimicked the Roman classical font for the 1937 Rome Exhibition that sought to link the regime with ancient empire.<sup>12</sup>

Benedict XIV has a terse 'built by' inscription above Oceanus's arch, in a competitively larger font than his predecessor's, and a fuller inscription above the door to the conduit in the Via della stamperia about his aqueduct restoration. Figures [8, 36].

### PER FECIT BENEDICTVS XIV · PON · MAX

[Built by Benedict XIV, the Great Bridge Builder]

His successor, Clement XIII, completed the Fountain and his inscription takes the form of a long, slim line in the smallest font of the three. Figure [7]. It starts above Fertility and runs inside Oceanus's arch to finish on the other side above Health:

# POSITIS SIGNIS ET ANAGLYPHIS TABVLIS IVSSV CLEMENTIS · XIII · PONT · MAX · OPUS CVM OMNI CVLTV ABSOLVTVM · A DOM · MDCCLXII

[These designs and bas-relief pictures were placed in position as ordered by Clement XIII, the Great Bridge Builder, a work with every refinement brought to completion in AD 1762].

The inscriptions could be said to create a competitive mood that undermines the proposed narrative of power. The commissioning pope lays anticipatory claim to the entire monument, his successor boldly states he built the monument, and the third claimant affirms refining and completing the Fountain. The narrative voices of the earlier Trevi's fifteenth-century inscriptions are heard only in prints and written text: 'NICOLAS·V·PON·MAX·/ [...] DVCTV·AQVAE·VIRGINIS·1453', as in Franzini's woodcut print. Figure [20]. The voices compete: a Spanish guidebook of 1610 has longer, different wording and the date is given in Latin. 13

Yet the eighteenth-century voices on the façade are nearly forgotten. The words evoke a historical distance, nuanced with the classical, that also increases the attraction of the Fountain for the purposes of marketing Rome in addition to their shining, decorative shapes. The shapes of the words have become overwritten with new memory

William Stenhouse, 'Classical Inscriptions and Antiquarian Scholarship in Italy, 1600-1650)', in *Inscriptions*, ed. by Cooley, pp. 77-91; origins of Latin font styles, *OCCL*, p. 217, 2.

The central exhibit displayed classical quotations in Roman font; elsewhere the fascist sticklike *bastone* font. See Tim Benton, 'Epigraphy and Fascism' in Cooley, ed., pp. 163-192.

Pedro Martyr Felini, *Tratado nuevo de las cosas maravillosas de la alma ciudad de Roma* (Rome, 1610), pp. 282-83.

without needing to be understood. The placing of papal logos signifies those of future branding practices at the Trevi. The glittering words, mirroring the sparkle of the coins in the water below, belong to the present illusory grandness of the Fountain as part of a new power process whose hegemonic discourse is one of commodification. Arguably the selling of a commodity has always been a function of the Trevi inscriptions.

Contrasting with the expression of intended memory in the material text of the three inscriptions, the narratives of art and literature surrounding the Trevi evolve and borrow from one another. Following Erll and Rigney, 'particular media offerings become agenda-setters for collective remembrance' through the intermedial reiteration of stories. <sup>14</sup> Taking this further, account must be made of the selection and changes in meaning of stories as they circulate across and within media. In the narratives of art historiography, a label attaches itself to the Trevi that expands the dimension of its illusory presence in memory.

# **4.2 Retrospective Memory of Art:** Making the Trevi Baroque

# 4.2.1 Presently Assigning Past Labels

The style in art, architecture, literature and music characterized by magnificence, display, spectacle, grandiosity, richness, surprise, beauty, exuberance, expression of feeling and theatricality of movement that is now termed 'Baroque' originated in Rome in the late 1500s. The earlier forms of the Trevi have also been labelled retrospectively as medieval and Renaissance, terms that possess their own histories as does that of the afore-mentioned term of classical. The Baroque label is frequently associated with the 1732 Fountain as a marker in memory of its spectacular performance. Baroque spread as the art style of Catholicism with localised versions throughout Western Europe and beyond from the early 1500s into the early 1700s. The European area it covered can be likened to a crescent shape encompassing Rome, its south-western point in Southern Italy and the north-eastern one beyond Prague into Russia, of monuments whose rich decoration would counter the appeal lost to Catholicism during the Reformation. <sup>16</sup>

<sup>15</sup> Emden, 'Invention of Antiquity', pp. 39-68.

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Erll and Rigney, *Mediation*, p. 2.

Dominique Fernandez, *Le Banquet des anges* (1984) cited by Franco Moretti (n. ref.), *Atlas of the European Novel, 1800–1900* (London & New York: Verso, 1998), p. 188.

Some art historians seek to establish architecture as the dominant form of the style: Anthony Blunt refers to it as the master art in the Roman Baroque age with those of painting and sculpture under its control.<sup>17</sup> From a perspective of topographical and technical constraints in a city associated with water power, Rinne maintains that the improved infrastructure of Rome contributed in large part to enabling Baroque display and making it the most important European city for the style.<sup>18</sup>

The term, used as adjective and noun, has a long and complex history. <sup>19</sup> An earlier meaning of *baroco* in Italian may have indicated a distortion of language before the Spanish/Portuguese *barueco* was imported. This described an irregularly shaped pearl about to burst and may have been applied loosely and negatively to art forms considered exaggerated, bizarre, distorted, floridly decadent, irregular, bewildering, monstrous or grotesque. <sup>20</sup> The Trevi became Baroque, sometimes late Baroque, about a century after its construction, along with other monuments built in Rome and elsewhere in the previous two centuries. From the mid 1800s onwards, art narrative appropriated the word as a critical term, a century after the style had evolved and given way to one of more complexity subsequently termed Rococo. <sup>21</sup>

As the term 'Baroque' was applied retrospectively in art historiography in the mid nineteenth century and about the same time as other periodic designations emerged, it is not used in earlier descriptions of Salvi's Trevi. It was not yet a marker to be laid down in memory for travellers or writers who published their experiences. Two decades before the Trevi was finally inaugurated, a guidebook of 1741 describes it in terms of grandness, beauty, movement, pleasure, and sound that generate anticipatory memory of future statuary of the as yet unfinished Fountain. As quoted in Italian at the end of Chapter Three, the architectural critic, Milizia, writing in 1785, bestows a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Blunt, Guide to Baroque, pp. vii-viii.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Rinne, p. 219.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> The Oxford Dictionary of Art entry on Baroque <a href="http://www.enotes.com/oxford-art-encyclopedia">http://www.enotes.com/oxford-art-encyclopedia</a> [accessed 17 March 2012]

Douglas Radcliff-Umstead, *Cassell Dictionary of Italian Literature*, ed. by Peter Bondanella and Julia Conaway Bondanella (London: Cassell, 1996), p. 32.

The chronological order of periodic designations is Renaissance, Mannerism, Baroque, and Rococo. 'Renaissance' entered wider circulation in the title of a volume for Jules Michelet's *Histoire de France* (1855), according to Francis Haskell, *History and its Images: Art and the Interpretation of the Past* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993), pp. 273-74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Giovanni Lorenzo Barbiellini, *Roma moderna distinta per rioni* (Roma: 1741), pp. 196-200. <a href="http://www.arachne.uni.koeln.de">http://www.arachne.uni.koeln.de</a> [accessed 19 October 2013] keyword 'roma moderna distinta per rioni barbiellini', pp. 216-20 for pp. 196-200.

complimentary mix of anthropomorphic qualities on the as yet un-Baroque Fontana as proud, grand and rich, with a surprising beauty.<sup>23</sup>

In memory terms, the significance of the Baroque association with the Trevi is the retrospective configuration of a new past for the monument that increases its attraction as a vehicle for narratives. The purpose here is not to define the term but to consider the shifting and evolving images of its retrospective application. In order to evaluate its implications for the Trevi, attention is first given to the labelling device in the narrative constructions of a sample of key Western art historians. As the term evolves, it belongs increasingly to a marketing strategy for Rome as a tourist destination with Baroque fountains as key promotions. It is proposed here that the Baroque association enhances the potential of Trevi imagery for the illusory practices of commodification, as will the later addition of glamour. Questions arise again, not about the how and why of perceptions of the past but about the interactive and dynamic processes of memory in the creation and consumption of images and their ideological contexts.

# 4.2.2 Labelling Practice: Baroque to Theatre

In the eighteenth century Milizia preceded his praise of the Trevi with criticism about an excess of ornament and license in design.<sup>24</sup> He disapproved of the windows breaching the entablature and also the style of the water display, rockwork, niches and columns as breaking with prevailing design rules. Pinto claims these negative images that were compounded by other contemporary writers are remembered in the narrative of art historiography rather than in any praise until recently.<sup>25</sup> Burckhardt, the first major art critic to define the Baroque, sees it as an inferior art style to that of the Renaissance and for reference only in historical terms.<sup>26</sup> According to Francis Haskell, Burckhardt's legacy was considerable and long-lasting.<sup>27</sup> However, he begrudgingly approves of the Trevi, contradicting his poor estimation of the Baroque:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> Milizia, 5, pp. 333-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Ibid., pp. 333-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 236.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Joachim Burckhardt, *The Cicerone: An Art Guide to Painting in Italy for the Use of Travellers and Students* [1855], trans. by A. H. Clough (London: T. Werner Laurie, Clifford's Inn, c. 1920s), pp. 221, 235.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Haskell, *History*, p. 335, citing *Der Cicerone: Eine Anleitung zum Genuss der Kuntswerke Italiens* (Basel: 1855), pp. 366, 676. Also see Rudolf Wittkower, *Art and Architecture in Italy 1600-1750*, 5<sup>th</sup> edn (New Haven and London: Yale University Press, 1980).

Die Sculpturen und die Ganze abschliessende Palastfassade sind wohl blosse Decorationen, letztere aber, mit dem triumphbogenartigen Vortreten ihres Mittelbaues, wodurch Neptun als Sieger verherrlicht wird, giebt doch dem Ganzen eine Haltung und Bedeutung, welche jenen beiden andern Brunnen fehlt. <sup>28</sup>

[The sculptures and the palace façade enclosing them are, admittedly, purely decorative. The latter, however, with its forward projecting central section, which comprises a triumphal arch glorifying Neptune's victories, lends to the whole scene a distinctive style and significance lacking in both the other fountains (the Moses and Paul V)].<sup>29</sup>

The flow of negative Baroque narrative in the discourse of late nineteenth-century art historiography is strengthened by Heinrich Wölfflin's contribution. 30 Focusing on architecture, he speaks disparagingly of a style characterized by grandness, massiveness and movement. It is powerful but anticipatory, creating a feeling: 'of something yet to come, of dissatisfaction and restlessness rather than fulfillment. We have no sense of release, but rather of having been drawn into the tension of an emotional condition.' Monumentality is 'well suited to the baroque' [sic]. Wölfflin's concept of consecutive and differing periods of Renaissance and Baroque styles becomes a limiting dichotomy in the discourse of art history, one of oppositional relationships. The implication for a Trevi designated as Baroque is one of ambivalence. Its design was found praiseworthy in part by a major art critic but it belonged to a narrative period that was dismissive of the style. The negative images endured in the social frameworks of memory of groups of art historians and by association the Trevi was relatively neglected by them. These images overlaid the positive ones until a narrative shift in the twentieth century favoured re-interpretations and the Baroque style regained favour. Adding to the shifting value judgments attached to the term, Pinto sees Burckhardt's critique as denoting a specific style rather than a term of abuse. 32 Pinto defines the Fountain as representative of 'late Baroque Classicism', and is the first art historian to place it in political and urban contexts, compared to other art historians who evaluated it as a monument detached from its cultural environment.<sup>33</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Burckhardt, *Der Cicerone* [1855], (Leipzig: E.A. Seamann, 1898), p. 543. <a href="http://www.archive.org">http://www.archive.org</a> [accessed 3 August 2010]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Peter Willig, freelance translator, November (2010).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Heinrich Wölfflin, *Renaissance and Baroque* [1888], trans. by Kathrin Simon (London: Collins & Co. Ltd, 1964).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> Ibid., p. 38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, p. 237.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Ibid., p. 1.

The continuing evolvement of the term from the nineteenth century can be followed in Erwin Panofsky's essay, 'What is the Baroque?', first written in 1934.<sup>34</sup> He challenges the concept of Renaissance versus Baroque by maintaining the latter is a style in its own right. The epoch is a crucial turning point for Panofsky as the birth of European consciousness, an awareness of feelings and examination of the self, and he places the period at the conclusion of the Renaissance and the start of the Modern.<sup>35</sup> The use of Baroque as a derogatory term, claims Panofsky, denoted a lack of sincerity and, when it became a Rankian classification in the nineteenth century, its significance was neutralized.<sup>36</sup> Both the sense of opprobrium and the Baroque as oppositional to the Renaissance extended into other narrative forms: architecture, sculpture and painting, then outside the visual arts to poetry, music and mathematics, and into composite appellations, for example, Hellenistic Baroque. 37 Panofsky gives the tomb of Alexander VII by Bernini as an example of Baroque performance. 38 The sculpted pope in swirling apparel is placed centrally in an ornate triumphal arch surrounded by an audience of statuary exhibiting dramatic poses. The Trevi exemplifies a similar expression of movement, seen in Oceanus's apparel flowing as he moves forward on his shell chariot with the supporting cast of Tritons and seahorses, deities posturing, and action-packed bas-reliefs. The performativity is enhanced by the water flowing over dramatically positioned rockwork.

The value of Panofsky's essay is its dismantling of oppositional relationships of style and narrative repositioning of the Baroque in positive terms as the art of heightened subjective feeling leading to the modern. His detailing of an evolution in the historiographical critique of the Baroque contrasts with Benjamin's understanding of its symbols as revealing a relationship between past and present. The latter's interest lies in symbolic margins of the past waiting to be discovered and it is the past that fuels the imagination of the present.

There is a sense of performance and theatricality in the Baroque themes of feeling and movement and the Baroque as theatre is a metaphor often made in art

<sup>34</sup> Erwin Panofsky, 'What is Baroque?' in *Three Essays on Style*, ed. by Irving Lavin (Cambridge, MA: The Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press, 1995), pp. 17-88.

35 Panofely p. 89

Panofsky, p. 88.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Leopold von Ranke's periods constructed fact-based history from archive documents. Clark (endnote 5, pp. 197-98) cites the source of the well-known phrase, 'wie es eigentlich gewesen ist', as Ranke's Geschichten der romanischen und germanischen Völker von 1494 bis 1514, 3rd ed., (Leipzig, 1885), p. vii.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Panofsky, p. 20.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Ibid., p. 21-22.

narrative. Panofsky refers to the play of light and shadow, curves and dynamic interaction between mass and the energies of Baroque structures that: 'display a quasitheatrical scenery that integrates the conflicting elements into a spatial ensemble, enlivened by *chiaroscuro* values and placing sculptures in a picturesque or even stagelike setting': a description that could apply to the Trevi.<sup>39</sup> Rome is described by Blunt as a city that continued to build grandiose urban Baroque stage-settings from the seventeenth into the eighteenth century, including the stairway of the Spanish Steps and the Trevi. 40 Germain Bazin claims that opera might be considered as the major Baroque art of the time, the one from which the others all derive, including architecture, as many monumental effects were first tried out in the theatre before being realized in stone.<sup>41</sup>

Pinto refers to the Trevi as 'perhaps the most overtly scenographic of all examples of Baroque city planning':

> Not only does its architecture function as a grand urban *scaenae* frons [forward part of a stage set] but the stairs leading down to the Fountain serve to accommodate an audience. From behind the set building the main group of sculpture appears to enter upon the rustic stage comprised of the *scogli*. The marble figures enact an event, - the adventus of Oceanus - which has close parallels in contemporary dramatic compositions.<sup>42</sup>

He enthuses about Salvi's design offering 'consciously theatrical terms', the audience as part of the 'continuing spectacle' and the 'traditional barriers separating illusion and reality' becoming blurred by the 'exquisite choreography' which 'climaxes in the foamy crescendo of the central cascade'. 43 Morton describes the Trevi as a place of Baroque theatre, with a 'rocky stage' and 'marble orchestra stalls.'44 Narratives are often nuanced with inferences of the Baroque. Venturi and Sanfilippo refer to the Trevi as: 'Questo grande monumento sceno-grafico, che coniuga la natura e la cultura, e corrisponde ad un'altra gigantesca scenografia sull'acqua.'45 The metaphor of Baroque as theatre attached explicitly or implicitly to the Trevi endorses it again as a place for the performance of memory that is dependent on temporary illusions and suspension of disbelief.

<sup>39</sup> Panofsky, p. 45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Blunt, p. 168.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Bazin, p. 24.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Pinto, *The Trevi*, pp. 166-67.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Ibid., p. 168.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Morton, A Traveller in Rome, 1<sup>st</sup> edn (London: Methuen & Co., 1957), p. 39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> Venturi and Sanfilippo, p. 56.

#### 4.2.3 The Expanding Narrative of a Baroque Trevi: Guidebooks

The term Baroque spread from its linguistic domain of art without escaping from its contradictory art historical origins as expressed in the vernacular narrative of guidebooks where it is often attached to the Trevi. The nineteenth-century Murray and Baedeker mainly offer practical advice to tourists although they give information on where to purchase prints, as had an eighteenth-century guidebook in ten volumes illustrated with prints, *Delle magnificenze di Roma*, that was widely on sale and included one of the Trevi. <sup>46</sup> The concepts of art and commodification were blending in the appropriation of the Fountain as a marketing tool. <sup>47</sup> The popular Franzini guidebooks of woodcut images that included one of the remodelled medieval Trevi by Alberti had catered for the pilgrim market. <sup>48</sup>

The achronological narrative weaving in some recent guidebooks can produce uncertain and unreliable memory. Bernini, who died in 1680, and the Salvi Trevi, completed in 1762, are linked in many entries. The *Touring Club italiano: Roma* guide (1997), describes the Fountain as an: 'Eccezionale connubio fra rigore classico degli elementi architettonici e concezione scenografica delle sculture barocche' and then states that: 'Tutta la decorazione riecheggia modelli berniniani.' The AA's *Spiral Guide, Rome* portrays his name as synonymous with the Baroque and offers a list of Bernini's 'Five Great Works of Art' as: the 'Apollo and Daphne, Baldacchino, Cappella Cornaro, Fontana dei Quattro Fiumi, Fontana di Trevi'. The *Spiral Guide* contradicts itself by continuing: 'No one is sure who dreamt up Rome's loveliest fountain – Bernini may have been involved – but the result is a triumph.' The inclusion of the Trevi in the list of his greatest works carries forward an unreliable memory of Bernini building the Fountain after his death. An attempt at historical exactness in *Eyewitness Travel* is subverted by placing the Trevi on a Baroque timeline chart ending in 1735 and states

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Each volume of Giuseppe Vasi's *Delle magnificenze di Roma* (1747-1761) has twenty plates and numerous smaller images <a href="http://www.vasi.uoregon.eduworks\_magnificenze.html">http://www.vasi.uoregon.eduworks\_magnificenze.html</a> [accessed 23 October 2013] VI, Trevi, Plate 104. Amy Marshall notes that from the eighteenth century onwards guidebooks were developed by foreign publishers, *Mirabilia Urbis Romae: Five Centuries of Guidebooks and Views* (Toronto: University of Toronto, 2002), p. 7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> See Cavazzini on establishment of accessible markets for all tastes and incomes in seventeenth-century Rome, pp. 153-56.

<sup>48</sup> Marshall, p. 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Touring Club italiano: Roma (Rocca: Milan, 1997), p. 106.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Spiral Guide, Rome (2006), pp. 14-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> *Spiral Guide, Rome* (2006), p. 15.

that work starts on the Fountain in 1732.<sup>52</sup> Meaning is conveyed of a monument either never finished or finished within three years: the opposite of the authorial intention.

Hawthorne's widely-read travel novel, *The Marble Faun* [1860], asserts that Salvi was 'some sculptor of Bernini's school gone absolutely mad in marble'. <sup>53</sup> This places the Trevi architect temporally before he was born (1697). In the *Insight City Guide*, a 'Rococo Trevi' is attributed to Salvi and transfers him beyond his death (1751) into the period following the Baroque in art historiography. <sup>54</sup> As shown by the *Spiral Guide* example, the textual images of Salvi and Bernini compete in commercial narrative practices whose objective is the marketing of Rome. There is a dissonant interweaving of misremembered fragments of inaccuracy, a false shared currency in collective memory, and increased awareness of the Fountain as a conduit for ambiguous interpretations.

Hereward Lester Cooke's landmark article (1956), presents Salvi as the designer of the Fountain instead of an enactor of Bernini's (possible) plans. <sup>55</sup> The attribution prevails in the subsequent narratives of academics, art critics and fountain writers, and this thesis. Guidebook descriptions of a Baroque Bernini Trevi are at variance with these narratives and with those of other guidebooks who favour Salvi. Memory processes compete and demonstrate their changeability in differing contexts: Bernini is more marketable than Salvi for the selling of guidebooks.

Retrospective memory of the Fountain as Baroque is often embedded in guidebooks as in art historiography without using the term. *The Blue Guide: Rome* states that: 'The huge Trevi Fountain [...] one of the most famous sights of Rome, and its most magnificent fountain, [...] the city's most exuberant and successful 18<sup>th</sup> century monument, [is] made all the more extraordinary by its confined setting in such a small square.' The vernacular representations of the Baroque Fountain in the selection of guidebooks above, whether explicit or implicit, impact differently on memory in their evolution from those of art historiography intended for an elite. They are for a wider audience and, whilst retaining traces of their narrative origins, contribute to a shaping of memory within consumerist frameworks.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Eyewitness Travel: Rome (2006), pp. 34-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Hawthorne (1990 edn), pp. 144-45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Insight City Guide, pp. 144-45.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Cooke gives Wittkower as a source of this misrepresentation, pp.149-73, noting Valesio does not mention Bernini regarding Trevi design, p. 152.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> Alta Macadam, *Blue Guide: Rome* (London: Somerset, 2006), p. 210.

Guidebooks can be implicated as agents countering unwanted memory. In the article by Barthes on the *Guide Bleu* he maintains that the selected aspects of the landscape, including monuments, that accord with prevailing ideology seek to influence the visitor and thus the guide acts in a manner opposite to the intention conveyed by its title. It is 'un instrument d'aveuglement' serving the interests of a class by removing any challenge to its dominance: 'l'humanité du pays disparaît au profit exclusif de ses monuments.' The ideological implication is that the packaging by many guidebooks of the Trevi as Baroque with other monuments in the publishing processes of late capitalism seeks to replace or obscure memory of previous power structures. The Italian *ROMA*, *City Book* lists the Baroque Trevi among its twelve tourist sites, 'Da non perdere'. The *Blue Guide* Trevi portrayed as 'the city's most exuberant and successful 18<sup>th</sup>century monument' accords with consumerism's need for the victorious and the iconic whilst triumphantly casting the monument as an active agent in its cause.

In conclusion, the Baroque Trevi did not occupy a memory space until the label emerged for retrospective application of configured new pasts in the present. The constantly shifting images of the style in written narrative are of extreme movement, spatial illusion and anticipatory surprise. Initially, it was a term of abuse in the nineteenth-century art historiographical discourse of Western art critics. Positive images in cultural memory became overlaid with negatives until they could be released in future narrative contexts, to be destabilized in turn by the evasiveness of the term Baroque. The art label spread rather than escaped from its origins and carried forward traces of these ambiguities into new memory. The Baroque adds to the slippery moving signifiers of water, power and illusion and to the potential of the Fountain for storytelling practices.

The shifting focuses of positive and negative Baroque images invite Foucault's observations that history should not be construed as a repetition of sources but as discourses of rewriting that are linked with social practices and institutions that seek to control human activity. <sup>59</sup> Applying these concepts to the political power of art, the Baroque and other designations promote a perception that they can be identified as existing before they are retrospectively configured. Due to constraints of time, what cannot be considered here are discourses of art linked to social control, beyond

<sup>57</sup> Barthes, 'Le Guide bleu', p. 137.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> ROMA City Book (Milano: Mondadori Electa, 2002), pp. 8-9.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Foucault, *Archaeology*, pp. 137-44.

acknowledging the ideological drive for manipulation of the imagined historical past to which the Baroque Trevi contributes.

The term Baroque linked to the Trevi in the vernacular usage of guidebooks increases its value as an iconic monument in the marketing of Rome as 'cultural capital'. It becomes a 'must see' tourist destination in the context of consumerism whereby managers of large urban areas manipulate cultural resources including monuments for the selling of place. 60 The retrospective images of a Baroque Fountain are carried forward across media to be reflected imperfectly in art, literature, film, music and on the Internet where the term evolves as it contradicts and competes with itself. The significance of the percolation of the term, along with linguistic reverberations from the narrative of art historiography, is the continuing enhancement of the Trevi as a purveyor for illusion in preparation for future commodification. The fading in and out of focus of positive and negative Baroque images reflects the relation of cultural memory to contemporary situations. <sup>61</sup> Categorizing periods of style was a prerequisite of nineteenth-century art historiography. The Trevi as Baroque is a past of the Fountain that never had a present and attention now turns to a future of its images in the practices of art.

# 4.3 Anticipatory Memory: Picturing the Trevi

#### 4.3.1 Early Images: From Functional Power to Neglect

In contrast with retrospectively created new pasts for the Trevi in art historiography, memory could be anticipated through changing representational practices in the narratives of visual art. Demand for art work across all classes within Rome had developed in the 1600s. 62 The Trevi began to be pictured more widely during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries in oil paintings, watercolours, drawings, prints and sketches and their acquisition generated future memory of destinations for Grand Tour travellers and non-travellers alike. 63 These media, however, informed a still predominantly elitist European memory of Rome and their representations of

<sup>62</sup> Cavazzini, pp. 153-56.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> See Gerry Kearns, Selling Places, ed. by Kearns and Christopher Philo (Oxford: Pergamon Press, 1993), 'Preface', p. ix.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> Jan Assmann, 'Collective Memory', 130.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> See Cavazzini on merchandizing art images in the previous century, p. 155, and generally on the widening market.

monuments and the depictions of urban topography, according to Tarnya Cooper, created a 'conditional expectation' and 'misremembrance' of the city. 64 Maggi's 1625 map showing Della Porta's 1590 *mostra* design for a grand new Trevi that was never built could potentially destabilize memory because seventeenth-century users of the map would see the Alberti Trevi when visiting. 65 Figures [31, 20].

Pictorial images of the Salvi Fountain contrast with those of its predecessors: as functional water provider with design embellishments and later as an unfinished Bernini edifice. The woodcut print of the Alberti Trevi is among the first of its published representations. The 1453 edifice appears as free-standing and unrelated to its background, dominated by inscriptions of ownership that express competing papal and city power in the provision of water. Two prints and an oil painting of Bernini's unfinished Fountain feature the new site. The print by Giovanni Battista Falda (1660) of the Piazza gives prominence to the papal parish church for the Quirinale. Figure [21]. His representation of the fountain highlights the functionality of the everyday edifice – a horse is led to drink water and washerwomen work at the laundry troughs. Lieven Cruyl's *veduta* of 1667 offers a lively interpretation of the Piazza as an enlarged open space of everyday performance. He employs a physically impossible aerial viewpoint with a wide angle perspective that is repeated in future *vedute* of the Salvi Fountain, depicting the figures of people and animals around the unfinished Bernini building site. Figure [22]. The edifice appears unadorned iconographically, discarded masonry lying by the troughs and the low Fountain structure bridging the gap between the two uneven sections of the Palazzo. The topography of power expressed by the buildings with porticoes, the church and the palaces of princes on the skyline predominates.

A few decades later an anonymous oil painting titled *Piazza di Fontana di Trevi* (early 1700s) gives prominence to the buildings around the Piazza and shows a comparatively small Trevi with water troughs amongst scattered construction material. Figure [23]. A group of men talk as a carriage, sedan chair, man on horseback and pedestrians pass through, nuns outside the convent stand beside tables of food and washerwomen are at work. The space of the Piazza is depicted as one of everyday local performance in the style of contemporary print design, as shown in the two prints.

These portrayals of the Bernini Trevi have a dual outcome; an unfinished

Tarnya Cooper, 'Forgetting Rome and the Voice of Piranesi's "Speaking Ruins", in *Forgetting*, ed. by Forty and Küchler, pp. 107-25.

<sup>65</sup> See Borsi for Maggi's map, p, 57.

monument with an uncertain future yet an important part of everyday city life and work. The intentions of the artists were to represent the Piazza and its impressive buildings for consumption in the widening market for prints and paintings characterised by *grandezza*. The pictured Trevi was inconsequential because of its functionality and incompleteness. For this reason, there is no Bernini Trevi print in an imposing volume of copperplate prints (1675) with gilt-edged pages of more than one hundred grand-looking Roman fountains which include the Moses and the Paul V. <sup>66</sup> The Fountain also possessed limited articulation in Franzini's woodcut print and the imagined false presence on Maggi's map. The edifice would not be given a voice of significant power in art images until Salvi started construction in the 1730s.

## 4.3.2 Italy as Europe's Other: A Place for the Grand Tour Trevi

Rome continued as a primary destination of the late Grand Tour until the Napoleonic Wars (1803–1815) and subsequent occupation by French troops. <sup>67</sup> Travellers' narratives portray it as a city surrounded by a malarial Campagna reached after experiencing a difficult journey yet possessing a compelling attraction of difference, not only in extravagant events like the Carnival but also everyday experiences. Chloe Chard, in her exploration of the Tour as narrative, challenges its ubiquitous definition as a 'narrowly British practice' with pre-determined destinations, as exemplified by Jeremy Black's standard work, *The British Abroad* (1992). <sup>68</sup> She locates the traveller as starting a journey somewhere in Northern Europe, with a destination south of the Alps and an intention to include Rome. Movement takes place in the narrative of the journey even if the destination is not attained or the physical journey itself never commenced. Sometimes, on arrival, home may never be left discursively.

Travel as metaphor is also employed by George van den Abbeele.<sup>69</sup> He builds on Said's concept of the need of western nations to construct an imaginative territory of a traditional Orient as the Other when forging their imperialist identities and maintaining control of them. Abbeele claims that an imagined Italy was appropriated as Europe's internal Other once it was no longer the continent's artistic, economic or religious

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Falda, Le fontane nelle piazze, libro primo (Rome: Rossi, 1675), Plates 5, 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> The Grand Tour can be seen as recommencing after 1815, until replaced by popular tourism (1850s). The term is recycled: see thesis 5.3.2 on the 'virtual Grand Tour'.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Chloe Chard, *Pleasure and Guilt on the Grand Tour: Travel Writing and Imaginative Geography 1680-1830* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1999); Jeremy Black, *The British Abroad: The Grand Tour in the Eighteenth Century* (New York: St Martin's Press, 1992).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Edward Said, *Orientalism* (London: Routledge, 1978); George van den Abbeele, *Travel as Metaphor* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1992), pp. xiii-xxx (pp. xxix-xxx).

leader. It became a fantasized place of exotic and dangerous alterity geographically poised on the boundary between West and East. However, Italy as an imaginary construct of myths rather than an actual place attests to the spell cast for two thousand years outside its borders. The Trevi as part of the alterity, of a fantasized Rome in an Italy pictured visually and in written text as Europe's Other, travels across media. The authors considered later use the Trevi as a narrative device that conveys this Otherness that depends on images of difference and illusion.

During the 1800s the major Italian cities acquired well-established communities of foreign artists like Angelika Kauffman, Thomas Jones, John Robert Cozens, and Jean-Baptiste-Camille Corot who spent varying periods of time in Rome. Some travellers, like the brothers Robert and James Adam, and Johannes Wolfgang von Goethe, often employed their own artists to record their journey or undertook the activity themselves. The heyday of the Tour period is generally regarded as the early to the mid eighteenth century, the period during which the Salvi Trevi was built.

The process of translating the topographical city into visual narratives in the media of paintings, drawings and engravings by foreign and local artists had already developed as an expanding export market for consumption in Europe and as souvenirs for visitors. An important destination such as Rome could be visited and remembered before, or without, going to the city through the purchase of travel novels, guidebooks, pictorial images of paintings and the more affordable sketches and copper engraved prints. Cooper comments that features of the city were reduced to particular viewpoints that only existed in representations and led to a misremembrance of its topography with its totality forgotten. Her observation could be applicable to the misremembering engendered by the technological processes of the media-to-come, of photography, film, advertising and the Internet, offering visual images of anticipated destinations.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>70</sup> See Joseph Luzzi, *Romantic Europe and the Ghost of Italy* (Yale: Yale University Press, 2008). Luzzi places long-neglected Italian Romanticism in a wider framework, epic and secular, a literature responsive to classical and religious pasts.

Anna Ottani Cavina, ed., *Un paese incantato: Italia dipinta da Thomas Jones a Corot* (Milan: Electa, 2002).
 Johann Tischbein sketched for Coothor the Latt.

Johann Tischbein sketched for Goethe; the latter produced several paintings. See illustrations in *Italian Journey*, 1786-1788, trans. by W.H. Auden and Elizabeth Mayer (London: Collins, 1962).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Robert Casillo on the 'heyday', *The Empire of Stereotypes: Germaine de Staël and the Idea of Italy* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2006), p. 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>74</sup> See Cavazzini.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Cooper, p. 109.

#### 4.3.3 Writing the Visual: Deceptive Demotions and Promotions

Interpretations of art in the emerging medium of travel writing could also condition memory of the monuments of Rome before any actualization of a visit. Cooper surveys a selection of travellers in the later stages of the Grand Tour who had access to the expanding print industry. Many comment in their writings on a city they remembered from pictorial images which did not match what they found. They did not see the city as new, Cooper claims, because the urban topography in its fictive presentations viewed beforehand created deceptive anticipatory memories. The contrasts between cultural objects and the everyday conditions of the city are frequently commented upon in literary accounts and claims are made that what is remembered has to be forgotten in order to remember the new.

However, these written recollections of recollections about earlier recollections of art indicate the processes of revisionary memory in the practice of writing for the requirements of publishing. Joseph Forsyth is among the travel writers finding a disparity between an imagined Italy of antiquities and arts and the reality of the city they visit, for which Piranesi is often blamed. Forsyth attacks the style of copper plate prints in his 1802–1803 guide: 'That rage for embellishing, [...] has thrown so much composition into the engraved views of Rome, [...] has so expanded the space in which they stand, that a stranger arriving here with the expectations raised by those prints, will be infallibly disappointed.' A print of a temple frieze of stuccos is among others: 'which appear very beautiful and perfect in Piranesi [...] those lying engravers!' Forsyth is dissatisfied with the Trevi on visiting: the sculpture is pompous, the rockwork is fit for a *castellum* but not the 'frittered Corinthian' columns'. <sup>79</sup>

The irate authorial voice of Forsyth's judgmental persona gives rise to potential disenchantment and counter-memory for readers by intentionally using art images in the literary medium for adverse criticism to make his book more marketable. The vocative strategy of employing the first person singular implies direct experience and can shift images around powerfully: the narrative strategy underscores its own unreliable memory source and the author's voice in the process of remembering is always present.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Cooper compares Augustus Hare, John Flaxman, William Beckford and William Hazlitt and their differing conditional expectations, with Piranesi as the main contributor, pp. 113-14.

Joseph Forsyth, *Remarks on Antiquities, Arts and Letters during an Excursion in Italy in Years 1802 and 1803*, 4<sup>th</sup> edn (London: John Murray, 1835), p. 123.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Ibid., p. 139.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> Ibid., p. 176.

It is a borrowing of the style of tetchy disillusionment to which earlier Grand Tour travel writers like Tobias Smollett subscribed.<sup>80</sup>

Unlike Forsyth, Goethe's account of his first visit to Rome in 1786 reflects positive anticipatory memories from childhood of monuments shaped by art images. He celebrates Italy as the place where he allegedly overcame personal and artistic crises and Rome as the place of his intellectual rebirth. His *Italienische Reise* was intended as a defence of classicism in the context of the Romantic movement. Generations of German tourists countered Goethe's authorial intentions and used the book as a travelogue to retrace Goethe's steps. He portrays himself as immersed in memories of childhood on arriving in Rome:

Rom, den 1 November 1786

Alle Träume meiner Jugend seh'ich nun lebendig; die ersten Kupferbilder, deren ich mich erinnere (mein Vater hatte die Prospekte von Rom auf einem Vorsaale aufgehängt), seh'ich nun in Wahrheit, und alles [...] steht nun beisammen vor mir; wohin ich gehe, finde ich eine Bekanntschaft in einer neuen Welt; es ist alles, wie ich mir's dachte, und alles neu. 83

[All the dreams of my youth have come to life; the first engravings I remember –my father hung views of Rome in the hall – I now see in reality, and everything I have known for so long [...] is now assembled before me. Wherever I walk, I come upon familiar objects in an unfamiliar world; everything is just as I imagined it, yet everything is new.]

Goethe represents his youthful memory as partially overlaid by new remembering. Augustus Hare mirrors this intertextually in 1871 when he assumes that travellers to Rome find 'new and most familiar, strange and yet well known' sights whose 'appearance has been familiar to them from childhood.' There seems to be no mention of the new Trevi in the *Reise*. Goethe writes admiringly about the Fountain of Paul V, finding its architecture reminds him of sumptuous arches through which returning

<sup>85</sup> Augustus John Cuthbert Hare, Walks in Rome, 2 vols (London: G. Allen, 1900), 1, p. 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Tobias Smollett, *Travels through France and Italy* [1766], ed. by Frank Felsenstein (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981).

Johannes Wolfgang von Goethe, *Italienische Reise*, 1786-1788 [1816] (Leipzig: Insel, 1914). <a href="http://www.archive.org.details/goethesitalienis00goetuoft">http://www.archive.org.details/goethesitalienis00goetuoft</a>> [accessed 14 September 2013]

See Gretchen Hachmeister, *Italy in the German Literary Imagination: Goethe's "Italian Journey" and its Reception by Eichendorff, Platen, and Heine*, Studies in German Literature, Linguistics and Culture (Rochester, NY: Camden House, 2002).

<sup>83</sup> Goethe, *Reise*, pp. 132.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Goethe, *Journey*, p. 116.

conquerors entered in triumph. It is now, for Goethe, a peaceful although equally powerful benefactor, shown by the inscription of the Borghese pope whose family makes a stately, eternal entry by proxy. <sup>86</sup> His travel memories are shaped in diary and letter form and constantly revisioned over three decades after his 1786 and 1788 visits to Italy before publication; they belong to a present of later life. Huyssen distinguishes, as quoted for this chapter's epigraph, an unavoidable yet powerfully creative fissure that opens up between experiencing an event and its remembrance but this does not relate easily to deliberate choices made in representational practices, repetitive editing of memoires over time, or to the longevity of an author, unless fissures are seen as potentially multiple. <sup>87</sup>

Forsyth's narration of the misremembrance generated by artists is one of angry disappointment. It contrasts with the tone of Goethe's enthusiasm that configures a positive anticipatory memory retrospectively for his reading market. The authors' voices belong to collectively shared norms of European groups of writers that reflect how difference and sharing make up the social frameworks of memory. Memories when published become available to readers and emulators, and the act of publishing letters and diaries mediates between personal and public memory. The externalization of memory in the medium of print makes autobiographical narratives like those of Forsyth and Goethe and their feelings about art images available not only to elite groups in their own countries but also to foreign readers of their language, and in translations with differing reception. Perhaps, as Luzzi puts it, what is on offer is 'a privileged perspective on the status of Italy in the foreign imaginary.' In this context, the transcultural travelling of the written texts associated with art images of the Trevi correlates with the increasing circulation of its images by artists who offered diverse interpretations of the recently built monument.

## 4.3.4 Piranesi and the Engraved Trevi: Evolving Anticipation

Piranesi (1720–1778) was the most prolific of eighteenth-century *vedutista* print artists whose representations of monuments contributed to European visual memories of Rome. The extensive print runs from his copper plates resulted from the simplicity and

.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> Goethe, *Journey*, p. 431.

Huyssen, Twilight Memories, pp. 2-3.

<sup>88</sup> Luzzi, p. 59.

straightness of etched lines that prolonged the clarity and life of the plates. <sup>89</sup> Ones with thicker multiple cross-hatchings by other artists trapped ink and the resultant deterioration reduced output. The increasing circulation of Piranesi's prints continued after his death with publications by his sons who established a workshop in Paris. The plates eventually returned to Rome, to the Accademia di San Luca, and are now held by the Istituto nazionale per la grafica in the palazzo directly behind the Fountain. <sup>90</sup> The publishing context of Piranesi's work was the new technology allowing for the mechanical productions of prints in an expanding art market. There were outlets across Rome and Europe and Grand Tour travellers could visit the print shops lining the Corso in proximity to the Trevi. Guidebooks like Vasi's *Delle magnificenze* mentioned earlier illustrated locations with prints that were for sale.

The commercial activity could relate to Benjamin's comment that, 'what withers in the age of mechanical reproduction is the aura of the work of art [...] a plurality of copies for a unique existence.' However, the source of prints, the reverse image on the master copper plate engraving, is not an original work. The plate itself is not viewed or reproduced and the print run can be extensive and vary in quality. New prints of Piranesi's aging plates are now obtainable only with digitization techniques. The *Istituto* holds pre-digital prints from his copperplates as do other archives, often with the sensory aura of ageing paper and mustiness of old volumes in collections and libraries. Images on websites and in online databases offer a different sensory experience: the non-tactile and aroma-free medium of the Internet. When viewed online, or read about, the elegant tome of copperplate prints of grand fountains by Falda lacks sensory information but can be compensated by the individual practice of memory that, in Sturken's words, integrates elements of 'remembrance, fantasy, and invention.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> Marguerite Yourcenar discusses Piranesi's publishing in *The Dark Brain of Piranesi and other Essays* [1962], trans. by Richard Howard, (Henley-on-Thames: Aidan Ellis Publishing Ltd, 1985), pp. 94-100; also Cooper, focusing on *Antichità*, pp. 110-12; her perspective on anticipatory memory applies here to the *Vedute*.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> The Istituto, established by the Ministero per i Beni culturali e ambientali (1975), combines the Gabinetto Stampe and Calcografia, the latter holding the copperplate collection of the de'Rossi publishers acquired by Clement XII (Trevi patron) who founded the Calcografia Camerale Romana (1738) its prints forming the nucleus of the Gabinetto Stampe. Istituto forerunners acquired Piranesi's copperplates (1838). The archive is on

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.calcografica.ing.beniculturali.it">http://www.calcografica.ing.beniculturali.it</a> [accessed 22 October 2013] or

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.grafica.arti.beniculturali.it">http://www.grafica.arti.beniculturali.it</a> [accessed 22 October 2013]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>91</sup> Benjamin, 'The Work of Art', ed. by Arendt (1999), pp. 215.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> As in the *Vedute* holdings, British Library; Senate House Library, University of London.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Sturken, p. 259.

The Piranesi collection is one of the most important Calcografia collections held by the Istituto and includes his two Fountain *vedute* engravings. <sup>94</sup> Figures [42, 43]. Their location provokes thoughts of a dissonant intermingling of silent plates and prints and their noisy subject in close proximity behind the palace frontage. The colour brochure of the Istituto (2011) also resonates dissonantly in its 'then and now' front page format that mixes media. Figure [45]. The inside pages are folded into panels with half of the front page comprised of a panel from one page with a coloured photograph of the Oceanus group. It juxtaposes the folding of a panel from another page which shows the same group and angle taken from Piranesi's black and white oblique *veduta*. 95

In the dedication to his first published work, *Prima parte di architettura e* prospettive (1743) Piranesi credits Nicola Giobbe, the principal contractor for the Fountain with whom he stayed (and Ghezzi's companion at Salone when he saw the ruins he represented in a sketch as Trivia's home) for revealing to him how the past can be perceived. 96 He thanks him for teaching him since: 'avendomi Voi non solo d'ogni rarità di questo genere antica, o moderna, che si ritrova in Roma fatto osservare le più singulari bellezze [...] come si possa in nuove forme fare un lodevole uso de'ritrovati de'nostri maggiori. 97 Piranesi reshapes a past for his self-laudatory purposes that will be made beautiful and praiseworthy in the present by his new forms of engravings. These images of the ancient and the modern, the ruins of imperial Rome and of the recently built monuments, referred to in the dedicatory epigraph to Giobbe, would appear in his two volumes of copperplate prints, Vedute di Roma (1743), with two of the Trevi, and Antichità romane (1756). In his *Prima parte* dedication Piranesi praises architects who, like those of the Trevi, 'sarà abbastanza alla posterità comprovato'. 98 He interweaves visual memories of a Rome where many classical artefacts had been, or were being, intentionally rendered invisible by official culture in its demolition of monuments, to be reshaped in a new classical style as intended, but thwarted, for a Bernini Trevi built with stones from Metella's tomb.

Piranesi came to Rome from Venice in the early 1740s to join the workshop of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>94</sup> A Palazzo exhibition (2004) displayed Piranesi's and Vasi's Fountain *vedute*. See Mario Bevilacqua's catalogue, Palazzo Fontana di Trevi, 27 November 2004 to 7 February 2005, Nolli, Vasi, Piranesi: Immagine di Roma antica e moderna (Rome: Artemide Edizione, 2004). <sup>95</sup> Juxtaposition of Piranesi's *vedute* with location photographs is used by Levit, *Views of* 

Rome: Then and Now, Figures 37, 38. <sup>96</sup> Dorothea Nyberg, 'Dedicazione' [1743], in Giovanni Battista Piranesi: Drawings and

Etchings (New York: University of Columbia, 1972), pp. 115-16 (p. 117).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Ibid., p. 117.

<sup>98</sup> Ibid., p. 116.

the *vedutista*, Giuseppe Vasi and entered an established community of engravers producing topographical representations of the city. Their style of invented viewpoints and the placing of performing figures around buildings informed his reworking of technique, size, scale and inventive use of the etching needle to depict light falling on architectural details, assisted by his skills of perspective learnt from earlier training in stage design. <sup>99</sup> Piranesi's *Vedute* comprising 135 plates was for sale in volumes or as individual plates and enjoyed immediate popularity. <sup>100</sup>

Piranesi does not use 'Fontana' in the titles for his engravings of the Paul V and the Moses Fountains: the Veduta del Castello dell'Aqua Paola sul Monte Aureo and the Veduta del Castello dell'Acqua Felice. 101 The functionality of each fountain is conveyed by 'castello', or terminal workings, in contrast to the Trevi views beneath which the proclamatory tone of the titles is the *Veduta in prospettiva della gran Fontana* dell'Acqua Vergine detta di Trevi (from a frontal perspective) and the Veduta della vasta Fontana di Trevi (from an oblique angle). Figures [42, 43]. The titles seek to elicit a gaze of admiration from the viewer. In the visual borrowings between pictorial representation and title, as John Welchman points out, there is a re-imaging of the image by the title: 'these gestures force attention from the material site of the image to the conditions of its representation, including the site of the title.'103 The past tense forming the noun *veduta* also suggests the subject has already been seen. The term 'in prospettiva' in the title of Piranesi's frontal Trevi print indicates it is drawn according to the rules of perspective for a panoramic view, as opposed to *profilo* or sky-line, volo d'uccello or bird's-eye view, or to pianta or map. 104 Vasi's 1756 Chiesa di S. Maria in Trivio (1756) with a less panoramic and more profilo perspective and little chiaroscuro contrast has less visual impact, making it arguably less memorable than Piranesi's veduta in prospettiva. Figure [41]. The question of what is being remembered remains

^

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> John Wilton-Ely, 'Piranesi and the Tourists' in *The English Prize: The Capture of the Westmorland, An Episode of the Grand Tour*, publication for Exhibition with same title, ed. by Maria Dolores Sánchez-Jáuregui and Scott Wilcox (Yale University, 2012), pp.137-43 (p. 138). Also, Cooper, pp. 110-11.

Wilton-Ely, English Prize, p. 138.

Wilton-Ely, *The Mind and Art of Giovanni Battista Piranesi* (London: Thames And Hudson Ltd, 1978), Plates 41, 54. Figures gesticulate, beggars argue, carriages cross the Piazza but the Fountains are backgrounds for performance.

Quarto-size reproductions in Wilton-Ely, *The Mind and Art, Vedute* section, Plate 12, oblique view, Plate 104, frontal view.

John C. Welchman, *Invisible Colors: A Visual History of Titles* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997) analyses the impact of titles on perceptions of photographs and paintings, p. 341.

Meaning of *in prospettiva* clarified by Stefano Jossa, Dept of Italian, RHUL (email 28 December 2013).

as raised by Susan Sontag about photographic prints. <sup>105</sup> People may not remember by means of the *veduta* but remember the *veduta*.

Vasi's print shows the Fountain and the *Chiesa di S. Maria* near each other although the latter building can only be glimpsed through a narrow walkway. He almost transposes the church into the Piazza which he enlarges to accommodate it and, by proximity, links it to the grandness of the Trevi. This form of representational practice moves monuments around, creating the misremembrance, the deliberately false topographical memory which Forsyth credited to 'lying engravers'. It was not limited to the copperplate medium. An oil painting by Pannini of the Trevi (1744) depicts the first inauguration of the monument. He places it in a vast square, like Piranesi's *Veduta in prospettiva*, but at eye level, filled with onlookers and shops brought inside the frame and moved sideways for the viewer. The road to the left of the Fountain is straightened to become visible and with the palazzo flanking it. The interpretation in vibrant colour magnifies expectations of a Trevi and its piazza as a place of *grandezza*.

Subjective choices made by artists and patrons about topographical interpretations and titling, or absence of titles, offer lesser known but often conflictual challenges to representations, like Piranesi's of the Fountain. In three later depictions, the Piazza di Trevi is present in its absence in untitled drawings in pencil, chalk and watercolour, circa 1755, by an anonymous artist for Robert and James Adam during their stay in Rome. 107 The Fountain is sketched in close up so that the viewer is led in all three drawings to the water's edge as if joining the spectators standing there. The technique underscores the intended effect of forceful water as it flows over rocks and tumbles downwards. The viewer is required to look upward towards the Oceanic group whose mass and outline is exaggerated by a blurred palazzo behind, as if seen through spray: a further fluid image that emphasizes the power of the Fountain. Prints, drawings and paintings also find a place in cultural memory as images with edges or frames raising questions about visual amputation that creates absences and unexpected presences. Manipulation by the artist and patron, shown in the three Adams's drawings in close up, or inclusion of outlying material brought into sight within the frame, as seen in Vasi's *veduta* [Figure 41], determines what may be depicted. The spatial relation of viewer to the viewed is fluid.

Susan Sontag, Regarding the Pain of Others (New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux, 2003).

See Pinto, *The Trevi*, Figure 134, p. 186, citing source as Pushkin Museum.

The Adams's sketches, John Soanes Museum, under 'Adam', Vol 56. See: <a href="http://www.soane.org.uk/drawings/index.cfm?searchterm=trevi+fountain">http://www.soane.org.uk/drawings/index.cfm?searchterm=trevi+fountain</a> [accessed 20 September 2010]

#### 4.3.5 Views of Piranesi's Vedute

The first print runs of Piranesi's Trevi *Veduta in prospettiva* from an aerial perspective introduce temporal uncertainties as they show the temporary statues of Agrippa and Trivia in their niches, as do other *vedute* of the time. Nine years after the final inauguration, a Piranesi print of 1771 shows the replacement statues of Health and Fertility and the amended cascade, with all the other details unaltered. Clement XII's inscription is clearly shown and the others still remain in shadow. Piranesi's small figures perform identically in front of the new iconography and cascade. The representational practice shifts some images about and not others as if within a fluid *mise en scène* – again the Fountain is not what it seems.

Piranesi depicts the Trevi from an imaginary viewpoint, as if reconfiguring Cruyl's print of the Bernini Trevi, in a Piazza whose size has been inflated to complement the size of the monument. Figures [42, 22]. The lofty, wide angle representation interprets the spatial relationship between large Fountain and small Piazza as one of equal grandness, and basin, steps and walkway are angled on a flat plane towards the viewer. Light falls on the Trevi making it stand out against the shadows of buildings to the left and cast its shadow on houses to the right. Human activity in this chiaroscuro outdoor salotto frames the monument within a circular sweep composed of rows in widening loops. Two carriages hastily leave the Piazza, one on either side of the Fountain, with an implied visit completed: carriages regularly appearing as a mysterious feature in Piranesi's and other artists' vedute. A third carriage remains, a beggar approaching the dark windows hiding any occupants. Well-dressed visitors face the Fountain or one another in discussion, people stroll by and someone beckons to an object in the water. Piranesi hints at the co-existence of social and commercial life surrounding the Trevi in his interpretation of thriving street life composed of pedestrians, street vendors, traders, laden donkeys and open shops. His depictions of figures as visual guides around monuments, interpreted by his skilfully presented gesturing and posturing in the contemporary style, impart the bodily performance of everyday life and are transmitted to spectators, inviting them to gaze at the subject. 109

Marguerite Yourcenar found Piranesi's images overwhelming in that they 'have gradually and retroactively extended in the human imagination' so that it is almost a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>108</sup> See thesis, p. 131.

Cooper discusses his visual guides, p. 108.

mechanical process to think first of his images, 'when we happen to name this or that Roman edifice.' For Yourcenar, Piranesi's figures are: 'little characters from the comedy of manners or picaresque romance' and 'a scherzo contrasting with the architecture's solemn *largo*'. The impact of her metaphor of the figures as *commedia dell'arte* characters performing like lively music is strengthened by comparison with the solemnity of place, suggesting the formality of the Trevi columns and windows in the *vedute*. Yourcenar's ludic allusion offers the spectator of Piranesi's prints an anticipatory memory of Rome as a place of ephemeral theatre and fantasy, of a city with these connotations belonging to Italy's Otherness.

Piranesi's obliquely angled *veduta* looks eastwards across the Fountain towards the old Trevi site, almost at eye level, implying the presence of the former edifice. The Oceanus group and the rockwork are in profile so that their performativity merges with that of the foregrounded figures of groups, street vendors and pedestrians. Figure [43]. The perspective of proximity to these figures places the artist as a participant in their activities, unlike the angle of the frontal *veduta* in which the intention appears to be that aerial suspension of the artist will maintain his distance as a voyeuristic spectator of spectators. The oblique *veduta* forms future memory of a Rome of populous squares and splashing fountains framed by the sky and heightens the potency of an anticipated experience by the invitation to participate personally. In contrast, the frontal *veduta* of grandezza with its exaggeratedly large Fountain and Piazza in a lofty topographical panorama offers a privileged future memory, a more collective experience. The Fountain is made both a place to see, and to be seen, on the late Grand Tour. The inclusion of groups of visitors with whom travelling or stay at home visitors could identify can be interpreted as a visual narrative practice indicative of the increasing commodification of the Fountain. Piranesi advances his commercial endeavours by manipulating images of the Trevi which implicates it again as a vehicle for narratives of the expanding ideology of rising capitalism.

Piranesi's *vedute* of the Fountain invite spectators to join in the life surrounding it in different ways, personally and publicly, to enter its constructed space drawn in by the gestures of visual guides. The representations of these gestures impart the bodily signs that Connerton defines as 'incorporating practices', in this instance a visual repertoire of movements held in collective memory so that possession of the monument

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>110</sup> Yourcenar, *Piranesi*, p. 122.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>111</sup> Ibid., *Piranesi*, p. 103.

is passed on to the viewer of the print. His 'inscribing practice', when information is imparted from a secondary source like a Piranesi print, places its visual interpretations in interwoven personal and public memory. Taking these concepts further, it can be argued that such images need to be powerfully shaped to impart sufficient information for remembrance and that some may not contribute to memory-making. A drawing by Piranesi of the Fountain for a guidebook (1741) shortly after he arrived in Rome has blurred lines and an awkward composition showing minimal statuary and a few inert-looking figures round the water. It lacks the potentiality to act as a significant marker for memory in the imaginative lives of readers and travellers, unlike his skilfully presented prints of the Fountain intended for an expanding international market.

## 4.3.6 Marketing Future Past Memory: Art of the New Fountain

Amongst the prints for sale in galleries and shops of the recently constructed Fountain might be those by Piranesi, Pannini, Vasi and Vanvitelli which could be ordered from abroad or purchased during visits. Travellers frequently acquired drawings, paintings and prints as souvenirs, a practice reflecting the Aristotelian assumption that a material object could act as an analogue of personal memory. Souvenirs, prints and paintings presaged the Trevi products on sale in shops and stalls near the Piazza for the present marketing of the city.

An example of the popularity of prints is Vasi's afore-mentioned illustrated guidebook in ten volumes, *Delle magnificenze*, with notes on where to purchase prints. The guide became more portable in a single volume French edition and an English one followed. In 1833 Mariana Starke writes that 'a large assortment of prints and coloured drawings' are to be found in the Corso shops, and the 1843 Murray guidebook comments that: 'Works of art [sic] are sent to England with the greatest facility and dispatch (by agents of the Royal Academy).' Some travelled to unforeseen transnational destinations. Crates of art souvenirs on board the Westmorland, a ship bound for England from Italy but captured by a French vessel and

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>112</sup> Connerton, *Societies*, pp. 72-73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>113</sup> Ibid., pp. 72-73.

<sup>114</sup> Two faint Piranesi sketches are in Barbiellini, preceding p. 199.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Vasi, VI, Trevi print, Plate 104.

Sánchez-Jáuregui and Wilcox, eds, Descriptions, Catalogue 109, pp. 274-75.

Mariana Starke, *Travels in Europe for the Use of Travellers on the Continent* (London: John Murray, 1833), p. 585. *The Handbook for Travellers in Central Italy* (London: J. Murray, 1843), p. 251.

taken to Spain where its contents were sold in 1779, contained loose prints and forty volumes of Piranesi's works including his *Vedute* with its Trevi prints. 118

Murray calls the papal governments' marketing enterprise, the *Calcografia camerale*, a 'great collection' occupying new rooms near the Trevi: 'Catalogues are hung up for examination, with the prices of each print marked. All the beautiful engravings from the great masters, executed at the expense of the papal government may be purchased here.' Many British universities purchased works like Piranesi's *vedute* for their libraries; they formed part of private collections as for William Beckford and were found in private homes. Ocean Goethe claimed his expectations of Rome were influenced by the drawings his father acquired in Rome. A preference for a Trevi print, contrasting with Forsyth's later criticism of the medium, is promoted by Hester Piozzi in her Grand Tour diary:

The fountains of Rome should have been spoken of long ago [in her *Observations*]; the number of them is known to all though, and of their magnificence words can give no idea. One print of the Trevi is worth all the words of all the describers together.<sup>122</sup>

Following Connerton's concept of how societies remember, it was the embodied act, the ritual and normative social behaviour surrounding the purchase of prints by individuals that contributed to transmission of memory. As souvenirs there would be an expectation on return home that a traveller could exhibit proof of a visit through artefacts acquired at the time that would link memory and place. Other souvenirs for display might include jewellery purchased from the Castellani shop at No. 86, Fontana di Trevi, in the Piazza. 123

The art gallery was a significant location for the purchase of future and past memory. Pannini painted several interior views of a stylish, colonnaded commercial gallery with its walls covered in paintings for sale for his *Vedute di Roma moderna*. Two of these, possibly more, display a Trevi painting in a prominent position in the same gallery. The 1757 one places it on the left amongst a foregrounded group of other

Hester Piozzi, *Observations and Reflections Made in the Course of a Journey through France, Italy and Germany*, 2 vols (London: Srahan & Cadell, 1789), 1, p. 412.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Sánchez-Jáuregui and Wilcox, eds, Inventories, Catalogue 61, p. 228.

Murray's (1843) only places the Trevi topographically, eg nearby shops, streets with lodging houses.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Cooper lists university libraries, pp. 124-25.

Goethe, Journey, p. 116.

Geoffrey C. Mann, *Castellani and Giuliano: Revivalist Jewellers of the Nineteenth Century* (London: Trefoil Books, 1984), p. 27.

pictures of popular monuments, all angled to face the viewer. Figure [46]. In the 1759 version, the Trevi painting dominates the gallery by its forward position in the lower right hand corner and by highlighting with a draped red cloth. Figure [47].

Each painting of paintings is a *mise en scène*, deliberately constructed like a showcase to inform the viewer about the purchasable provision of exportable memory. The placing of a Trevi painting within a painting is a *mise en abîme*. It visually entices the Grand Tour viewer into making a purchase. The story told within the story is about the same medium, of oils and colour, in which Pannini can knowingly advertise his work and marketability as a painter. The paintings function as business cards for the artist himself who might be the seated figure at work in a central position who self-referentially draws attention to himself beside a bright blue drape.

Pannini's commercialized appropriation in oils of the Trevi differs in its expression of political power from an undated and unsigned water-colour and tempera lithograph, possibly by Felix Benoist, for an 1870 album of prints, *Rome dans sa Grandeur*. The artist appears to interpret symbolically the last occupation of French troops before final Unification in 1870 by positioning military figures in a crowd at the Trevi. Soldiers stand on the right in sunlight and a cavalryman on horseback merges into the deep shade on the left; light and darkness are again visual indicators of a performative display of power. The artist represents control by his country of the grandeur of Rome during the occupation by using the Trevi as metonym for both city and Italy. The effect of the lithograph changes according to reproductive technologies and to the temporal location of the viewer: a pale sepia copy of the print could be bought as a souvenir for one euro on Roman stalls in 2011. Figure [48]. A colourenhanced digital copy circulates on the Internet. Figure [49].

The exploration of the Trevi as a vehicle for the narratives of eighteenth-century and earlier art intimates differences according to its changing function from utilitarian to grandness. Configurations of the Salvi Trevi might be positively or negatively situated in anticipatory memory as expressed by the narrative voices of travellers like Goethe and Forsyth in their published accounts. Pictured representations of the Trevi increasingly travel transculturally and their purchase belongs to the context of the increasing commodification of Rome. The Grand Tour Fountain as depicted by Piranesi is both a place of everyday and elite performance of ritual in his prints. Onlookers could loftily gaze on its spectacle or be visually invited to join the pictured crowd in

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>124</sup> Figure [49], also front page of Illustrations Booklet.

anticipation of a remembered experience, engaging not only their admiration but also subjective feelings. It is the latter that carry forward onto new intermedial platforms of memory.

The *vedute* artists and painters mainly dispensed with Salvi's intention to maximize the contradiction between small space and large monument that emphasizes the display of water power. Fountain and Piazza are often depicted as sharing a visual relationship of spatial equality to match an idealized cityscape of imagined spectacle. Their visual representations are associated with a changing direction of ideological power. The Trevi as a vehicle for the commercial narratives of art endorses the new political objectives of the market place of emergent capitalism: narrative forms that again assist the forgetting of unsuitable pasts. The Trevi is increasingly imagined as a place for staging performances, a fountain that belongs to a city in Italy, a country fantasized as Europe's Other in collective memory and a key Grand Tour destination. The images of art circulate in a context of widening audiences for print publication where the rise of the novel, in particular the travel novel, could manipulate the Fountain as a metaphor and a literary narrative device.

## 4.4 Future Memory: Literary Nymphs in Search of a Fountain

#### 4.4.1 Cool Classical Water and Patriarchal (Im)Purity

Writing may be described as an act of memory by which every text, in Lachmann's words, becomes 'etched into memory space'; each new text incorporates others and its intertextual dimension functions as part of cultural memory. A literary text may seek to recollect the past, others may form a literary canon as objects of remembrance, or literature itself can be taken as a medium for observing the production of cultural memory. Authors draw on texts of other authors belonging to their own or another culture and reconfigure them. Intertextuality is a narrative interchange that can be literary and non-literary, demonstrated by Piranesi's etching technique that reworked

Erll and Rigney, 'Literature and the Production of Cultural Memory: Introduction' in *European Journal of English Studies*, 10, 2 (2006), 111-15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>125</sup> Renate Lachmann, 'Mnemonic and Intertextual Aspects of Literature', in *Cultural Memory Studies: An International and Interdisciplinary Handbook*, ed. by Erll and Nünning (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2008), pp. 301-10 (p.301).

the style of other engravers.<sup>127</sup> A monument is obviously not a literary text itself but its images in the medium allow observation of the production of intertextuality and its relation to memory. A difference between literature and art lies in the extent to which the changing narrative practices of the former offer more intermedial exchanges than the latter. The Fountain functions as a narrative device, sometimes as an intentional intertext and at other times unintentionally.

There are many classical authors who represent the Aqua Virgo water as uncontaminated. Its images of purity and freshness circulate across the millennia for future appropriation and reconfiguration in narratives that include art, literature, film, music, advertising and the Internet. Pliny the Elder reports that: 'iuxta est Herculaneus rivus, quem refugiens Virginis nomen obtinuit.' [the spring refuses to mingle at source with the waters of a nearby stream sacred to Hercules, and therefore is named Virgo.]<sup>128</sup> Frontinus's writings on the aqueduct and its myths are central for the interpretation of Trivia's story in her bas-relief on Salvi's Trevi: 'Virgo appellata est, quod quaerentibus aquam militibus puella virguncula venas quasdam monstravit' [It was called Virgo because a young virgin girl pointed out certain springs to soldiers searching for water].<sup>129</sup> The Roman statesman and writer, Cassiodorus, writing about four centuries after the aqueduct's inauguration, echoes Pliny the Elder:

Purest and most delightful of all streams glides along the Aqua Virgo, so named because no defilement ever stains it. For while all the others, after heavy rain show some contaminating mixture of earth, this alone by its every pure stream would cheat us into believing that the sky was always blue above us. 130

Cassiodorus nuances his description of Virgo purity with the possibility of deception indicating that suspension of disbelief is required. It is an ironic future echo of Trevi water as a metaphor for the purity of products in film and advertising, subjects of the next chapter.

Seneca employs the image of the water's coolness for the narrative construction of his Stoic persona as a cold-water enthusiast in his youth: 'Ille tantus psychrolutes, qui

Cassiodorus, *Variae epistulae*, vii 6, Formula 6, ed., trans. by Thomas Hodgkin (London: 1886), p. 324. Latin original presently unavailable.

Lachmann discusses intertextuality, p. 301. The term used (1966/67) by Julia Kristeva is of a text as absorption and transformation of another, not influence of one writer upon another. See Kristeva, *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art* (New York: Columbia University Press, 1980), p. 15.

Pliny, VIII, XXXI, 42, trans. by Jones, pp. 402-03.

Frontinus, p. 351. Full quote, thesis, p. 26.

kalendis Ianuariis euripum salutabam, qui anno novo quemadmodum legere, scribere, dicere, aliquid, sic auspicabar in Virginem desilire.' [To celebrate the first day of the New Year by taking a plunge into the waters of the Aqua Virgo (that supplied Agrippa's Campus Martius) was as easy as reading, writing or speaking]. Another translation has Seneca 'jumping into the Maiden Pool', an unstoic performance suggesting the temporal location of the translator in the twentieth century and a possible awareness of the present Fountain. Similarly, a translator of Ovid's *Tristia* has athletes bathing in the Trevi seventeen centuries before its construction: 'Now after smearing their bodies with dripping oil the young athletes/ Wash down in the Virgin's Fountain their limbs tired out with sport. The practices of translation reshape images and convey changes of meaning as with the afore-mentioned status of Frontinus's *puella* as *virguncula* that is lost in translation by the twentieth-century classicists, C.E. Bennett and Clemens Herschel.

The discourse of purity is employed by Martial who offers coolness, 'sed curris niveas tantum prop Virginis undas' [runners by the melted snow water of the Virgo aqueduct] and supplies a counter image to idealized purity and coolness by referring to one Lattara: 'cur [...] perfundit gelida Virgine? ne futuat' [Why [...] does he plunge into the Virgin's cold water? To stop his fucking]. In more recent narrative, Morton refers to five jars of Trevi water in Michelangelo's cellar which were regarded of sufficient value to be recorded in the inventory of his possessions and that it was the custom until the 1800s for people to keep Trevi water in large jars. Hawthorne describes the water as: 'in request, far and wide, as the most refreshing draught for feverish lips, the pleasantest to mingle with wine, and the wholesomest to drink, in its native purity, than can anywhere be found. '137

A narrative took shape in classical texts of myths about the purity of the water source of the aqueduct and of the young girl who knew of its location and gave them

Seneca, *Epistulae morales*, *Epistles of Seneca*, [1<sup>st</sup> Century CE], trans. by Richard M. Gunmere (London: Heinemann, 1920), p. 261.

Seneca, *Letters from a Stoic: Epistulae Morales ad Lucilium*, trans. by Robin Campbell (London, Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1969), p.141.

Ovid: Tristia, Book 3, 12, trans. by Levi Robert Lind (Athens: University of Georgia Press,

Ovid: Tristia, Book 3, 12, trans. by Levi Robert Lind (Athens: University of Georgia Press 1975), p. 83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>134</sup> Bennett (1969), p. 351; Herschel, p. 15.

<sup>&#</sup>x27;ne futuat' lost in one translation as, 'So he may not be tempted', in *Martial Epigrams*, parallel trans. by Walter C.A. Ker (London: Heinemann, 1919), 1, V11, XXX11, 11, pp. 446-47 and 2, 11, XLV11, 5-6, pp. 272-73.

<sup>136</sup> Morton, *The Waters*, p. 65.

Hawthorne, Faun, p. 145.

symbolic value in the transmission of memory. The stories promoting the quality of the water find physical form on Salvi's Fountain. The word SALVBRITATE [health-giving properties] for Clement XII's inscription, the statues of Health and Fertility, the attic iconography, the Agrippa and Trivia bas-reliefs and the Oceanic triad all symbolize the abundance of water. The narratives become both textual and visual as the Trevi is shaped as a conduit for classical myths. The aqueduct also brings the water to the city under the protection of a deity called the Nymph of Salone: the dress rehearsal for water nymphs who attend the water of the Fountain in media yet to come. A self-perpetuating legacy of gendered narrative that feeds into misogyny is projected into remediated literary symbolism to which poetry contributes.

## 4.4.2 A Well-Versed Nymph: Fountain Poets and the Night

The long and potent association in cultural memory of water and gods, goddesses and nymphs was exploited by fountain designers following the re-discovery from the 1400s onwards of classical Greek and Roman texts describing springs and their nymphs. <sup>138</sup> The idea of a Nymph at the Salone source of the Acqua Vergine who could surface in its Roman fountains belongs to Frontinus's inference of a temple deity. Images in sixteenth-century poetry of fountain nymph and man attracted to the water of the Aqua Vergine anticipate the performative ones of literary and filmic narratives. Poetic narrative, however, was taking a different memory path to contemporary architectural accounts about the Salone source that revealed a lack of knowledge, and memory, about its location and concern over polluted water feeding into the aqueduct from other streams. There was an increasingly meagre supply of water until a major restoration in 1570. <sup>139</sup>

Reference to the Nymph of Salone is made in the early 1500s by the humanist scholar and poet, Angelo Colocci, who lived near the Trevi. According to his biographer, Colocci used the water from the aqueduct running through the garden: 'di fare una fonte di quest'acqua Vergine, che gli servì, in luogo di molta delitia e commodità.' The fountain inspired inscriptions and poetry, with a print of the fountain and a version of a popular epigram underneath its naked, reclining river nymph

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>138</sup> See Robert W. Gaston, 'Pirro Ligorio's Roman Fountains and the Concept of the Antique: Investigations of the Ancient Nymphæum in Cinquecento Antiquarian Culture', in *Patronage and Italian Renaissance Sculpture*, ed. by Kathleen Christian and David J. Drogin (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2010), pp. 223-49 (p. 223).

Rinne details efforts to rediscover the source and aqueduct restoration, pp. 43-55. Federico Ubaldini, *Vita di Mons. Angelo Colocci* [1653], ed. by V. Fanelli (Rome: Vatican, 1969), p. 51.

appearing in a *Topographiae* of Rome.<sup>141</sup> Colocci's biographer records the epigram, in which the poet addresses the Nymph, as:

Huius Nympha loci, sacri custodia fontis Dormio, dum blandae sentio murmur aquae. 142

[The sacred custodian nymph of the fountain Sends me to sleep, whilst I sense the murmur of charming waters.]

In Colocci's verses *Ad Nympham Salonida*, he ingratiates himself with his patron who has a country residence near Salone. In the following extract, the Nymph is imagined as the provider of healthy water since the past of Roman Empire and capable of travelling to spread her benefits. By implication, the Cardinal benefits from the laudable geographical location:

[...] Dea fontis amoeni, Quae laeta Augusti Principis arva rigas Nunc post tot curas, et fessum pulvere, et aestu Sparge salutiferis Nympha Solonis aquis. Ille, tibi geminis faciens cava pocula palmis.<sup>143</sup>

[...] the delightful goddess of the spring, The health-giving Nymph of Salone moistens The pleasing land of the Emperor Augustus With water that is curative, cleansing and cooling. When drinking it from cupped hands.]

The performance of the Nymph in these verses presages the ritual at the Trevi of sipping water in cupped hands. The pre-symbolic female deity, the Nymph of Salone who bestows the benefits of water, prefigures the iconographic expression of female goddesses on the future Fountain: Health, Fertility and the four attic statues.

The water of fountains as a vehicle for conveying narratives has its power enhanced if associated performances take place at night. As Harbison comments on the visual uncertainty of the dark: 'Night is not just another part of reality that demands representation, too, but an opacity whose meaning we cannot fix very well.' 144 By the

D'Onofrio, citing source as Jean Jacques Boissard, *Romanae Urbis Topographiae* (Frankfurt: 1597–1602), p. 158, *Acque*, Figure 108, p. 128.
 Ubaldini, pp. 51-52. D'Onofrio's Boissard print has slightly different wording. For a history

Ubaldini, pp. 51-52. D'Onofrio's Boissard print has slightly different wording. For a history of the epigram, see Elizabeth MacDougall, 'The Sleeping Nymph: Origins of a Humanist Fountain Type', *The Art Bulletin*, 57 (1975), 357-65. Chifletti includes the epigram in Graevius, 4, col. 1788.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> In Ubaldini, pp. 54-55.

Harbison, *Spaces*, p. 11.

early nineteenth century the medium of poetry was contributing to cultural remembrance of an Italy where fountains were attended by nymphs at night. In *Childe Harold's Pilgrimage* (1812), Byron's Egeria meets the king of Rome in the enchanted setting of her fountain dwelling and: 'The purple midnight veil'd that mystic meeting/With her most starry canopy. <sup>145</sup> In the illustrated edition of the popular *Italy, A Poem* by Samuel Rogers (1822), his poem 'The Fountain' starts beneath a picture of a nymphæum where a boy sips water from the hands of a classically-garbed woman:

The sun had set [...] Soon I heard
Footsteps; and lo, descending by a path
Trodden for many ages, many a nymph appeared, [...]
At length came the loveliest of them all,
Her little brother dancing down before her [...]
Stopping there,
She joined her rosy hands, and, filling them
With the pure element, gave him to drink;<sup>146</sup>

The sipping of pure water and a patriarchal idealized female attendant serving a male figure at fountains in the sensory ambience of the dark are literary devices that suffuse travel novels and then film where the Trevi is employed at a key turning point in the narrative with outcomes not always beneficial for participants, as explored in the following section and in Chapter Five.

#### 4.4.3 Literary Markers for Memory: Moonlight, Romance, Tragedy

The mythical subjects of nymphs and fountains in a discursive framework offer the potential for intensifying subjective feeling. It is strengthened by the narrative device of night-time darkness which prevails over daylight in its power for generating the required suspension of disbelief and is further intensified when the ingredient of illumination by moonlight is added. Descriptions of visits to Roman buildings, statues and monuments viewed by the light of the moon, waxen tapers and torchlight appear frequently in the literary discourse of travel writers and novelists from the mid eighteenth century onwards. Some prints may have been viewed by candlelight to

Samuel Rogers, *Italy, a Poem* [1822] (London: T. Caldell; E. Moxon, 1830), pp. 176-77. Pearlee Freiberg, 'Roman Nocturne,: Classical Sculpture Illuminated', paper given to meeting of North-Eastern American Society for Eighteenth-Century Studies, Boston, (1997), cited by Chard, p. 229.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>145</sup> George Gordon Noel Byron, 'Childe Harold's Pilgrimage' [1812] in *The Complete Poetical Works: Lord Byron*, ed. by Jerome J. McGann, 7 vols (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1980–82), 2, Canto IV, stanza 118, ll. 5, 6.

replicate, anticipate or vicariously experience moonlit visits. <sup>148</sup> Chloe Chard suggests the fashion of viewing illuminated sights at night was a positive one for travellers because of a heightened sense of history, colour or beauty, although she does not distinguish between moonlight and the artificial light of torches and tapers. <sup>149</sup> In the literary extracts presented later, the authorial preference for moonlight is a potent non-human vehicle for underscoring intentions that seek to convey ephemeral human emotions. *Corinne: ou l'Italie* (1807), the Romantic travel novel by Anne-Louise Germaine de Staël, promulgated the literary vogue of moonlit remembering in a scene at the Trevi. <sup>150</sup> François-René de Chateaubriand preceded Staël in admiring moonlit monuments and he in turn borrowed the device from earlier writers. <sup>151</sup> Their accounts may have been observations or interpretations of a local custom of viewing Roman monuments by artificial light and moonlight. <sup>152</sup>

In *Corinne*, Staël re-unites the Scottish peer, Lord Oswald Nelvil [*sic*] and the Italian poet laureate, Corinne, after a break in their emotionally-charged relationship:

Le soir du quatrième jour de cette cruelle absence, il faisait un beau clair de lune, et Rome est bien belle pendant le silence de la nuit: il semble alors qu'elle n'est habitée que par ses illustres ombres. Corinne [...] oppressée par la douleur, descendit de sa voiture, et se reposa quelques instants près de la fontaine de Trevi, devant cette source abondante qui tombe en cascade au milieu de Rome, et semble comme la vie de ce tranquille séjour. 153

Before Oswald's appearance at the moonlit Fountain, Staël inserts a topographical reference in the discursive style of the novel. The Fountain is a promoter of fantasy in the centre of Rome; if it stops then so does the life of dreams led there. When Staël lived in Rome, the Fountain was on a central thoroughfare before becoming a backwater location after construction of the Via del Tritone to the Corso in the late 1800s:

Anne-Louise Germaine de Staël, *Corinne: ou l'Italie* [1807], pp. 136-37. <a href="http://www.inlibroveritas.net/lire/oeuvre2742.html">http://www.inlibroveritas.net/lire/oeuvre2742.html</a> [accessed 29 September 2013]. Translations are in Appendix Two, p. 257-59. *Corinne* was referenced during the Grand Tour in travellers' experiences, eg Anna Jameson, *Diary of an Ennuyée*, cited by Chard, p. 16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>148</sup> Cooper mentions Piranesi's *Vedute* in the Frederick William Hope collection, Ashmolean Museum, having candle wax droppings on several pages, p. 112. The librarian did not find these on the Trevi prints (email, 8 November 2012).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> Chard, pp. 226-29.

Casillo refers to Lady Knight (*Letters from France and Italy, 1776-1795*), Goethe's *Reise*, and George Christian Adler's *Reisebemerkungen auf einer Reise nach Rom* (1784) whose work precedes François-René de Chateaubriand's, *Lettres sur l'Italie*, 1803, p.3.

 <sup>152</sup> Casillo, p. 3.
 153 Staël, *Corinne*, p.136.

Lorsque pendant quelques jours cette cascade s'arrête, on dirait que Rome est frappée de stupeur [...] c'est le murmure de cette fontaine immense, qui semble comme l'accompagnement nécessaire à l'existence rêveuse qu'on y mène. L'image de Corinne se peignit dans cette onde, si pure, qu'elle porte depuis plusieurs siècles le nom de *l'eau virginale*. Oswald, qui s'était arrêté dans le même lieu peu de moments après, aperçut le charmant visage de son amie qui se répétait dans l'eau. Il fut saisi d'une émotion tellement vive, qu'il ne savait pas d'abord si c'était son imagination qui lui faisait apparaître l'ombre de Corinne [...] il se pencha vers la fontaine pour mieux voir, et ses propres traits vinrent alors se réfléchir à côté de ceux de Corinne.

Oswald, symbolic for Staël of an emotionally repressed northern Europe, falls in love on his arrival in Rome with Corinne, symbol of a demonstratively dangerous South and possessing a mysterious past of previous lovers. Her mythical attributes are established before meeting at the Fountain: her figure resembles a Greek statue and 'elle dansoit comme une nymphe.' Later, Staël situates Corinne's house above the Tivoli falls opposite the Temple of the Sibyl; a sibylline metaphor of an uncannily known future pervades the novel. The intertexts in the narratives of male classical writers and Renaissance poets of the idealized female deities who dwell in or by water sources shape the textual Corinne in a continuing framework of gendered fantasy.

In Staël's Trevi scene, the lovers only recognise one another when they are reflected by moonlight on the water. Corinne invites Oswald to renew their relationship, a proposal presaging danger for their futures as she guides him round the sights of Rome, including Egeria's Fountain and the Tiber, and as they journey to the South. The physicality of each location is expressed in terms of peril or beauty which underscores the portrayal of the liaison that was renewed at the purveyor for dreams, the intangible presence of the Fountain. Corinne dies from unrequited love after Oswald unknowingly marries her English sister. He pines away in the loveless marriage, reviving when duty prevails.

The resumption of the relationship between Corinne and Oswald in the scene of myopic manoeuvres by the Trevi water is a key turning point in the novel. It is another dress rehearsal for future memory in literature and the intermedial borrowings of film, video, music, promotions and advertising. One performer, usually female, lures a male

Staël, *Corinne*, p. 137. 'L'existence rêveuse' echoes Chateaubriand's version of past, present and future memory on first visiting: 'Le lieu est propre à la réflexion et à la rêverie: je remonte dans ma vie passée: je sens le poids du présent, et je cherche à pénétrer mon avenir.' *Lettres sur l'Italie*, 1803, cited in Luzzi, p. 240.

figure or figures, often in moonlight or artificial light, to the life-changing Trevi water which offers a new but not necessarily promising future. Corinne's performance at the Fountain is ambiguous as the authorial intentions to convey tragic vulnerability are both undermined and sustained. Staël also introduces the idea of the silent Fountain as a negative device, giving rise to new memory.

Whilst Corinne represents the possibility of fresh beginnings she simultaneously suggests an erotic trope in art and literature of beautiful nymphs inhabiting water locations and who symbolize sexual temptations resulting in catastrophic outcomes for men. Literary examples include the Homeric goddesses, Circe and Kalypso, who entrap Odysseus on their islands, and Heinrich Heine's Rhine Lorelei who lures men to their death in dangerous waters. The combination of water, rocks and woman at the Trevi links to the Sirens, beautiful Greek goddesses whose lyre-playing charms men onto deadly rocks. As Odysseus's ship passes the Sirens he is tied for safety to the ship's mast, this Homeric image represented in paintings by John William Waterhouse (1891) and Herbert James Draper (c.1909). *The Siren* by Waterhouse (c.1900) depicts a fish-like woman with a lyre beside men drowning on rocks. Edward Armitage's *The Siren* (1888) shows a naked nymph playing her lyre on a cliff overlooking dangerous waters. <sup>155</sup>

Corinne also belongs to the literary construction of a tragic Italy during the historical context of its occupation by France during the Napoleonic wars. The discursive style of Italy as a 'tableau vivant of suffering womanhood' would give way, although not entirely, in the 1850s to representations of the country as an aestheticised place removed from the everyday presence of French occupation, <sup>156</sup> as in Hawthorne's Faun (1860). Romantic Europe's literary fabrication of Italy as 'ruinous', according to Joseph Luzzi, is a dishonest and empirically unsound myth often permeated with political motives and obfuscating ideologies that continues to be remembered. Memory, whether personal or public, he comments, 'involves a bend in the direction of the imagination: the words we use to describe this look backward [...] can signal our exile to the realm of the anachronism, as potentially creative as it is inaccurate', an

<sup>155</sup> Staël, as a classically-attired Corinne playing a lyre, backgrounded by Tivoli falls and temple, was painted by Elisabeth Vigée-Lebrun (1807) – but fails to suggest allurement.

See Angela Leighton, 'Resurrections of the Body: Women Writers and the idea of the Renaissance', in *Unfolding the South: Nineteenth-Century British Women Writers and Artists in Italy*, ed. by Alison Chapman and Jane Stabler (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2003), pp. 222-38 (p. 222).

Luzzi, p. 54.

observation similar to Huyssen's about productive fissures. <sup>158</sup> The Trevi is a late arrival in the context of Luzzi's 'ghost of Italy' as a country constructed in the Western imaginary with its origins transmitted in cultural memory over millennia. Staël's depiction of Corinne as a consummate symbol of Romanticism, of Italy as suffering and dying, is one to which the Trevi belongs by association. It is a narrative device that furthers the symbolism.

The translated *Corinne* can carry a slightly different meaning of the Trevi which also alters Staël's authorial intentions. She sees the Fountain as 'l'accompagnement nécessaire à l'existence rêveuse' but in one translation it becomes 'the necessary background to the day-dreaming life' in the centre of Rome. This makes the English Trevi subservient to the illusory practice of dreaming and weaker than the French Fountain as the co-producer of dreams, another instance of translation practices reshaping meanings in transcultural memory similar to those of the classical writings on the Aqua Virgo.

Stendhal's description of the Fountain about twenty years later forms a counter memory to Staël's depiction of its central importance to Rome. He overlooks his earlier diary entry which comments positively that the Trevi *rione* is 'ainsi nommé a cause de la belle fontaine'. Representing himself as being in a bad mood, part of his main entry reads:

*1er mai 1828.* – [...]Mme de Staël dit que, lorsque les eaux de la fontaine de Trevi cessent de jouer par suite de quelque réparation, il se fait comme un grand silence dans tout Rome. Si cette phrase se trouve dans *Corinne*, elle suffirait à elle seule pour me faire prendre en guignon toute une littérature. On ne peut donc obtenir d'effet sur le public en France que par une plate exagération! L'architecture de cette fontaine de Trevi [...] n'a de bien que sa masse et le souvenir historique qui nous apprend que cette eau coule ainsi depuis dix-huit cent quarantesix ans. La chute de ces nappes d'eau assez abondantes au fond d'une place entourée de hautes maisons fait un peu plus de bruit que la fontaine de Bondi sur le boulevard. <sup>161</sup>

The authorial voice operates on multiple levels: the Trevi is inferior architecturally with only size and historical memory to commend it and sounds not much louder than a

Staël, Corinne, or Italy (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), p. 74.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>158</sup> Luzzi, p. 20; Huyssen, *Twilight Memories*, pp. 2-3.

Marie Henri Beyle Stendhal, *Promenades dans Rome* [1829] (Paris: Michel Lévy frères, 1858), p. 90 <a href="http://www.archive.org/details/texts">http://www.archive.org/details/texts</a> [accessed 14 September 2013]
Stendhal, pp. 296-97.

fountain he knows in France. Like Staël, he draws attention to the auditory aspects of memory: as both authors write they are remembering the noise made by water. By praising French design at the expense of the Roman and defending himself against the topographical romanticism of *Corinne*, Stendhal's becomes nationalistic and misogynist. He could be called an oxymoronic 'sedentary traveller' who has not left Paris. Chard defines this as someone who controls the threat of alterity abroad by personal memories of home and may never leave discursively. <sup>162</sup>

Stendhal widened his rational critique by denigrating Staël's literary output and the reading habits of the French in the quoted diary entry. As Sara Mills comments, women writers were caught in a publishing double-bind as publishers permitted them to write on topics such as romance and travel which were then judged inferior by critics. Alternatively, by focusing on emotions, Staël contributes to a subversion of contemporary travel writing of the Grand Tour that focused on works of art in terms of architectural style. For Staël, Trevi water is a narrative device functioning as a reflector of emotion: the Fountain as the *fons* of feeling echoes Piranesi's *veduta* where he engages the spectator in his diagonal view at eye-level across the water and the Piazza. The literary image of a woman desperate for the love of a man adds to the sexual stereotyping in Frontinus's representations of a young girl and the poetic notion of a Salone Nymph inhabiting the aqueduct water yet differs in its subjective resonance.

A few decades after Stendhal's visit, Charles Dickens was in Rome (1844). His swiftly presented images of the Trevi for his travel accounts are of a moonlit monument. It functions as a contrast to the darkness of the surrounding streets and to his experience of spending the day touring the dry Campagna. Dickens descriptions of the latter as a 'desolate' and 'ruined world' reflect the eighteenth- and nineteenth-century discourse of northern European travel writers describing an outer ring of malarial desolation encircling the city walls. His images heighten those of Rome as Other, the setting for his bright, fluid, audible Trevi. Back in the city, and as a fitting end to his day, the moon shines intermittently between grand monuments and on bleak areas as Dickens's carriage passes by, suggesting its symbolic function of mystery in a Piranesi *veduta*:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>162</sup> See Chard, pp. 2-5. A well-known sedentary traveller comparing locations unfavourably with those of home is Tobias Smollett, *Travels through France and Italy* [1766], ed. by Frank Felsenstein (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1981).

Sara Mills, Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism (London: Routledge, 1993), p. 48.

Charles Dickens, *Pictures from Italy* [1846] (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1989), p. 397; first serialised in Dickens's *Daily News*.

there are the ponderous buildings reared from the spoliation of the Coliseum, shutting out the moon, like mountains: while here and there, are broken arches, and rent walls, through which it gushes freely [...] Crossing from these patches of thick darkness, out into the moon once more, the fountain of Trevi, welling from a hundred jets, and rolling over mimic rocks, is silvery to the eye and ear.

The Dickens Trevi is a literary mise en scène where the properties, lighting and background of the Piazza have been deliberately arranged together with a moon that gives its silver shine to the Fountain. The motifs of light and darkness continue in the flaring lamps of a street booth on a dark corner of the Piazza and a torch-bearer in front of a cart carrying away the dead. The authorial intent of telling a story about a city of chiaroscuro contrasts at night is rendered more memorable by the device of intermittent light that is then fully displayed in the open at the moonlit Trevi. The noise of the carriage on cobbles is overlooked as Dickens chooses to remember his Fountain as one of beautiful visual and auditory qualities in order to underscore the narrative of contrasts. His depiction is an intertext for a 2006 guidebook: 'There it is [the Fountain] as you turn from one of the three streets [...] into the small piazza, a sight the writer Charles Dickens memorably described as "silvery to the eye and ear". '165 The literary narrative ingredients of moonlight and darkness as the background for the performance of subjective feelings are blended in the heterogeneous complexity of Fountain images in cultural memory. By making her Trevi location moonlit, Staël conveys the intensity yet ephemerality of her lovers' relationship. She adds a sexual dimension to the lunar narrative ingredient that gains prominence as a future intertext in the mediatized reiteration of stories surrounding the Trevi.

## 4.4.4 Intertexts: Dark Memories Travelling

A key scene in Hawthorne's *Faun* (1860) takes place at the moonlit Trevi. The American author, who lived for a while near the Fountain, claims to have struggled with memory when writing his travel novel on returning to England because of the extensive descriptions he had recorded in Italy. His observation that the change of scene 'made these Italian reminiscences shine out so vividly that I could not find it in my heart to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>165</sup> Spiral Guide, p. 124.

Exemplifying this detail, Hawthorne wrote: 'the rims of all the fountains [...] shaggy with icicles, and the fountain of Trevi skimmed almost across with a glassy surface.' 'Winter in Rome', *The Nottinghamshire Guardian*, Issue 730, 15 March 1860, p. 4, British Newspapers, University of London (1600–1900).

cancel them!' resonates with a strong link between place and memory. <sup>167</sup> Hawthorne was in Rome during the final years of the Risorgimento but his novel reflects little of the social and political climate of the penultimate occupation by France until 1864, the period in which the *Faun* is set. Hawthorne's Italy is not one of 'suffering womanhood' but primarily the aesthetic one of art and its history and the marketing of his Rome is aimed at the increasing number of visiting Americans. <sup>168</sup> One critic calls the novel 'a portable museum, bringing certified Italian masterpieces' into the home. <sup>169</sup> By the late 1860s the best-selling *Faun* belonged to a cultural apparatus of advice on how to see the sights of Rome. Like Goethe's *Reise* and Staël's *Corinne*, the *Faun* was a shaper of anticipatory personal memory for travellers and non-travellers. Yet it is inflected with Stael's Romanticism when Hawthorne employs the Trevi location for the parallel purposes of storytelling about his characters.

Hawthorne's Trevi, like Staël's, is a narrative device portentous of tragedy. The novel centres around two figures. The Italian Donatello is pictured as a half-human, half-animal faun with furry ears, the writer taking his inspiration from the marble Faun in the Hall of the Dying Gladiator at the Capitoline Museum. Miriam, his American lover, has a mysterious guilt-ridden past catching up with her. The text is interwoven with frequent topographical references, the narrative device also employed in *Corinne*, that dominate in the *Faun*: 'works of art [...] loom over the action in exaggerated eminence, compelling its meaning to be figured in their terms.' Later editions from about 1885 became more commercially attractive by inserting photogravure illustrations, including the Trevi. A publishers' Advertisement claims it was the culmination of a memorial practice:

Ever since the first publication of *The Marble Faun*, travellers and lovers of Rome have used the book as a souvenir, [...] it early became the custom of visitors to Italy to collect photographs of the statues, paintings, and buildings referred to in the romance, and to interleave the book with them; and this has become so common that dealers in Rome and Florence make it their practice to keep such photographs arranged and ready for the traveller <sup>172</sup>

lbid., Advertisement following List.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>167</sup> Hawthorne (London: Trench and Company, 1885), Preface, p. 15.

Richard H. Brodhead, 'Introduction', Faun, 1990, p. xiii.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Ibid., p. xxvii.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>170</sup> Brodhead, p. xviii.

For example, *Faun*, List of Illustrations (Boston and New York: Houghton, Mifflin and Company, The Riverside Press, 1890), p. 14, Trevi insert precedes p. 172.

It goes on to claim that many sights had disappeared since Hawthorne wrote of them. Others might be altered or vanish in a Rome of 'rapid change' so 'the work thus becomes a valuable record of the past as well as a pleasure to the eye.' Another edition (1885) has pasted on sepia-tinted photogravures on single pages, the Trevi one of postcard size. 173 One commercial activity fed into another by the offerings of souvenir photogravures used as analogues of memory. However, the early photographic medium juxtaposed with the literary text creates dissonance between its material representations and the topographical accounts and storytelling elements of the novel. The view of the Trevi in the 1885 photogravure showing a few figures by the water and an empty cart does not relate to Hawthorne's observations of lively daytime activity in the Piazza or to the ominous night-time events at the Fountain. Also, it does not relate to his professed memory of Italy, 'valuable to him as affording a sort of poetic or fairy precinct.' While the moonlit Trevi functions as a generator of fictions in both the *Faun* and *Corinne*, the inclusion in Hawthorne's novel of visual images unconnected to the written text raises a query about the memory offered to readers.

In the *Faun*, Donatello, Miriam and their friends visit the Fountain, their way lit by waxen tapers. The moonlight has a 'delicate purple or crimson lustre [...] some richer tinge than the cold, white moonshine of other skies.' It gleams on both the beauty and squalor of a nearby palace and Rome is 'quietly full' of the sound of playing fountains:

the narrow street emerged into a piazza, on one side of which, glistening, and dimpling in the moonlight, was the most famous fountain in Rome. Its murmur, - not to say, its uproar - had been in the ears of the company, ever since they came into the open air. <sup>176</sup>

Hawthorne then inserts his interpretation of the Trivia myth. The story of man led by woman to water foreshadows Miriam's invitation to Donatello to join her in the ritual of sipping Trevi water to ensure her return as she leaves the following day. Hawthorne interposes an appraisal of the architecture, 'which the calm moonlight soothed into better taste', before giving a lengthy description of the powerful play of the water in the rockwork and its moss, slime and weeds so that after a century nature had taken over the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Hawthorne (1885). Trevi photogravure precedes p. 173.

Hawthorne often referred to himself in the third person (1990), 'Preface', p. 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>175</sup> Hawthorne (1990), p. 144.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>176</sup> Ibid., p. 145.

Fountain. The topographical descriptions continue with the lively daytime market in the Piazza and its thirst-quenching Fountain providing water for a variety of purposes, the intention of conveying purity undermined by the previous description of invasive nature. The architectural description and bright day-time performativity contrast with the moonlit empty Piazza, highlighting Hawthorne's intentional borrowing from *Corinne*:

It was a delight to behold this untameable water, sporting by itself in the moonshine, [...] 'I have often intended to visit this fountain by moonlight', said Miriam, 'because it was here that the interview took place between Corinne and Lord Nelvil, after their separation.' 177

When she gazes into the water it becomes agitated and the moon flings her shadow to the bottom of the *vascone* with two other shadows: "Three shadows!, exclaimed Miriam. Three separate shadows, all so black and heavy that they sink in the water! There they lie on the bottom, as if all three were drowned together." "There they lie on the bottom' evokes the line, 'There they lie in the fountain' from the song 'Three Coins in the Fountain' (1954). Hawthorne's three figures by the water suggest the triad of performers that is a trope in the film of the same name. 179

One of the shadows is Donatello's but the other is cast by the evil figure haunting Miriam. He encourages her to form an act of ablution but when she takes some water in the hollow of her hand she 'practised an old form of exorcism by flinging it in her persecutor's face.' Myth, purity, moonlight, darkness, guilt and future tragedy merge by the water of Hawthorne's Fountain. Later that night Donatello murders the stranger from Miriam's past and destroys his future with her. As Leighton observes, about representations of mid-nineteenth century Italy by writers, painters, and historians, in similar vein to Luzzi: 'Just as it becomes a nation, a contemporary, industrializing power in the modern world, it also becomes a ghost, a mysterious, enigmatic riddle of the past. For both Staël and Hawthorne the Italian Trevi is narrated as an ambivalent place anticipating uncertain futures for their literary performers: a place for the attraction of opposites, of the beautiful and the dangerous.

<sup>179</sup> Three Coins in the Fountain, dir. by Jean Negulesco (20<sup>th</sup> Century Fox, 1954).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>177</sup> Hawthorne (1990), p. 146.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>178</sup> Ibid., p. 147.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>180</sup> Hawthorne (1990), p. 148.

Leighton, 'Resurrections', in *Unfolding the South*, ed. by Chapman and Stabler, p. 223.

The intertextuality of doomed lovers and Staël's 'existence rêveuse' in Rome also resonates in Ouida's *Ariadnê*, *The Story of a Dream* (1888). The city offers false dreams to Ariadnê whose desertion by her lover leads to her death. The Trevi as an aural narrative device enhances Ouida's city that is continually filled with the sound of fountains. Each possesses a classical deity who awakens at night:

Go where you will there is the water; whether it foams by Trevi where the green moss grows in it like ocean weed about the feet of the ocean god [...] in all its shapes one grows to love the water that fills Rome with an unchanging melody all through the year. [...] In every one of the fountains of Rome a naiad, or a satyr, a god, or a genius, has taken refuge, and in its depths dreams of the ruined temples and the levelled woods, and hides in its cool, green, moss-grown nest all day long and when the night falls, wakes and calls out loud. 184

Ouida borrows from the *Faun* and reconfigures Hawthorne's meaning about the powerful association of water with intended memory. Hawthorne wrote, as quoted for the main thesis epigraph:

Men of every age, have found no better way of immortalizing their memories than by the shifting, indestructible, ever new, yet unchanging, upgush and downfall of water. They have written their names in the unstable element, and proved it a more durable record than brass or marble. 185

Ouida synthesises this as: 'Men here have written their names in water and it has kept them longer than bronze or marble', an intertext illustrating the fallibility of authorial intentions. Hawthorne's sarcastic reference to the futility of attempting to record memory in physical media, with the instability of water as a preferable medium, is lost. Ouida's wording suggests longevity of memory with water as its best carrier. Hare also borrows from the *Faun* about a decade after first publication by quoting the descriptions of a bright and bustling daytime Piazza di Trevi. The narrative format both continues

<sup>185</sup> Hawthorne (1990), p. 147.

Ouida (pen name for Marie Louise Ramé), *Ariadnê, The Story of a Dream* [1877] (London: Chatto & Windus, 1888). In Greek mythology, Ariadnê is a granddaughter of Zeus. She gives the thread to Theseus to escape the labyrinth after killing the Minotaur but he abandons her.

Natalie Schroeder and Shari Hodges Holt provide a plot summary, in *Ouida the Phenomenon: Evolving Social, Political, and Gender Concerns in Her Fiction* (New Jersey: Associated University Presses, 2008), pp. 116-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>184</sup> Ouida, pp. 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> Ouida, p.10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Hare, 1, p. 67.

and heralds the arrival of guidebook 'must see' sights in the selling of Rome. The overt intertext without Hawthorne's contrast of a daytime with a night-time Fountain travels with changed meanings in Hare's text to create new memory without the doom laden overtones of the moonlit Fountain scene in the *Faun*.

The Trevi is a vehicle contributing to contrastive narrative strategies in the two versions of Marguerite Yourcenar's *Denier du rêve* which was first published in 1934 just after the author left Rome, having lived there during the rise of fascism in the early 1920s and at the time of the Matteotti assassination (1924). The novel was partly rewritten and published again in 1959 after another visit. Both novels are structured as a series of stories featuring chaos, disease, suicide, death, murder, sexual perversion, illhealth and alcoholism against a background of fascism, whose ideology stresses the opposite images; wholeness, health, strength, harmony and procreative sex for the body politic. The link between the stories in both novels is the changing ownership of a ten lira coin in Rome by nine people, hence the English title translation, A Coin in Nine Hands (1982), a translation that replaces the ephemerality of dreaming with a matter-offact tone. Each character uses the coin during the course of one day in 1933 to purchase a dream that remains disastrously unfulfilled. If, as Martine Gantrel claims, 'un de ces détenteurs étant d'ailleurs la fontaine de Trevi elle-même' it makes a total of ten owners and reflects the numerical composition of the ten lira coin. 189 The English title, however, denies the possibility of Trevi ownership and removes any alliterative association between denier and dênier, implying the final dream, which is the experience undergone by all the protagonists. 190

In the 1934 edition, Yourcenar represents the Fountain as a threatening, noisy location of stone and crashing water that is symbolic of death for the story about the artist, Clément Roux, a negative force that can overcome his memory and swallow the past. In the 1959 edition, the Fountain and its water are introduced as a monument of Baroque surprise, splendour and beauty that offers potential change, with destabilisation of these aspects in an evolving relationship with the artist that ends negatively. In the Préface to the 1959 *Denier*, Yourcenar claims that the 1934 edition was a form of memory enabling her: 'de revivre cette aventure imaginée par moi dans des

Martine Gantrel, 'Le Rôle de la Fontaine de Trevi dans *Denier du Rêve* de Marguerite Yourcenar, *Francofonia: Studi e Ricerche sulle Letterature di Lingua Francese*, 43, 2002, 27-43. 1934 editions are rare; Gantrel includes material. The 1959 version is used here, *Denier du rêve* (Gallimard: 1971). The Trevi features in Yourcenar's play, *Rendre à César* (1961). Gantrel, p. 29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>190</sup> A Coin in Nine Hands, trans. by Dori Katz (London: The Harvill Press, 1982). Yourcenar collaborated with the translation, presumably approving the title.

circonstances dont je ne me souviens plus.' 191 She claims to keep her 1959 narrative memory free from the influence of remembered events involving fascism, which she lists however, until the Second World War. 192 Arguably, the revisionary processes of memory by 1959 make the performance of the Trevi more ambivalent in her new configuration of initial beauty that turns into the threatening power to kill.

In the penultimate story about the coin, Massimo, a bi-sexual fascist informer, has just witnessed the murder of his girlfriend following her attempt to assassinate Mussolini. He meets the ailing artist, Clément (a naming that ironically references its Latin wording in two of the papal inscriptions claiming ownership of the Trevi) by chance in the moonlit Trajan Forum at midnight. 193 Massimo offers to help and while they walk towards his hotel the two men recount their life stories. 'La lune avait pris l'aspect maléfique qu'elle a aux heures tardives ou l'on n'a pas l'habitude d'être dehors.' The Trevi scene unfolds in this evil light, underscoring Clément's illness:

> Ils se trouvèrent subitement devant une petite place qui n'était guère tout entière que la vasque d'une fontaine énorme. Des dieux de marbre présidaient à cet immense ruissellement; des tourbillons, des ramous, ou au contraire des petites flaques tranquilles se formaient au creux de rochers de pierre sculptée que le temps, l'humidité, l'usure avaient transformés en vrais rochers. Une folie baroque, un décor d'opéra mythologique était devenu peu à peu un grand monument naturel qui maintenait au cœur de la ville la presence de la roche et celle de l'eau plus vieilles et plus jeunes que Rome. 195

The water acts as a trigger of involuntary memory for Massimo: 'Un souvenir presque oublié lui revint, bouleversant de réalité, se superposa a cette place, cette fontaine, ce vieil homme assis sur cette margelle', as he recalls his dangerous childhood journey along a river into exile. 196 Clément articulates fragments of his memories, trying to make his companion feel positive about the future. He starts with his anticipatory memory of the Trevi: 'Cette fontaine, par example, je tenais un peu à la revoir avant mon départ, [...] Des choses si belles qu'on s'étonne qu'elles soient là.'197 He scoops up some water in his hand and watches it slip though his fingers. He takes out the ten lira

<sup>192</sup> Ibid., p. 43.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> Yourcenar, (1959), p. 10.

Gantrel observes his name, like theirs, will be forgotten, pp. 36-37.

Yourcenar, (1959), p. 183. Translations in thesis Appendix Two, pp. 257-59.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> Ibid., pp. 185-86.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Ibid., p. 186.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Ibid., p. 187.

coin given to him by someone who mistook him for a sick beggar: 'Et ceux qui s'en vont, s'ils jettent ici une pièce de monnaie dans l'eau, [...] on dit qu'ils reviennent [...] ne me tente pas d'y revenir. Plutôt voir autre chose, du vrai neuf, avec des yeux frais, des yeux lavés, des yeux purs.'198

Clément throws his coin awkwardly and it lands in the rocks. He immediately experiences angina pains so Massimo goes for a taxi. The Trevi becomes threatening:

> L'eau et la roche si merveilleuses tout à l'heure ne sont plus que des substances insensibles qui ne peuvent pas lui venir en aide. La musique du flot n'est qu'un bruit qui empêcherait qu'on l'entende, s'il avait la force de crier au secours.'199

As Clément leaves in the taxi Massimo disappears from view into the night. The motif of darkness continues in the last story about morbid activities in the nocturnal city, and by the dark Trevi water:

> Le chant des fontaines s'élève plus pur et plus aigu dans la nuit silencieuse; et, sur la place de Trevi, où une onde noire coulait au pied du Neptune de pierre, Oreste Marinuni [...] plongea les deux mains dans l'anfractuosité d'un rocher, racla au hazard, et en retira quelques pièces de monnaie jetées à l'eau par les imbéciles '200

The last dreaming owner of the *denier*, Oreste, is the alcoholic water worker who searches the rocks for coins to buy drink and was mending a leak in the square during Massimo and Clément's visit. The latter's coin offers the purchased dream of illusory happiness as he drinks himself into oblivion: a total loss of memory as his wife gives birth at home to another unwanted child.

Whilst the composition of Yourcenar's characters appears to be a critique of the fascist regime, the power she exercises over them in their creation and subsequent torture, destruction or death has fascist overtones.<sup>201</sup> Her text can be interpreted as depicting excess, distortion and sadism so that it achieves the opposite of her stated intentions to show how fascism adversely influences the individual. The Yourcenar Trevi is made to prophesize that Clément will never return to Rome. The Fountain which he initially finds beautiful renders itself impervious to his needs as he fails to

<sup>200</sup> Ibid., p.198.

Yourcenar, p. 190.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>199</sup> Ibid., p. 191.

See Margaret Elizabeth Colvin, Baroque Fictions: Revisioning the Classical in Marguerite Yourcenar (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2005), pp. 97-98; Yourcenar, Denier (1959), Préface, p. 8.

acknowledge its power over his future with his badly thrown *denier* and will mask any cries for help. Like the female literary attendants of the moonlit Fountain, the bi-sexual Massimo plays an ambiguous role. He leads Clément to the Yourcenar Fountain that threatens him, as the Hawthorne Fountain frightens Miriam when she invites Donatello to the water and the Staël Fountain of reflected images denies Corinne and Oswald lifechanging opportunities: motifs that are remediated by the stories of rejection in the films Three Coins in the Fountain and La dolce vita. 202

The daylight Fountain can also be narrated as threatening. In contrast to moonlit Trevi scenes, Coins in the Fountain (1953) by John Hermes Secondari opens with a hot, brightly sunlit scene on cleaning day. Doubts are expressed by the American protagonist, Frank Bertin, about coin-throwing, thrifty tourists and their pennies left in the slime of the silent Fountain. <sup>203</sup> He believes the Fountain keeps him in Rome against his wishes after throwing his coin fifteen years ago:

> Does everyone who throws a coin into you really want to come back to Rome? Are they really using you as the instrument of a dream? Or are they giving recognition to an illusion that has been widely publicized and which was included in the price of the tour $9^{204}$

The charm of the place is broken for him and the Trevi's trickery revealed: 'Without water it was an altogether different thing. It didn't look like the magic fountain it was supposed to be' [...] 'like a whore on the morning after; a disappointing vessel for my illusions of the night before', proclaims Bertin, in an interplay of sexual fantasy and darkness.<sup>205</sup> It is a place for the daily performance of coin-throwing by his dying friend, Shadwell, who holds onto future hope by wishing for another day and is distressed by the waterless Fountain that denies him the ritual until it resumes playing. Before Bertin eventually leaves Rome he plans to throw into the Trevi the ten dollar gold coin Shadwell gives him before his death. 206 Secondari builds on Staël's notion of the silent Fountain as a withholder of the granting of wishes and dreams in a new performance of coin throwing whereas Yourcenar challenges the presence of Trevi sound as promoting future life.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> Coincidentally, *La dolce vita* was produced in 1959, the year of Yourcenar's second edition of Denier.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>203</sup> John Hermes Secondari, *Coins in the Fountain* (Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1953), pp. 7-25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>204</sup> Ibid., p. 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>205</sup> Ibid., p. 13.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>206</sup> It is unknown whether Secondari knew of Yourcenar's 1934 *Denier* and ten lira coin.

By referencing the Trevi, the French, English and American authors, Staël, Dickens, Hawthorne, Yourcenar, Ouida and Secondari configure and sustain the myths of water and nymphs as narrative devices. The texts considered also indicate an increasing intertextual weave of circulating Trevi narratives that underscore the differential power of gender relations. The exalted representations of the Salone Nymph in sixteenth-century fountain epigrams and poetry is premediated in the classical narration of virginal water. The myth of the maiden who discovers the water is shaped for the physical Fountain. The literary narratives of the authors selected begin to interweave descriptors of moonlight and darkness, with new myths of romance and tragedy and the presence and absence of sound. These literary practices increase the potency of the Trevi as metaphor: a place of illusion and subjective feelings. The ingredient of moonlight adds a potent slippery signifier and increases the attraction of the Trevi for the impending language of sexualized commodification.

In concluding this chapter on the intersections, divergences, and textual borrowings in art and literature that have circulated Trevi imagery across millennia, questions continue to arise concerning the ideologies that surround its shaping and consumption. Memory is probably always contingent on mediation and remediation, in which the relations between existing and emergent technologies play a part in generating new memories. In the discursive frameworks of art and literature, the Trevi exemplifies changing social orders as they unfold their power in correlation with the development of transcultural media. Notions of memory as intended, retrospective, anticipatory and future provide the focal points for interpreting the transnational Fountain as a metaphorical host for the narratives of art and literature. It was acknowledged at the outset that the implied boundaries are challenging because of their ever-changing foci – but are productive in their overlapping.

Intended memory is visually sculpted into the narratives of inscribed power expressing how the Trevi builders wanted to be remembered. The meanings change over time and signify new ideological intentions as the inscriptions become decorative aides in the service of consumerism. The labelling in retrospective memory of the Trevi as Baroque originated within art historiographical narrative and there is a shifting of the ambiguous term within time frames as it linguistically slides into other narratives without losing its contradictory beginnings. The 'Baroqueness' of the Trevi is now employed in the capitalist selling of Rome for tourism, advertising and guidebooks,

whereas it previously assisted in selling the city 'unbaroqued' for a papacy endorsing its political legitimacy through grand building programmes.

Whilst the 1762 Fountain was already narrated as a monument of surprise and spectacle, the labelling as Baroque about two centuries later added to its signification of illusion. The Baroque descriptor, with its emphasis on subjective feeling, further enhanced the preparatory usefulness of the monument as a political tool for future commercial exploiters of its imagery. The Fountain never ceases to be appropriated as a host for ideologies.

The memory associated with the Grand Tour often produces negative narratives of misremembrance, like Forsyth's, resulting from visual representations, but these could also generate positive narratives, such as Goethe's. Also, the *vedute* depictions of the inscribing and incorporating practices of human subjects around the Fountain added to the image of the Trevi as a place of theatrical performance in cultural memory, whether visited on the Grand Tour or viewed in pictures elsewhere. The meanings accorded to the representations were produced in the act of consumption, a two-way process influenced by artistic skills.

In literature, the moonlit Romantic Trevi becomes a narrative device that frequently furthers the intentions of subsequent authors. The intertextuality of the nocturnal prevails as it becomes a future circulating framing device for illusory practices in emergent media. The Fountain moves differently in memory by day and by night, the potency of illuminated darkness enhancing it as a conduit for deceptive practices. The discursive frameworks of literary narrative during the Grand Tour variously shape Italy as an imaginary country of fantasy and tragedy as Europe's internal Other – and later. The Fountain images in art and literature contribute to its function as a generator for fictions, anticipating its location in memory as a place of bodily activity, ritual and aspiration: essential components for its future mediated performativity that will be associated with glamour and sexualized commodification.

The diverse memories surrounding the Fountain evolve within the media of art and literature and continue this dynamic and active process as they travel intermedially. The following chapter explores the Trevi as a vehicle for the narratives of power and performance in film, music, advertising and on the Internet, and also considers the implications of the convergence of old and new media for the production of memory.

## CHAPTER FIVE

# A Vehicle for Narratives: Cinema, Music, Advertising, Internet

[...] different mnemonic practices do not exist side by side in parallel universes. They react to, build on, and bounce off one another as narratives are circulated across different media, across different institutions, and engage the loyalty of different social groups.

Ann Rigney<sup>1</sup>

#### Introduction

The central themes of Chapter Three are the appropriation of a grand illusion-producing Trevi in the service of a dominant ideology and the shared social frameworks of memory surrounding the monument's creators. The Trevi patrons failed to control the future memory of their endeavours through design aesthetics and inscriptions and the Fountain continued as an alluring and manipulable vehicle for new patrons also seeking to promulgate self-serving myths in changing political and social orders. Chapter Four, on the Trevi as a narrative device in the media of art and literature, notes how new meanings are added to the stories of illusion and gender politics already surrounding the Fountain. Emergent technologies in the context of evermore capitalist markets generates increasingly diverse configurations of Fountain imagery that flow across multiple media platforms. The associated intermedial narratives combine in a blend of partial remembering and partial forgetting constitutive of new identities, those of the tourist and consumer.

Attention to the evolution of Trevi imagery in cultural memory now turns to cinema, music, advertising, and the Internet. These designations can suggest discrete activities but this chapter placers emphasis on the interwoven tissues of differing forms of memory in circulation that are productively invented by borrowings flowing across media. New media enable the same content to flow through the channels of television, cinema, advertising, merchandising, social electronic devices and the Internet: not a single market platform but a composition reflecting new patterns of cross-media

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Ann Rigney, 'All This Happened, More or Less: What a Novelist Made of the Bombing of Dresden', *History and Theory*, 47 (May 2009), pp. 5-24 (p. 6).

ownership.<sup>2</sup> Jenkins maintains that: 'If the [earlier] digital revolution paradigm presumed that new media would displace old media, the emerging convergence paradigm assumes that old and new media will interact in ever more complex ways.'<sup>3</sup>

This chapter concerns the rapid diffusion of Fountain imagery, concomitant with new technologies and increasing commodification. It is attractive as a host for the hegemonic ideology of late capitalism as its images seemingly unmoor from their origins, multiply and fragment, simultaneously carrying forward memory traces and adding to narratives of ephemerality. The Trevi becomes celluloid and then a digital place and space for the performance of selling glamour from the mid twentieth century onwards.

The images of water nymphs in film, advertising and on Internet sites resonate with echoes of the gender politics promoted by the statuary design and literature. The Fountain as a narrative device for Staël (1807), Dickens (1846), Hawthorne (1860), Ouida (1888), Yourcenar (1934; 1959), and Secondari (1953) continues intertextually across multiple media. The potency of performances by night or with silent water is remediated in film scenes and allows for an increase in the heightened sense of the unreal and suspension of disbelief by the presentation of movement, sound and dialogue on the screen. They are repeats of earlier performances and dress rehearsals that increasingly engage the senses, attractive for future consumerism and connoting performativity that centres on the aspirations of individuals.

Contrasting with the Trevi imagery envisioned and shaped by art and literature, that of film reaches wider, more diverse audiences. *Three Coins in the Fountain* and *La dolce vita* can make it difficult to think of the Trevi without recalling related scenes. The narratives of film, music and Internet intersect and converge with stories told in other media; sometimes there is imperfect remembering, sometimes partial forgetting. The constellations of narratives continue, using Rigney's words in this chapter's epigraph, to 'build on, and bounce off one another' in changing contexts, and circulate rapidly. The images slide into and beneath one another, a constant conceptual reminder that the Fountain may be taken as an increasingly slippery signifier and that memory as a sign is one of fluidity and ever-changing foci.

<sup>3</sup> Henry Jenkins, *Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide* (Updated and with new Afterword), (New York: New York University Press, 2008), p.6.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Exemplified by the Berlusconi and the Murdoch media empires.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Jenkins discusses dispersal of fictions across multiple delivery channels on <a href="http://henryjenkins.org/2007/03/transmedia\_storytelling\_101.html">http://henryjenkins.org/2007/03/transmedia\_storytelling\_101.html</a> [accessed 15 January 2015]

## 5.1 The Filmic Fountain

## 5.1.1 Cinema and Memory

As Radstone comments, the focus of research on cinema/film and memory since the 1990s has been on catastrophe, trauma, violence and victimhood, leaving unexplored much of cinema's relation to the range of memory's interpersonal and public dimensions. The lack of exploration might be reduced in small part by considering filmic images of the Trevi as they travel within and across media and transculturally. Issues previously raised in the thesis about the politics of memory and manipulations of Trevi images continue to be explored in this chapter, including the transmission of sexual stereotyping. The search by hegemonic cultures for self-perpetuation through interlinking webs of mediated persuasion often seems a neglected aspect when considering film. The Trevi itself has hitherto been overlooked as a performative vehicle for the retention and promotion of ideological power.

The thesis is not concerned with film theory but with film as a medium that produces imagery of the Fountain, a medium whose public discourses, like those of art and literature, interweave with personal memory but travel more widely. Notions of cinema memory may include the likening of memory to the medium, or cinema as analogous with types of memory, or cinema/memory as porous and interpenetrating.<sup>7</sup> The final, more dynamic, approach seems the most appropriate for exploring the relationship between Fountain and filmic memory.

During a film's production the director may assume viewers share the same memory frameworks; sometimes new ones are driven by political considerations as seen in *Three Coins in the Fountain*. Fellini's *La dolce vita* was intended, in part and not with any moral objective, as a critique of the decadent Roman elites in the late 1950s but these intentions were overturned by interpretations of the film as advertising glamorous products and ways of living. Shared cultural frameworks evolve. The film offers an imagined Rome of fifty years ago in which the Trevi is a narrative device portraying the ambiguities of glamour and (dis)illusion.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Radstone, 'Cinema and Memory', in *Memory*, ed. by Radstone and Schwarz, pp. 333-34; p. 338.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> See Victor Burgin on control of the film industry, *The Remembered Film* (London: Reaktion Books, 2004), pp. 109-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See Radstone, 'Cinema', in *Memory*, pp. 326-38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Three Coins in the Fountain, dir. by Jean Negulesco (20<sup>th</sup> Century Fox, 1954).

The remembrance of La dolce vita has been shaped by art film screenings, CD and DVD releases, posters, Internet websites and advertising as well as media studies and academic research. The film's arguably most-remembered scene, at the Fountain, becomes increasingly – but never completely – detached from its original context. Its motifs of flowing and of silenced water, signifying the notions of glamour and decadence, are attractively ambiguous concepts for manipulation by commercial enterprises, either by re-scripting the scene or utilizing fragments and single images. Sometimes the scene is incorporated into another film. A section on the trope occurs later in the chapter.

A film can spark an instant yet pre-planned *Nachleben*, to widen Warburg's meaning of continuity in the transmission of symbolic transformation, in promotions, advance publicity, CDs, DVDs and Internet usage. Benjamin maintained there was erosion by modernity of the inner world of memory whilst expressing some optimism about its replacement by the informative functions of photography and film. 10 Whilst he argues cinema may possess a potential for the advancement of political awareness, the implication is that it would still serve hegemonic ideological forces. Commercial films are consumed and produced in different ways, perhaps viewed on DVDs or online, in part or in whole, and personal non-commercial videos are downloaded and uploaded. The contexts of viewing include cinema, theatre, film club, home, library, village hall, public and private transport, and on electronic devices for personal use.

### 5.1.2 In Search of the Screen Trevi

Tax concessions for foreign film-producers made Rome's Cinecittà studios attractive in the immediate postwar years and the number of Italian productions remained minimal whilst the American output made in Italy increased. 11 Roman Holiday and Three Coins belong to the Hollywood on the Tiber period starting with Quo Vadis in 1949 and continuing into the 1950s. By 1960, in the context of the first miracolo economico, thousands of Italian films were given export licences, including La dolce vita. A sensation at home and successful abroad, the film helped to open up the foreign market to Italian productions. The medium of film sought to shape perceptions of a mid-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Research on *La dolce vita* is considerable. Many contributors, eg Bondanella, Chandler, Costantini, Dyer, Gorbman, and Gundle, are referenced later in this chapter.

Benjamin, 'The Work of Art', ed. by Arendt (1999), pp. 224-25.

For postwar background see: Peter Bondanella, Italian Cinema: From Neorealism to the Present (New York: Ungar, 1983); Christopher Wagstaff, 'Italy in the Postwar International Cinema Market' in Italy in the Cold War: Politics, Culture and Society, ed. by Christopher Duggan and Wagstaff (Oxford: Berg, 1995).

twentieth century Rome with selected pasts, an objective earlier art and literary texts had attempted. With cinema attendance in Western countries peaking in the mid 1950s, the dominant mass medium reached wide and socially diverse audiences. In Italy this diversity occurred across urban and rural areas of the North, South and Central regions and between generations of film-goers. <sup>12</sup> Counterbalancing the diffusion of images, the Catholic Church, through its postwar network of parish cinemas, censored film content according to methods inherited from fascism. <sup>13</sup> Film-goers across the Italian peninsula experienced pasts shaped for them by the Vatican and foreign film-makers and also Roman pasts by non-Romans like Fellini, suggestive of the legacy of eighteenth-century *forestieri*, outsiders like Vanvitelli, to the aesthetics of Trevi design.

Screen images of the Trevi from the major American studios in the 1950s belong to a new remembering of pre-war glamour in a context of aspirational consumerism and an attempted forgetting of fascist Italy. Film images of postwar Italy with an American inflection arguably encouraged future similar reception of prevailing consumer ideology. The Fountain does not inform postwar *neo-realist* films that reference the recent fascist regime, for example, Roberto Rossellini's *Roma città aperta* (1945): an indication that an edifice associated with illusion is unsuited to a film genre of realism interpreting a recent past of brutality.

The choice of the Trevi location belongs to a cinematic custom of using Rome's *centro storico* as a set whose constituent parts assist storytelling, as employed in art and literary narratives. Other well-known locations include amongst many: the Coliseum in *Un americano a Roma* (1947); Piazza del popolo in *Ladri di biciclette* (1948); Pantheon and Piazza della Rotonda in *Umberto D* (1952); Spanish steps in *Roman Holiday* (1953); the Vittorio Emanuele II monument in *The Belly of an Architect* (1987), and the Piazza Navona in *The Talented Mr Ripley* (1999). Their filmic images offer a new form of anticipatory memory of Rome similar to the futures promised by *vedute* prints.

Trevi appearances, some fleeting as in Woody Allen's *To Rome with Love* (2012), belong to a broad spectrum of intermingled film genres including glamour, comedy, horror, romance and pornography. The Internet Movie Database listed the most visited films on their site with a Trevi location as: *Roman Holiday* (1953), *Three Coins in the Fountain* (1954), *Accade al penitenziario* (1955), *La dolce vita* (1960), *Totòtruffa* (1961), *Gidget Goes to Rome* (1963), *The World's Gold* (1967), *Brutti di notte* (1968),

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Pierre Sorlin, *Italian National Cinema*, 1896-1996 (London: Routledge, 1996), p. 75.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> A well-known interpretation is *Cinema paradiso*, dir. by Giuseppe Tornatore (Cristaldifilm, 1988).

C'eravamo tanto amati (1974), Xiangang xiao liao fu (1974), Fotogrammi mortali (1996), The Lizzie McGuire Movie (2003) and Second Life (2009). 14

Not on the list were *Fontana di Trevi* (1960), *Divorzio all'italiana* (1961), *Intervista* (1987), *Sabrina Goes to Rome* (1998), *Coins in the Fountain* (1990) and *Elsa y Fred* (2005). Tribute films to *La dolce vita* using different fountains are made in two chick flicks, *Under the Tuscan Sun* (2003), *When in Rome* (2010) and in *Michael Lucas' La Dolce Vita* (2006). The *Europeana* data base (2013) has more than two hundred videos featuring the Trevi, mostly taken from the Cinecittà Luce archive, whose duration range from a few minutes to half an hour, and also hundreds of photographs. Pinto, art historian and author of *The Trevi Fountain* (1986), coproduced *Trevi* in 1988. The appearances fall into approximate and overlapping groupings which are broadly those of fascism, glamour and political commentary. Selections are taken from these films when their content informs an understanding of attempts to shape public and personal perceptions of particular pasts and calls attention to remediation in cultural memory.

#### 5.1.3 Fascism's Fountain

The Trevi is amongst the monuments perceived as important for fascist ambitions, as Chapter One details: the centrepiece of a new traffic hub in the political service of *romanità*. <sup>16</sup> Four films produced by Cinecittà, when the studios formed the Istituto Nazionale Luce, indicate this significance for the regime. <sup>17</sup> Three of them construct a Rome suffused with key aesthetics of fascist ideology: physical power, noise and violent movement. In the first film the city is rhapsodic, in the second, full of the largest, richest, most varied and beautiful fountains in the world, and in the third it is superlatively Baroque. <sup>18</sup> The implication is that fascism is likewise a performance of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> <a href="http://www.imdb.com/search/title?locations=Fontana">http://www.imdb.com/search/title?locations=Fontana</a> [accessed 11 August 2011]. Updated list unavailable. Directors referenced later when films mentioned.

<sup>15 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.archivioluce.com/> [2013]. 
16 Thesis, pp. 42-43.

Founded 1925, rebuilt 1936 with state subsidy, Cinecittà studios headed fascist renewal of the Italian film industry. Cinecittà Luce has large paper and digital archives of cinematographic and photographic material, distributes films and holds exhibitions eg CINECITTÀSIMOSTRA' (2011), visited by the thesis writer.

Roman Rhapsody; Rapsodia a Roma (1936); Le fontane di Roma: Sono le più numerose, le più ricche, le più varie, le più belle nel mondo (1924-1931) and L'Architettura barocca a Roma (1942). <a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.europeana.eu</a> [accessed 31 January 2012]

extremes and illusion and the Trevi appropriation undermines the intended propaganda: a reminder the regime did not possess a unified ideology and censorship was inconsistent in detecting films that contradicted the cause.<sup>19</sup>

The fourth film, La Fontana di Trevi (1941) is a twenty-minute documentary of a day in its 'life'. Directed by Fernando Cerchio, a prolific film-maker for the Istituto Nazionale Luce and Cinecittà, it was possibly screened in cinemas before the main film. 20 The film opens with shots of thundering waterfalls accompanied by loud orchestral music from Enzo Masetti, an influential film composer with a classical background and an international postwar career. <sup>21</sup> Plants in rocks echo those sculpted on the Trevi before location filming switches to the monument. Shouting boys scamper over the rockwork. Oceanus's size is exaggerated by the camera angle and the small boy beside his lower leg. The camera pans down from the attic into the basin. The keeper goes through the castellum door to turn off the Fountain. He professes his love for 'la fontana', calling himself her 'padrone' and drinks some of her water. The following scenes show water slowing down, dripping statuary, people leaving the Piazza as night falls, the silent Fountain, roof tops as dawn breaks and cats on dry sunny rocks. Oceanus is mirrored in still water which starts to move and sound. The images of movement and noise are underscored in the film by oppositional ones of stillness and of power waiting to resume its performance after gaining potency at night-time. The silent Trevi depicts strength and continual readiness in keeping with the tenets of fascism. Alternatively, the nightly silences might imply that fascism is almost 'played out' and its power functions intermittently.

In1946, a film from the *La Settimana Incom* output by Cinecittà of short weekly productions for cinema release also contests the attempted fascist appropriation of the Trevi to convey the regime's tenets of power and action. The Rome-centric information film produced in the political context of Allied occupation portrays the city's daily problems with work, food, transport, queues and black market as a fascist legacy. Cinecittà studio campus is a refugee camp and the Trevi is waterless. By establishing that 'le fontane di Roma si tacciono ancora', the commentary expands the political narrative of deprivation and challenges images of excess in memory of recent

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Sorlin, p. 78.

See Cerchio's output <a href="http://www.imdb.com/name/nm0148486/">http://www.imdb.com/name/nm0148486/</a> [accessed 29 October 2013]

<sup>2013] &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.allmusic.com/artist.enzo-masetti-nm0001965986">http://www.allmusic.com/artist.enzo-masetti-nm0001965986</a> [accessed 29 October 2013]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Dopo le amministrative: problemi del giorno (1946) <a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.europeana.eu</a> [accessed 2 March 2014]

decades. Within three years a filmic Rome would emerge that borrowed and built on pre-war representations of glamour. The Trevi would be utilized in the endeavour of forgetting fascism and the fostering of capitalism, an endeavour explored next through glamour and the number three.

## 5.1.4 The Glamorous American Trevi: A Forgetting?

The concept of glamour has travelled transculturally and across media since its first literary usage.<sup>23</sup> Glamour was appropriated commercially for nearly a century, crossing the Atlantic and returning to Europe via the American film studio system of the 1930s, where the word 'glamour' had absorbed the meaning of something falsely enchanting. It returned without dissociating from sexual nuances acquired during its linguistic travels. Its dictionary definitions also evolve. 24 One describes glamour as: 'a strangely alluring atmosphere of romantic enchantment; bewitching, intangible, irresistibly magnetic charm [...] combined with unusual physical and sexual attractiveness.<sup>25</sup> There is no equivalent word in Italian, which uses il glamour as a masculine loanword. It cannot be said that American glamour dominates over the Italian form but that there is a two-way relationship. 'Made in Italy' was a product labelling requirement for receipt of Marshall aid, the memory overlaid by the new global descriptor of a product reliant upon glamour for marketing fashion, design and style: images of Italy abroad that return as icons to inform home-grown identity.<sup>26</sup>

According to Stephen Gundle, glamour can only exist in a society based on the American consumerism model requiring a mass audience. Its enticing image closely relates to consumption, requiring both distance and accessibility. 27 Subjects may be people, objects, places, events or environments which capture the imagination by relating to qualities of beauty, sexuality, theatricality, wealth, dynamism, notoriety, movement and leisure.<sup>28</sup> The more of the qualities present, the more glamorous the outcome which encourages consumerism based on the allure of the unattainable.

By association with the American word, the Trevi is arguably inflected with

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>23</sup> In Walter Scott's *Lay of the Last Minstrel* (1805), Canto III, the elf opens the magic book: 'And one short spell therein he read./ It had much of glamour might' so that: 'All was delusion, nought was truth.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> The New Fowler's Modern English Usage (1996); The Oxford Concise English Dictionary (1964).
<sup>25</sup> Webster's Third New International Dictionary (1961).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Giannino Malossi, 'Volare', in Volare: The Icon of Italy in Global Culture, ed. by Malossi (New York: Monacelli Press, 1999), p. 29. The frontispiece comprises a two page close up of the Ekberg/Mastroianni 'almost kiss' in *La dolce vita*, Fountain water in background.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Stephen Gundle, *Glamour: A History* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2008), p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Gundle, *Glamour*, pp. 6-7.

consumerism. It becomes a theatrical location for performances of filmic and photographic glamour from the 1950s onwards, and its relations with the qualities defined by Gundle qualify it as glamorous. It is a money-making place for dreams, for sexualized performativity and movement, simultaneously accessible yet distant. One can see but not touch: the Fountain is unattainable. The rockwork by the *fontanina* draws in the spectator before denying further access and the thrown coin is an illusory proxy for a nearness that emphasizes distance. Moreover, its ephemeral appearances on a film screen make it irrevocably distant, untouchable and inaccessible. According to Gundle, the scenes from *La dolce vita* captured by Fellini's cinematographer, Otello Martelli, render the Trevi 'visually fabulous' by the 'baroque white exuberance of the fountain' and the 'contrasts of black and white' so that: 'The glamour was entirely an illusion of cinema.'<sup>29</sup> In memory terms, the monument cannot be the active agent of glamour but the vehicle for its expression.

The aims of the film output of the imported American studio system during the hardships of the early postwar era can be seen as seeking to replace residual memories of fascism by anticipation of a glamorous consumerist future. The connection with glamour builds in *Roman Holiday* (1953) and *Three Coins in the Fountain* (1954). Famous stars feature in the Trevi scenes and the new water nymphs at the Fountain become filmic devices that debatably further the anti-communist narratives of Western postwar ideology. The films suggest a purposeful attempt to refurbish the transcultural memory of postwar Italy in the formation of its capitalist identity under American imperialism. However, as Connerton points out, official attempts at erasure of memory by constituting new identity formation do not produce a unitary phenomenon of loss: memory traces that remain can be resistant to change and their erasure requires effort. The city authorities repeatedly remove but fail to stop the attachment of *lucchetti d'amore* on railings, including those in the Piazza di Trevi, on grounds of safety, seeking to maintain Rome as a major tourist attraction but failing to support its identity as a city of 'amore'.

In 1953, *Roman Holiday* was the first film of the established Hollywood romance genre to be shot entirely in Rome. The Trevi can be interpreted as signifying a

<sup>29</sup> Gundle, *Death and the Dolce Vita: The Dark Side of Rome in the 1950s* (Edinburgh: Cannongate, 2011), p. 299.

Connerton, 'Types', pp. 60-61. An example is the acronym of L.U.C.E. for L'Unione Cinematografica Educativa, the memory traces of its fascist origin seen in its present title, Cinecittà Luce, and continuing use of an eagle's head logo on its website homepage <a href="http://www.archivioluce.com/">http://www.archivioluce.com/</a> [accessed 27 August 1213]. The image is popular with many political systems.

life-changing attempt – that ultimately fails – by a princess (Audrey Hepburn) who escapes from her hotel/castle whilst on a state visit. Found asleep in the street by a society photojournalist (Gregory Peck), he recognises her and takes her to his flat overnight. Next day, when the long-haired Hepburn arrives at the Trevi she goes into the hairdresser's. Peck is shadowing her in the hope of a story. The water roars in the background of sunlight and deep shadows with children scrambling over the rocks; Hepburn appears with a cropped hairstyle. The romance of two mutually deceiving lovers then develops around the sights of Rome, famously on a Vespa, before Hepburn dutifully returns to her former life in this Hollywood configuration of the sleeping princess fairy-tale. Woken by an unsuitable prince she returns to her 'castle' without him, a romance film without a happy ending but an endorsement of prevailing notions promulgated by the Western film industry of the dominant male and admiring female responding to his masculinity.<sup>31</sup> In that film genres do not occur as unmodified categories, the Fountain is a device to assist covertly in undermining some expectations while supporting others. It strengthens what appears to be a key point of the overall narrative in Roman Holiday: individuals hope for personal change but should be subservient to duty in the context of Cold War politics. The added ingredient to the narrative mix is glamour which in turn builds on the sexual politics of memory surrounding the Trevi iconography and its myths.

As a motif of ambiguous outcomes with a glamorous dimension, the Trevi is used for Jean Negulesco's *Three Coins in the Fountain* (1954), very loosely based on Secondari's novel *Coins in the Fountain* (1953). It is another Hollywood film romance with the apparently happy ending of re-united lovers but permeated with uncertainty. The opening shots of a sequence of fountains establish Rome as a contemporary *regina aquarum* with an early scene at the Trevi and also the closing scene. The images of powerful flowing water are underscored by reverberating orchestral music and 'Three Coins in the Fountain' loudly sung by Frank Sinatra. Figure [50]. The number three associated with the film and song is a well-known mnemonic link with the Trevi and furthers its monetary connotations.

Symbolic representations of three occur with differing interpretations in the discourses of many cultural systems. Briefly considering the Western context, Celtic mythology has three-headed monuments and the goddess Brighid; pagan Greek religion

The dominant male features – particularly in Hollywood westerns, war movies, epics, romance and comedies – until 1970s roles express doubt about dominance, MacKinnon, p. 37. Figure 50, Illustrations Booklet, has the lyrics.

offers many examples, the Fates, Graces, Gorgons and Furies, with multiples of three in the nine Muses and twelve Olympian gods; the Trinity is central to Christianity; Shakespeare's three witches in *Macbeth* select from the three elements of 'Thunder, lightning, or in rain' for their three meetings and 'thrice' is a number used in spells.<sup>33</sup> Multiples of three fired Dante with his early love for Beatrice.<sup>34</sup> Aged nine when they first meet, the heavens move east the twelfth part of a degree, they meet nine years later, Beatrice in a group of three, on the ninth hour of the day and Dante's dream of Beatrice is during the first of the nine hours of the night. The scientific diagrammatic representation of water as H<sub>2</sub>O has three molecules, two of hydrogen and one of oxygen: a scientific *ménage à trois*. Arithmetically, three is a powerful prime number in that it is only divisible by itself in an infinite sequence of prime numbers. Also, the conceptual threesome of past, present and future memory has entered the narratives of memory studies.

When looking at the Fountain iconography its triadic groupings dominate:

Oceanus and the Tritons (their name suggesting three); Oceanus and the statues of
Health and Fertility and the three-banded papal escutcheon. Architecturally, there are
three pilasters with three windows on each storey beside the central arch, three panels
for Benedict XIV's inscription, and three tableaux, two blank, with Clement XIII's
inscription in the middle. Three ones feature in Clement XIII's name on his inscription.
Salvi's single cascade was modified into three tiers, echoing the three outlets of earlier
designs. The triadic performance of thrower, coin, and wishing takes place in front of
the Fountain whose name itself of Trevi connotes three and its likely origin in *tre vie*.
The new ritual of throwing three coins for a divorce undermines the message of
marriage promoted by the three couples in *Three Coins*. 35

The film interweaves aspects of ritual performance and bodily automatisms of multiple triads: the title, song, actors in three pairs, coins and streets leading to the Trevi. Threes disrupt binary oppositions and offer possibilities of changing interpretations, the filmic three coins connection to a prime number adding to notions of a Fountain producing multiple, ever-changing meanings. Threes invite the Derridian concept of *différance* when a shift from one pattern to another calls attention to the new pattern whilst partially suppressing awareness of the other, still always already present,

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Macbeth, Act 1, Scene 1, 3, Act 1V, Scene 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Dante, *La vita nuova*, Canto II, III.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>35</sup> Ritual mentioned by Sturgis, p. 247, also Gilberto Vallauri, former official Trevi guide (2009).

by pushing it sporadically into the background.<sup>36</sup> The implications of triadic formations in *Three Coins* are that solutions may or may not be possible for the dilemmas the film presents, illicit love, infidelity and illness.

The Fountain is a key motif in the film and referenced frequently in dialogue, using the 'Three Coins' score as a musical motif. In an early establishing scene, Frances takes her equally glamorous flat-mates, Anita and Maria, to the Fountain. Maria throws her coin and tells the female *fontana*: 'Keep me in Rome at least a year, Mr Fountain.' Frances's annual wish after fifteen years in Rome is: 'Bring me another year of contentment, a penny's worth of hope.' Anita is leaving to get married so does not wish. The patriarchal wording of the script endorses a 1950 stereotype of the ideal work for women as secretaries to men while searching for a husband. References follow later about the Trevi's dubious wish-fulfilment ability as relationships with lovers founder. When Frances hears her employer, Shadwell, is ill and therefore rejecting her, she refers to 'the lovely fountain of Trevi – where hope can be had for a penny.' Shadwell later repents and becomes a granter of wishes, dispensing them at the Fountain in the concluding scene.

The coins are being cleared out of the silent Fountain as the three women meet. 'Clean out the old dreams, make way for new ones', says Maria. [...] 'That fountain is a fraud. I tossed my coin in and wished I could stay for a year in Rome, and I am leaving after a month.' The water and 'Three Coins' start playing as the three men come separately down the three roads to the Piazza to be re-united with their women. Each seemingly 'gets her man' although expectations of the romance genre are again challenged by ambiguous futures offered at the Trevi. Shadwell is ill, the Prince is a mother-dominated womaniser and Giorgio only has the promise of future work.<sup>37</sup>

The ambiguity is replicated in the song whose romantic narrative is conditional and self-centred. Figure [50]. Only one wish can be granted – 'Which one [coin] will the fountain bless?' – 'Make it mine!' – repeated three times, implying two unhappy outcomes. The literary intertext of Hawthorne's fateful Fountain shadows is reconfigured. 'There they lie in the fountain' in 'Three Coins' reshapes his representation of a triad of shadows in the water, 'There they lie on the bottom'. The filmic coins of the title do not link to Hawthorne's premonitions of death, but to

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Derrida, 'Différance', in *Margins of Philosophy*, trans. by Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982), pp. 3-27.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>37</sup> Giorgio threw the third coin.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Hawthorne (1990), p. 147.

symbolic coins promising the purchase of happiness for the glamorous Trevi water nymphs of film. The three women lead future consumers to the water which, by filmic strengthening of the monetary and glamour associations, becomes attractive for the marketing of aspirations.

A reading of the film's conclusion as a happy ending undermined by the ambiguity of the Fountain's role reflects that of *Roman Holiday*. The literary intertextuality from the narratives of Staël, Hawthorne, Yourcenar and Secondari of ambiguous encounters for their protagonists visiting the Fountain permeates both filmic texts, as do contradictory art images of the public and the personal in Piranesi's vedute. Yet both films in cinema memory are carried forward by the narratives of film historians as suiting the mood of postwar escapism with the 'feel good' factor of glamorous female American stars, romantic latin lovers, American songs, and sights of Rome. Such films appear to underpin postwar American capitalist ideology by offering images of Italy as a worthwhile country. An Italy that could be appropriated by filmmakers as fought for by Americans, economically supported by the Marshall Plan and a capitalist bulwark against communism is conveyed in the two internationally circulated films. In these respects, the Trevi becomes not only metonymic for a suitable Italy rescued by America but also contributes to the prelude of mass tourism and subsequent remakes of the film are driven by expanding marketization.

Jean Negulesco, who directed *Three Coins*, remade it as *The Pleasure Seekers* (1964), using Madrid for the location scenes.<sup>39</sup> The American television film *Coins in* the Fountain (1990), in which three women seek romance in Rome, is only loosely connected to Secondari's book. 40 When throwing coins into a Piazza Navona fountain to a 'Three Coins' soundtrack one woman comments, 'It doesn't look the same as in the movie'. The Trevi is present in its absence as the remembered film host for the performative coin ritual in the 1954 film. Halbwachs's observations are again pertinent about groups who transform the spaces in which they find themselves into their own images by enclosing themselves in frameworks they construct about the exterior environment. 41 These images then pass into the realm of the idea they have of themselves. The film-makers of *Roman Holiday* and *Three Coins* reshaped the space in which they found themselves into their own image suffused with American inflections.

Further information presently unavailable (2015).
 See <a href="http://www.imdb.com">http://www.imdb.com</a> [accessed 28 October 2014]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Halbwachs (1950), p. 132.

The Trevi designers and papal patrons had also produced a self-referential space by choosing to configure imperial pasts to support their political endeavours in Europe.

Taking Halbwachs's concept further, the social frameworks of memory shared by groups change. The implications for the politics of film memory involve the dynamics of consumption, the contextual timing and emergence of certain narratives, and not only the production but the reception of films and shaping of their imagery in individual memory. The political impact of *Roman Holiday* and *Three Coins* was strengthened by filming on location in the target country. Yet the two films also build on and reconfigure memories of Grand Tour Italy as a country in the service of tourism. A cinema controlled by a dominant ideology was seeking to re-programme the flow of Western memory by promulgating a transcultural forgetting of fascism and the laying down of new memory for which the Trevi proved an attractive conduit; its ambiguity again unintentionally generated. In the instance of *Roman Holiday* and *Three Coins*, the Hollywood studio system transmitted its own postwar myths of glamour. Fellini's *La dolce vita* (1960) sought to challenge these earlier filmic myths but was undermined by its reception in the popular imaginary as promoting consumerism linked to glamour, a potent signifier of sexualization in the interests of profit.

## 5.1.5 Not So Sweet Life: The Fountain Scene in La dolce vita

The Trevi appears as a background for scenes in several Italian films contemporaneous with *La dolce vita*. Claudio Villa sings 'Il mio amore a Fontana di Trevi' in *Fontana di Trevi* (1960), a comedy accompanied by *musicarelli*.<sup>43</sup> Totò sells the Fountain to a gullible American tourist and disappears with his money in *Totòtruffa* (1961), a film pervaded with anti-Americanism.<sup>44</sup> It ironically presages a short documentary on the Trevi's bad state of repair: *Chi la compra – Ford o Onassis? La possibilità che la Fontana di Trevi sia venduta* (1963).<sup>45</sup> Fellini's Fountain differs from these filmic images as a key narrative device, productive intertext, and important future marker in memory of sexual commodification. He repeatedly claimed *La dolce vita* should be remembered as a satirical comment on the postwar decadence of modern Roman elites and not as a hedonistic 'sweet life', which became the commercially exploited

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Foucault considers the control by cinema of memory, in 'Film and Popular Memory', *Foucault Live, Collected Interviews, 1961-1984*, ed. Sylvère Lotringer (New York: Semiotext(e)), 1996, pp. 122-32 (pp.123-24).

Fontana di Trevi, dir. by Carlo Campogalliano (Rosa Films, 1960).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> *Totòtruffa*, dir. by Camillo Mastrocinque (Astoria Cinematografica, 1961).

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.trovacinema.repubblica.it">http://www.trovacinema.repubblica.it</a> [accessed 22 July 2011].

<sup>45 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.europeana.eu</a>> [accessed 31 January 2014].

meaning.<sup>46</sup> Although the title as a phrase pre-dates the film, *La dolce vita* contributes to an 'Italian dream of everyday life [that] has taken root outside of Italy with astonishing vigor. It is a dream that has transcended itself, becoming a long-term stereotype'.<sup>47</sup>

The filming of *La dolce vita* connotes theatrical spectacle. The press was invited, visitors came to the studio and crowds gathered for location filming, which included the Piazza di Trevi. Fellini's observation conjures up a run of theatre performances: 'It took eight or nine nights. Some of the owners of the surrounding houses would rent out their balconies and windows to the curious. At the end of each take the crowds would cheer. A show within a show.'<sup>48</sup> The metaphor of theatre evokes the textual and print representations of Salvi's 1729 *macchina pirotecnica* spectacle with onlookers as participants. Like the *macchina* depictions of its ephemerality, but with a larger reception, the filmed Trevi scene disappears and reappears in the on-going remediation of its images in cultural memory.

La dolce vita was a complex production, an 'art film colossal or spectacular' with over eighty locations. 49 Most filming took place on Cinecittà sets designed by Piero Gherardi, of the Via Veneto, salons, cafes and hotels that formed the luxurious background to the lifestyle of the Roman glitterati during the first economic boom. 50 The few non-studio locations like the Trevi were already sufficiently '"Fellinian" to need no touch of the master's fantasy,' comments Peter Bondanella, adding to the images of an illusion-producing Fountain. 51 The establishment perceived the film as attacking the Vatican and politicians. Allusions were made in it to recent events such as the Montesi Affair. 52 The film was condemned by the Vatican and Fellini's excommunication considered, an action seeking to control images for posterity that included those of the Fountain which, in this context, were not of papal creation. 53 The edifice, produced under its former patronage, was being manipulated by a medium which now threatened the Church's interests in maintaining a position of political power aligned against communism in postwar Italy.

1

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Claims variously appear eg in Bondanella, *Films*; Costanzo Costantini, ed., *Fellini on Fellini*, trans. by Sohrab Sorooshian (London: Faber & Faber Limited, 1994); Charlotte Chandler, *I Fellini* (London: Bloomsbury, 1996).

Franco La Cecla, 'Italian Fashion and the Air-Conditioned Nightmare', in *Volare*, ed. by Malossi, p. 99.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>48</sup> Costantini, p. 48.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Bondanella, *The Films of Federico Fellini* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002), p. 68.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>0</sup> Ibid., p. 68; Gundle, *Death*, pp. 298, 300.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>51</sup> Bondanella, *Films*, p. 91.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Gundle, *Death*, covers the Montesi Affair – a young girl found murdered on the beach.

See Costantini on reactions to the film, pp. 295-300.

Fellini's Fountain scene links to filmic and photographic memory of earlier dips in fountains by female film stars. For *Roman Holiday*, Hepburn splashes about elegantly in the Barcaccia. A still from the scene for the catalogue of an exhibition on fountains is captioned with a translated quote from Salvi about water that: 'quenches the excessive heat which would destroy this life. Thus water can be called the only everlasting source of continuous being.' For *Three Coins*, Frances climbs into a fountain to be assisted out by Shadwell: an act with future resonance of Marcello leading Sylvia out of the Trevi in *La dolce vita*. Photographs by Pierluigi Praturlon of Ekberg splashing in the water at night were published the year before the film was made, her gestures presaging those of Sylvia. 55

The Fountain scene marks the turning point in *La dolce vita* of a choice between moral decline or change for Marcello, the jaded photo-journalist who scrounges for gossip about Roman aristocracy and film stars with the photographer, Paparazzo. <sup>56</sup> Marcello is attracted to Sylvia, a visiting film star from America, and they return to Rome at night as he continues his attempted seduction after a drive to the countryside. When Marcello leaves her for a few minutes, Sylvia hears the Fountain and is drawn towards the Piazza, the camera filming from behind to maximize the impact of her surprise on suddenly arriving at the Trevi. The artificiality of camera lighting supersedes the deployment of moonlight in literary narratives and intensifies the suspension of disbelief by accentuating the moving images of protagonists.

Sylvia wears a black evening dress with a white fur stole.<sup>57</sup> Figure [51]. Marcello has the latest Italian-styled close fitting 'sharp' suit with narrow revers and a thin tie. Figure [52]. Sylvia calls to him to join her in the water, and he yields to the new hope she symbolises: 'Sì, Sylvia, vengo anch'io, vengo anch'io. Ma sì, ha ragione lei, stiamo sbagliando tutti, stiamo sbagliando tutti.' 'Sylvia! Sylvia, ma chi sei?', he queries, approaching the Fountain.<sup>58</sup> She trickles water onto his head in a ritualistic gesture of religious purification, blessing and baptism. They move together for the screen kiss that never happens. Figure [52]. The Fountain stops playing as if Marcello is

-

<sup>54</sup> Symmes, p. 33. In Italian, thesis, p. 118.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> Photographs, *La Dolce vita*, *L'Album*, compiled by Sam Stourdzé (Fondation Jerôme Seydoux-Pathé, Éditions Xavier Barral, 1960), pp. 99-101.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> By association, the Fellini Trevi links to the neologism 'paparazzo' in the film and the media power of capitalism.

Displayed at 'CINECITTÀSIMOSTRA' (2011). Created by the famous Sorelle Fontana sisters <a href="http://www.lifeinitaly.com/fashion/Sorelle-fontana.asp">http://www.lifeinitaly.com/fashion/Sorelle-fontana.asp</a>[accessed 31 January 2014] From dialogue script, British Film Institute, catalogue no. S1030, and Nouveaux Pictures DVD (2004).

unworthy of receiving Trevi water. He reacts with a startled, bewildered look, an early manifestation of the trope of *inetto* who hides his inadequacies beneath a performance of hyper-masculinity, a trope that would dominate Italian cinema for decades. <sup>59</sup> The visual representation of masculinity as power conveyed by Marcello's suit now fails to camouflage his loss of sexual confidence as he leads Sylvia out of the water into their bleak futures. She returns to her alcoholic husband and Marcello evolves from observer into active participant and initiator of decadent parties. The silent Fountain that destroys the fantasy of dream fulfilment dependent on its flowing water is an intertext from the literary medium, Stael's *Corinne* and Secondari's *Coins in the Fountain*, and in the same medium of film, *Three Coins*. The meaning starts to shift: the still water signifies not the end of dreaming but unfulfilled dreams. Yet the selected images carried forward in cinema memory are not those of disillusionment but the iconic ones of the glamorous Ekberg under the falling water who has a sexual encounter with a Latin lover.

Sylvia taps into the trope of eroticized bathing woman or women depicted by male artists. The paintings include the *Birth of Venus* (c.1485) by Sandro Botticelli; *The Garden of Earthly Delights* (1500) by Hieronymus Bosch; two canvases by Jean Auguste Dominique Ingres, *The* (Valpinçon) *Bather* (1808) and *The Turkish Bath* (1862); *Le Déjeuner sur l'herbe* (c.1863) – originally *Le Bain* – by Edouard Manet, possibly inspired by Giorgione's *The Pastoral Concert* (1510), and Paul Cezanne's *The Large Bathers* (1906). Fellini's image of Sylvia emphasizes the link between the female bathing body and sexual threat and opportunity, a trope reflecting that of the Siren water nymph as deadly for men whom Staël's Corinne evokes.

There are other challenges to the glamorous images in the popular imaginary of Fellini's scene. As technology of the time required sound, dialogue and music to be dubbed later onto film, Fellini on set was verbally directing his actors so that his absence is present in their performances. The multi-layered function of film production mirrors itself in the French publication *L'Album* (1960) and its hundreds of photographs taken during the filming of *La dolce vita*, especially at the Fountain. They add to the weave of remediated memory: still images of Fellini rehearsing the action, the film crew hanging around, camera cranes extending across the water, all images for future intertexts in a 1974 film using the location. In written and filmed reminiscences Fellini

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Catherine O'Rawe details the history of *inetto*, *Stars and Masculinities in Contemporary Italian Cinema* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), pp. 65-66.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>60</sup> L'Album, Fountain scene takes and rehearsals, pp. 102-26, 143-69.

Photographs of filming the scene were displayed at 'CINECITTÀSIMOSTRA' (2011). The 1974 film 'features' later.

and Ekberg contest the screen portrayal of the apparent ease with which Mastroianni stood in the cold water, alleging he wore a frogman's diving suit under his suit and was drunk on vodka. A *L'Album* photograph of Ekberg shows her pulling on a wellington boot under her evening dress: the practical requirements of film-making puncture depictions of glamour. <sup>63</sup>

As far as known, the motif of water in *La dolce vita* has yet to be researched so that fuller exploration beyond the following overview, particularly in memory terms, would be productive. The opening scene establishes the motif when the helicopter transporting the statue of Christ, (a link to previous papal control over the water supply), flies past a ruined aqueduct whose fluid promises have long since failed. Water as signifying the failure to renew prevails in the relationships between Marcello and four women. Sylvia and the waitress, Paola both offer him an optimistic future. His suicidal partner, Emma and his promiscuous lover, Maddelena both represent destructive forces which eventually destroy this prospect.

An ironic reference is made to water when Marcello and Maddelena stop in her luxury car by a Piazza del Popolo wall fountain supplied by the Acqua Vergine and pick up a prostitute. Later, at her flooded basement flat in the *borgate* they cross the water on a plank to borrow her bed for the night, a future negative connotation of events at the Fountain where a life-changing opportunity for Marcello symbolically disappears when the Trevi water stops flowing. It is Emma who takes him to the field where she believes a miracle occurred; death follows when the crowd panics in the dark after rain short circuits the lighting equipment of a film crew. Marcello is with Emma at a party where the host plays a tape-recording of ominous sounds that includes crashing ocean waves, auditory images that presage his suicide after murdering his children. The new life symbolized by Paola goes unnoticed by Marcello in the scene at the seaside restaurant with the background sound of waves and, as the film concludes, he fails to comprehend when her distant call inviting him to join her is drowned out by crashing waves on the beach. Most of the scenes are at night but Paola features in daylight as if to illuminate the hope she represents.

In the above overview, the water motif in each *mise en scène* functions not as a signifier of renewal but of accumulative failure. The visual and auditory images of water appear accidental yet build a strong challenge to the collective memory of water as a positive source of renewal, a challenge intimated by Salvi's intentionally eroded

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Costantini, p. 47; Nouveaux Pictures DVD (2004), Ekberg interview.

<sup>63</sup> L'Album, Photograph T28 shows a tracking crane across the vascone.

rockwork and column. In *Roman Holiday* and *Three Coins*, water symbolizes a cleansing of the memory of fascism. In *La dolce vita* it symbolizes rejection of past and present and failure to deliver a future. Water can be taken as informing Fellini's critical commentary on consumerist Rome as decadent and culturally ailing. The carefully crafted Fountain scene is central to this interpretation.

#### 5.1.6 Fellini's Fountain: Mise en Scène? Lieu de Mémoire?

A function of *mise en scène* is to advance the overall narrative of a film by creating a pattern of motifs and deliberate choices concerning location, design, lighting, space, costume, movement and acting.<sup>64</sup> Film motifs come in and out of focus according to the context of the observer and their meanings in *mise en scène* evolve in cultural memory. The Fountain scene as such provides a key turning point in *La dolce vita*.

The placing of actors in front of the large Fountain in its small Piazza filmically mirrors Salvi's architectural exploitation of the irregularities of spatial ambiguity for maximum visual impact. Fellini creates a new sense of deep but falsely moving space behind Sylvia and Marcello by using a camera lens that keeps them in focus with a slight distortion of the Trevi background, instead of a widescreen lens bringing everything into focus. Nearness to or distance from camera are technical methods that convey affect. Sylvia's framed face with closed eyes symbolizes her remoteness and the slow long shot of the actors conveys mutual rejection as they leave the silent Fountain. The shots build on the gender politics conveyed by its design aesthetics and the media of art and literature, with Fellini's images of couples wearing evening attire in or by the Trevi water becoming frequently appropriated for the future enactment of overtly sexualized commercial stories.

Fellini's scene seemingly invites the notion of a transnational filmic *lieu de mémoire* whose national origins are anchored in an Italian 'sweet life', as does *La dolce vita* itself.<sup>66</sup> The scene's on-going interpretations, several of which follow, suggest the sedimentation of new meanings and continual metamorphosis that Nora requires for memory sites.<sup>67</sup> As already propounded, the difficulty lies with the framework of national specificity although the updating of the concept of a memory site

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> David Bordwell and Kristin Thompson, *Film Art: An Introduction*, 9<sup>th</sup> ed. (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2004), p. 225.

<sup>65</sup> Bordwell discusses movement in film, pp. 198-207.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>66</sup> Erll considers *lieux* transnationally from differing cultural viewpoints, 'Remembering across Time', in *Mediation*, ed. by Erll and Rigney, pp. 110-38.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> Nora, 'Between Memory', 7-25.

with dynamic, dialogic, and intermedial aspects moves beyond Nora's and Isnenghi's national boundaries.<sup>68</sup> Interpretations of the Fountain had been premediated in print form that travelled transnationally and their digitized images now circulate on the Internet where borders seem irrelevant.

As films are disseminated, translations become attached but constraints of thesis space allow for only brief consideration of the commercial practices of sub-titling or dubbing translations and their implications for transcultural remembering of a wellknown *mise en scène*. <sup>69</sup> Film images with sub-titles are diversely produced and received by audiences across time in changing contexts and influence memory collectively and individually in different linguistic settings. 70 The domestication function of translated sub-titling shapes different memories to those conveyed by the host language due to changes in dialogue and screen space limitations and voice-over dubbing that seeks to fit the requirements of synchrony. The large size of the English sub-title letters in a Mediaset DVD (2008) of La dolce vita causes loss of meaning through abbreviation and synthesis. One of cinema's iconic moments is configured in new remembrance by commercially driven translation. When Sylvia invites Marcello into the water his repeated 'veng'anch'io' [I'm coming] is translated once as, 'All right, Sylvia', and the repeated, 'stiamo sbagliando tutti' [We are all wrong] once as, 'we've been all wrong about everything.<sup>71</sup> The portrayal of a life-changing opportunity weakens in translation. Marcello's next words, 'Sylvia, Sylvia, ma chi sei?' [Sylvia, Sylvia, but who are you?] alluding to her mythical and untouchable qualities, are not sub-titled and lost in nontranslation. It qualifies as a Venuti 'translation scandal' as its 'asymmetry' results in a sexual focus on Sylvia. 72 New memory opens up of a man in a hurry to seduce the woman in the water. The changes of meaning in the written text on the screen evoke the shifting interpretations of words on the Fountain inscriptions: the dedications to themselves by papal patrons that became purely decorative in a new marketing context.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Erll, 'Remembering'; also Carrier, 'Places, Politics, in *Memory and Methodology*, ed. by Radstone, pp. 37-57.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>69</sup> Replacement voices are copies: DVDs may have subtitles/dubbing/voices over in several languages.

Nub-titling for non-hearers concerns a different practice, of co-ordinating text and visual imagery.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> 'Veng'anch'io' relates to the film's final scene: Marcello replies 'Vengo' to a summons to continue his self-destructive life.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> Lawrence Venuti, *The Scandals of Translation: Towards an Ethics of Difference* (London: Routledge, 1998), p. 7.

## 5.1.7 Images for Sale: Sexy Trevi

The Fountain scene became a marker of an imaginary past in popular imagination due to Fellini's choice of the scene for publicity. The Shortly after release of *La dolce vita* its filmic images were remediated in photography, publicity, advertising and the press. A 1960 example is a cartoon supplement, *La Douceur de vivre*, for a monthly periodical. The summarized wording required to fit each frame results again in a focus on sexual aspects and further undermines Fellini's satirical intentions, an effect achieved by the Mediaset DVD (2008) sub-titling.

La dolce vita transformed its stars into icons, Mastroianni as 'Latin lover' and Ekberg as 'dream woman'. 75 Her subsequent fame depended on the film and she became memorialized as a monument of her cinematic image. Ekberg appropriated the Fountain scene in press interviews, a British television programme and an interview for a Nouveaux Pictures DVD (2004). <sup>76</sup> In the interview she mirrors Salvi's 'unicogenita' possessiveness: 'They say now it's my fountain and I agree. It's my fountain. It wasn't created for me but it's become mine.' Fellini reminisces that the film changed Ekberg's life: 'After that she could not go too far away from the Fountain of Trevi. She had found the place where she truly existed, and Rome became her home.<sup>77</sup> For one of Fellini's autobiographies she claims: 'It was me who made Fellini famous, not the other way round. When the film was presented in New York, the distributor reproduced the fountain scene on a hoarding as high as a skyscraper.' The cover page of an Italian publicity brochure pictures Ekberg in the Fountain with Oceanus behind and a still inside shows her in swirling gown at the nightclub, a performance that mimics Oceanus's with flowing drapery and long exposed leg. 79 The scene as the main publicity vehicle for the film re-enforced the association of Ekberg and Fountain in images that continue to market the film. 80 In this sense Fellini appears to contribute to the fallibility of his authorial intentions.

In a commercially exploitative privileging of female images over the male, the

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> *La Dolce Vita*, publicity brochures (English and Italian); 'Campaign Book', and publicity programme, Columbia Pictures (British Film Institute holdings, n.cat. nos, n.d.).

Supplement, 'Nous deux FILM', issue 81, 1960, in L'Album.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>75</sup> Gundle, *Death*, p. 304.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> Il Messaggero, 9 October 1989; Il Corriere della Sera, 17 July 1991; BBC 2 Television, Arena, 1997 (date uncertain).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>77</sup> Chandler, p. 121.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>78</sup> Costantini, p. 52.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> La dolce vita, 'Campaign Book', cover and p. 5.

<sup>80</sup> See Gundle, *Death*, p.299.

cover for the Mediaset DVD features one film still of Mastroianni and four of Ekberg. One of these induces false memory by transposing droplets of the Trevi cascade behind the nightclub Ekberg and another widely distributed still shows her upturned face, flowing blonde hair, closed eyes and profiled breasts against a background of highlighted Trevi spray. In 2006 the British Film Institute used this in a large montage of iconic film moments behind the reception desk. Figure [53]. On 23 February 2008 a full page advertisement appropriated the same image in the Guardian, offering the Mediaset DVD of La dolce vita free with The Observer. 81 Large capitalized words were superimposed in a column down her cleavage: 'ANITA EKBERG. OSCAR. GLAMOUR. CELEBRITY. SELF INDULGENCE. LA DOLCE VITA. FELLINI'S MASTERPIECE.': a new Trevi location for an overtly sexualized commercial inscription. A small inset of the nightclub still with transposed droplets of water behind Ekberg also features. The cleavage image features again in a press advertisement for the DVD of Martin Scorsese's lengthy documentary on the influence of Italian films on his long career, My Voyage to Italy. 82 The cover has the same Ekberg still and the DVD includes the Fountain scene. These memory-markers continue to undermine Fellini's intended satirical narrative so that the Swedish star and the Trevi continue as metonyms for La dolce vita in cinema and other mediated memory.

The images of Ekberg's physique continue to influence films and advertising. They belong to what was called *epoca delle maggiorate* in Italy, a Western cinematic and photographic craze in the 1950s that took commodification of the exaggeratedly large breasts of female stars to extremes. Some stars with the same attributes preceded Ekberg at the Fountain so it was already a place of *maggiorate* performances before Fellini's scene; as mentioned she had already been photographed there by Praturlon. The vogue produced, amongst many other stars, Gina Lollobrigida and Sophia Loren who visited the Fountain for publicity purposes. *L'Acqua della Fontana di Trevi* (1957) has Lollobrigida throwing coins and filling a jar with water to encourage coin-throwing into a Johannesburg fountain for a children's charity. The sexually-endorsed water is filmed on its journey until emptied in the South African fountain. Non-Italian *maggiorate* stars included Ekberg, Marilyn Monroe, Diana Dors and Jayne Mansfield.

. . . .

<sup>81</sup> Mediaset owns the rights to La dolce vita.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>82</sup> Guardian, 16 July 2011. My Voyage to Italy, dir. by Martin Scorsese (Mediatrade, n.d.).

Stefano Masi and Enrico Lancia overload their misogynist narrative about the era in *Italian Movie Goddesses: Over 80 of the Greatest Women in Italian Cinema* (Rome: Gremese, 1997), pp. 99-100; Ekberg is 'ripe femininity full to the bursting point', a 'colossal woman', p.120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>84</sup> Lollobrigida and Loren videos and photographs are under 'Fontana di Trevi'

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.europeana.eu</a> [accessed 10 March 2013].

The English *maggiorata*, Sabrina (Norma Sykes), her Latin name appropriately that of a river goddess, visited the Trevi in 1958 for a photo shoot when she leant forwards in a low cut gown over the water. <sup>85</sup> Figure [54]. The photographic and filmic water nymphs performed, and continue to perform, in front of goddesses in the statuary with their exposed or lightly covered breasts sculpted according to earlier patriarchal perceptions.

Subsequent discourse adds goddess and nymph-like qualities to Ekberg interpretations, expanding previous patriarchal narratives of Fountain imagery but now promoting commercial objectification of the glamorous female body. Fellini's choice of 'Sylvia' implicitly suggests a classical divinity in contrast to his sexually explicit nickname for her of 'Anitona' - 'Big Anita'. 86 In the cartoon strips for La Douceur her ritual action of trickling water on Marcello's head is captioned as: 'Elle laisse couler l'eau sur son visage comme si elle accomplissait un rite païen'. <sup>87</sup> Bondanella refers to 'Marcello's adventure with this water nymph' and Gundle to 'a film goddess from the land of dreams'. 88 Publicity material, probably for the UK film release, features her in the water, right arm held high and left arm down towards the water in reverse mimicry of Oceanus's pose with right arm down, the picture titled 'WATER NYMPH'. 89 Gundle labels the photographic image of Ekberg and Mastroianni about to kiss: 'Water Nymph: screen goddess Anita Ekberg tempts Mastroianni to join her for a frolic in Rome's Trevi fountain, in one of the film's most sexy scenes'. 90 Figure [52]. The fluid textual borrowings between pictorial representations and titles denote, following Welchman again, a re-imaging of images by titles as they move attention away from the material site of images onto themselves. In this instance, the re-imaging promotes a sexually fantastic quality: an effect also achieved by the afore-mentioned captioning for the water ritual in the La Douceur cartoon and the sub-titling of the Mediaset DVD (2008). 91 The double act of Ekberg and Trevi, as well as undermining Fellini's

<sup>85 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.imdb.com</a> [accessed 16 February 2012].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>86</sup> 'Sylvia' suggests the 'selva' of woodland, *Lo Zingarelli minore: vocabolario della lingua italiana* (Bologna, Zanichelli, 1994), p. 1138. On 'Anitona', on

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it">http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it</a> [accessed 10 January 2012] and Gundle on Fellini's liking for 'large women', *Bellissima: Feminine Beauty and the Idea of Italy* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2007), pp. 199-200. Fellini's *Boccaccio '70* (1962) features Ekberg in a dream sequence, 'her opulent curves enlarged by a billboard' on which she advertises milk, Masi and Lancia, p.120.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>87</sup> L'Album, La Douceur de vivre cartoon for Nous deux FILM, issue 81, 1960 (n. page nos).

<sup>88</sup> Bondanella, Films, p. 87; Gundle, Death, p. 352.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>89</sup> La Dolce vita 'Campaign Book', Columbia Pictures, British Film Institute, n.cat. no. (December 1960).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>90</sup> Gundle, *History Today*, (January 2000), 29-35 (p. 34).

<sup>91</sup> Welchman, p. 341.

intentions to satirize Roman society, then becomes an exploitative memory marker for repeated borrowing.

## 5.1.8 Fellini's Future Trevi: Intertexts, Borrowings, Transformations

The concept of filmic intertextuality is taken here to mean the intentional borrowing of original material from one film to shape the meaning of another film or that it is possible to reference the text of one film when viewing another. In all narrative forms any borrowing has to be recognised and remembered as familiar to advance authorial intentions. In the literary medium, Hare's insert of a lengthy quotation from Hawthorne's topographical description of the Trevi, to further his travel account of walking the sights of Rome, added new memory of the city as a tourist destination. Fellini's Trevi scene offered film-makers the appropriable motifs of flowing and silenced water, love and rejection, in a fantasy-heightening night-time location, falsely illuminated – the motifs of glamour and decadence added to the mix. The following lesser-known Fountain scenes that follow, including a parody and tributes, illustrate the differential exploitative potential of intertexts. The first four cinema films and Pinto's *Trevi* use the device of a film extract within a film.

Released in 1961, *Divorzio all'italiana* satirizes religion and marriage. <sup>93</sup> A priest's denouncement of *La dolce vita* misfires by advertising the film's sexual content to his congregation: Trevi imagery once more challenging intended power. A *mise en scène* of a cinema auditorium shows the male audience staring fixatedly at Ekberg's scenes, including the one at the Trevi. The scene advances the emphasis of ironic comment on prevailing patriarchal attitudes by referencing the recent memory of *La dolce vita* in popular imagination about sex. <sup>94</sup>

Intentional borrowing also occurs in *Intervista* (1987), a self-referential Fellini film. Mandrake the magician (Mastroianni) in black tie and tails, the name conveying poison and magic, visits Ekberg's villa in Rome. She appears partially wrapped in a bright, gravity-defying towel, long blonde hair flowing. Mandrake gives the order to 'revisit happy times of the past'; the night club and Fountain scenes from *La dolce vita* appear on a conjured-up screen and the two mature actors watch their younger images.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>92</sup> Hare, pp. 53-54; Hawthorne (1990), p. 145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>93</sup> Divorzio all'italiano, dir. by Pietro Germi (Lux Film, 1961).

On the film's impact, see Gundle, *Death*, pp. 348-49.

<sup>95</sup> Intervista, dir. by Federico Fellini (Castle Hill Productions, 1987) on

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.youtube./com/watch">http://www.youtube./com/watch</a>> [accessed 23 August 2012]. Reviewed by Philip French, *The Observer*, 17 February 2008.

The camera repeatedly cuts to exchanges of knowing glances about a past that must be remembered as happy when conjured by the illusory exercise of magic.

In *Lost in Translation* (2003) Bob and Charlotte drink sake in the bedroom scene whilst watching *La dolce vita* on television. <sup>96</sup> The camera cuts from their expressionless faces to the screen when it shows the night club and Fountain scenes. In the latter, Sylvia is heard calling, 'Marcello, come here! Hurry up!' The auditory impact derives from the diagetic sound as Bob and Charlotte are assumed to hear and see the same things (that may be understood differently) whereas non-diegetic sound would not be heard by them. <sup>97</sup> Impact also derives from the portrayal of a similar symbolic and unfulfilled desire, in a different and contrasting location, that again deflates clichéd screen romance. The Fellini intertext advances the film's narrative of a complex relationship of attraction and distance yet shared problems of alienation and insomnia.

The documentary *Valentino: The Last Emperor* (2011) shows the fashion designer walking down the Via Veneto in conversation with his partner. <sup>98</sup> Sections of Fellini's Fountain and Via Veneto scenes are intercut with the reminiscences. Valentino claims his last visit was in the 1960s. The scene invents an imagined Rome of trendsetting fashion at the time and, in Foucault's words: 'people are shown not what they were, but what they must remember having been.' Puring a catwalk scene at a fashion show, Ekberg's question as she approaches the Fountain is heard, 'Where are you, Marcello?' as if the absent male is being sought. The auditory intertext leaves it unclear whether the fragment is diegetic, and heard by the audience, or non-diegetic to advance a new narrative of the past for viewers only, producing uncertainty in the absence of a distinction. The impact of an intentionally selected filmic intertext draws attention to the medium and its fictive status as well as to the intertext as a vehicle for the transmission of memory. Arguably, the impact of intertextual borrowing within media differs: in the literary reference made to Hare's borrowings from Hawthorne, the impact is not visual and auditory but on the reader's imagination. <sup>100</sup>

Some films reference the Fountain scene in a different form of borrowing as the trope of a film within a film. The drama comedy *C'eravamo tanto amati* (1974) portrays

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>96</sup> Lost in Translation, dir. by Sofia Coppola (Momentum Pictures, 2003).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>97</sup> Claudia Gorbman, 'Music as Salvation: Notes on Fellini and Rota', *Film Quarterly*, 28, 2 (1974-1975), 19.

Dir. by Matt Tyrnauer (Acolyte Films, 2008), music by Nino Rota. Television broadcast, BBC Four, 7 July 2011. On <a href="http://www.youtube/com/watch?v=UGJJRPWqvzM">http://www.youtube/com/watch?v=UGJJRPWqvzM</a> [accessed 1 November 2013]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>99</sup> Foucault, 'Film', in *Foucault Live*, ed. by Lotringer, p. 123.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>100</sup> Hare, 1, p. 67. Hawthorne (1990), p. 145.

the relationships between three anti-fascist partisans, Nicola, Gianni and Antonio who occasionally meet to share memories. <sup>101</sup> Their lives after the war diverge socially, professionally and politically, but all three fall in love with Luciana at different times. <sup>102</sup> Ettore Scola's film traces their disillusionment in the present with the future promises of their partisan past. He privileges cinema memory as a temporal measure by borrowing footage to establish the linear chronology of the story from, for example, *Ladri di biciclette* (1948) and *Of Human Bondage* (1964). Dialogic references to other films are made, such as *Last Year at Marienbad* (1961) and *L'eclisse* (1962). <sup>103</sup>

In contrast, for '1959', Fellini is filmed for C'eravamo as if rehearsing the Fountain scene in an explicit performance of intertextuality, with distant figures in the Fountain resembling Ekberg and Mastroianni. A camera crane extends over the water, echoing the L'Album stills (1960) and photographs at the CINECITTÀMOSTRA Exhibition (2011). Figure [55]. One director directs another for new mise en scène in which the Fountain is one of many intertexts. Luciana's agent hussles a part for her as the Ekberg stand in and Antonio gazes with 1974 eyes at the famous Mastroianni watching the filming and not the 1959 lesser known actor. Fellini is mis-remembered by someone as 'Signor Rossellini'. The Nino Rota score from the Fountain scene is reworked with energetic phrasing, a musical intertext that connotes pending misfortune for the relationship between Antonio and Luciana as they meet by the water. The referencing of Fellini's Fountain in C'eravamo heightens awareness of the fictiveness of the cinematic medium when it seeks to reinvent memory. Also, the performances at the Trevi resonate with multiple echoes of earlier ambiguous relationships. It builds on memory of uncertain outcomes for those required to perform in front of the Fountain, both filmic and literary: the pairings in Roman Holiday, Three Coins, Lost in Translation and La dolce vita, of Staël's Corinne and Oswald, Hawthorne's Miriam and Donatello, Yourcenar's Clément and Massimo and Secondari's Bertin and Shadwell.

Another film that explicitly references the Fountain scene, *Elsa y Fred* (2005), is a Spanish-Argentinian co-production in which two elderly lovers from Madrid travel to

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>101</sup> *C'eravamo tanto amati*, dir. by Ettore Scola (Delta, 1974). The title is the first line of Armando Gill's popular song, 'Come pioveva' (1918). Full text, on

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.interviu.it/canzone/gill/gill2.htm">http://www.interviu.it/canzone/gill/gill2.htm</a> [accessed 1 November 2013]

Ekberg as *maggiorata* contrasts with Sandrelli (Luciana), a1970s feminist star, Masi, p. 170.

See Millicent Marcus, *Italian Film in the Light of Neorealism*, (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986), p. 412; Vincent Canby, *The New York Times*, 'Movie Review: *C'eravamo tanto amati*', 24 May 1977, on

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.movies.nytimes.com/pages/movies/index.html">http://www.movies.nytimes.com/pages/movies/index.html</a> [accessed 1 November 2013]

Rome because the dying Elsa has always wanted to re-enact Ekberg's performance. Elsa, in black dress and white fur stole, is reluctantly joined by Fred in the water until a policeman intervenes. The Trevi immersion does not bestow longevity; the script requires Elsa's eventual death and discovery of her mendacity. There is another puncturing of clichéd screen romance by death, as in the literary examples: Staël's Corinne pines away, Hawthorne's Donatello commits murder, Yourcenar's Clément is seriously ill, Rome's fountains background the death of Ouida's Ariadnê and Secondari's dying Shadwell cannot wish at the silent Fountain for another day of life.

In contrast, the romantic comedy *Bianco e nero* (2008) uses the Trevi to explore inter-racial relationships in the adulterous affair between the white Carlo and black Nadine. Rejecting his doubts about re-enacting Fellini's scene because of its ethnicity, Carlo carries Nadine into the water where they laugh and kiss under the cascade. The colour of her body, enhanced by a white dress, recalls the trope of the Black Venus 'as an age-old object of desire', <sup>106</sup> and substitutes that of Sylvia, the eroticized white woman in a black dress. Similarities can be drawn between Carlo and Marcello as the *inetto* in Italian cinema, yet Marcello continues to fail whereas Carlo has momentary success in the Fountain. *Bianco e nero* reverses Fellini's negative outcomes at the Trevi: for *La dolce vita* Sylvia lures Marcello into the Fountain that falls silent and thwarts his sexual intentions.

Another contrast is in a comedic parody of Fellini films for which the Fountain scene is re-worked by the British television comedians Dawn French and Jennifer Saunders, *Franco and Sandro* (1996). <sup>107</sup> The Italian dialogue, with English sub-titles, is dubbed 'out of synch' in the levelled register of post-dubbing in the 1960s. French, with long blonde wig, black evening dress and white stole, mimics Ekberg in a studio Trevi. Saunders, as Maddelena with sunglasses, replaces Marcello. The paparazzi favour her and neglect French. However, in an exchange of banter that includes – 'You'll catch your death in there' – Saunders unintentionally references the doom laden associations of the literary Trevi.

Some films contain covert or explicit tribute acts of the scene. Sabrina Goes to

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>104</sup> Elsa y Fred, dir. by Marcos Carnevale (Distrimax Inc., 2005); Fountain scene on <a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch%3Fv%3Dps\_hBjt0u0">hBjt0u0</a> [accessed 1 November 2013] <sup>105</sup> Bianco e nero, dir. by Cristina Comencini (01Distribution, 2008).

See Aine O'Healy, '"[Non] è una somala": Deconstructing African Femininity in Italian Film', *The Italianist*, 2 (2009), 175-98 (p. 193).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>107</sup> <a href="http://www.youtube./com/watch?v=rmzxLXJ6oGE">http://www.youtube./com/watch?v=rmzxLXJ6oGE</a>> [accessed 1 November 2013] (Part Two)

Rome (1998), an ABC film for American television, has a teenage witch rescued from the water by a photographer. <sup>108</sup> For *Under the Tuscan Sun* (2003), an actor mimics Ekberg's gestures in a fibreglass fountain filled with warm water at the Piazza Signorelli in Cortona. <sup>109</sup> *When in Rome* (2010) borrows the motifs of coins and wishes for a Fontana di Amore [*sic*] with an animated goddess statue. <sup>110</sup> She punishes the woman who steals five coins by making their throwers fall disastrously in love with her. The happy ending, the thief and her lover in the forgiving Fontana, overturns the denial of redemption in Fellini's scene. In the pornographic film, *Michael Lucas' La Dolce Vita* (2006) Lucas cavorts with Savanna Samson (he wears a dark suit, she has a black dress) in the cascading waters of City Hall Park Fountain, Manhattan. <sup>111</sup> Figure [56]. The tribute acts link to Fellini's scene in other geographical locations where the Trevi is not a specific referent: a difference between the film medium and the print and literary media where images are known to be those of the Trevi. <sup>112</sup>

Contrasting with its exploitation in widely-released commercial films, part of the Fountain scene is borrowed for an academic documentary film about the monument, available on DVD. Pinto is one of the two co-producers of *Trevi* (1988). In their introductory talks to camera, 'multiple meanings' are said to reside within the many discussions about the Trevi and the viewer is warned about these narrative strategies. Over the years people who visit 'have seen the Fountain but they have also seen themselves.' A voice-over reads from eighteenth-century letters and documents about construction and gives a Hawthorne quote about the design. Has well as a clip from the Fellini Fountain scene, a day in the 'life' of the Trevi shows shots of money being swept up, the Salone source, stream and overground aqueduct, a rainy Piazza, the silent Fountain overnight and the water restarting. Visitors voice their opinions on the Trevi, passersby perform for camera at the water's edge and an elderly man who stares reflectively at the Fountain emphasizes its fictional presence by moving out of frame. The film concludes with people partying at night-time. Pinto's approach anticipates the

1

Details on <a href="http://www.imdb.com">http://www.imdb.com</a> [accessed 13 February 2012]

Under the Tuscan Sun, dir. by Audrey Wells (Disney/Miramax, 2003). Information from <a href="http://www.cortona.tuscantreasures.net/cortinfo.html">http://www.cortona.tuscantreasures.net/cortinfo.html</a> [accessed 1 November 2013]

When in Rome, dir. by Mark Steven Johnson (Touchstone Pictures, 2010). Adapted from Frances Mayes, *Under the Tuscan Sun: At Home in Italy* (New York: Broadway Books, 1996).
 Michael Lucas' La Dolce Vita, dir. by Michael Lucas and Tony Dimarco (Lucas Distribution, 2006).

<sup>112</sup> Interestingly, the Trevi is never named in *La dolce vita*.

<sup>113</sup> *Trevi*, co-producers Richard Rogers and John Pinto, dir. by Corey Shaff (Metropolitan Museum of Art and John Paul Getty Foundation, 1988).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>114</sup> Hawthorne (1990), p. 145.

emphasis in memory studies of shifting meanings and inventive social practices. His montage of images, dialogue, and the Fellini scene as a trope of film within a film offers a layered representation that follows through the co-production intentions of conveying a multivalent Trevi and its availability as a narrative vehicle.

The reconfiguration of the Trevi as a filmic device enhances the continuing power of its intertextual imagery; it increases an awareness of the diverse narratives forming transcultural cinematic memory. The differences between the medium of film and those discussed earlier lie in the increased reception of images and reshaped borrowings that offer the commercial dimension of glamour. Fellini's Fountain scene is significant in memory terms for its appropriation of Trevi imagery by the media of advertising and cyberspace. The intertextuality of earlier postwar films featuring the glamorous Trevi resonates in the scene and relates to the literary manœuvres by its water.

The medium of cinema immediately borrowed Fellini's Trevi imagery for sexually exploitative practices in subsequent productions and so draws attention to itself, and the Trevi, as a generator of fictions. Linked to these reconfigurations is the music accompanying filmic images which so far has been briefly indicated. The performativity in memory of coin rituals, playing and silent water, romance and rejection, and light and darkness is magnified by the interrelation of music and film.

## 5.2 (Un)Sound Memory: Water, Music, Film

## 5.2.1 Auditory Images

Film music is undervalued as a research area in memory studies, perceived perhaps as peripheral to image and narrative. It is proposed here as an associative auditory vehicle for memory with its host film and one that travels intermedially. Before turning to the musical Trevi, the sound a fountain makes is acknowledged as bringing its own aural dimension to memory, a sound that links to music representations. The difference between the silent monument and a playing fountain is the latter's possession of a narrative of sound, evoking different connotations when silent. The sound is conveyed in many European languages by the verb 'to play', suggesting a ludic quality in English or a musical instrument playing, as for the German *spielen* and the French *jouer*. The Spanish *sonar* and Italian *suonare* may also describe a playing fountain or the performance on a musical instrument. The verb alludes to theatricality, adding to the image of a fountain as performative. The aim of the project *Il suono delle fontane di* 

Roma is to partner sound with a short musical score; the Trevi piece is composed by Amedeo Minghi. 115

The authors discussed in Chapter Four refer to the sound, sometimes musical, of the Trevi. For Staël (1807) when, 'cette cascade s'arrête, on dirait que Rome est frappée de stupeur' and the murmur of the Fountain, 'semble comme l'accompagnement nécessaire à l'existence rêveuse qu'on y mène'. 116 Stendhal (1829) comments on it as 'un peu plus de bruit que la fontaine de Bondi sur le boulevard' and Dickens (1846), as 'silvery to the eye and ear.' For Hawthorne (1860), 'Its murmur, – not to say, its uproar – had been in the ears of the company, ever since they came into the open air.'118 Ouida (1888) has the Trevi belong to 'the water that fills Rome with an unchanging melody all through the year.' 119 After initially appreciating the 'immense ruissellement' of the water, Yourcenar's Clément (1959) finds it a malevolent force and, 'La musique du flot n'est qu'un bruit qui empêcherait qu'on l'entende' if he has to call for help. 120 Secondari, however, refers to the noise of scraping when the Fountain is being cleaned and its 'crashing' and 'gurgling' when switched on. 121

The images of sound in written text cannot be heard, their evocation informed by personal memory. This raises the issue, beyond the thesis remit, of its neurological dimensions. <sup>122</sup> Analogue forms of photographs, film posters, montages, advertisements, prints and books are silent, potentially triggering a replay of musical memory; 'Three Coins' is an example. For Proust, memory is frequently referenced by metaphors of music. 123 Memory that remains elusively unattainable is compared to a forgotten melody: 'Et personne ne saura jamais, pas même [sic] soi-même, l'air qui pursuivait de son rythme insaisissable et délicieux.'124

Fountains filmed on location are musically silent. The aural dimension of music is added later to the soundtrack. A fountain's splashing may be recorded or a similar sound dubbed later from film archive recordings and a music score synchronized – the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>115</sup> Information from L'Associazione culturale acque (email, 8 November 2011). The project commenced 2008. See <a href="http://www.ilsuonodellefontanediroma.com">http://www.ilsuonodellefontanediroma.com</a> [accessed 20 October 2013].

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>116</sup> Staël, p. 137.

Stendhal, p. 90, Bondi presently untraceable; Dickens, p. 397.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>118</sup> Hawthorne (1990), p. 145.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>119</sup> Ouida, pp. 9-10.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>120</sup> Yourcenar, *Denier*, pp. 185-86, 191.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>121</sup> Secondari, p. 7, 20.

A warning note: Trevi songs possess earworm potential.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>123</sup> Michael Wood, 'Proust: The Music of Memory', in *Memory*, ed. by Radstone and Schwarz, pp. 109-22 (p.109).

Proust, Contre Sainte-Beuve, 19th edn (Paris: Gallimard, 1954), p. 313.

sound of a playing Trevi may not be that of the Trevi. A musical theme may become a leitmotif that travels, like 'Three Coins', with associated auditory images into related media. It accumulates and shifts meanings that may or may not be explicit in images or dialogue as new stories evolve. Fellini and Rota demonstrate the power of the music leitmotif in film to convey meanings that are not explicit in visual images or dialogue and in *La dolce vita* the link between music and image is powerfully made at the Fountain.

### 5.2.2 'Three Coins', 'Arrivederci Roma'

The sung and unsung narratives of Trevi music circulate in broadcast and online media, sometimes with visual images from film, sometimes without them. As suggested, the song 'Three Coins' strengthens the film's ideological endeavour of forgetting fascism by remembering a glamorous Rome, and Italy, by extension, as an American ally against communism as well as pointing to future memory of a dreamed-of tourist destination. The orchestral score as a non-diegetic motif is used throughout *Three* Coins, frequently and with increasing length, over scenes where relationships develop, prompting audiovisual memory of the opening scene at the Trevi with Sinatra singing. 125 Different instruments link scenes and indicate mood – gentle notes are for daydreaming. When the action switches to Venice, the motif is a reminder that the Trevi is present in its absence, moving its location and fantasy of granting wishes geographically. The song eventually becomes a metonym for the film, its monetary images conveyed by association in orchestral scores without the lyrics. 'Three Coins' both as score or song is regularly selected from digital archives by documentary makers, as for the ITV programme about Rome for 'The Greatest Capitals of the World' series when Griff Rhys Jones, the presenter, emerges from the Fountain conduit and 'Three Coins' starts playing. 126 The auditory reminder reinforces his story about the Trevi as a money-earner, the idea that romance can be bought with a coin in a global urban context – and coincidentally references his own fee.

The swift crossing of 'Three Coins' into popular musical memory was assisted by 20<sup>th</sup> Century Fox failing to copyright the song: the Trevi again linked to an evasion of power. Numerous hit recordings were made by crooners followed by later versions.<sup>127</sup> In the year of the film release, the song became sufficiently known to be

For music motifs, see Gorbman, p. 18.

Occasional ITV broadcasts since 2009. Ironically the silent Trevi is being cleaned.

Doris Day, Dean Martin and Perry Como amongst others, now crooning on the Internet.

parodied on *The Goon Show* programme, 'The Affair of the Lone Banana'. <sup>128</sup> Cyril Cringinknutt sings the opening lines as, 'Three Goons in a Fountain, which one will the Fountain drown?'.

Several Trevi motifs are referenced in another popular hit, initially within Italy. In the following verse from Renato Rascel's 'Arrivederci Roma' (1955) he refers to moonlight, a kiss, coin, and departure:

Stasera la vecchia fontana racconta la solita luna, la storia vicina e lontana di quella inglesina che un giorno partì. Io qui, proprio qui l'ho incontrata, io qui ....proprio qui l'ho baciata. Lei qui con la voce smarrita m'ha detto 'È finita ritorno lassù!' Ma prima di partire l'inglesina buttò la monetina [...]. Figure [57]<sup>129</sup>

Two versions are sung by Mario Lanza for the Italo-American film *Arrivederci Roma/Seven Hills of Rome* (1958) beside the wrong fountain, in Piazza Navona, accompanied by a female street urchin. <sup>130</sup> The Italian version removes verses with a sexual content and the London identity of the *inglesina*. The American version uses the title words, repetitively, and almost eliminates Trevi references, substituting a bland version of leaving Rome and returning to wed. Figure [57]. The significations in the international hit song remain of moonlit places, embraces and the city as a place of farewell and return. The song loses its Rascel interpretation as a fountain linked to kisses, coins, wishes, sex in a Margutta garret, anguished farewell and unlikely return.

The textual manipulation again underpins the notion of a filmic image of Rome aimed at Western markets in the search for an ideologically acceptable postwar Italy. A Rome centred on a sexualized Trevi as conveyed by Rascel is sanitized by the replacement of an Americanized political narrative aimed at wider audiences: a song with a happy ending and without any intrusive ambiguities of a meeting at the Fountain followed by a lover's grieving. By interpreting the story as love leading to marriage it denies the Rascel Trevi a presence and turns it into a significant political absence. In the mid-twentieth century era of peak cinema attendances the American version promoted a

Dir. by Roy Rowland (MGM, 1958). Lanza sings on numerous Internet sites.

\_

Episode 5, Series 5, script by Spike Milligan, BBC Radio, 26 October 1954. <a href="http://www.thegoonshow.net/scripts">http://www.thegoonshow.net/scripts</a> show.asp> [accessed 1 November 2013]

Figure [57], Illustrations Booklet; parallel Italian and English versions.

city of love, marriage and tourist destination. <sup>131</sup> In La dolce vita Marcello and Sylvia dance at the night club to the score of 'Arrivederci Roma'. Fellini has Marcello undermine the sense of Rascel's lover by speaking his wishes in Italian to the uncomprehending Sylvia: that the sexually challenging star goes home. Her incomprehension is another 'curtain call' for their failed relationship in the Trevi scene.

Travelling transculturally and intermedially with their American-inflected narratives, 'Arrivederci Roma' and 'Three Coins' now circulate online as digital fragments in video clips of crooners performing live or backed by photographs and in simulations, parodies, and pastiches distanced digitally from the early songs. The music texts travel across auditory media, possibly without Fountain or films having been heard of or seen, in differing commercial contexts determined by Internet servers and users. The inter-correlations of memory and technology evolve according to new ideologies and music becomes available as a commodity seemingly with or without its originating context, partially remembered and partially forgotten.

#### 5.2.3 Musical Intertexts and Unsung Memory

In the following examples of music compositions from film in which the Trevi appears, borrowed or plagiarised sources interweave the memory traces of earlier musical phrases, including those of song. They invite postmodernist and poststructuralist notions that originality is impossible. For La Fontana di Trevi (1941), Masetti's sharp-edged style hosts multiple orientations. 132 These include a hint of Luigi Dallapiccola's modernism, Alfredo Casella's symphonic 'fascist hymn' style that employs phrases from Fratelli d'Italia and Ottorino Respighi's later work: his earlier orchestral score, La fontana di Trevi al mattino also expresses the sound of crashing water. 133 The motif in Masetti's loud opening horn solo for *La Fontana di Trevi* is repeated soon afterwards and remembered in fainter notes from the cor anglais (alto oboe) as the film ends. The arrangement permeates the visual images and dialogue with representations of fascist tenets: powerful movement and noise which are challenged by contrasting images of stillness and near silence. As observed previously, an interpretation of the portrayal is the foreshadowing of the implosion of fascism. The music of varying pitches intensifies

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>131</sup> See Wagstaff on cinema attendance, 'Italy in the Postwar', in *Cold War*, pp. 89-115.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>132</sup> Analysis assisted by Ben Earle, Department of Music, University of Birmingham (September, 2011).

Alfredo Casella was fascism's official leading composer. See Roberto Illiano, *Italian Music* during the Fascist Period (Tornhout: Brepols, 2004), p. 37. Casella's Elegia eroica, Symphony No. 3 (1916), references musical phrases from the national anthem. La fontana di Trevi al mattino is from Ottorino Respighi's Fontane di Roma (1916).

the contradictions in using the filmed Fountain as an intended conduit for fascist ideology.

Nino Rota's music for Fellini's Fountain scene, seemingly without song, reverberates with layered memory traces. Rota was one of the most prolific composers of film music, providing scores for *The Godfather* Parts One and Two, Visconti's *The Leopard*, Zeffirelli's *Shakespeare* and most of Fellini's films.<sup>134</sup> He was often accused of plagiarism, as for the main *La dolce vita* theme that echoes Respighi's *Pini presso una catacomba* from his *Pini di Roma* (1924).<sup>135</sup> His secondary theme as for the Fountain scene is reworked from 'Die Moritat von Mackie Messer' ['Mack the Knife'], a song in Kurt Weill and Berthold Brecht's *Der Dreigroschenoper* [*The Threepenny Opera*], (1928).<sup>136</sup> The *Opera* is itself an adaptation of John Gay's *The Beggar's Opera* (1728) set to music by Johann Christoph Pepusch and based on popular and traditional sources.<sup>137</sup>

'Mack the Knife' crossed into European and American popular memory with recordings made by famous artists who lent glamour to the violent narrative of the written score. Before *La dolce vita* (1960) these included Louis Armstrong, Bing Crosby, Bobby Darin, and Weill's wife, Lotte Lenya, with a hit in Italy for Jula de Palma. The BBC banned the broadcasting of the song in 1959 for its content about blood, knives and murder. Recording artists after 1960 include Ella Fitzgerald, Eartha Kitt, Sting, and Michael Bublé. <sup>138</sup>

The four notes of the opening phrase of the score borrowed by Rota for the beginning and conclusion of Fellini's Fountain scene insinuate a motif of incompleteness that conflicts with the aural memory of completion. As the melodic development is never fulfilled, and repeated several times, the effect is one of suspense. The symbolic use of a harp, clearly audible, for the four notes appears to signify a move from real to metaphysical realms as Ekberg approaches the Fountain for her

1

Rota wrote scores for most of Fellini's films and numerous other productions. See Richard Dyer, *Nino Rota: Music, Film and Feeling* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>135</sup> M. Thomas van Order, *Listening to Fellini: Music and Meaning in Black and White* (Cranbury Farleigh: Dickinson University Press, 2009), p. 213. Also, Illiano, p. 4. <sup>136</sup> Dver. p. 168.

Pepusch entry, *Chambers Biographical Dictionary* (1986), p. 1037.

History of song on 'Everything You Wanted to Know about "Mack the Knife" '
<a href="http://www.mobydick.com/lecture">http://www.mobydick.com/lecture</a> [accessed 5 December 2013]; Paul Revoir, 'Revealed: The Less Than Shocking Classics the BBC Banned', *Daily Mail*, 17 December 2007 on <a href="http://www.dailymail.co.uk/tvshowbiz/article-502751">http://www.dailymail.co.uk/tvshowbiz/article-502751</a> [accessed 6 December 2013] (paras 13-14)

Dyer details musical content, p. 168.

performance in its mythical water. <sup>140</sup> The phrase is repeated several times then slows. The lingering fourth note has an occasional shift of key. The harp, resonating with the lure of a Siren's lyre to enter dangerous water in order to fulfil sexual desire, stops when Mastroianni succumbs to Ekberg's invitation. The muted repetition of the motif over the end of the scene when they wade through the dark, silent water suggests a return from the metaphysical to the real that advances the film's subsequent narrative of failure. The motif pervades the earlier night club scene, the party at Steiner's apartment, and orgies after the Fountain scene at the Bassano di Sutri country house and villa. Its use signifies the accumulation of negative outcomes. The images of violence cross by association from the sung narrative into Rota's score and undermine the notion of 'the sweet life'. The configuration becomes an explicit musical borrowing in the Fountain scene for Scola's *C'eravamo* to advance his own story of pending misfortune in relationships.

Some films and their orchestral scores are less known and heard by limited audiences, as for Pinto's *Trevi* (1988). The chamber music for a small ensemble by Martin Bresnick, 'Wir weben, wir weben' (1978) [We are weaving, we are weaving], uses a repeated motif of melodic and incomplete contrapuntal patterns that underlines Pinto's exploration of the multiple meanings attached to the Fountain. The score reinforces the filmic images of rhythmically changing, moving and still water, images that cannot produce final, definitive meanings. In a two way process, the layered visual imagery likewise adds to the melodic interweaving of the music.

On a final note, the auditory images of music linked to the film practices that appropriate the Trevi as a narrative device also evolve in cultural memory in correlation with the changing technologies of new power groupings. Suggestive of the unreliable revisions of personal memory, the development of digitally refurbished sound, dialogue, and music of re-mastered old films creates auditory images for pasts that are configured in contemporary contexts.

Music informs the visual imagery of a film, sometimes forming its own transcultural memory sites. When it circulates without its filmic images this creates a productive tension. Film music is heard differently by changing audiences, perhaps in new forms as fragments of memory partially but never completely disconnected from the original film, or as intertexts shaping new interpretations. The question arose earlier about sound in memory, a possible subject for further research. Some musical narratives

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>140</sup> Instruments functioning as symbols are a complex area requiring consideration of changing cultural contexts. Communication from Rachel Beckles-Willson, RHUL (email, 6 January 2014).

of the Trevi are widely heard, others are limited to smaller audiences; some circulate with, and some without, a sung narrative. Music associated with film suggests it is as unstable but also as productive of new memory as the narratives of art and literature, but capable of wider diffusion. Music promoting glamour reconfigures the gendered remembrance surrounding the Fountain, increasing its allure as a future vehicle for the illusory promises of advertising. It underpins the plasticity and attraction of the monument as an on-going host for mediatized narratives, that of music interweaving with those of design, art, literature and film. As a practice that sells, it is remembered for future advertising. The musical showpiece Fountain assists film as the showcase of consumption that allows dreams to take shape and circulate in transcultural remembrance.

# **5.3 Trevi Advertising Trevi: Placing Products in Memory**

## 5.3.1 Brand New Memory: Commercial Water Nymphs

Fountain imagery is used for advertising package holidays, cruises, and city breaks in various settings. *Rough Guide* advertisements (2011) showing six cities used the latest digital technology for twenty second mini-guides projected onto walls opposite platforms on the London Underground: a different city featured daily. <sup>141</sup> In a new subterranean location of captive viewers, the frontal Trevi image was co-opted as a metonym for Rome in another instance of the manipulation of cultural capital for the economic activities of tourism. In this sense, the Fountain has always been a conduit for brand values. It was commercially exploited as a source of income for cardinals in its new and old forms, as an international idea in design competitions, for marketing pilgrim Rome in guidebooks, by papal managers of resources who could lure money on which they depended into the city by self-endorsing their power on monuments, been sold as prints, paintings and souvenirs, and employed as a narrative device for literary marketing purposes. It is always a vehicle for the 'mentality that trades' attracted by its display potential, coin-throwing ritual and promised return to Rome – to spend more money. <sup>142</sup> In an ironic inversion of the Trevi 'return guarantee', an image of Oceanus

1

 <sup>-141 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.1.cbsoutdoor.co.uk/Global/UK/Rough Guide">http://www.1.cbsoutdoor.co.uk/Global/UK/Rough Guide</a> [accessed 24 March 2011]
 Details from CBS Outdoor UK (email, 2 March 2011). Video restricted to commercial use.
 142 The 'mentality that trades', Kearns, p. 29.

backgrounds an advertisement for a one-way air ticket to Rome. 143 In everyday street life in Rome, manifestations of the Trevi image are found in expected and unexpected locations: the door of a city tourist bus, a Telecom italia junction box and a supermarket wall showing large stills from the Fountain scene and *Totòtruffa*. Figures [58–60].

At some point in the second half of the twentieth century, many films, commercials and advertisements employed a scaled down model of the Fountain at Cinecittà studios. It is beyond the scope of the thesis to determine which productions used the model. 144 It exists, like print images of the former Trevis, in other media and in individual remembrance: 'Il modello della Fontana è tolto; è soltanto una memoria ma ... abbiamo sempre la realtà'. 145 A photograph with a film technician wading in the water may date from 1959. Figure [61]. The users of the deceptive doppelgänger Trevi gained from the illusory potential of its double by proxy. More attempts at material simulation in other geographical locations are explored later.

The narratives of advertising that manipulate the Fountain continue to resonate with the misogynist memory laid down by filmic scenes. Valentino's international photographic campaign for newspapers, magazines and television (1994) features the German international model, Claudia Schiffer, wearing his prêt à porter designs as she poses for photo shoots in La dolce vita locations. The slender Schiffer in the Fountain, wearing a black evening dress, is partnered by a 'Mastroianni' Bosnian model in a suit. The advertisement challenges the memory held by a newspaper reporter: 'La donna più bella del mondo ha sfidato il mito della Ekberg e la memoria di Federico Fellini: immersa nell'acqua della Fontana di Trevi, i capelli biondi sciolti sulle spalle e un abito nero che lasciava scoperto il celebre decolleté', and then reminds the reader of Fellini's nickname for Ekberg of 'Anitona'. 146 The iconic immersion of the Swedish star helped to promote Valentino designs by association with his own non-Italian model in new and profitable international markets, adding interpretations of style and dolce vita to that of invented glamorous Italianness. 147 Fellini's Trevi scene could be recognised and remembered as familiar in photographic images that advanced the narrative of the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>143</sup> *The Times*, 3 November 2012.

Peroni publicity (2006) claims their film unit was the second permitted to film on location since La dolce vita. <a href="http://www.eventmagazine.co.uk/features/Features">http://www.eventmagazine.co.uk/features/Features</a> storu.cfm?ID=4645> 

demise.

<sup>146 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it">http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it</a> [accessed 10 January 2012]

Gundle explores exported glamour, 'Hollywood Glamour and Mass Consumption in Postwar Italy', in Histories of Leisure (Oxford: Berg, 2002), pp. 337-57.

campaign abroad. The purchase of a Valentino black dress could buy into an imagined glamorous Rome offered by Schiffer in the Fountain, images ironically challenged by forbidden entry.

The promotional video *DolceVita* for Longines' watches of the same name (2010) is a pastiche of themes from *Three Coins* and *La dolce vita*, featuring three glamorous international bewatched female stars in fast cars failing to evade the paparazzi. 148 Kate Winslet, in a black dress, strides to the basin of Bernini's Four Rivers Fountain in the Piazza Navona. Celebrities were fêted for the video launch in Shanghai on a set of iconic Roman sites and threw coins into a mock Trevi whose replication, again for a different geographical location, served the 'mentality that trades' by promoting the sale of watches. 149 The product is described, with several shifts of meaning, as a 'horological interpretation of the gentle way of life' recalling 'one's yearning for the carefree and luxurious lifestyle' of Rome. 150 The multiple interpretations of the Trevi scatter meaning along an infinite chain of signifiers, sometimes obscurely, including aspiration, fame, sex, glamour, time, water and money as exemplified by Longines' globalized promotional event.

Fellini's Fountain scene is also reconfigured in advertising campaigns for alcoholic drinks. Peroni launched an international promotion of its premium lager for cinema, television and Internet with branded merchandise ahead of the 2006 World Cup in a black and white three-and-a-half minute pastiche of La dolce vita including four Ekberg scenes. Each *mise en scène* contains a word or product placement of 'Peroni', notably in the climactic Fountain scene when the sexual imagery of enticing female gesturing by cascading water is replaced by a phallic bottle. 151

The commercial semiotics evoke film memory of a 1960s Italianness of style, of glamour and hedonism, a connection that shifts the brand into new positioning territories for consumer aspirations in the global beer market and away from the previous code, a localized masculine one of football and motor racing. 152 The Peroni

<sup>151</sup> A full length black and white version is on

<sup>148 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.the-jewelleryeditor.com/2010/11/kate-winslet-joins-longines/">http://www.the-jewelleryeditor.com/2010/11/kate-winslet-joins-longines/</a> [accessed 2 November 20131

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>149</sup> <a href="http://www.longines.com/events/2010/Longines-Dolce-Vita-launch-event-Shanghai-20">http://www.longines.com/events/2010/Longines-Dolce-Vita-launch-event-Shanghai-20</a> [accessed 30 January 2014]
<sup>150</sup> Ibid., (paras 2 and 3)

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.youtube./com/watch?v=rYnuzTd16OY">http://www.youtube./com/watch?v=rYnuzTd16OY</a>> [accessed 17 September 2013]; a shorter colour clip on <a href="http://www.voutube.com/watch?v=KmdT5aNx511">http://www.voutube.com/watch?v=KmdT5aNx511</a> [accessed 17 September 2013]. Also 'More4', 'Channel Four News advertisement broadcast, 30 seconds (April 2006). <sup>152</sup> See Inka Crosswaite entry on Peroni's advertisement, 'Cracking Consumer Codes with Commercial Semiotics', The Encyclopaedia of Brands and Branding, Affinity Publishing, 2009.

Fountain scene employs the narrative device of night-time, again assisting the suspension of disbelief. Once more, employment of a glamorous female foreigner strengthens the brand's appeal abroad; the international South African model, Landi Swanepol in a black dress with Ekberg's stole symbolically reduced to a white sash, meeting the requirements of contemporary commodification of the slim female body.

Ekberg, wearing a black dress in a re-enactment of her 1960 appearance, attended on location as a consultant and for the advertising photo shoot, adding performances with new commercial links in film memory. The Peroni video became available on several websites in reworked versions, full length or edited, in a colour version (2007), with or without 'Mastroianni' who is sometimes edited out for the almost kiss and for leading Swanepoel out of the water. Her wide open eyes full of lager-fuelled transient promise face the camera to connect with the consumer, unlike Ekberg's closed eyelids in Fellini's scene which signify sexual unavailability. The background cascade references associations of refreshing Trevi water across the millennia for their product; the implications of failure in Fellini's scene remain only as memory traces. The ambiguities emerge again of nuances of freshness conflicting with chemically-controlled water forbidden for drinking, or entering.

Another video advertisement for cinema and Internet promoting an alcoholic beverage is *Martini Gold* (2010). <sup>154</sup> Both Peroni and Martini advertisements signify one fluid element, alcohol, by relating to another, Trevi water, and the moving signification shifts into new territory: the stories of finding water evolve into finding alcohol for consumers. In *Martini Gold*, the Italian film star, Monica Belluci, wearing a short black dress, walks towards the Fountain in opening scenes intercut with titles. The camera films from behind, as in Fellini's scene, but focuses on men by the Fountain. They turn to stare as Belluci walks round the *vascone* with the Martini bottle visible in her shoulder bag. A growing crowd of admiring men follow her through the streets. The advertisement illustrates a change from blatant sexual stereotyping up to the 1980s, of men as dominant and women sexually responding. As MacKinnon points out: 'Men are increasingly [...] objectified [...] as targets of advertising [...] men have joined women in some measure – in powerlessness.' <sup>155</sup> The Peroni and Martini advertisements

153 <a href="http://www.eventmagazine.co.uk/news/825054/">http://www.eventmagazine.co.uk/news/825054/</a> [accessed 2 November 2013]

-

Martini Gold, dir. by Jonas Åkerlund (Dolce and Gabbana, 2010) <a href="http://www.youtube./com/watch">http://www.youtube./com/watch</a> [accessed 18 May 2013] Adding 'martini gold' calls up sites.

<sup>155</sup> MacKinnon, p. 98.

demonstrate the plurality of masculinities and the complexity of the flow of male as well as female images across media.

The advertisements exploit the audiovisual cinematic Trevi by linking music and film image to make intended meaning more explicit: the international pitch of Peroni's video is strengthened by the re-recording of 'Baby It's You'. <sup>156</sup> The American inflections, both in title and content of the popular song, amplify the commercial overtones with their promise of sexual gratification. <sup>157</sup> As Belluci approaches the water in *Martini Gold* a female voice sings, 'Ami le labbra? Ami gli occhi?', with positive replies from a male voice. The text resonates with earlier film representations of the *Three Coins* women seeking to purchase love at the Fountain with their coins, in this instance a bottle of *Martini*. Like the representations of literary, filmic and fashion nymphs, the 'alcohol nymphs' of advertising serve patriarchal needs but with a new libation to commercial gods in front of the gendered statuary.

At the time of writing, the Trevi is in the early stages of another restoration and partly covered in wrapping. <sup>158</sup> The sponsor is the Fendi fashion house, owned by the multinational luxury goods conglomerate of LVMH (Louis Vuitton, Moët Hennessy). Visitors can use a walkway across the empty Fountain and a small coin-throwing facility is in place. A permanent plaque will be placed on the Fountain to record Fendi's involvement. <sup>159</sup> Their sponsorship followed an offer made in June 2012 by the manufacturer of bottled Acqua Claudia water at Lago di Bracciano when some cornice fell off the attic. The company felt the Fountain should not 'crumble' and would pay for repairs. <sup>160</sup>

The Trevi belongs to the trend of branding and advertising on iconic monuments under restoration or renovation. In Italy, wrappings of Venice's buildings have carried advertisements and logos and their illumination at night heightens the impact of sales messages. <sup>161</sup> In Rome, the colourful cover of the Moses Fountain masking the papal

\_

Recorded for Peroni by Maria Antonia and The Sapphires; released September 2006. <a href="http://www.eventmagazine.co.uk/features/Features\_storu.cfm?ID=4645">http://www.eventmagazine.co.uk/features/Features\_storu.cfm?ID=4645</a> [accessed 16 August 2007], p. 1.

An international hit by Burt Bacharach, recorded by The Shirelles (1960s), the Beatles, Carpenters, and Smith amongst many, latest release 2011.

BBC News Europe, 'Inside Rome's Trevi Fountain', article and video <a href="http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-29175316">http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-europe-29175316</a> [accessed 18 September 2014]

Lizzy Davies, 'Fendi Throws Coins in Rome's Crumbling Trevi Fountain', <a href="http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2013/jan/28/fendi-rome-trevi-fountain">http://www.guardian.co.uk/world/2013/jan/28/fendi-rome-trevi-fountain</a> [accessed 14 February 2013] (p.2). The Fendi Fountain Project is restoring other fountains.

chttp://www.roma.repubblica.it/cronaca/2012/06/13/news/fontana\_di\_trevi\_sponsor\_e\_accuse\_3711641> [accessed 5 December 2013]

Observer, World News, 3 October 2010, p. 11.

inscription in 2009 featured a bank advertisement with statistics on customer satisfaction. Figure [62]. Commercial wrappings with logos differ in their impact on memory from that generated by non-commercial ones: another possible area for research. Sponsors make their products newly visible and are not revealing monuments, in Huyssen's terms, that were previously invisible.

However, the physical presence of Trevi water continues to challenge marketable memory with its controlled impurity, corrosive tendencies, undrinkable quality, cleaning days, removal of coins and their theft. Also, attempts to dominate the Trevi commercially are challenged by collective and individual practices. Attilio Battistini offers a local view of the Fountain as suitable for a city villeggiatura on hot summer days when people gather by its water. 162 When red dye was thrown in the water to protest about the cost of the 2007 Rome Film Festival, this ostensibly political advertising by a Futurista activist knowingly used a transnationally remembered location with the potential for world-wide viewing (in pre-viral days) on the Internet. Figure [63]. The images continue to circulate as markers of contestual memory on several websites. 163 Also, Pinto used non-commercial narrative for the purposes of his academically-orientated film. When Mastroianni died in 1996, the Fountain was draped in black cloth as a sign of mourning, illuminations were dimmed and the water switched off in remembrance of the scene from La dolce vita so that the monument became a newly visible memorial in a changed colour, accompanied by flute music. 164 When Ekberg died in January, 2015, the BBC1 News obituary showed a clip of her under the Trevi cascade in Fellini's scene.

The flow of advertising associated with the Fountain indicates limitations on how far the fictional narratives of brands, with new myths propagated in fleeting images, attain their aim of creating long term memory, new connections and paths of memory that become familiar. Advertising evokes the strength of filmic memories which in their turn evoke earlier ones so that the medium simultaneously dilutes as well as strengthens them. The Trevi reaches wider and changing audiences as a transmitter for ideology, attracting new myths promulgating the narratives of late capitalism. Halbwachs's construction of group memory applies again to multinational commercial

<sup>162</sup> Battistini, p.10.

Examples on <a href="http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it">http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it</a> articles and YouTube videos.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>164</sup> Celestine Bohlen, 'Marcello Mastroianni' on

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.nytimes.com/1996/12/20/movies/marcello-mastroianni">http://www.nytimes.com/1996/12/20/movies/marcello-mastroianni</a> [accessed 2 November 2009] (para. 9). *Son et lumière* suggests a night time illusory 'wrapping'.

On branding, see Steve Goodman and Luciana Parisi, 'Machines of Memory', in *Memory*, ed. by Radstone and Schwarz, pp. 343-59 (p. 357).

consortia, like LVMH, enclosed within the worlds of their own making and invented pasts which include a commercialized Italianness. The irony of this false memory of identity again concerns the Trevi's origins in the Papal States before Unification. Its appropriations in advertising are never less than contemporaneous for promotion of an imagined Italy remembered in the present, as for the *Rough Guide* on London Underground stations. Countering the alluringly presented invitations by advertisements for travel *to* the Italy of the Trevi are the challenges by its material imitations in geographical locations devoted to consumption.

#### 5.3.2 The Fountain in the Desert: Models, Imitations, Simulacra

Several Trevis have been constructed as advertising edifices in Las Vegas but these differ from the models made for practical purposes in Rome. A wooden one by Paolo Camporese of Salvi's design was a construction aide. The Cinecittà studio model exists only as images in film and individual memory. Plaster cast souvenirs for sale to tourists replicate the Trevi, badly, as analogues of memory.

Caesars [sic] Palace, the Bellagio, and The Venetian are the three Italian-themed resort casinos in Vegas where 'imitation and reinvention' interplay. A large Trevi imitation stands with a water basin in front of the entrance to the Caesars Palace shopping mall. Figure [64]. The papal inscriptions of ownership are replaced by 'The Forum Shops' invitation that subscribes to the Vegas show of popular and commercial language, a system of signs of American culture and imported mythology. The mall was added to the renovated Palace in 1990, one of changing trompe l'oeil skies, airconditioned promenades with shops and restaurants, palaces in Renaissance and Baroque style, and rows of classical-style statues: a Vegas passaggio coperto for the acquisition of economic status through architectural display fronted by a Trevi.

The Vegas Trevis can be visited in real time, as can the Rome Trevi. The Internet images are available, without physically travelling, in a virtual experience that echoes the anticipatory memory of Grand Tour destinations imagined through travel literature and prints but with greater accessibility. The counter-indication of the activity is that the more it controls the creation of pasts, presents and futures, the likely outcome could be the dilution of memory and identities. As the welcoming edifice to step inside

Las Vegas <a href="http://www.worldof.stock.com">http://www.worldof.stock.com</a> ID ASC1912> [accessed 31 October 2013]. Vegas developed from a gambling city into America's main resort for casinos and family-orientated theme parks.

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>166</sup> Giovanna Franci, *Dreaming of Italy: Las Vegas and the Virtual Grand Tour* (Reno & Las Vegas: University of Nevada Press, 2005), p. 19.

the commercial fantasy of Caesars Palace mall, on location or on screen, the imitation Trevi is intended to encourage spending whilst it simultaneously informs an invented Italianness of the classical and 'the sweet life', an ephemeral identity to be tapped into globally.

The arrival of another imitation Trevi further strengthens the notion of Italianness that took root in Vegas. Made in Italy, it was installed in 2010 inside one of Fendi's city stores. The scaled down model was shipped to 'its home in CityCenter's high-end retail property' and was claimed 'to herald a truly Italian shopping experience'. A video shows the iconography limited to Oceanus with an open book at his feet displaying the 'FENDI' logo, Tritons, seahorses, Health and Fertility, with water heard flowing into the narrow basin. An etching of the monument on the store's outer wall offers an invitation to spend inside, like the welcoming Trevi at the Caesars Palace mall.

The irony of the imitations is further underlined by their deceptive performances relating to water in a city constructed in the waterless Nevada desert. Like the Rome Trevi of advertising, the intended function of the Vegas edifices is to promote aspirational dreams and not water. The desert location gives rise to further ambiguity. The Vegas Trevis are not fed by aqueducts but water from the Hoover Dam built in the 1930s during the aftermath of the Great Depression and whose water continues to be crucial in city development.<sup>171</sup>

The appropriated Trevi images advance the desert city's monetary objectives of throwing money, not into water but into gambling and spending. The imitation fountains lack the link to a piazza and their spatial relationships interweave with several commercial locations: the spaces of shopping malls as places for the everyday performances of consumption, the individual and group behaviour constitutive of memory that transmits the ideals of capitalism. A Vegas Trevi, by association with the Rome Trevi as a fantastical receptacle of coins and wishes, subscribes to American consumer aspirations so that: 'What you see is not what you get: it is what you can't

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>168</sup> Some other Italian-themed resorts are in Reno and Atlantic City; also in Japan, Macao and Dubai

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>169</sup> Sarah Feldberg, 'New Fendi store unveils own Trevi Fountain', *Las Vegas Sun*, 18 February 2010 <a href="http://www.lasvegassun.com/news/2010/feb/18new-fendi-store">http://www.lasvegassun.com/news/2010/feb/18new-fendi-store</a> [accessed 2 November 2013]

<sup>170 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nA0D41CUdVA">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=nA0D41CUdVA</a> [accessed 19 May 2013]

For 'Hoover Dam's Impact on Las Vegas', see

<sup>&</sup>lt;a href="http://www.onlinenevada.org/">http://www.onlinenevada.org/</a> hoover\_hoover\_dam\_s\_impact\_on\_las\_vegas> [accessed 2 November 2013]

get'. There is a possibility of succumbing to a dream world of aspirations and 'a triumph of fun and magical belief that results in an infantilizing aimed at producing a better consumer. Deterministic views of consumers' malleability, however, overlook individual viewing as an activity that interprets offers of fantasy and produces differing personal memories, meanings and identity in the active and social practice of remembering.

Imitations of buildings and monuments could arguably be 'new originals' and 'new destinations' for visitors who may be unaware of the Rome Trevi and the ritual of coin-throwing and wishes.<sup>174</sup> It raises the query as to 'who is imitating whom?' in Vegas's autonomous space, the self-referentiality of which invites the concept of the hyperreal and of its Trevis as simulacra. Vegas performs hyperreality as Jean Baudrillard figures it: there is no reality outside the copies completely detached from their originals.<sup>175</sup> A Vegas Trevi might qualify as his 'perfect simulacrum – that of the immanence and material transcription' of American dreams.<sup>176</sup> In these terms, a Trevi simulacrum is a giant copy montage in the service of consumerism and completely detached from the Rome Trevi. Umberto Eco points out that the hardest part is defining the original whereas for Baudrillard there is no link.<sup>177</sup> Stephanie Hom suggests that Italy may be predisposed to simulacral reproduction because its images further the appropriation of new imperial grandeur in the market place.<sup>178</sup>

The inference that the imitation Trevis are simulacra offers a perception of an iconic edifice as a global commodity that can never be the original: a Vegas Trevi is not the Trevi Fountain. Yet it would not have achieved a material transcription without the intermedial illusory images of the Rome monument circulating in transcultural memory. These would attract power groups of Vegas designers as suitable for commercial exploitation. The issue remains over the link with the original Trevi, without which there could be no imitation; it intimates there can only be a partial detachment. The

1 '

Russell Belk, 'Three Coins in a Caesar's Palace Fountain: Interpreting Las Vegas', 25, *Advances in Consumer Research*, 25, 1998, 7-9 (p.7).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>173</sup> Ibid., p. 8.

Franci discusses new originals and destinations, p. 21.

Jean Baudrillard, in his postmodern phase, *America*, trans. by Chris Turner (London and New York: Verso, 1989), p. 28. Also, see 'Simulacra and Simulations', in *Jean Baudrillard*, *Selected Writings*, ed. by Mark Poster (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1998), pp. 166-84. Baudrillard, *America*, p. 28.

Umberto Eco, *Travels in Hyperreality* (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1986).

Stephanie Malia Hom, 'Italy without Borders: Simulacra, Tourism, Suburbi, and the New Grand Tour', in Italian Studies, 65, 3 (2010), 376-97 (p. 377).

concept of a simulacrum sits uneasily in relation to theories of memory by suggesting a closing down of interpretive and inventive possibilities and denying their continuity.

Issues arise too about whether an imitation may be recognized as a Trevi because of poor replication or become a nameless classical referent of luxury in keeping with the surrounding architecture. As LaCapra puts it, the ways of construing the past have far-reaching political and ethical issues because diverse cultural forms, including monuments, in turn shape our perceptions of the future. Poorly-executed imitations facilitate false and uncertain memory of the images they seek to copy. In the Epcot *Italy Pavilion* of the Walt Disney World Resort in Florida (2013) the representation of Rome offers a fountain with a couple of columns, a central arch containing a Neptune statue with trident, two dolphins on rockwork, and a small water basin with a flower pot either end. There is no female statuary. It is an ironic reflection of Baudrillard's choice of Disneyland to exemplify simulacra and hyperreality. Wikipedia describes the fountain with its Neptune statue as 'reminiscent of Rome's Trevi Fountain' and unreliably titles its photograph, with some gender confusion, as 'Venus Fountain', an apposite illustration of re-imaging by the title.

Where papal imperial ideology failed to maintain its intended meanings for posterity in the design aesthetics of the Trevi, Vegas consumerism presently succeeds in shaping Trevis according to its hegemonic political ideals. The imitation fountains in the gambling resort city of the Nevada Desert contribute to the 'everyday practices of power covered up by a patina of leisure' with control of movement, closed circuit television and security guards. Is In this respect of covert political intentions, the idea of the Trevi has always been used to convey narratives of power masked by fantasy. The electronic images of the Vegas Trevis when viewed on a screen are another layer of imitation on the already imitated. Diverse gazes of spectators are brought to bear on the monuments whose meanings change in the forging of personal memory. The Fountain is constantly reconfiguring in cultural memory but shifts differently and more rapidly when mediated by the Internet.

LaCapra, *Writing History*, p. xi.
Baudrillard, 'Simulacra', p. 172.

<sup>182</sup> Hom, p. 396.

\_

<sup>181 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Italy\_Epcot">http://www.en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Italy\_Epcot</a> [accessed 2 November 2013]

# 5.4 Cyberspace Trevi: In Memoriam Perpetuam?

#### 5.4.1 Digital Memory: Remainders and Fragments

In seeking to answer how 'digital' and 'memory' combine and recently enter the field of memory studies, Anna Reading suggests that its epistemological origins lie in medical discourse, mathematical treatises and musical terms. The term 'digital memory' emerges from marginal discourse about computer processing in the 1950s and 1960s to become commonplace. It moves from analogue to digital electronics, enters popular leisure discourse in the 1990s and then becomes a field of research. In digital memory research, attention focuses on defining a new relationship between media and memory. Andrew Hoskins refers to 'mediatisation' as the impact of digital electronics upon processes of social change: 'so that everyday life is increasingly embedded in the mediascape', resulting, he says, in a 'new ubiquitous mediatised past, literally a "new memory" '. This does not account for the differential reception and consumption of digital media but does point to an issue about variations in the transmission of memory compared to other media.

One of many metaphors for the Internet is as a cybernetic archive of the past, of stored memory waiting to be uploaded and downloaded. As Parisi and Goodman observe, the metaphor can be expanded to include present and future archives but the storing of cultural memory in digital devices does not predetermine the present; the past co-exists as a potential of the present and future. One area for attention here is the acceleration of remembering and forgetting as images fragment, multiply and partially disconnect from their sources. Another area, which has implications for future memory, concerns the ostensibly innovative and democratizing medium of the Internet. This links to the convergence of media if understood as a continuing process or series of interactions between different media systems, not a convergence implying fixed relationships or merging ones. 187

Anna Reading, 'The Dynamics of Zero: On Digital Memories of Mars and the Human Foetus in the Globital Memory Field', *ESSACHESS*, *Journal for Communication Studies*, 5, 2 (10), (2012), 21-44 (p. 29).

Andrew Hoskins, 'The Mediatisation of Memory', in *Save As ... Digital Memories*, ed. by

Andrew Hoskins, 'The Mediatisation of Memory', in *Save As ... Digital Memories*, ed. by Joanne Gard-Hansen, Hoskins and Reading (Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009), pp. 27-43 (p. 14).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>185</sup> Ibid., p. 29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>186</sup> Goodman and Parisi, pp. 343-59 (pp. 345, 352, 358).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>187</sup> Jenkins, Glossary, p. 322.

References to proliferating images online recalls Calvino's pre-Internet description of 'la civiltà dell'immagine': 'La memoria è ricoperta da strati di frantumi d'immagini come un deposito di spazzatura, dove è sempre più difficile che una figura tra le tante riesca ad acquistare rilievo. '188 Some images may acquire a brief *rilievo* from the *spazzatura* like those of the red Trevi (2007) before their multiplication arguably dilutes the impact. The relationship with images changes, observes Burgin, so that from a western world in which images were once limited in number, circumscribed in meaning, and contemplated at length, society is now inundated with images. 189 The alternative argument is that the Internet does have a democratizing effect in that restricted ownership and lengthy contemplation are elitist privileges.

Events may be broadcast simultaneously and repetitively, sometimes achieving viral transmission when driven by the technology of social media. There is a new collective memory of electronically told individual stories, for example, the coin throwing performance at the Trevi is transmitted on personal devices, social networking sites and as photographs and videos on numerous websites such as Flickr, YouTube and Facebook. The Fountain is increasingly located in this mediascape. File sharing systems, according to Hoskins: 'mesh the private and the public into an immediate and intensely visual auditory present past' giving rise to 'digital network memory'. 190 There is acceleration of remembering with the recent past represented as memory as soon as it is lived and of forgetting through intentional or accidental deletion, or lack of interest.

Images that go straight on line differ from those first held in analogue form. The latter exist in other media before their second hand borrowing for the formatting required by websites – a thesis acquires a digital presence in a data base. In contrast to social media and video images generated on the Internet, others, like the Piranesi vedute, are remediated by digitized archives. They can go from analogue to digital and return to analogue as when downloading and printing a *veduta*. The Internet itself does not act as an archivist of material but as the network provider of images selected by the database compiler for requirements such as research, demonstrated by the selection of near forgotten Fountain films in the Cinecittà Luce archives and on the Europeana database. These images circulate with the longevity of their afterlives determined by commercially driven considerations and database formatting. The Internet acts as the

<sup>190</sup> Hoskins, p. 92.

 $<sup>^{188}\,</sup>$  Calvino, 'Visibilità', Lezioni americane: sei proposte per il prossimo millennio (Milano: Garzanti, 1989), pp. 91-92.

Burgin, In/Different Spaces: Place and Memory in Visual Culture (Berkeley, California: University of California Press, 1996), pp. 117-21.

largest memory *deposito di spazzatura* in the repetitive re-presentation and accumulation of similar images, indicative of a memorialising that accelerates forgetting; cyberspace begins to resemble a digital dump *in memoriam perpetuam*.

The ephemerality of the digital is a narrative construct employed across academic disciplines and in the field of memory studies. As an example, Huyssen observes that the digital images of the wrapped Reichstag are: 'symptomatic of the likely fate of the monumental in our postmodern times: it has migrated from the real into the image, from the material into the immaterial, and ultimately into the digitized computer bank. 191 The notion of the convergence of existing and new media in an increasingly digital world also contributes to this narrative of ephemerality: 'digitization set the conditions for convergence.' 192 Alternatively, Jennifer Gabrys points to the unseen materiality of 'digital rubbish' in the vast number of physical remainders of electronics and to the screen interfaces that apparently lack material form yet possess a highly toxic presence in their considerable e-waste generated by production, disposable technology and constant upgrading. 193 A difference between digital and other media is the associated narratives of ephemerality of the former that produce a technological imaginary, of virtuality and transient data. The narratives elide the underlying materiality of production behind an apparently ephemeral screen as well as the vested economic interests whose ideology masks surrounding issues. 194

Trevi images could be said to lie in the remainders of obsolete e-waste but also in the detritus produced by the technologies of other media, like the unusable Piranesi copperplates and long-vanished woodcuts. In other words, all media leave a trail of material waste. However, images have afterlives in other media and the complex relations in the convergence of media and emergence of new technologies is productive of Trevi imagery previously lying within one medium.

The implications for cultural memory are again those of the persistence of dominant political systems and ownership of rapidly changing technology. The development of electronics allows for continually emergent forms of digital memory but may close access to images. The technical equipment necessary for their recovery may become redundant, or specialized, resulting from changes in computer hardware and software in a culture of replacement rather than repair and adaptation. Circulating

<sup>194</sup> Gybras, pp. 45-71.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>191</sup> Huyssen, 'Monumental Seduction', pp. 205-06.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>192</sup> Jenkins, p. 11.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>193</sup> See Jennifer Gybras, *Digital Rubbish: A Natural History of Electronics* (Michigan: The University of Michigan Press, 2011).

images are reliant on the capacity of databases for reformatting, updating, and continuing readability on new platforms. Arguably, closing down of access shapes new memory: Piranesi's Trevi *vedute* are available from his copperplates in online databases and brightly enhanced on commercial websites. There is are new auras in digitized prints on screen observable in the Paterson illustration (1873) of a man sipping water from a woman's hand at the Trevi and in its marketed form as a print. However, spatial constraints of the thesis limit further discussion of the inferences for memory of these technical processes. Figure [29]. The analogue and digital occupy different memory spaces.

Art and literary texts are increasingly available from online databases: Piranesi's vedute, Staël's Fountain scene in French, and the 'Three Coins' and 'Arrivederci' songs. Fellini's Fountain scene as cinematic memory fragments, often as stills, suggests detachment from the film. Applying Burgin's comments on film to the Internet, a sequence can break apart into proliferating fragments of simultaneous sameness and difference and enter into new combinations. 195 The online reconfiguration of his scene using the City Hall Park Fountain in Manhattan for Michael Lucas' La Dolce Vita is available as a promotional video clip but has limited capacity for parody and pastiche, unlike the extensive borrowings of the Fellini scene. Trevi narratives have never been binding but constantly evolving. Their digitization is, however, more challenging to place theoretically in terms of inventiveness and renewal.

Fountain scenes as fragments often mask commercial endeavour: the introductory invitation to purchase the download of a film or a product subscribing to the employment of cultural capital that permeates the expanding online market place. The exploitation of the Trevi in the interests of economic benefit continues. In the Internet medium it reaches its widest, most diverse audience yet. However, the ostensible democratization in terms of increasing accessibility occurs within the dominant system of late capitalism containing groups of Web servers who provide the Internet medium. It is within the context of their commercially-driven frameworks that viewers are offered, and make, choices. The activity arguably counter-balances, in part, the political domination of digital memory in the public domain but collective consumer power is quick to form and also dissipate.

Individual viewing extends the range of possibilities for reconfiguring the narratives of cinema online. The episodic viewing of selected fragments measured by

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>195</sup> Burgin, *Film*, pp. 67-68, 109.

individual hits interweaves collectively with those of other viewers. The Fountain scene can be accessed independently of the film and is often reworked by editing on numerous sites. The text slips out of its filmic context and changes meaning in the digital one. The *Three Coins* Fountain scenes appear in compilations, famous voices sing 'Three Coins', and videos and pastiches mimic them often with a rearranged score. <sup>196</sup> The key difference between an Internet fragment of Fellini's scene and, for example, its borrowing as an insert for Pinto's *Trevi* or referencing in Scola's *C'eravamo* is that these practices further narrative intent.

The disturbance of linear time by the exercise of choice in viewing activity destabilizes the filmmaker's intentions for posterity: 'layers of memory are stratified into achronological time.'197 The viewing of the Fellini Fountain scene online reflects technological practices allowing for selection, such as a DVD menu, re-viewing previous scenes or fast-forwarding to future ones: practices which build on earlier CD and tape-recording technology. The online viewer is in control when countermanding narrative chronologies by exercising preferences and the choice for the individual remembering and forgetting palette is widened whilst being narrowed. The key technical difference in watching the Fellini Fountain scene online is its loss of anchorage within the film so it becomes atextual rather than intertextual and arguably more quickly forgotten. The performance of the spectator at the screen may determine the future of the text through an online presence with the viewing hit. The least visited sites might be removed by a server but continue in digital memory and therefore posted in another form of *Nachleben*. Other sites vanish and close down personal memory although may be retained electronically by the Internet server, or in downloads or individual memory – perhaps as memory traces in theses' footnotes. <sup>198</sup>

The individual performance of the everyday ritual of coin-throwing in the practiced place of the Piazza is remediated by smart phone technology. *YouTube* posts hundreds of videos under 'Trevi Fountain'. A necessarily random selection showed groups of people, Fellini's scene, coin throwing and mobile phone users. Other clips showed a drunken man wading in, a woman sweeping coins into a bucket, weddings, the *Trevi rossa* event and a performance by Lisa Minnelli. Cercelletta, the coin thief, featured on several videos protesting about his rights and self-mutilating on the

\_\_\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>196</sup> Thirty six Doris Day tributes were on <uk.video. search.yahoo.com> [accessed 2 November 2013]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>197</sup> Discussed by Goodman and Parisi, pp. 343-59 (p. 343).

Many sites accessed during thesis research disappeared, shifted about or changed addresses.

<sup>199 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch">http://www.youtube.com/watch</a> [accessed 2 November 2013] (video results section)

rockwork. The keywords 'bagno trevi' produced numerous videos of people bathing, a nude swimmer, Fellini's scene, group dips, and crowds in the water after football matches. Video titles grouped together in a menu of clips, like the Fountain scenes, indicate that website designers, like film directors, may determine 'what people must remember having been', <sup>200</sup> although the website content unlike film has been contributed to by individuals.

#### 5.4.2 Future Perfect Promises of Advertising: The Internet Trevi

The romance, glamour and popular song surrounding the Trevi expand its attraction as a conduit of sound and image for the audiovisual commercial narratives of the mass mediated twenty-first century and especially for Internet advertising. The Peroni campaign (2006) developed a themed website page with 'an immersive interface' using their Fountain scene, with rotating text links including a desktop background from the scene and to Peroni products. <sup>201</sup> Two other videos sampled promote the music associations of the Trevi. An album by Peter Andre and Katie Price Jordan loosely references La dolce vita and implies the presence of the Fountain in one of the stylistically postmodern scenes of disjointed *mise en scène* sets using water. It promotes the impossibility of definitive meanings whilst failing to mask the definite intent to sell. 202 Bon Jovi's *Thank You for Loving Me* (2000) has the singer performing by the Trevi, the song inducing the themes from 'Three Coins' and 'Arrivederci Rome'. 203 Couples kiss, throw coins and there is a wedding. The artificial-looking monument may demonstrate the procedure of adding backgrounds from film archives and the digitized Trevi, like the earlier Cinecittà studio model, becomes a deceptive copy for hosting the aspirational promises of advertising.

The intertext of the Trevi as Baroque from art historiography frequently shapes Internet holiday advertisements. Future remembrance activated by the power of suggestion offers experiences before any actualization similar to the anticipatory memories mediated by Grand Tour prints. The advertising indicates new economic groupings for products purchased on screen. An example from an Internet travel agency promotes fast, cheap travel and the 'Top Ten Things to do in Rome for Frugal

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>200</sup> Foucault, 'Film', p. 123.

<sup>201 &</sup>lt; http://www.digitmag.co.uk/features/index.cfm?FeatureID=1460> [accessed 3 June 2007]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>202</sup> 'A Whole New World: The Sweet Life' <a href="http://www.it.youtube./com/watch?">http://www.it.youtube./com/watch?>[accessed]

<sup>21</sup> October 2008]. Made before the couple notoriously separated.

<sup>203 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.youtube./com/watch">http://www.youtube./com/watch> [accessed 22 September 2011]

Travelers'. Number Four suggests: 'Free up your Wanderlust: Pitch Three Coins into the Trevi Fountain – Gawk at Nicola Salvi's late Baroque waterworks influenced by an earlier try by Bernini'. The vernacular language of the imperatively-worded sentence seeks to capture attention quickly and masks the pitch for future custom. The coin ritual melds with *Three Coins*, the song, a Baroque aesthetic and Salvi and Bernini in multiple layers of unreliable memory. The advertisement offers a coin performance similar to the double past-futurity promised by guidebooks: a memory offered of what has not happened that anticipates another memory of returning to the Rome not yet visited.

The illusory aspects of the Trevi as Baroque are expanded by online advertising. Thousands of websites result from key wording 'baroque trevi fountain hotels', necessarily sampled here from a few pages. One site blended imagery of empire, legend and art when describing the Trevi location as: 'inspired by victory arches and Roman mythology, in pure baroque style'. 205 The topographical link is often tenuous. 'Our hotels are near the Trevi [...] one of the jewels of the Baroque', claimed a hotel chain with only one hotel nearby. 206 The visitor in 2010 to the English website of the Hotel Fontana opposite the Trevi was offered the 'Fountain's Baroque splendour' and 'its magic from a viewpoint most visitors to Rome do not see', provided they stayed four nights. 207 The advertisement moves the viewer, and potential guest, from collective public space to individual private elitism, a future experience whether staying or not. One photograph with a bottle of wine in a cooler in front of a window shows a sunlit Oceanus through the draped curtains. Figure [65]. Consumption of Trevi views is offered with breakfast in the top floor restaurant. The Italian pages omit il barocco and reference La dolce vita; Ekberg in the Fountain is co-opted for marketing Rome to Italians as a 'sweet life' city. The English pages target viewers with images of a Baroque Trevi metonymic for Rome/Italy. The contrasting authorial voices reflect choices made in manipulating memory for transnational consumption.

The Internet offers a 'Cyber Grand Tour' of Rome for sedentary screen travellers. The online tourist can pass swiftly through an imagined Rome of sites linked to accommodation offers for which the Baroque Trevi is used as a sales promoter. Related advertisements appear on the screen margins as unsolicited digital memory

21

<sup>204 &</sup>lt; http://www.goeurope.about.com/cs/rome/a/rome\_free.htm> [accessed 2 November 2013]

<sup>205 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.tritonehotel.com">http://www.tritonehotel.com</a> [accessed 2 November 2013]

<sup>206 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.leonardihotels.com"> [accessed 9 March 2010]. In 2013, this became 'close to the ancient heart of the eternal city', captioned over a Trevi image.

<sup>207 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.hotelfontana-trevi.com"> [accessed 20 May 2010]. In 2013 the new website (2013) briefly mentioned baroque in Italian and English.

traces seeking future economic activity. The intertwined ingredients laid down in cultural memory of Trevi romance and glamour merge with Baroque fantasy in selling future perfect accommodation, with any subsequent enactment of a decision to travel implying an economic status making this possible.

#### 5.4.3 Cyber Wishes

Since the late nineteenth century the Fountain has occupied a place in individual and collective memory of symbolic wishing in the performance of coin-throwing, a ritual detailed in Chapter One, of adapting the millennial 'ruse' of throwing objects into water to influence future outcomes. Images of the individual or group enactment can now be transmitted cybernetically so that, expanding on Certeau, the remembered act of votive offering continues as an on-going process of adaptation by individuals according to the prevailing electronic constraints of modernity, which include the Internet. <sup>208</sup> Coin performances at fountains and water sources are adapted worldwide in the inventive practices of the global everyday and on social media; simultaneously a loss of hegemony for the Trevi but a transmission of its traces in a new digitized collective imaginary.

Some cybernetic inventions of everyday performance may be quickly forgotten. The superabundance of websites on the *lucchetti d'amore* ritual included one for the lovesick cyberspace traveller: 'If you're not planning a trip to Rome but still want to declare your love, you can attach a virtual lock to the virtual Ponte Milvio'.<sup>209</sup> The virtual key could be thrown into a virtual Tiber, its padlock evading the removal of physical ones. The website risked losing all its padlocks when another site deemed the unpopular Internet performance as physically unsatisfactory and a cause of the ritual physically appearing at the Trevi.<sup>210</sup> In 2009 'real' padlocks were multiplying on the church railings nearby. Figure [30]. Jay Winter claims that websites seem as transitory as the groups of individuals who create, sustain and relate them to their networks of social life, a perception however lending support to narratives of the digital as ephemeral.<sup>211</sup> The ritual of locking a digital padlock with the click of a mouse presumably lacked the tactile and auditory satisfaction of throwing objects into flowing water. Sturken's observation is relevant again, that cultural meaning does not reside

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>208</sup> Certeau, p. 41.

<sup>209 &</sup>lt;a href="http://www.eternallycool.net/?p=373">http://www.eternallycool.net/?p=373</a> [accessed 15 January 2009]

No More "Locks of Love" '< http://www.eukn.org/news> [accessed 27 May 2009] and
 http://www.spiegel.de/international/zeitgeist/omnia-vincit-amor> [accessed 2 November 2013]
 Jay Winter discusses transitory aspects, 'Sites of Memory', in *Memory*, pp. 312-24 (p. 324).

with the text of a particular object but is produced in an act of consumption, when the viewer engages with the meaning of the text: 'Memory is a social and individual practice that integrates elements of remembrance, fantasy, and invention.' <sup>212</sup> Cyberwishing could not provide such integration.

Questions continue to arise here about renewal and inventiveness of cultural memory in the Internet medium and the dominant systems of late capitalism that seek to control it. Circulating fragments of Fountain images in cyberspace often appear to be cultural indicators of replication and not difference: repetitive memory contingent on commercial activities that borrows and dilutes but does not lend to nor interweave with other mediated narratives. The implications for the digital Trevi are wide-ranging. Its remembered associations with power, glamour, illusion, romance, and ambiguous outcomes may be increasingly emptied of significance whilst it simultaneously continues to be used as a widely mediated vehicle for the narratives of multinational commodification due to the potency of these associations.<sup>213</sup>

The similarities and differences across the narratives of film, music, advertising, and Internet and their links to those of art and literature reflect Rigney's words in the opening epigraph to this chapter: memory practices 'react to, build on, and bounce off one another' as narratives circulate across media. 214 The Internet medium raises doubts about the continuation of these dynamic processes, doubts partly answered by acknowledging that new media technologies enable the content of old media, that had their own distinct markets, to flow through many different channels.<sup>215</sup>

Popular postwar films and their songs appropriated the Fountain as a key narrative device to promulgate a forgetting of fascism. Fellini's Fountain scene significantly adds further gendered connotations of glamour and is subsequently used as the trope of a film within a film or is intertextually referenced. These practices make the Trevi increasingly attractive as a commodified host for late capitalist ideologies. The

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>212</sup> Sturken, pp. 258, 259.

An example of multiple borrowings and dilution, in analogue newspaper and online format: 'La Dolcelatte: Gorgeous blonde bird eats blue-veined Italian soft cheese in a fountain', in 'How to get ahead in Christmas advertising', Giles Coren, *The Times*, 16 November 2013, p. 22. <sup>214</sup> Rigney, 'All This Happened', p. 6.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>215</sup> Jenkins, p. 10.

slippery signifiers multiply: in addition to film, the narratives of glamour, music, and song enhance reconfigurations that convey the sexualized narratives of advertising. The Fountain is always sought after as a conduit for the expression of hegemonic ideologies by powerful groups sharing social frameworks of memory, from popes to artists to writers to film directors and advertisers. New patrons have different political myths to disseminate; the idea of the Trevi is promoted in diverse geographical locations as a metonym for Rome/Italy. Whilst the monument masks the power of ideological systems it remains a channel for non-consensual memory, like the *Trevi rossa* event.

The imagery of the Trevi is constantly updated and reshaped in the contemporary resonant moment. A key shift in this production centres on the Internet medium and the acceleration of remembering and forgetting through the partial disconnections of images in converging multi-medial sources. Repetitions with minor variations underscore commercial persuasion on how to remember the past – a Rome with a 'sweet life' Trevi. In digitized form, its fragmentary images slip out of context and circulate with their originating traces often obscured. The implications are those of dilution of memory and identification of the Trevi as the Trevi, resulting from the repetitive outcomes of digitization. Also, the rapid development of electronics and concomitant fossilization of its technology can lock away imagery. A future Internet Trevi could become an anonymous iconic edifice with a tenuous, but commercially useful, remembered link to glamour. Whilst such a Trevi might exist only in cypberspace, the materiality of its presences should not be overlooked as the source of its imagery, nor the associated narratives of digital ephemerality that mask the underlying toxicity of e-waste and political materiality of the Internet.

Nonetheless, there is increased accessibility to second hand Internet Fountain imagery sourced across diverse viewing channels, of art, literature, film and music, imagery whose diffusion is limited in analogue forms. The Fountain belongs to a discourse in the digital mediascape. Memory in digital form on social media and on websites for retention or deletion foregrounds the circularity of the productive interweaving of personal and public memorial dimensions. The concept of memory as an inventive social practice has been maintained throughout the thesis and both the challenges and the opportunities that the Internet medium poses for this practice are addressed again in the Conclusion.

## Conclusion

The Trevi Fountain is always more than it seems yet less stable than its material presence suggests. Diverse manifestations of the monument's imagery flow across converging and interacting media – art, literature, film, music, advertising and the Internet – from Frontinus's writings about a temple and a young girl at a water source, to digital fragments in cyberspace. The Fountain's place in the popular imagination detracts critical attention from the powerful agency invested in it as a conduit for political memory, and from the transcultural narratives engaging with its images.

The idea of the Fountain continually attracts the discourses of ideologies from the papal to late capitalist which underlie the representations of this apparently populist edifice: political discourses related to, building on, and reshaping the remembered myths and stories surrounding its water. Sometimes the Trevi becomes a contestual or ambiguous site and these challenges to intended meanings that seek to control future memory are, in turn, productive of new memory. The hegemonic usage of power is undermined by vernacular protest in contra flows of memory, such as the dislike for Bernini's demolition plans, Benaglia's criticized Fountain project and, more recently, the *Trevi rossa* protest and Cercelletta's demonstrations on the rockwork.

The Fountain as a metaphor can be likened, as above, to a conduit and similarly to a vehicle, carrier, host, transmitter or channel for flows of transcultural memory but it opens up further metaphorical uses. It is a critical lens providing a focus on the fluid production and movement of memory, showing how groups like Trevi designers and papal patrons share political and social frameworks of memory. The premises of power and performance in the production of memory build throughout this thesis to take account of the present global groupings of commercial power that include Fendi, the 2015 restorer of the Trevi and part of an international conglomerate.

The flexible conceptual framework established in Chapter Two emphasizes the multivalency of the Fountain and its water: a moving signifier of indeterminate and infinite meanings. Near convergences and divergences allow for hybrid theoretical possibilities. In this inventively shifting landscape of approaches that move around, the processes of remembering are themselves brought into new configurations. Memory is always fissile and the study of the Trevi as a research subject for the thesis reflects back this feature and adds political insights. The consumption of its images is a research area to which Appendix One makes a necessarily limited contribution and in which it is

noted that that interviewees selectively choose memories and seek to discard others which, however, remain partially remembered and partially forgotten.

The Fountain is also a vehicle for the narratives of memory studies and their investigation; it is used here to draw attention, for example, to the current theoretical emphasis on memory as a transcultural process. The contrasting efforts in academic communities to seek theoretical positionings are suggestive in themselves of the uncertain nature of the subject being researched. In recent years the term 'cultural memory' has emerged as an overarching term for the complex ways in which societies and individuals produce their pasts, presents and futures. The focus is on the dynamic processes by which memories become shared, consumed and carried forward. Common threads of contemporary research are those of memory as a social practice both active and inventive and of pasts shaped in the present, in other words, by the multiple practices of memory. Often the social dimension can be overemphasized at the cost of the political, and this research seeks to address the latter omission by drawing out why the Fountain is attractive to its appropriators, why it is so potent and ubiquitous – and so remembered. By using the Trevi as a critical lens, the study illustrates how its imagery travels across media, how thoughts about it already belong to weaves of discourse and how its texts and their contexts are interrelated. Also, drawing on critical approaches to the Trevi becomes another form of remembering. It reflects the active practices of memory research itself as a transcultural process.

The thesis argues there is no start or originating layer of memory although the palimpsest as a concept may often seem applicable to the representations of the Trevi explored here: that they consist of memory layers that build up, commencing with Frontinus's account of the Aqua Virgo myths. However, his writings are contingent on inventive memory processes: on what he perceives has gone before, forged in his present context of collective memory to which he adds, with implications for future memory in imaginings of the Trevi. These incorporate descriptors that enhance the narrative ingredients generated by classical writers of pure aqueduct water: of night-time, moonlight, the sound of water, its silence when not flowing, and of glamour. They increasingly inform narratives of illusion and the literary appropriations of the Trevi make it a metaphorical generator of its own fictions. Ambiguous performances surround the Fountain as if attracted by the deceptive hydraulics creating the powerful delivery of water. Popular memory carries forward notions of glamour, moonlight, romance, songs, coins, wishes, and returns to Rome but most literary ones convey danger or the absence

of glamour – Staël's prediction of doom, Hawthorne's menacing shadows, Yourcenar's life-threatening Fountain and Secondari's whore-like, silent one.

Although the Trevi has avoided the fate of silence for many monuments, including other fountains, the content of its associated narratives can be both challenging and revealing. It opens up the issue that what is carried forward in memory has ethical implications. The most challenging content, and arguably what gives the Trevi the widest scope for gendered performativity, is the on-going transmission of sexual stereotypes. Configurations of Fellini's Fountain scene make a significant contribution to misogynist advertising centred on commodification. This feeds through from the patriarchal design of the iconography but with a change of its emphasis on bodies expressing masculine power to that of eroticized, glamorous women. This aspect emerged clearly in Chapter Five on the narratives of film, music, advertising and the Internet which are marked by the intertextuality of narratives related to the Fountain across the millennia. It reflects a selling out to interests that promote sexual objectification of the body, particularly in terms of glamour, a practice that increases as its electronic representations proliferate and fragment.

The Fountain becomes a prolific nexus for its images circulating in constellations of memory. They come in and out of focus: the term 'Baroque' associated with the Trevi in art is eventually deployed to market Rome as a tourist destination. The Fountain attracts new memory-makers as manipulators of cultural capital. The physical manifestations of the imitation Trevis in Las Vegas and in real time function overtly as promoters of the myths of global late capitalism. New technologies allow the Fountain a presence in diverse geographical locations like the London Underground. The evolution of Trevi presences is increasingly shaped by the illusory practices and myths of consumerism, not only by its producers but also its receivers. Ironically, the myth of refreshing Trevi water informs advertising whilst the impurity of its material presence requires chemical control.

Above all, the thesis demonstrates that the memory surrounding the Trevi in the narrative flows of power and performance is indicative of ideology. The politically and commercially advantageous myths linked to the benefits of its water increasingly become intertextual motifs across media. Yet, following Jenkins, if this on-going process of convergence in the interaction and complex relations between old and new media does not mean uniformity, then it has the potential of creating new meanings for the Fountain.

The future implications of a digitized Trevi are raised at the end of Chapter Five about the possible dilution of the potency of its representations when compared to the renewals and intertextuality produced by analogue media. Relatively inaccessible and unknown Trevi images are increasingly available in digitized forms from online databases, as shown by the 1941 fascist film, *La fontana di Trevi*. The analogue and derivative digital forms are occupying different memory and material spaces. Many of the websites disappeared during the thesis study but left traces. A virtual tour of the Fountain and Piazza added to digital memory, possibly in downloads but also in this sentence, and the footnote below. Other sites re-emerged with new addresses, and many multiplied as borrowings from Fellini's Fountain scene in part or in whole for advertisements, DVDs and documentaries, or on social media.

The Fountain takes on new forms in its commercial appropriations. What might be the future of the online Trevi? One possibility is an e-book with sound produced as the reader's eyes scan the relevant lines: the meeting of lovers by moonlight in *Corinne* could be accompanied by the splashing sound of Trevi water – with reminders about updating the text from the online translator. The Fountain would continue as a host for appropriation by changing technologies in profit-seeking global markets. At the time of writing, the digital Trevi may portend an acceleration of remembering and forgetting by the over-production of its images. Yet such a description of transience verges on becoming a narrative of ephemerality criticized earlier for belying the materiality and ewaste underlying screens that mask the political exercise of digital power.

On a pessimistic note, the Trevi might increasingly echo Benjamin's Angel of History as another metaphor for the loss of hope: a symbol of late capitalism, the iconography trapped by gendered representations, its back to the future as it gazes on the past and the present, its coins and wishes, and on an over-abundance of sexualized and rampant consumerism, all compounded by loss of identity in the dilution of its performance in digitized representations.<sup>2</sup> The material presence of the Fountain, its chemically-treated water, the sculpted erosion of plants and columns, the internal and external deterioration of the structure, the leaking basin, and the funding of its 2015 restoration all reflect concerns about the destruction of global habitats, conservation issues and commercially-sponsored renovation.

<sup>1</sup> <a href="http://www.hotelcastellucciarome.com/ldsite/italian/vtrome/Rome\_Virtual\_Tour\_Trevi">http://www.hotelcastellucciarome.com/ldsite/italian/vtrome/Rome\_Virtual\_Tour\_Trevi</a> [accessed 15 June 2008]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Benjamin, 'On the Concept of History', trans. by Harry Zohn, in *Selected Writings*, 4, ed. by Howard Eiland and Michael W. Jennings (Cambridge Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 2003), IX, pp. 389-400.

More optimistically, if uncertainty of memory is evoked about the past, as Kuhn and Kirsten McAllister say, this 'instils hope, openness to what is yet to come: that the future is not determined by the past.' Their words echo LaCapra's, on attempting to learn from the past 'in the present in a manner that opens possible futures.' Value can be placed on the inventiveness and creativity of memory, for which the Trevi is also productive in its availability for challenging official culture. If taken as an indicator of envisioning in the present how future memory takes shape, the Fountain emphasizes the value of change that contrasts with its commercial exploitation.

Whilst it has only been possible in the available space to indicate fleetingly how an understanding of the Trevi in memory extends to other populist monuments associated with water, the strong indication is that they, too, merit critical attention as political spaces. Other previously mentioned research possibilities present themselves: Trevi images in photography, memory and water in *La dolce vita*; the *Nachleben* of footnote references in digital memory, and the wrapping and colouring of monuments that makes them newly visible in ideological terms.

The Trevi Fountain is *infinitely* more than a famous global attraction. It is made iconic by the investment of memory. It not only reveals the processes of memory but, through the prism of theories of memory theory, can also be understood as a significant vehicle for powerful institutional discourses masked by populist imagery. The appropriations of the Trevi by dominant political classes seeking to generate new myths reveal the attempted control of memory in the present by the invention of suitable pasts, with implications for future efforts that manipulation of memory may not be successful. Light is shed by a cross-disciplinary approach to the mediatized monument as a vehicle reflecting the shifting diversity and plurality of memory practices. The Trevi Fountain's flow of power and transcultural performance is mirrored in the opening epigraph; how those seeking to control memory have preferably turned to the 'shifting, indestructible, ever new, yet unchanging, upgush and downfall of water' and 'written their names in the unstable element'.

-

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Kuhn and Kirsten Emiko McAllister, in *Locating Memory: Photographic Acts*, ed. by Kuhn and McAllister (New York and Oxford: Berghahn Books, 2006), p. 15.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> LaCapra, *History in Transit*, p. 122.

# APPENDIX ONE

#### ORAL MEMORY INTERVIEWS

# Remembering the Fountain: Personal Stories

The project looks at how personal and public memories of the Trevi Fountain interweave and relates this to a key area in memory work about who consumes remembered images. The size of the project is necessarily limited by time and space constraints. A number of people had started, when they heard about the thesis subject, to share memories with me of their visit to the Fountain and this resulted in interviewing a small selection of three people. It was important methodologically to enter the memoryworld of their accounts and performance of oral remembering, not the veracity of the account, and to consider the shaping of personal pasts through the expressive practice of remembering. The project, completed in 2011, starts with two edited interviews followed by a third at greater length which are then related to theoretical perspectives in memory work. It concludes with information about formal research procedures including permission, consent, confidentiality, recording, consent and transcription.

#### **INTERVIEW ONE**

#### The Traumatic Fountain: The Tourist Who Never Was

Fiona is Australian and lives in London

Fiona has bad feelings about the Trevi. A memory from her first visit in 1993 'is attached to losing somebody and spending the *whole* of my time in Rome trying to find this person who had disappeared.' Fiona was with a group of art students back-packing round Europe. They stayed outside the city and came in one evening to see the sights:

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> An area often seen as neglected. See Wulf Kansteiner, 'Finding Meaning in Memory: A Methodological Critique of Memory Studies', History and Theory, 41(2002), 179-97.

Annette Kuhn defines memory work as: 'an active practice of remembering which takes an inquiring attitude towards the past and the activity of its (re)construction through memory. Memory work undercuts assumptions about the transparency or the authenticity of a particular sort: material for interpretation, to be interrogated, mined, for its meanings and its possibilities. [...] a conscious and purposeful staging of memory'. 'A Journey through Memory', in *Memory and Methodology*, ed. by Susannah Radstone (Oxford and New York: Berg, 2000), p. 186.

I don't recall having a guidebook but we *knew* what we had to see, I mean, I'd studied art history and I *knew* about the Trevi Fountain and everything because I did Baroque.

Her other 'remembrance' was of seeing a card or photos of the Fountain as a child:

but the other image was in the art context, I believed that was Baroque, I could *read* it was Baroque, so I had that view. [...] So I was expecting this huge fountain. I knew it was attached to a *wall*.

It was her intention to visit as an art student, not a tourist.

The student who disappeared, Leanne, remained at the Fountain whilst the others went to buy *gelati*. When they returned she had gone. 'As you know, the area itself isn't that big, the actual theatre, but we couldn't find her.' Fiona has an image of darkness round the Piazza, with the Fountain lit up. They decided to contact the Australian Embassy. The following day it made arrangements for the group to visit the Vatican Museum to take their minds off the problem. Leanne was found later. She had wandered away from the Trevi, got lost, did not know her hotel address and been cared for by a helpful local.

The Vatican visit is not associated with negative memory and the shock of loss like the Trevi. She did not want to go to the monument on further visits to Rome but eventually did. When she got to the Trevi square she had:

forgotten how small it was [...] I thought it was much larger than this and I knew that there was a wall, I knew that there was always a *wall* [...]. It's just the feeling, the sense that, it's not on a huge grand scale but it is. [...] I didn't remember how close all the shops were — I didn't recall that, recall the small side streets and the church. [...] The interesting thing is, I've never seen that in daylight. Because the second time I went to Rome I refused to go anywhere near that area.

Her first visit had been at night. This one was in daylight. [...] 'Strangely this time round I really liked Rome and we're planning to go back' but not to the 'touristy' area again near the Trevi, apart from the famous *gelateria*. This visit was on Sunday and 'most people were young Romans. You could identify tourists by their cameras.' She and her husband were the only people to throw coins, backs to the Trevi:

I'd been told when I was younger that's what you do if you throw money into a fountain. Any fountain, even wells, I was told. If you drop money into water you had to do it with your back to the water. But that was something I'd learnt as a little girl. So I did it.

#### **INTERVIEW TWO**

## Keep the Best Memory: Reject the Worst

Peter is English and lives near London

Peter was in Rome for a New Year party (2007/2008) with Roman friends. His hotel was near the Fountain and he was taken there by his friends one evening before the party. On New Year's Day he visited the Fountain in the early morning.

On the first visit, 'I could hear the Fountain playing, almost before we got there'. His friends gave an explanation of the iconography and papal history. The Piazza was crowded:

The impact was great! It looked so pristine and also, being illuminated, I think I was able to look at the intricacy of the statues. [...] So, illuminated at night, Fountain going, I think that is important. I have a mixture of visual impact and sound. I got the sound first and then the vision afterwards. And I was quite surprised -Oh, it's coming back now; I was quite surprised how much water there was.

He was given a coin to throw into the basin, which he did haphazardly without wishing, mimicking the actions of people around him. He felt that with his friends being so enthusiastic about the Trevi he was seeing it for the first time and suddenly recalled, in interview, with great surprise that he had visited thirty years ago. Trying to locate memories of this visit, he could not at first remember anything. He then said that Trevi visit was short because it did not look appealing, unlike his recent memory of light and sound. If he thinks of the Trevi now, it is the 2007 night-time image because of its 'splendour'.

When he visited alone on New Year's Day morning, the skies were overcast and the Fountain not playing. Workmen were dredging for coins. He was disappointed:

There was no sound or motion. It didn't seem the same Fountain that I was looking at. [...] The Fountain seemed naked [...] more in its natural state. [...] It's all a matter of a degree of size. I mean, the impact of the Trevi Fountain playing, it's enormous, [the associations with water] can bring out myths, they can bring out emotions, too, and added to the fact, you see, of the illumination, it has a different effect on water playing. So you've got a different combination of colouration and movement

He had seen the Fountain at its best and its worst, resulting in 'acute bathos': a 'beautiful dream' broken by a 'grey dawn of reality'. He was watching 'drama on one night' and 'looking at the props in the morning.' Everyone was talking to the workmen

and asking them questions, 'It could be my memory deceiving me; on the evening visit it seemed much bigger. On the day visit, it seemed much smaller', due perhaps he thought to less people, no illumination and no water playing. Also he had had little sleep.

A photo of the *Trevi rossa*, when red dye was thrown in the water, caused intense dislike:

I *don't* like it because it just doesn't fit in with the rest, [...] the Fountain was designed as a whole, as an entity, both the sculpture and the water, and I think that that just spoils it. It's intrusive.

This image triggered a preferred memory of Oceanus being 'beautifully illuminated' at night, more so than the other iconography. 'Agrippa I remember, too, because the people I was with spoke about him. I'd forgotten that.'

#### **INTERVIEW THREE**

#### Everyday Presence: Taken For Granted Fountain and a Wakeup Call

Daniela is Italian. Her childhood home in Rome, where her parents continue to live, is a ten minute walk from the Trevi. She lives in England.

Daniela emphasized the importance of the Fountain as a symbol and meeting point especially for young Romans who see it differently to tourists: 'in a way we take it for granted', like the other major symbols of Rome. It is the first place to take friends coming from abroad, 'doing the silly thing with a coin, like express your wish and turn your back' which she *really* loves and has had 'many, many wishes'. It is very common for friends to say, 'We'll meet at the Fountain' and it is also important as a renowned shopping area with the famous *gelateria* nearby. 'It's part of the way we live, the city. It's sort of functional in a way.'

The image of the Fountain usually remembered by Daniela is of the bright, restored monument in daylight. At night, the image changes for her:

There's some sort of charm which I can't really define specifically; it's a totally different colour experience if you're taking people there [...] I find myself doing two different things. During the day I would probably introduce the Fountain in terms of, you know, the monument, and the history, probably how it's Baroque, the style, and [...] at night-time you try just to enjoy the atmosphere. It's something very difficult to describe, many people obviously arrive there and remember because of Fellini's film [...] and a very common question, you know, I've been

asked many times: 'Can you go in the water? *No!* You might encounter a few troubles. But I think that's a very stereotypical image of the Fountain. [...] you can also feel a sort of nostalgia, in a way. It's a very nostalgic place; to think maybe of the great days of Rome, and now you feel it is not.

Daniela said she was too young before the restoration in the 1980s to recall how the monument looked previously. She thought it had been covered during restoration by scaffolding with some sort of drapery but without an image of the Fountain on it, as there probably would be now:

Even when it was covered, I know people used to go there, many tourists used to go there. There was still a very strong bond, you know, between the people and the Fountain. There was a big celebration after restoration: Trevi Day.

Talking about *La dolce vita* and the Ekberg image, Daniela was fascinated as to why the Fountain scene became so famous as it did not reflect Fellini's intention. The film is one of her favourites and she has used it for teaching film studies. The Fountain scene:

wrongly summarises the film and [...] if you contextualize that scene within the film it is not that relevant [...] it is a turning point but it's certainly not the most shocking or striking scene we have in the film [...] I think, *that* became that successful because it is the best manifesto for the title of the film [...] Anita getting into the water worked really well within the film because it was the era of liberation and enjoying life.

Now, she thought, many people only know that scene in commercial contexts but haven't seen the film: 'As they don't have a background about Italian cinema and everything, they don't really understand the film, they expect much more about the Fountain and Anita. They expect much more coming out from that scene.' She found it unbelievable how famous and important the Fountain became after the film.

She did not wish to recall the Fountain when silent on cleaning days: it was a complicated image. Only sound played in memory:

You can hear it from a distance. You don't need to get there [...] it depends from which street you're coming, you hear the sound and then you turn and you see the big, big water coming out and that's probably what's in *my* memory. When the Fountain is switched off, it makes the thing more complicated. Yes, I used to pass the Trevi very often when I used to go the University [...] It was an everyday presence [...] It's always been there.

Since leaving Rome five or six years ago she has felt a 'need to go to the centre, to go to the Fountain', and to other iconic monuments when she returns.

Size and place mark out the Trevi as special for her: 'Because it's very big but it is placed in a very constricted space, it's in the middle in a way, but you perceive it is at the end of something when you come from the street.' She thought the surrounding medieval streets kept this surprise factor, unlike the roads to St. Peter's Square opened up by Mussolini. Daniela's image of the Fountain at this point in the interview was one of playing in daylight under blue skies, with blue water.

The *Trevi rossa* demonstration, she thought, was: 'one of the most effective protests.' The image was 'like a river of blood, streaming, and I felt the anger probably of the person, and I was shocked, but I thought it was [...] a good wakeup call'. Her first reaction had been to think of possible damage:

You know I still remember when it was in *La repubblica* [...] I think there was a very important reason why [the protester] chose the Fountain [...] we filter our memories, polished and nice, and we are sharing them because we probably associate the Fountain with the most glamorous aspect of the town. Something that, you know, we like to portray, to advertise abroad, but an aspect which is not any more.

Daniela thought giving the world this image on the Internet was quite successful:

it was a wakeup call because probably the stereotype image we have of the Fountain is just something that, yes, we have in our memory but no, maybe [...] it's becoming a sort of abstract concept, detached from the actual Fountain. So you have the beautiful image, you know, that goes around on the Internet that still is in our memory [...] we don't realise it might be dirty or there might be something that is not exactly just coins. [...] I don't think anybody after leaving the Fountain would keep the nasty side [...] like people leaving litter.

She always carries the memory in her mind of a beautiful Fountain: 'Which, you know, is an image. Yes, it reproduces the Fountain but probably doesn't, you know, conform to the reality as it is now. But that's just a personal impression.'

## Postscript: Selection of Observations on Fountain

These came, randomly, from non-interviewees:

**A.** I was, well, expecting the square to be bigger. [...] We saw the Trevi several times. The square was always full of people so we never got near to take photos or throw a coin. It didn't matter that I couldn't throw a coin as I didn't want to go back; there are other places to visit. I thought, well, you would be able to walk round it because I thought it was big and that's what you do, walk round big fountains!

Did I have an image of the Fountain before I went? Well, no, I think, it's just famous, isn't it? Oh, I thought it was really old, you know, classical [...] I'll always remember it, I think, because my husband drank his first Italian beer there.

- **B.** I couldn't see what all the fuss was about. When we got there in the evening, all the lights were out 'cause of a power cut. And it was cold and raining. I was so disappointed.
- **C.** No, I don't think I've heard of that fountain. Yes, of course, I've seen *La dolce vita*. So that's the Trevi Fountain!
- **D.** [On seeing photographs of the daytime and night-time Trevi] That's not the same Fountain, is it?
- **E.** You wonder if the Fountain controls us or we are controlling the Fountain!
- **F.** There's this large, beautiful fountain in the middle of Rome, although I've never been there. I can't think of its name, but I suppose there are others?

#### Summary

Bearing in mind the necessarily small scale of the project, the interviews reflect ways in which personal and public memories intermingle. The articulation of memory by the interviewees offered shifting and multiple images of the Fountain: as a meeting-place for young Romans; a taken for granted monument; Baroque in style; cause of nostalgia; place of theatre; of a beautiful Fountain always playing under blue skies; contrasts of size and place; fame because of Fellini's scene; a perfect image detached from its physical reality in cyberspace; different at night in positive and negative ways; linked by bright colour to fantasy; dissonant in memory when silent, and as a place of traumatic loss and dislike.

It was noted that all interviewees had preferred memories. Some forgotten ones were recalled and reshaped during the interview process so the activity itself also contributed to new memory. Following Huyssen, the fissure between 'experiencing an event and remembering it in representation is unavoidable [...] a powerful stimulant for cultural and artistic creativity.' This was shown, for example, by Peter's productive memories of a beautiful, dream-like, Trevi at night-time whose drama was spoilt by a grey dawn, silence and cleaning. It was also shown in his sudden recall of Oceanus being more beautifully illuminated than the other iconography. Daniela remembered

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Andreas Huyssen, *Twilight Memories* (New York: Routledge, 1995), pp. 2-3.

colour differences between the day and night-time Fountain that made her perform differently in its presence. During the day she would talk to her visitors about its history but at night it was enjoyment of the social atmosphere that she remembered.

Images compete in personal memory. For Daniela, the Fountain had been an important part of everyday life as a child and then as a student when she crossed and re-crossed the Piazza and spent time there with friends. Her preferred memories were 'filtered' and 'polished and nice' yet she also held negative images, of a dirty Fountain and a nostalgic one of a previous Rome. As John Foot points out, memory-narratives can be wrapped within nostalgia which is a tactic, a device and a prism. <sup>4</sup> Nostalgia helps point to ways in which a past is understood and narrated through memory. For Daniela, it was those of a happily recalled childhood and her years as a student. The silent Fountain was described as a 'complicated', unwanted image. She still remembers a recent image of the *Trevi rossa* political protest that challenged her taken for granted image of the Fountain, which she sees as circulated and shared collectively in cyberspace as a 'perfect' image. She also commented on the commodified nature of Trevi images.

As a tourist, Peter's anticipatory memory of the Trevi was formed by a guidebook and influenced by the memories held by significant others, his friends. The image of the splendid, illuminated Trevi overlaid that of the 'naked' silent daytime monument but both stimulated considerable memorial reconstruction in the interview process. The forgotten, then remembered, visit of thirty years ago was reshaped and discredited as was the grey, silent Fountain of New Year's Day that created a personal sense of 'bathos'. Peter explicitly wanted to choose images closer to his anticipatory memory informed by guidebooks and generated during his night visit.

For Fiona, her most significant Trevi images were linked to a distressing experience as a young student. Her memory of the Baroque Fountain when she was an art student was overlaid by this traumatic event as were earlier memory traces remaining from childhood of images she had seen in cards and family photos, and in films and adverts shown on Australian television. Memory of a happier recent visit did not appear to diminish the enduring emotional significance of her first visit.

All three interviewees commented on size as a function of memory and place. Fiona's earliest memory was of visiting a much larger Fountain and Piazza, Peter found

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> John Foot, 'Micro-History of a House: Memory and Place in a Milanese Neighbourhood, 1890–2000', *Urban History*, 34, 3 (2007), 431-52 (pp. 449-50).

the appearance of the Trevi smaller in daytime with the seemingly larger night-time Trevi more fantastical, and Daniela saw size dependent on constricted space giving the Fountain its surprise factor. The remembered sound of the Fountain's water before it was seen was also significant for Daniela and Peter. All three interviewees performed the coin ritual: Daniela when taking visitors and for her own enjoyment, Fiona because that was what she had been taught to do as a child and Peter mimicked the performative actions of other people. The interviewees repeated ritual performance from across millennia, each resulting in diverse personal meanings and memories.

# Theoretical Perspectives

The project shows that the three Trevi visitors remember a variety of gazes brought to bear on the monument at different times but there is always one image they each choose to emphasize amongst competing ones. For Daniela there is the perfect Fountain, for Fiona a distressing location and for Peter the beautiful Trevi at night. Two interviewees strongly indicate that preferred memories are significant, as if these mask or dilute those that are disliked. The other interviewee reveals that stressful memory is not always successfully overlaid although there is the potential for change in new circumstances whilst the connotations of the earlier experience remain. Anticipatory memory proves significant for Peter in positive terms and negatively for Fiona arising from her previous traumatic experience.

The transmission of ritual performance in memory as shown by the cointhrowing ritual manifested itself as obligatory at the Fountain. Yet this was performed for different reasons by all three interviewees. Throughout the interviews there are intersections and divergences, continuities and discontinuities between personal and social memory. Many layers of meaning are generated, always with the potential for mutually reshaping personal memory and public memory as they interweave. The interview project explores the multiple and active practices of individual memory, the question of 'who consumes images?', how this is framed collectively, and seeks to show the inventiveness of these cultural dimensions.

The intersubjective element of the interviews, the interrelationships between researcher and interviewees, was full of complex meaning. As Giovanni Contini and Alfredo Martini observe, the interviewee 'si tratta di un'interpretazione del suo passato' and the researcher is 'qualcuno che nel frattempo è diventato un altro, anche se si

chiama con lo stesso nome, e che si volta indietro giudicando secondo la logica del suo presente. Alessandro Portelli stresses the narrativity of oral sources and the significance of the interventions required for transcription such as editing, punctuation and selection of material so that, like translation, intervention also means invention: the product is that of interviewee *and* interviewer. Mis-narration of events is irrelevant, not negative, and it is the way events are remembered and not their re-construction that is important. This study on individual stories of remembering the Fountain shows how personal versions coincide with collective imagination but it also shows how they differ. Expressions of memory reveal the power of myth and ideology.

The key areas of the project shed light on memory as an active and social practice and on the meanings produced in the consumption of images. These aspects relate to transmission processes in the ritual performance of memory, to anticipatory memory and, interestingly, to preferred memory. There was much similarity yet surprising diversity in the consumption of Trevi Fountain imagery amongst the three interviewees. Bearing in mind the small scale of the research undertaken, the project also experienced the challenges in the recording of 'memory talk' and its subsequent theoretical use. All these dimensions make work in the field a much debated as well as an interesting and productive field of research.

#### Interview Procedures

#### Permission

The project was approved by my co-Supervisors; the Director of Graduate Studies, School of Modern Languages; the Freedom of Information Officer and the Secretary of the Research Ethics Committee, Royal Holloway, University of London.

<sup>5</sup> Giovanni Contini and Alfredo Martini, *Verba manent: L'uso delle fonti orali per la storia contemporanea* (Rome, 1993), p. 29.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Alessandro Portelli, 'The Peculiarities of Oral History', 12, 1 (1981), *History Workshop Journal*, 96-107, (p. 103). Much Italian research on memory is event focused and explores through interviewing what happens to an experienced event as it gathers symbolic, legendary and imaginative qualities in memory and culture.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Portelli, inaugural lecture, launch of Public History Centre, Royal Holloway, University of London, 6 November 2012.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> 'Memory talk' is Annette Kuhn's phrase for oral history, *An Everyday Magic: Cinema and Cultural Memory* (London: I. B. Tauris, 2002), p. 20.

# Information

Several interviewees were contacted for a preliminary discussion. The three who went ahead were given an information sheet before the interview, which was at a time and place of their choosing. The sheet identified the purposes of the research, how the individual interviews would be carried out, the secure holding of material, and gave my contact details and those of my Supervisors. Interviewees were assured they could stop at any time and any requests for withholding material would be respected.

#### The Interviews

The interviews each took between thirty and forty minutes and were recorded on an unobtrusively placed small digital device. Pre-determined questions were asked using an inconspicuous list, not in any particular order and introduced when appropriate, allowing each interview to proceed naturally at the interviewee's pace. Following each interview, a 'thank you' was sent.

#### Consent

Interviewees were requested to sign a form at the end of the interview. In this they acknowledged receipt of the information sheet and gave me permission to use the interview material for academic purposes, including this PhD thesis, journal articles, conferences, seminars and possible book form. They also gave consent for Royal Holloway, University of London, to hold the copyright of authorship for the material I have provided and for the material to be kept securely. Interviewees knew they could request a copy of the interview.

## **Transcriptions**

These were done on a password protected computer, backed up on memory sticks kept in a secure location and to my University email account and later deleted. The recordings were first transcribed in full which included my questions and input. This transcription helped during editing to register the feelings expressed through interjections, hesitations, unfinished sentences and pauses as part of the activity of remembering. Some emphasized words have been italicized. Some comments during discussion from people not interviewed conclude the Interviews Section.

# APPENDIX TWO

## FRENCH TRANSLATIONS

German and Latin translations are included in the main text

#### De Staël

*Corinne, or Italy* [1807], from trans. by Sylvia Raphael (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1998), p. 74.

Thesis Chapter Four, p. 170

On the evening of the fourth day of this cruel separation there was a lovely moon, and Rome is very beautiful during the silence of the night when it seems inhabited only by its illustrious ghosts. Corinne [...] dejected and sorrowful, got out of her carriage and rested for a few moments by the Trevi Fountain, in front of the abundant stream of water which cascades down the centre of Rome and seems, as it were, the life of this calm spot.

Corinne, trans. by Sylvia Raphael, pp. 74-75

Thesis Chapter Four, p. 171

When the waterfall stops flowing for a few days, it is as if Rome were struck with amazement [...] in Rome it is the murmur of this enormous fountain which seems the necessary background to the daydreaming life you lead there. Corinne's image could be seen in the water, which is so pure that for several centuries it has borne the name of *virgin water*. Oswald, having stopped at the same place a few moments later, caught sight of the charming face of his friend reflected in the water. He was gripped by such intense emotion that at first he did not know if his imagination was bringing Corinne's shade [...] he bent down over the fountain to see better and his own features were then reflected beside Corinne's.

#### Stendhal

Promenades dans Rome [1829] (Paris: Michel Lévy frères, 1858) <a href="http://www.archive.org/details/texts">http://www.archive.org/details/texts</a> [accessed 14 September 2013], pp. 296-97, translation assisted by Ruth Cruickshank

Thesis Chapter Four, p. 173

Mme de Staël says that, when the waters of the fountain of Trevi cease playing by reason of some reparation work, there is a deep silence throughout Rome. If one locates this sentence in *Corinne*, it alone would suffice to make me disregard a whole body of literature! Thus one can only have an effect on the public in France by using commonplace exaggeration! The architecture of this fountain of Trevi, leaning backwards against the Palace of Buoncompagni, has only its vastness and historical memory from which we learn that this water has been flowing for eighteen hundred and forty six years. The fall of these fairly abundant sheets of water at the back of a piazza surrounded by tall houses makes only a little bit more sound than that of Bondi's fountain on its boulevard.

#### Yourcenar

A Coin in Nine Hands (Denier du rêve) [1959], trans. by Doris Katz (London: The Harvill Press, 1994). Page numbers refer to Chapter Four in thesis, then to Katz's translation:

p. 181, Katz, p. 110

The moon had taken on that evil aspect it assumes in the later hours, when one isn't used to being outdoors and everything looks different in the sky.

p. 181, Katz, pp. 111-12

They came suddenly into a small piazza that was no more than the basin of a fountain. Marble gods presided over this trickling: whirlpools, eddies, quiet puddles had formed in the hollows of sculptured stone rocks that time, humidity, and erosion had transformed into real rocks. A baroque fancy, a mythological opera prop had gradually become a great natural monument that offered, at the heart of the city, rock and water both older and younger than Rome.

#### p. 181, Katz, p. 112

An almost forgotten memory came back to him, overwhelmingly real, superimposing itself on this piazza, on this fountain, on this old man sitting on the step.

#### p. 182, Katz, p. 112

This fountain, for example, I wanted to see it again before leaving [...] Things so beautiful that you're surprised they are there.

#### p. 182, Katz, p. 114

And those travellers leaving, if they throw a coin in the water [...] it is said they'll come back... I'm not tempted to come back. Rather see something else, something really new, with fresh eyes, eyes washed clean, pure eyes [...]

### p. 182, Katz, p.115

The water and rock, so wonderful a little while ago, are now only insensible substances that can't help him. The music of the waterfall is only a noise that would cover up his calls for help.

#### p. 182, Katz, p. 120

The song of the fountains rises purer and keener in the silence of the night; and at Piazza di Trevi, where a black flood overran the foot of the stone Neptune, Oreste Marinuni [...] stuck his two hands into the crag of a rock, and raking at random, took out some coins thrown in the water by fools.

# Bibliography

## **Entries appear under the following headings:**

Fountains	260	Music	271
Art	262	Memory	271
Literature and Travel Novels	264	General	277
Travel and Guidebooks	266	General Websites	283
Film	268		

#### **Abbreviations:**

CUP = Cambridge University Press

Cambridge, MA: HUP = Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press

Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press = Cambridge, Massachusetts: The Massachusetts Institute of Technology Press

MUP = Manchester University Press

OUP = Oxford University Press

YUP = Yale University Press

Where an author has more than one work, these are listed in alphabetical order of title disregarding 'a' and 'the' Classical authors are under *Literature* 

#### **Fountains**

Ashby, Thomas, *The Aqueducts of Rome* (Oxford: [n. pub.], 1935)

Bachelard, Gaston, *Water and Dreams: An Essay on the Imagination of Matter* [1942], trans. by Edith R. Farell (Dallas: Pegasus Foundation, 1983)

Battistini, Attilio, Villeggiatura alle fontane di Roma, con 9 disegni di Domenico Purificato (Rome: Trevi Editore, 1979)

Bernstein, Frances, Classical Living: Reconnecting with the Rituals of Ancient Rome (San Francisco: Harper Collins, 2000)

Bianchi, Arturo, 'La Sistemazione di Piazza Trevi', *Capitolium*, 9 (December 1925), pp. 563-71 <a href="http://www.periodici.librari.beniculturali.it/visualizzatore.aspx?anno=1925-1926&id\_imma">http://www.periodici.librari.beniculturali.it/visualizzatore.aspx?anno=1925-1926&id\_imma</a> [accessed 14 December 2013]

Borsi, Stefano, *Roma di Urbano VIII: La pianta di Giovanni Maggi, 1625* (Rome: Officina Edizioni, 1990)

- Cardilli, Luisa, ed., *Fontana di Trevi: La storia, Il restauro* (Rome: Edizioni Carte Segrete, 1991)
- Cederna, Antonio, *Mussolini urbanista: Lo sventramento di Roma negli anni del consenso* (Rome, Bari: Laterza & Figli Spa, 1980)
- Cooke, Hereward Lester, 'The Documents Relating to the Fountain of Trevi', *The Art Bulletin*, 38 (1956), 149-73
- D'Onofrio, Cesare, *Acque e Fontane di Roma* (Rome: Staderini Editore, 1976)

  —— *Le fontane di Roma*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (Rome: Staderini Editore, 1962)
- Fanelli, Vittorio, *Ricerche su Angelo Colloci e sulla Roma cinquecentesca* (Rome: Vatican City, 1979)
- Frontinus, Sextus Julius, *De aquis urbis Romae: The Aqueducts of Rome* [97 CE], revised parallel trans. by C. E. Bennett of trans. by Clemens Herschel (London: William Heinemann Ltd, 1969)
- Gaston, Robert W., 'Pirro Ligorio's Roman Fountains and the Concept of the Antique: Investigations of the Ancient Nymphæum in Cinquecento Antiquarian Culture', in *Patronage and Italian Renaissance Sculpture*, ed. by Kathleen Christian and David J. Drogin (Ashgate: 2010), pp. 223-49
- Habel, Dorothy Metzger, *The Urban Development of Rome in the Age of Alexander VII* (Cambridge: CUP, 2002)
- Herschel, Clemens, *Frontinus and the Water Supply of the City of Rome* (New York: Longmans, Green & Co, 1913)
- Hirst, Bryan, R., 'Fountains' (Higher National Diploma Dissertation, Kingston University, 1996) <a href="http://waterlandsproductions.co.uk/pages/disseratation.html">http://waterlandsproductions.co.uk/pages/disseratation.html</a> [accessed 9 September 2013]
- Hodge, Trevor A., Roman Aqueducts and Water Supply (London: Duckworth & Co., 1992)
- Kermon, David, 'Restoring the Ancient Water Supply System in Renaissance Rome: The Popes, The Civic Administration and the Acqua Vergine' (in unpublished doctoral thesis) 'The Protection of Ancient Monuments in Renaissance Rome', Harvard: 2003) <a href="http://jefferson.village.virginia.du/rome/karmon.html">http://jefferson.village.virginia.du/rome/karmon.html</a> [accessed 9 December 2008]
- Lanciani, Rodolfo Amedeo, Ancient and Modern Rome (Boston: Marshall Jones, 1925)
  - The Ruins and Excavations of Ancient Rome: A Companion Book for Students and Travellers (London: MacMillan and Co., 1897)
  - Wanderings in the Roman Campagna (Boston and New York, 1909)
- MacDougall, Elizabeth, 'The Sleeping Nymph: Origins of a Humanist Fountain Type', *The Art Bulletin*, 57 (1975), 357-65
- Milne, James-Lees, *Roman Mornings* (London: Alan Wingate Ltd., 1956)
- Morton, Henry Canova Vollam, *The Waters of Rome* (London: The Connoisseur and Michael Joseph, 1966; 2<sup>nd</sup> edn published as *The Fountains of Rome*, 1970)

- Nash, Ernest, A Pictorial Dictionary of Ancient Rome (London: Thames & Hudson, 1968)
- Neuerburg, Norman, *Fontane e ninfei nell'Italia antica* (Napoli: Gaetano Macchiaroli Editore, 1965)
- Pinto, John A., The Trevi Fountain (New Haven: YUP, 1986)
  - —— and Elisabeth Kieven, 'An Early Project by Ferdinando Fuga for the Trevi Fountain in Rome', *The Burlington Magazine*, 125, (1983), pp. 746-51
- Rhea, Nicholas, 'Wells' <a href="http://nicholasrhea.co.uk/author/archives">http://nicholasrhea.co.uk/author/archives</a> [accessed 27 May 2007]
- Rinne, Katherine Wentworth, *The Waters of Rome: Aqueducts, Fountains, and the Birth of the Baroque City* (New Haven: YUP, 2010)
- Schiavo, Armando, La Fontana di Trevi e le altre opere di Nicola Salvi (Rome: 1956)
- Symmes, Marilyn, ed., Fountains: Splash and Spectacle: Water Design from the Renaissance to the Present (London: Thames & Hudson, 1998)
- Ubaldini, Federico, *Vita di Mons: Angelo Colocci* [1653], ed. by V. Fanelli (Rome: Vatican 1969)
- Valesio, Francesco, 6 vols, *Diario di Roma* [1700–1742], 3-6 [1704–1742], ed. by Gaetano Scano (Milan: Longanesi & C., 1977–1979)
- Venturi, Francesco, and Mario Sanfilippo, *Le fontane di Roma* (Rome: Silvana Editore, 1996)
- Vogel, Lisa, Column of Antoninus Pius (Cambridge, MA: HUP, 1973)
- Winslow, E.M., A Libation to the Gods (London: [n. pub.], 1963)
- Wünsch, R., 'Der Abschied von Rom an der Fontana di Trevi', in *Strena Helbigiana* (Lipsia: 1900), pp. 341-46

#### Art

- Assunto, Rosario, Specchio vivente del mondo: artisti stranieri in Roma, 1600-1800 (Rome: De Luca, 1978)
- Bazin, Germain, *Baroque and Rococo*, trans. by Jonathan Griffin (London: Thames and Hudson, 1964)
- Benjamin, Walter, 'A Short History of Photography'
  - <a href="http://traumwerk.stanford.edu:3455/MichaelShanks/1164?view=print">http://traumwerk.stanford.edu:3455/MichaelShanks/1164?view=print</a> [accessed 24 November 2008]
  - ---- 'The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction', in *Illuminations*, trans. by Harry Zorn, ed., with Introduction, by Hannah Arendt (London: Random House, 1999), pp. 211-43
- Bevilacqua, Mario, ed., *Nolli, Vasi, Piranesi: Immagini di Roma antica e moderna*, in Catalogue of Exhibition at Palazzo Fontana di Trevi (Rome: Artemide Edizione, 2004)
- Blunt, Anthony, *Guide to Baroque Rome* (New York: Harper and Row, 1982)
  - ---- 'Roman Baroque Architecture: The Other Side of the Medal', *Art History*, 3, March 1980, pp. 61-80

- Bragg, Melvyn, In Our Time, The Baroque, BBC Radio 4, 20 November 2008
- Bullfinch, Thomas, Myths of Greece and Rome (London: Penguin Books, Allen Lane, 1981)
- Burckhardt, Jakob, *Der Cicerone: Eine Anleitung zum Genuss der Kunstwerke Italiens* [1869] (Leipzig: E.A. Seemann, 1898)
  - The Cicerone: An Art Guide to Painting in Italy for the Use of Travellers and Students [1869], trans. by A. H. Clough (London: T. Werner Laurie, Clifford's Inn, c. 1920s)
- Cavazzini, Patrizia, *Painting as Business in Early Seventeenth-Century Rome* (Pennsylvania: The State University Press, 2008)
- De Caus, Salomon, Les Raisons des forces mouvantes (Paris: Chez Hierosme Droüart, 1624)
- Dixon, Susan M., Italian Baroque Art (London: Blackwell, 2008)
- Falda, Giovanni Battista, Le fontane nelle piazze, libro primo (Rome: Rossi, 1675)
  - Il terzo libro del'novo [sic] teatro delle chiese di Roma date in luce sotto il felice pontificato di Nostro Signore Papa Clemente IX, disegnate in prospettiva et intagliate da Giovanni Battista Falda, in Vestigi delle Antich. e Fabriche [sic] di Roma (Prague: Aegidio Sadeler and Rome: Iacomo de Rossi, 1660)
- Hager, Hellmut, ed., Architectural Fantasy and Reality: Drawings from the Accademia nazionale di San Luca in Rome, Concorsi clementini, 1700–1750, Exhibition catalogue (Pennsylvania: The State University Press, 1982)
- Harbison, Robert, *The Built, the Unbuilt and the Unbuildable: The Pursuit of Architectural Meaning* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1991)
  - —— Eccentric Spaces (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2000)
  - —— Reflections on Baroque (London: Reaktion Books, 2008)
- Haskell, Francis, *History and its Images: Art and the Interpretation of the Past* (New Haven: YUP, 1993)
  - —— Patron and Painters: Art and Society in Baroque Italy (New Haven: YUP, 1993)
- Johns, Christopher M.S., *Papal Art and Cultural Politics: Rome in the Age of Clement XI* (Cambridge: CUP, 1993)
- Kieven, Elisabeth, and John A. Pinto, *Pietro Bracci and Eighteenth-Century Rome* (University Park, Pennsylvania: The State University Press, c. 2001)
- Mann, Geoffrey C., Castellani and Giuliano: Revivalist Jewellers of the Nineteenth Century (London: Trefoil Books, 1984)
- Milizia, Francesco, Memorie degli architetti antichi e moderni, Opere complete [1768], 9 vols, (Bassano: 1785), 5
- Milne, James-Lees, *Roman Mornings* (London: Alan Wingate Ltd, 1956)
- Nyberg, Dorothea, trans., 'Dedicazione', *Piranesi Drawings and Etchings* (New York: [n. pub.], 1972)
- Panofsky, Erwin, 'What is Baroque?', in *Three Essays on Style*, ed. by Irving Lavin (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1995), pp. 17-88

- Pinto, John A., 'Nicola Michetti and Ephemeral Design in Eighteenth-Century Rome', *Memoirs of the American Academy in Rome*, 35, *Studies in Italian Art History*, 1 (1980), 289-322
- Piranesi, Giovanni Battista, *Prima parte di architettura e prospettive* [1743], in *Giovanni Battista Piranesi: Drawings and Etchings* (New York: University of Columbia, 1972)
- Sánchez-Jáuregui, María Dolores, and Scott Wilcox, eds, *The English Prize; The Capture of the Westmorland*, *An Episode of the Grand Tour*, publication for Exhibition with same title (2012), (Yale University: 2012)
- Sheen, Fulton J., Yousuf Karsh, and Henry Canova Vollam Morton, *This is Rome: A Pilgrimage in Words and Pictures* (Great Britain: 1960)
- Vasari, Giorgio, *Le vite de' più eccellenti pittori scultori ed architetti* [1568], 2<sup>nd</sup> edn, ed. by Gaetano Milanesi (Florence: Sansoni, 1878)
- Warner, Marina, *The Inner Eye: Art Beyond the Visible*, National Touring Exhibition (1996-1997), organised by the Hayward Gallery (Manchester: Cornerhouse Publications, 1986)
  - Monuments and Maidens: the Allegory of the Female Form (London: Weidenfeld and Nicolson, 1985)
- Welchman, John, C., Invisible Colors: A Visual History of Titles (New Haven: YUP, 1997)
- Wilton-Ely, John, *The Mind and Art of Giovanni Battista Piranesi* (London: Thames And Hudson Ltd, 1978)
  - —— 'Piranesi and the Tourists', in *The English Prize*, *The Capture of the Westmorland*, *An Episode of the Grand Tour*, publication for Exhibition with same title (2012), ed. by Sánchez-Jáuregui, María Dolores, and Scott Wilcox (Yale University, 2012), pp. 137-143
- Wittkower, Rudolf, *Architectural Principles in the Age of Humanism* (London: Academy Editions, 1988)
  - Art and Architecture in Italy 1600–1750, 5<sup>th</sup> edn (New Haven: YUP Press, 1980)
  - Gian Lorenzo Bernini: The Sculptor of the Roman Baroque (London: [n. pub.], 1955)
- Wölfflin, Heinrich, *Renaissance and Baroque*, trans. by Kathrin Simon (London: Collins & Co. Ltd, 1964)
- Yates, Francis A., *The Art of Memory* (Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1978)
- Yourcenar, Marguerite, *The Dark Brain of Piranesi* [1962], trans. by Richard Howard (Henley-on-Thames: Aidan Ellis Publishing Ltd, 1985)

#### Literature and Travel Novels

- Byron, George Gordon Noel, 'Childe Harold's Pilgrimage' [1812], in *The Complete Poetical Works: Lord Byron*, ed. by Jerome J. McGann, 7 vols (Oxford: OUP, 1980-82), 2
- Casillo, Robert, *The Empire of Stereotypes: Germaine de Staël and the Idea of Italy* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2006)

- Cassiodorus, *Variae epistulae*, *The Letters of Cassiodorus*, ed. by Thomas Hodgkin, (London: [n. pub.], 1886)
- Colvin, Margaret Elizabeth, *Baroque Fictions: Revisioning the Classical in Marguerite Yourcenar* (Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2005)
- Dickens, Charles, *Pictures from Italy* [1846] (Oxford: OUP, 1989)
- Gantrel, Martine, 'Le Rôle de la Fontaine de Trevi dans *Denier du Rêve* de Marguerite Yourcenar', *Francofonia: Studi e Ricerche sulle Letterature di Lingua Francese*, 43, (2002), 27-43
- Goethe, Johannes Wolfgang von, *Italienische Reise*, 1786-1788 [1816] (Leipzig: Insel, 1914) <a href="https://www.archive.org.details/goethesitalienis00goetuoft">https://www.archive.org.details/goethesitalienis00goetuoft</a>> [accessed 14 September 2013]
  - —— *Italian Journey, 1786–1788*, trans. by W.H. Auden and Elizabeth Mayer (London: Collins, 1962)
- Grass, Günter, *Crabwalk*, trans. by Krisha Winston (London: Faber & Faber, 2002)
- Hawthorne, Nathaniel, *The Marble Faun* [1860] (London: Paul Kegan, Trench and Company, 1885)
  - The Marble Faun, or, the Romance of Monte Beni [1860] (Boston: Houghton, Mifflin and Company, The Riverside Press, 1890)
  - The Marble Faun, or, the Romance of Monte Beni [1860], with Introduction by Richard H. Brodhead (London: Penguin Classics, 1990)
- Lachmann, Renate, 'Mnemonic and Intertextual Aspects of Literature', in *Cultural Memory Studies: An International and Interdisciplinary Handbook*, ed. by Astrid Erll and Ansgar Nünning in collaboration with Sarah S. Young (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2008), pp. 301-10
- Luzzi, Joseph, Romantic Europe and the Ghost of Italy (New Haven: YUP, 2008)
- McMahan, Anna Benneson, ed., With Shelley in Italy: A Selection of the Poems and Letters of Percy Bysshe Shelley Relative to his Life in Italy (London: T. Fisher Unwin, 1907)
- Martial, Martial Epigrams, Books 1 and 2, trans. by Walter, C.A. (London: Heinemann, 1919)
- Ouida, Ariadnê, *The Story of a Dream* (London: Chatto & Windus, 1888)
- Ovid, *Tristia* [c. 8 CE–16 CE], trans. by Levi Robert Lind (Athens: University of Georgia Press, 1975)
- Pliny, Natural History, VIII, XXXVI, 24, in Readings in Ancient History: Illustrative Extracts from the Sources, Rome and the West, ed. by William Stearns Davis, (Boston: Allyn and Bacon, 1912–13), II
  - < http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/pliny-natihist-rome.html> [accessed 15 October 2013] third extract
  - —— Natural History, VIII, XXXI, 42, trans. by W.H.S. Jones (Harvard: Heinemann, 1963)
- Proust, Marcel, À la recherche du temps perdu [1913–1927] (Paris: Gallimard, 1987-1989)
  - Finding Time Again, trans. by Ian Patterson (London: Allen Lane, Penguin, 2002)

- Rogers, Samuel, *Italy, a Poem* [1822] (London: T. Caldell; E. Moxon, 1830)
- Schroeder, Natalie, and Shari Hodges Holt, Ouida the Phenomenon: Evolving Social, Political, and Gender Concerns in Her Fiction (New Jersey: Associated University Presses, 2008)
- Seneca, Epistulae morales: The Epistles of Seneca [1st century CE], trans. by Richard M. Gunmere (London: Heinemann, 1920)
  - Letters from a Stoic: Epistulae Morales ad Lucilium [1<sup>st</sup> century CE], trans. by Robin Campbell (London, Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1969)
- Staël, Anne-Louise Germaine de, Corinne: ou l'Italie [1807] (New York: Chez Leavitt et Allen, 1853) <a href="http://www.inlibroveritas.net/lire/oeuvre2742.html">http://www.inlibroveritas.net/lire/oeuvre2742.html</a> [accessed 29 September 2013]
  - Corinne, or Italy [1807] (Oxford: OUP, 1998)
- Yourcenar, Marguerite, A Coin in Nine Hands [1959], trans. by Dori Katz (London: The Harvill Press, 1982)
  - —— Denier du rêve [1959] (Paris: Gallimard, 1971)

## Travel and Guidebooks

- Baedeker, Karl, Handbook for Travellers: Central Italy and Rome (Coblenz: Karl Baedeker; London, Williams & Norgate; Paris: Haar and Steinert, 1869)
  - 1879 edn [n.p.] [n. pub.] <a href="https://www.archive.org">https://www.archive.org</a> [accessed 15 September
- Barbiellini, Giovanni Lorenzo, Roma moderna distinta per rioni, 2 (Roma: 1741) <a href="http://www.arachne.uni.koeln.de">http://www.arachne.uni.koeln.de</a> [accessed 19 October 2013] under 'roma moderna distinta per rioni barbiellini', pp. 216-20 for pp.196-200
- Beckford, William, Travel Diaries of William Beckford of Fonthill, ed. by Guy Chapman (Cambridge: Constable and Co., Ltd & Houghton Mifflin Co., 1928)
- Black, Jeremy, The British Abroad: The Grand Tour in the Eighteenth Century (New York: St Martin's Press, 1992)
- Chard, Chloe, Pleasure and Guilt on the Grand Tour: Travel Writing and Imaginative Geography 1680–1830 (Manchester: MUP, 1999)
- Explorer: Rome, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (Basingstoke: AA Publishing, 1999)
- Eyewitness Travel: Rome, 6<sup>th</sup> edn (London: Dorling Kindersley Ltd, 2006)
- Felini, Pedro Martyri, Tratado nuevo de las cosas maravillosas de la alma ciudad de Roma (Felini: Rome, 1610)
- Forsyth, Joseph, Remarks on Antiquities, Arts, and Letters during an Excursion in Italy in Years 1802 and 1803, 4th edn (London: John Murray, 1835)
- Franzini, Giovanni Domenico, ed., Descrittione di Roma antica e moderna (Rome: Andrea Fei, 1643) <a href="http://www.unikoeln.de/books/DescrittionRomaAntica1643">http://www.unikoeln.de/books/DescrittionRomaAntica1643</a> p. 744 in book, p. 763 for website [accessed 12 September 2013]

- Graevius, Joannes Georgius, ed., *Thesaurus antiquitatum romanorum*, 12 vols (Publication details: Lugduni Batavorum: early 1700s), 4
- Hachmeister, Gretchen L., *Italy in the German Literary Imagination: Goethe's "Italian Journey" and its Reception by Eichendorff, Platen, and Heine* (Rochester, New York: Camden House, 2002)

Hare, Augustus John Cuthbert, Walks in Rome, 2 vols (London: G. Allen, 1900), 1

Insight City Guide, Rome, 4th edn (Singapore: Apa Publications GmbH & Co., 2005)

Lonely Planet, Best of Rome, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (Australia: Footscray, 2004)

Macadam, Alta, Blue Guide: Rome (London: Somerset Books, 2006)

Marshall, Amy, *Mirabilia Urbis Romae: Five Centuries of Guidebooks and Views* (Toronto: University of Toronto, 2002)

Mills, Sara, Discourses of Difference: An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism (London: Routledge, 1993)

Morton, Henry Canova Vollam, *A Traveller in Rome*, 1<sup>st</sup> and 2<sup>nd</sup> edns (London: Methuen & Co., 1957; 1984)

Murray, John, *The Handbook for Travellers in Central Italy* (London: Murray, 1833) —— 1843 edn (London: Murray)

Pausanias, *Guide to Greece* [c. 250–270], 2 vols, trans. by Peter Levi (Harmondsworth: Penguin Books Ltd, 1971), 1

Piozzi, Hester, Observations and Reflections Made in the Course of a Journey through France, Italy and Germany, 2 vols (London: Srahan & Cadell, 1789), 1

ROMA City Book, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (Milano: Mondadori Electa, 2002)

Seta, Cesare de, L'Italia del Grand Tour (Napoli: Electa, 1992)

Smollett, Tobias, *Travels through France and Italy* [1766], ed. by Frank Felsenstein (Oxford: OUP, 1981)

SpiralGuide, Rome, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (Basingstoke: AA Publishing, 2006)

Starke, Mariana, *Travels in Europe for the Use of Travellers on the Continent* (London: Murray, 1833)

Stendhal, Marie Henri Beyle, *Promenades dans Rome* [1829] (Paris: Michel Lévy frères, 1858) <a href="https://www./details/texts">https://www./details/texts</a> [accessed 14 September 2013]

Sturgis, Matthew, When in Rome: 2000 Years of Roman Sightseeing (London: Francis Lincoln, 2011)

The Rough Guide to Rome, 4th edn (Rough Guides, 2010)

Thomas Cook Travellers: Rome (Basingstoke: AA Publishing, 1995)

Touring Club Italiano, Roma (Milan: Rocca, 1997)

## Film

- Armstrong, Nigel, and Federico M. Federici, eds, *Translating Voices, Translating Regions* (Rome: Aracne, 2006)
- Arrivederci Roma/Seven Hills of Rome, dir. by Roy Rowland (MGM, 1958)
- Bianco e nero, dir. by Cristina Comencini (01 Distribution, 2008)
- Bondanella, Peter, *The Films of Federico Fellini* (Cambridge: CUP, 2002)

  —— *Italian Cinema: From Neorealism to the Present* (North Devon: Roundhouse Publishing Ltd, 1999)
- Bordwell, David, and Kristin Thompson, *Film Art: An Introduction*, 9<sup>th</sup> edn (New York: McGraw-Hill, 2004)
- Brunetta, Gian Pietro, 'La ricerca dell'identità nel cinema italiano del dopoguerra', in *Identità italiana e identità europea nel cinema italiano: dal 1945 al miracolo economico*, ed. by Brunetta (Turin: Fondazione Giovanni Agnelli, 1996), pp. 11-68
- Burgin, Victor, *The Remembered Film* (London: Reaktion Books, 2004)
- Canby, Vincent, 'Movie Review' of *C'eravamo tanto amati*, in *The New York Times*, 24 May1977 <a href="http://www.movies.nytimes.com/pages/movies/index.html">http://www.movies.nytimes.com/pages/movies/index.html</a> [accessed 1 November 2013]
- C'eravamo tanto amati, dir. by Ettore Scola (Delta, 1974)
- Chandler, Charlotte, *I Fellini* (London: Bloomsbury, 1996)
- Costantini, Costanzo, ed., *Fellini on Fellini*, trans. by Sohrab Sorooshian (London: Faber & Faber Limited, 1995)
- Divorzio all'italiano, dir. by Pietro Germi (Lux Film, 1961)
- Egyoyan, Atom, and Ian Balfour, eds, *Subtitles: On the Foreignness of Film* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 2004)
- Ekberg, Anita, Interview on DVD of Fellini's La dolce vita, Nouveaux Pictures (2004)
- Ellwood, David W., *The Movies as History: Visions of the Twentieth Century* (Stroud: Sutton, 2000)
- Elsa y Fred, dir. by Marcos Carnevale (Distrimax Inc., 2005)
- Ferrari, Chiara, 'Translating Stereotypes: Local and Global in Italian Television Dubbing', in *Translating Voices, Translating Regions*, ed. by Nigel Armstrong and Federico M. Federici (Rome: Aracne, 2006)
- Fontana di Trevi, dir. by Carlo Campogalliano (Rosa Films, 1960)
- Foucault, Michel, 'Film and Popular Memory', in *Foucault Live: Collected Interviews*, 196–1984, trans. by Lysa Hochroth and John Johnston, ed. by Sylvère Lotringer (New York: Semiotext(e), 1989), pp. 122-32

- Gundle, Stephen, 'La Dolce Vita', *History Today* (January 2000), 29-35

  ----- 'La Dolce Vita', in *The Movies as History*, ed. by David W. Ellwood (Stroud: Sutton, 2000), pp. 132-140
- Hargan, Noeleen, 'The Foreignness of Subtitles: The Case of *Roma, città aperta* in English', in *Translating Voices, Translating Regions*, ed. by Nigel Armstrong and Federico M. Federici (Rome: Aracne, 2006), pp. 53-71
- Hayward, Susan, Cinema Studies: The Key Concepts, 3<sup>rd</sup> edn (London: Routledge, 2006)
- Ho voglia di te, dir. by Luis Prieto (Warner Brothers, 2007)
- Internet Movie Data Base, Film Locations of the Trevi Fountain <a href="http://www.imdb.com/search/title?locations=Fontana">http://www.imdb.com/search/title?locations=Fontana</a> [accessed 11 August 2011]
- Intervista, dir. by Federico Fellini (Castle Hill Productions, 1987)
- La dolce vita, dir. by Federico Fellini (UK distributor: Columbia Pictures, 1960)
- La dolce vita, publicity brochures (Italian and English), British Film Institute holdings [n.d.]
- La Dolce Vita, 'Campaign Book' for UK release, Columbia Pictures, British Film Institute holding, 1960 [no catalogue no.]
- La Dolce Vita, publicity programme for British Premiere, Columbia Theatre, Shaftesbury Avenue, 8 December 1960, British Film Institute holding [no catalogue no.]
- La dolce vita, dialogue script in Italian, British Film Institute holding, catalogue no. S1030, [n.d.]
- La Dolce vita, L'Album, compiled by Sam Stourdzé (Fondation Jerôme Seydoux-Pathé, Éditions Xavier Barral, 1960)
- La Fontana di Trevi, dir. by Fernando Cerchio (Istituto Nazionale Luce, 1941) <a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.europeana.eu</a> [accessed 2 October 2013]
- Lost in Translation, dir. by Sofia Coppola (Monumentum Pictures, 2003)
- Marcus, Millicent, *Italian Film in the Light Of Neorealism* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1986)
- Martini Gold, dir. by Jonas Åkerlund (Dolce and Gabbana, 2010)
- Masi, Stefano, and Enrico Lancia, *Italian Movie Goddesses: Over 80 of the Greatest Women in Italian Cinema*, trans. by Lucia Alma Braconi, Charles Nopar, Lenore Rosenberg (Rome: Gremese International, 1997)
- *Michael Lucas' La Dolce Vita*, dir. by Michael Lucas and Tony Dimarco (Lucas Distribution, 2006)
- My Voyage to Italy, dir. by Martin Scorsese (Mediatrade, 2011)
- O'Rawe, Catherine, *Stars and Masculinities in Contemporary Italian Cinema* (New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014)

Peroni advertisement (black and white, full version, 2006)

<a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rYnuzTd16OY">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=rYnuzTd16OY</a>> [accessed 17 September 2013]

- UK release, Channel Four (April 2006)
- —— in colour, shorter version (2007) <a href="http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KmdT5aNx511">http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=KmdT5aNx511</a> [accessed 17 September]
  - 2013]
- Quaglietti, Lorenzo, *Storia economico-politica del cinema italiano 1945–1980* (Rome: Editori Riuniti, 1980)
- Radstone, Susannah, 'Cinema and Memory' in *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Bill Schwarz (New York: Fordham University Press, 2010), pp. 325-42
- Rigoletto, Sergio, *Masculinity and Italian Cinema: Sexual Politics, Social Conflict and Male Crisis in the 1970s* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2014)

Roman Holiday, dir. by William Wyler (Paramount, 1953)

Secondari, John Hermes, Coins in the Fountain (Philadelphia: Lippincott, 1953)

Seven Hills of Rome, dir. Roy Rowland (MGM, 1958)

Seven Hills of Rome Press Book, MGM, British Film Institute holding, [n.d.], [no catalogue no.)

Shiel, Mark, and Tony Fitzmaurice, Screening the City (London: Verso, 2003)

Sorlin, Pierre, 'Modi di rappresentazione comuni e differenze nel cinema europeo', in *Identità italiana e identità europea nel cinema italiano: dal 1945 al miracolo economico*, ed. by Gian Pietro Brunetta (Turin: Fondazione Giovanni Agnelli, 1996), pp. 115-40

—— Italian National Cinema, 1896–1996 (London: Routledge, 1996)

*Three Coins in the Fountain*, dir. by Jean Negulesco (20<sup>th</sup> Century Fox, 1954)

Three Coins in the Fountain, unpublished dialogue script (n.d.), British Film Institute, catalogue no. S3300

To Rome with Love, dir. by Woody Alan (Italy: Medusa Distribuzione, 2012)

Totò, Peppino e la dolce vita, dir. by Sergio Corbucci (Istituto Luce/MB Film, 1961)

*Totòtruffa*, dir. by Camillo Mastrocinque (Astoria Cinematografica, 1961)

*Trevi*, co-producers John A. Pinto and Richard Rogers, dir. by Corey Shaff (Metropolitan Museum of Art and J. Paul Getty Foundation, 1988)

*Under the Tuscan Sun*, dir. by Audrey Wells (Disney/Miramax, 2003)

Valentino: The Last Emperor, dir. by Matt Tyrnauer (Acolyte Films, 2008)

Venuti, Lawrence, *The Scandals of Translation: Towards an Ethics of Difference* (London: Routledge, 1998)

Wagstaff, Christopher, 'Italy in the Postwar International Cinema Market', in *Italy in the Cold War: Politics, Culture and Society,* ed. by Christopher Duggan and Christopher Wagstaff (Oxford: Berg, 1995), pp. 89-115

When in Rome, dir. by Mark Steven Johnson (Touchstone Pictures, 2010)

# <u>Music</u>

- 'Arrivederci Roma', lyrics by Renato Rachel, Pietro Garinei, Sandro Giovannini (1955), EMI Music Publishing (1955) in *Acquarello italiano*, Anno X1, 5 (2005)
- 'Arrivederci Roma', lyrics by Carl Sigman for Perry Como song (1966)
- 'Arrivederci Roma', versions sung by Mario Lanza for *Arrivederci Roma/Seven Hills of Rome*, dir. by Roy Rowland (MGM, 1958)
- Assmann, Jan, 'Music and Memory in Mozart's *Zauberflöte*' in *Performing the Past: Memory, History, and Identity in Modern Europe*, ed. by Karin Tilmans, Frank van Vree, and Jay Winter (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010), pp. 187-206
- Dyer, Richard, Nino Rota: Music, Film and Feeling (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010)
- Gorbman, Claudia, 'Music as Salvation: Notes on Fellini and Rota', *Film Quarterly*, 28, 2 (1974-1975), 17-25
- Illiano, Roberto, ed., Italian Music during the Fascist Period (Tornhout: Brepols, 2004)
- Il suono delle fontane di roma, video of music and sound, Associazione culturale acque <a href="http://www.ilsuonodellefontanediroma.com/trevi">http://www.ilsuonodellefontanediroma.com/trevi</a> [accessed 28 September 2013]
- Order, M. Thomas van, *Listening to Fellini: Music and Meaning in Black and White* (Cranbury Farleigh: Dickinson University Press, 2009)
- Respighi, Ottorino, Feste romane (1928)

  —— La fontana di Trevi al mattino, Fontane di Roma (1916)

  —— I pini presso una catacomba, Pini di Roma (1924)
- 'Three Coins in the Fountain' lyrics from soundtrack of film (20<sup>th</sup> Century Fox, 1954)
- Wood Michael, 'Proust: The Music of Memory', in *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Bill Schwarz (New York: Fordham University Press, 2010), pp. 109-22

## Memory

- Anderson, Benedict Richard O'Gorman, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism* (London: Verso, 1991)
  - ---- 'Memory and Forgetting', in *Imagined Communities*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (2006), pp. 187-206
- Apfelbaum, Erika, 'Halbwachs and the Social Properties of Memory', in *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Bill Schwarz (New York: Fordham University Press, 2010), pp. 77-92

- Assmann, Aleida, 'Four Formats of Memory: From Individual to Collective Constructions of the Past', in *Cultural Memory and Historical Consciousness in the German-Speaking World since 1500*, ed. by Christian Emden and David Midgley (Bern: Peter Lang, 2004), pp. 19-38
  - —— 'Transformations between History and Memory', 75, 1, *Social Research*, (spring 2008), 49-73
  - —— and Sebastian Conrad, *Memory in a Global Age: Discourses, Practices and Trajectories* (New York: Palgrave MacMillan, 2010)
- Assmann, Jan, 'Collective Memory and Cultural Identity', trans. by John Czaplicka, *New German Critique*, 65 (spring 1995), 125-33
  - Moses the Egyptian: The Memory of Egypt in Western Monotheism (Cambridge, MA: HUP, 1997)
- Bal, Mieke, 'Introduction', in *Acts of Memory: Cultural Recall in the Present*, ed. by Mieke Bal, Jonathan V. Crew, and Leo Spitzer (Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1999), pp. vii-xvii
- Ben-Amos, Dan, and Liliane Weissberg, eds, *Cultural Memory and the Construction of Identity* (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1999)
- Bennett, Tony, 'Stored Virtue: Memory, the Body and the Evolutionary Museum', in *Memory Cultures: Memory, Subjectivity and Recognition*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Katherine Hodgkin (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006), pp. 40-54
- Bodnar, John, Remaking America: Public Memory, Commemoration and Patriotism in the Twentieth Century (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1992)
- Bond, Lucy, 'Intersections or Misdirections? Problematising Crossroads of Memory in the Commemoration of 9/11', *Culture, Theory and Critique*, 53, 2 (2012), 111-28
  —— and Jessica Rapson, (eds) *The Transcultural Turn: Interrogating Memory Between and Beyond Borders* (Berlin: De Gruyter, 2014)
- Burgin Victor, *In/Different Spaces: Place and Memory in Visual Culture* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1996), pp. 117-21
- Caciagli, Mario, 'Molta memoria dei luoghi e pochi luoghi della memoria', *Polis: Ricerche e studi su società e politica in Italia*, 13, 2 (1999), 303-12
- Caldicott, Eric and Anne Fuchs, eds, *Cultural Memory: Essays in European Literature and History* (Bern: Peter Lang, 2003)
- Carrier, Peter, Holocaust Monuments and National Memory Cultures in France and Germany since 1989: The Origins and Political Function of the Vel d'Hiv in Paris and the Holocaust Monument in Berlin (New York: Bergbahn Books, 2005)
  - 'Places, Politics and the Archiving of Contemporary Memory in Pierre Nora's "Les lieux de mémoire" ', in Memory and Methodology, ed. by Susannah Radstone (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006), pp. 37-57
- Certeau, Michel de, *The Practice of Everyday Life*, trans. by Steven F. Rendall (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2002)
- Confino, Alon, 'Collective Memory and Cultural History: Problems of Method', *American Historical Review*, 102, 5 (December 1997), 1386-1403

Connerton, Paul, 'Historical Amnesias: An Interview with Paul Connerton', <i>Cabinet Magazine</i> , 42 (2011)
<a href="http://www.cabinetmagazine.org.issues/42/kastner_najafi_connerton.php">http://www.cabinetmagazine.org.issues/42/kastner_najafi_connerton.php</a>
—— How Modernity Forgets (Cambridge: CUP, 2009)
— How Societies Remember (Cambridge: CUP, 1990)
'Seven Types of Forgetting', <i>Memory</i> Studies, 1 (2008), 59-71
Contini, Giovanni and Alfredo Martini, Verba manent: L'uso delle fonti orali per la storia contemporanea (Rome: 1993)
Cooper, Tarnya, 'Forgetting Rome and the Voice of Piranesi's "Speaking Ruins" ', in <i>The Art of Forgetting</i> , ed. by Adrian Forty and Susanne Küchler (Oxford: Berg, 2001), pp. 107-25
Cossu, Andrea, 'Memory, Symbolic conflict and Changes in the National Calendar in the Italian Second Republic', <i>Modern Italy</i> , 15, 1 (2010), 3-19
Emden, Christian, J., 'History, Memory, and the Invention of Antiquity: Notes on the "Classical Tradition" in <i>Cultural Memory and Historical Consciousness in the German-Speaking World since 1500</i> , ed. by Christian J. Emden and David Midgley, (Peter Lang: Bern, 2004), pp. 39-68
"Nachleben": Cultural Memory in Walter Benjamin and Aby Warburg, in Cultural Memory: Essays in European Literature and History, ed. by Eric Caldicott and Anne Fuchs (Bern: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 209-24
Erll, Astrid, 'Remembering across Time, Space, and Cultures: Premediation, Remediation and the "Indian Mutiny", in <i>Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural</i>
<i>Memory</i> , ed. by Astrid Erll and Ann Rigney (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2009), pp. 110-38
'Re-Writing as Re-Visioning: Modes of Representing the "Indian Mutiny" in British Novels, 1857-2000', <i>European Journal of English Studies</i> , 10, 2 (2006), 163-85
—— and Ansgar Nünning, eds, <i>A Companion to Cultural Memory Studies</i> (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2010)
—— and Ansgar Nünning, eds, in collaboration with Sarah S. Young, <i>Cultural Memory Studies: An International and Interdisciplinary Handbook</i> (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2008)
—— and Ann Rigney, 'Literature and the Production of Cultural Memory:
Introduction', European Journal of English Studies, 10, 2 (2006), 111-15
—— and Ann Rigney, eds, <i>Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural Memory</i> (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2009)
Forty, Adrian, and Susanne Küchler, eds, <i>The Art of Forgetting</i> (Oxford: Berg, 2001)
Foucault, Michel, <i>Language</i> , <i>Counter-Memory</i> , <i>Practice</i> , trans. by Donald Bouchard (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1977)
Freud, Sigmund, <i>Civilisation and Its Discontents</i> , trans. by John Riviere (London: Hogarth Press, 1969)
— 'A Note upon the "Mystic Writing Pad" ' [1925], in <i>On Metapsychology</i> :
The Theory of Psychoanalysis, 15 vols, trans. by James Strachey (Harmondsworth: Ponguin, 1991), 11, pp. 429-34
(Harmondsworth: Penguin, 1991), 11, pp. 429-34 —— 'The 'Rat Man' [1909], in <i>Case Histories II</i> , 15 vols, trans. by James
Strachey (London: Penguin Books, 1979), 9, pp. 36-100
— 'Screen Memories' [1899], in <i>The Standard Edition of the Complete</i>
Psychological Works of Sigmund Freud, 10 vols, trans. by James Strachey (London: Hogarth Press, 1962), 3, pp. 301-22

- Gard-Hansen, Joanne, Andrew Hoskins, and Anna Reading, eds, *Save As ... Digital Memories* (Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009)
- Gedi, Noa, and Yigal Elim, 'Collective Memory What is it?', *History and Memory*, 8 (Spring/Summer 1996), 30-50
- Gemünden, Gerd, 'Nostalgia for the Nation: Intellectuals and National Identity in Unified Germany', in *Acts of Memory*, ed. by Mieke Bal, Jonathan V. Crew, and Leo Spitzer (Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1999), pp. 120-33
- Goodman, Steve and Luciana Parisi, 'Machines of Memory', in *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Bill Schwarz (New York: Fordham University Press, 2010), pp. 343-59
- Goodwin, Robert E., and Charles Tilly, eds, 'Memory, Individual and Collective', in *The Oxford Handbook of Contextual Political Analysis* (Oxford: OUP, 2006), pp. 210-24
- Halbwachs, Maurice, *Les Cadres sociaux de la mémoire* [1925], ed. by Gérard Namer, (Paris: Albin Michel, 1994)
  - On Collective Memory [1925], ed. and trans. by Lewis A. Coser (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1992)
  - The Collective Memory [1950], trans. by Francis J. Ditter, Jr, and Vida Yazdi Ditter (New York: Harper and Row, 1980)
- Hirsch, Marianne, *Family Frames: Photography, Narrative and Postmemory* (Cambridge, MA: HUP, c. 1997)
  - 'Projected Memory: Holocaust Photographs in Personal and Public Fantasy', in *Acts of Memory*, ed. by Mieke Bal, Jonathan V. Crew, and Leo Spitzer (Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1999), pp. 3-23
  - —— and Valerie Smith, 'Feminism and Cultural Memory: An Introduction', *Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* 28, 1 (autumn, 2002), 1-19
- Hoskins, Andrew, 'Digital Network Memory', in *Mediation, Remediation, and the Dynamics of Cultural Memory*, ed. by Astrid Erll and Ann Rigney (Berlin: de Gruyter, 2009), pp. 110-38
  - ---- 'The Mediatisation of Memory', in *Save As ... Digital Memories*, ed. by Joanne Gard-Hansen, Andrew Hoskins, and Anna Reading (Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2009), pp. 27-43
- Huyssen, Andreas, *Twilight Memories* (New York: Routledge, 1995)
  - Monumental Seduction', in *Acts of Memory: Cultural Recall in the Present*, ed. by Mieke Bal, Jonathan V. Crew, and Leo Spitzer (Hanover, New Hampshire: University Press of New England, 1999), pp. 190-207
- Irwin-Zarecka, Iwona, *Frames of Remembrance: The Dynamics of Collective Memory* (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 1994)
- Isnenghi, Mario, ed., 2 vols *I luoghi della memoria: simboli e miti dell'Italia unita* (Roma: Editore Laterza, 1996)
  - —— L'Italia in piazza: i luoghi della vita pubblica dal 1848 ai giorni nostri (Bologna: Il Mulino, c. 2004)
- Kansteiner, Wolf, 'Finding Meaning in Memory: A Methodological Critique of Memory Studies', *History and Theory*, 41, 2 (2002), 179-97

- Kaplan, Ann E., *Trauma Culture: The Politics of Terror and Loss in Media and Literature* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2005)
- Klein, Kerwin Lee, 'On the Emergence of Memory in Historical Discourse', *Representations*, 69 (Winter 2000), 127-50
- Koshar, Rudy, From Monuments to Traces: Artifacts of German Memory, 1870-1990 (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2000)
- Kuhn, Annette, An Everyday Magic: Cinema and Cultural Memory (London: I. B. Tauris, 2002)
   'A Journey Through Memory', in Memory and Methodology, ed. by Susannah Radstone (Oxford: Berg, 2000), pp.179–96
- Kuhn, Annette, and Kirsten Emiko McAllister, eds, *Locating Memory: Photographic Acts* (New York and Oxford: Bergbahn Books, 2006)
- Leslie, Esther, 'Absent-minded professors: Etch-a-Sketching Academic Forgetting', in *Memory Cultures: Memory, Subjectivity and Recognition*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Katherine Hodgkin (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006), pp. 167-71
- Loyrette, Henri, 'The Eiffel Tower', in *Realms of Memory*, 3 vols, ed. by Pierre Nora, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1998), 1, pp. 348-76
- Margalit, Avishai, *The Ethics of Memory* (Cambridge, MA: HUP, 2002)
- Matsuda, Matthew, K., *The Memory of the Modern* (Oxford: OUP, 1966)
- Midgley, David, and Christian J. Emden, 'Introduction' in *Cultural Memory and Historical Consciousness in the German-Speaking World since 1500*, eds Christian J. Emden and David Midgley (Bern: Peter Lang, 2004), pp. 7-15
- Nora, Pierre, 'Between Memory and History: Les Lieux de Mémoire', *Representations*, 26 (1989), 7-25
  - ——Realms of Memory: Rethinking the French Past, vol 1, 'Conflicts and Divisions'; Realms of Memory: The Construction of the French Past, vol 2, 'Traditions' and vol. 3, 'Symbols' (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996-1998)
  - ---- 'The Reasons for the Current Upsurge in Memory', *Transit*, 22 (2002), <a href="http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2002-04-19-nora-en.html">http://www.eurozine.com/articles/2002-04-19-nora-en.html</a> [accessed 3 December 2013]
- O'Donovan, Patrick, 'Common Culture and Creativity: Forgetting and Remembering in the Cultural Theory of Michel de Certeau', in *Cultural Memory: Essays on European Literature and History*, ed. by Eric Caldicott and Anne Fuchs (Bern: Peter Lang, 2003), pp. 311-26
- Olick, Jeffrey K., "Collective Memory": A Memoir and Prospect, *Memory Studies*, 1 (2008), 19-25
- Passerini, Luisa, *Autobiography of a Generation* (Middletown, Connecticut: Wesleyan University Press, 2004)
  - —— Memory and Utopia: The Primacy of Intersubjectivity (London: Equinox, 2007)
- Peitsch, Helmut, Charles Burdett, and Claire Gorrara, eds, *European Memories of the Second World War* (New York: Berghahn Books, 1999)

- Portelli, Alessandro, *The Battle of Valle Giulia: Oral History and the Art of Dialogue* (Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1997)
  - ---- 'The Peculiarities of Oral History', 12, *History Workshop Journal* (1981), 96-107
- Radstone, Susannah, ed., Memory and Methodology (Oxford and New York: Berg, 2000)
  - —— and Katherine Hodgkin, eds, *Memory Cultures: Memory, Subjectivity and Recognition* (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006)
  - —— and Bill Schwarz, eds, *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates* (New York: Fordham University Press, 2010)
- Reading, Anna, 'The Dynamics of Zero: On Digital Memories of Mars and the Human Foetus in the Globital Memory Field', *ESSACHESS*, *Journal for Communication Studies*, 5, 2, 10 (2012), 21-44
- Ricœur, Paul, Memory, History, Forgetting (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005)
- Rigney, Ann, 'All This Happened, More or Less: What a Novelist Made of the Bombing of Dresden', *History and Theory*, 4 (7 May 2009), 5-24
  - 'The Many Lives of Ivanhoe', in *Performing the Past: Memory, History, and Identity in Modern Europe*, ed. by Karin Tilmans, Frank van Vree, and Jay Winter (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010), pp. 207-34
  - ----- 'Plenitude, Scarcity and the Circulation of Cultural Memory', *Journal of European Studies*, 35.1 (2005), 11-18
  - ---- 'Portable Monuments: Literature, Cultural Memory and the Case of Jeanie Deans', *Poetics Today*, 25.2 (2004), 361-96
- Roediger, Henry L., and James V. Wertsch, 'Creating a New Discipline of Memory Studies', *Memory Studies*, 1 (2008), 9-22
- Rossington, Michael, and Anne Whitehead, eds, *Theories of Memory: A Reader* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press: 2007)
- Rothberg, Michael, 'From Gaza to Warsaw: Mapping Multidirectional Memory', *Criticism*, 53, 4 (2011), 523-48
  - Multidirectional Memory: Remembering the Holocaust in the Age of Decolonialization (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 2009)
- Samuel, Raphael, *Theatres of Memory: Past and Present in Contemporary British Culture*, 2 vols (London, New York: Verso, 1994), 1
- Schacter, D.L., *Memory Distortion: How Minds, Brains, and Societies Reconstruct the Past* (Cambridge, MA: HUP, 1995)
  - —— Searching for Memory: The Brain, the Mind and the Past (New York: Basic Books, 1996)
- Schama, Simon, *Landscape and Memory* (New York: Knopf, 1995)
- Schudson, M., 'The Present in the Past versus the Past in the Present', *Communications*, 11 (1989), 105-13
- Schwarz, Bill, "Already the Past": Memory and Historical Time, in *Memory Cultures: Memory, Subjectivity and Recognition*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Katherine Hodgkin (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006), pp. 135-51

- Sherlock, Peter, 'The Reformation of Memory in Early Modern Europe', in *Memory: Histories, Theories, Debates*, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Bill Schwarz (New York: Fordham University Press, 2010), pp. 30-40
- Sontag, Susan, On Photography (New York: Delta, 1977)

  ——Regarding the Pain of Others (New York: Farrar, Strauss and Giroux, 2003)
- Sturken, Marita, *Tangled Memory: The Vietnam War, the AIDS Epidemic and the Politics of Remembering* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997)
- Terdiman, Richard, 'Given Memory: On Mnemonic Coercion, Reproduction and Invention', Memory Cultures: Memory, Subjectivity and Recognition, ed. by Susannah Radstone and Katherine Hodgkin (New Brunswick: Transaction Publishers, 2006)
- Tilmans, Karin, Frank van Vree, and Jay Winter, eds, *Performing the Past: Memory, History, and Identity in Modern Europe* (Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 2010)
- Veel, Kristin, 'Topographies of Memory: Walter Benjamin and Daniel Liebeskind', in *Cultural Memory and Historical Consciousness in the German-Speaking World since 1500*, ed. by Christian Emden and David Midgley (Bern: Peter Lang, 2004), pp. 231-51
- Weissberg, Liliane, in *Cultural Memory and the Construction of Identity*, ed. by Dan Ben-Amos and Liliane Weissberg (Detroit: Wayne State University Press, 1999), pp. 7-26
- Wertsch, James, V., Voices of Collective Remembering (Cambridge: CUP, 2002)
- Wilson, Colette, E., 'An Introduction', in *Photography and Cultural Memory*, Exhibition Catalogue, *Forgetting to Remember: Remembering to Forget* Conference (Canterbury: University of Kent, 2008)
  - —— Paris and the Commune 1871–1878: The Politics of Forgetting (Manchester: MUP, 2007)
- Woolf, Judith, *The Memory of the Offence: Primo Levi's* 'If This is a Man' (Hull: Hull Italian Texts, 1995)
- Young, James E., At Memory's Edge: After-Images of the Holocaust in Contemporary Art and Architecture (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2000)
  - —— The Texture of Memory: Holocaust Memorials and Meaning (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1993)

#### General

- Abbeele, George van den, 'Introduction', in *Travel as Metaphor: From Montaigne to Rousseau* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1992), pp. xiii-xxx
- Arnardóttir, Halldóra, 'Architecture and Modernity in Post-war Milan', in *Italian Cityscapes: Culture and Urban Change in Contemporary Italy*, ed. by Robert Lumley and John Foot (Exeter: Exeter University Press, 2004)
- Atkinson, David and Denis Cosgrove, 'Urban Rhetoric and Embodied Identities: City, Nation, and Empire at the Vittorio Emanuele II Monument in Rome, 1870–1945', *Annals of the Association of American Geographers*, 88.1 (1998), pp. 28-49
- Augé, Marc, Non-Places: Introduction to an Anthropology of Supermodernity, trans. by John Howe (London and New York: Verso, 1995)

- Barry, Peter, Beginning Theory, 3rd edn (Manchester: MUP, 2009)
- Barthes, R., *The Eiffel Tower and Other Mythologies*, trans. by Richard Howard (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997)
  - —— *Mythologies* (Paris: Éditions du Seuil, 1970)
- Beard, Mary, and Michael Crawford, *Rome in the Late Republic*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (London: Gerald Duckworth & Co. Ltd, 1999)
- Beasley, Chris, Gender and Sexuality: Critical Theories, Critical Thinkers (London: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2006)
- Belk, Russell W., 'Three Coins in a Caesar's Palace Fountain: Interpreting Las Vegas', *Advances in Consumer Research*, 25 (1998), 7-9
- Benjamin, Walter, 'The Image of Proust', in *Illuminations* [collection of essays, 1923–1940], trans. by Harry Zorn, ed., with Introduction, by Hannah Arendt (London: Random House, 1999), pp. 197-210
  - 'On some Motifs in Baudelaire', in *Illuminations* (1999), pp. 152-96
  - ---- 'Theses on the Philosophy of History' in *Illuminations* (1999), pp. 245-55
- Benton, Tim, 'Epigraphy and Fascism' in *The Afterlife of Inscriptions: Reusing, Rediscovering, Reinventing and Revitalizing Ancient Inscriptions*, ed. by Alison Cooley (London: Institute of Classical Studies, University of London, 2000), pp. 163-92
- Bernstein, Frances, Classical Living: Reconnecting with the Rituals of Ancient Rome (Harper Collins, 2000)
- Bolter, Jay David and Richard Grusin, *Remediation: Understanding New Media* (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1999)
- Brice, Catherine, *Il Vittoriano: Monumentalità pubblica e politica a Roma*, trans. by Luisa Collodi (Rome: Istituto per la storia del risorgimento italiano, 2005)
- Brook, Clodagh, and Giuliana Pieri, 'Interdisciplinary Italy: Disciplines, Inter-disciplines and Transmediality', in *Lingua e cultura italiana nei mass media*, Supplement 21, ed. by Marco Gargiulo (Rome: Aracne, 2014), pp. 13-31
- Brown, Frances, Tourism Re-Assessed: Blight or Blessing (Oxford: Heinemann, 1998)
- Burke, Peter, *Eyewitnessing: The Uses of Images as Historical Evidence* (London: Reaktion, 2001)
- Butler, Chris, *Henri Lefebvre: Spatial Politics, Everyday Life and the Right to the City* (Abingdon: Routledge, 2012)
- Butler, Judith, *Bodies that Matter: On the Discursive Limits of 'Sex'* (New York: Routledge, 1993
  - Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity [1990], (London: Routledge, 2007 edn, with Prefaces for 1990 and 1999)

- Calvino, Italo, Lezioni americane: sei proposte per il prossimo millennio (Milano: Garzanti, 1989)
- Canniffe, Eamonn, *The Politics of the Piazza: The History and Meaning of the Italian Square* (Aldershot: Ashgate, 2010)
- Caruth, Cathy, *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative and History* (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 1996)
- Clark, Elizabeth A., *History, Theory, Text: Historians and the Linguistic Turn* (Cambridge, MA: HUP, 2004)
- Cooley, Alison E., ed., *The Afterlife of Inscriptions: Reusing, Rediscovering, Reinventing and Revitalizing Ancient Inscriptions* (London: Institute of Classical Studies, University of London, 2000)
  - —— 'Inscribing History at Rome', in *The Afterlife of Inscriptions*, pp. 6-7
  - —— 'The Life-Cycle of Inscriptions', in *The Afterlife of Inscriptions*, pp. 7-20
- Cosgrove, Denis, and Stephen Daniels, eds, *The Iconography of Landscape* (Cambridge: CUP, 1988)
- Crimson, Mark, *Urbisville*, <a href="http://www.metamute.org/en/Urbisville">http://www.metamute.org/en/Urbisville</a> [accessed 19 December 2008]
- Culler, Jonathan, Literary Theory: A Very Short Introduction (Oxford: OUP, 2000)
- Cunningham, Colin, 'The Rise of Topography and the Decline of Epigraphy?: Architectural Inscription in the Nineteenth Century', in *The After-Life of Inscriptions*, ed. by Cooley, (London: Institute of Classical Studies, University of London, 2000), pp. 143-62
- Danto, Arthur, 'The Vietnam Veterans Memorial', The Nation (31 August 1986), 152-55
- Derrida, Jacques, 'Différance', in *Margins of Philosophy*, trans. by Alan Bass (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982)
  - —— *Of Grammatology*, trans. by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak (Johns Hopkins University Press, 1976)
- Dickie, John, 'La macchina da scrivere: The Victor Emanuel Monument in Rome and Italian Nationalism', *Italianist*, 14 (1995), 261-85
- Dines, Nicholas, 'Contested Claims to Public Space: The Re-Imaging of Naples and the Case of Piazza Plebiscito', in *Italian Cityscapes: Culture and Urban Change in Contemporary Italy*, ed. by Robert Lumley and John Foot (Exeter: Exeter University Press, 2004), pp. 114-26
- Eagleton, Terry, *Literary Theory: An Introduction*, Anniversary Edition (London: Blackwell Publishing, 2008)
- Eco, Umberto, *Art and Beauty in the Middle Ages*, trans. by Hugh Bredin (New Haven: YUP, 1986)
  - —— Travels in Hyperreality (New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1986)
- Edwards, Tim, 'Queering the Pitch?: Gay Masculinities', in *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities*, ed. by Michael S. Kimmel, Jeff Hearn, and R. W. Connell (California: Sage Publications Inc., 2005)

- Fantham, Elaine, Women in the Classical World: Image and Text (New York: Oxford: OUP, 1995)
- Favro, Diane, The Urban Image of Augustan Rome (Cambridge: CUP Press, 1996)
- Felman, Shoshana, and Dori Laub, *Testimony: Crises of Witnessing in Literature, Psychoanalysis and History* (New York and London: Routledge, 1992)
- Foot, John, *Milan since the Miracle: City, Culture and Identity* (Oxford: Berg, 2001)
  —— 'Micro-History of a House: Memory and Place in a Milanese Neighbourhood, 1890-2000', *Urban History*, 34, 3 (2007), 431-52
- Foucault, Michel, *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, trans. by A.M. Sheridan Smith (New York: Pantheon Books, 1972)
  - —— The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Social Sciences, n. trans. (New York: Pantheon Books, 1970)
  - —— Madness and Civilization, trans. by Richard Howard (London: Routledge, 2001)
- Franci, Giovanna, *Dreaming of Italy: Las Vegas and the Virtual Grand Tour* (Reno and Las Vegas: University of Nevada Press, 2005)
- Gabrys, Jennifer, *Digital Rubbish: A Natural History of Electronics* (Michigan: The University of Michigan Press, 2011)
- Galleria Colonna 1872–2003: Una storia nel cuore di Roma, Exhibition Catalogue, Museo di Roma (November 2003 to January 2004)
- Genette, Gérard, Narrative Discourse (Oxford: OUP, 1980)
- Golsan, Richard J., ed., *Fascism, Aesthetics and Culture* (Hanover: University Press of New England, 1992)
- Green, Anna and Kathleen Troup, eds, *The Houses of History: A Critical Reader in Twentieth-Century History and Theory* (Manchester: MUP, 1999)
- Gundle, Stephen, Bellissima: Feminine Beauty and the Idea of Italy (New Haven: YUP, 2007)
  - —— Death and the Dolce Vita: The Dark Side of Rome in the 1950s (Edinburgh: Cannongate, 2011)
  - —— Glamour: A History (OUP, 2008)
  - —— 'Hollywood Glamour and Mass Consumption in Postwar Italy', in *Histories of Leisure*, ed. by Rudi Koshar (Oxford: Berg, 2002), pp. 337-57
  - —— and Clino T. Castelli, *The Glamour System* (Basingstoke: Palgrave MacMillan, 2006)
- Harley, John Brian, 'Maps, Knowledge and Power', in *The Iconography of Landscape*, ed. by Denis Cosgrove and Stephen Daniels (Cambridge: CUP, 1988), pp. 277-312
- Henke, Suzette A., Shattered Subjects: Trauma and Testimony (London: MacMillan, 1998)
- Hobsbawm, Eric, and Terence Rangers, eds, *The Invention of Tradition* (Cambridge: CUP, 1983)
- Holter, Øystein Gullvåg, 'Social Theories for Researching Men and Masculinities', in Michael S. Kimmel, Jeff Hearn, and R. W. Connell, eds, *Handbook of Studies on Men and Masculinities* (California: Sage Publications Inc., 2005), pp. 15-34

- Hom, Stephanie Malia, 'Italy without Borders: Simulacra, Tourism, Suburbi, and the New Grand Tour', *Italian Studies*, 65, 3 (2010), 376-97
- Hughes, Robert, Rome (London: Weidenfield & Nicholson, 2011)
- Jefferson, Ann, and David Robey, eds, *Modern Literary Theory: A Comparative Introduction*, (London: B.T. Batford Ltd., 1997)
- Jenkins, Henry, Convergence Culture: Where Old and New Media Collide (Updated and with a New Afterword) (New York: New York University Press, 2008)
- Kearns, Gerry, and Chris Philo, eds, *Selling Places: The City as Cultural Capital, Past and Present* (Oxford: Pergamon Press, 1993)
- Kostof, Spiro, *The Third Rome: 1870–1950, Traffic and Glory*, in an Exhibition publication called *The Third Rome*, organized by the University Art Museum, Berkeley (1973)
- Krautheimer, Richard, *Rome, Profile of a City, 312–1308* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1980)
- Kristeva, Julia, *Desire in Language: A Semiotic Approach to Literature and Art*, ed. by Leon S. Roudiez (New York: Columbia University Press, 1980)
- LaCapra, Dominick, *History in Transit: Experience, Identity, Critical Theory* (New York: Cornell University Press, 2004)
  - ---- 'History, Language, and Reading: Waiting for Crillon', in *The American Historical Review*, 100, 3 (1995), 799-828
  - —— Representing the Holocaust: History, Theory, Trauma (New York: Cornell University Press, 1998)
  - —— Soundings in Critical Theory (New York: Cornell University Press, 1989)
  - Writing History, Writing Trauma (Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press, 2001)
- Leighton, Angela, in 'Resurrections of the Body: Women Writers and the Idea of the Renaissance', in *Unfolding the South: Nineteenth-Century British Women Writers and Artists in Italy*, ed. by Alison Chapman and Jane Stabler (Manchester: MUP, 2003), pp. 222-38
- Levi, Primo, Se questo è un uomo (edition includes La Tregua) (Torino: Einaudi, 1999)
- Levinson, Sanford, *Written in Stone: Public Monuments in Changing Societies* (Durham, North Carolina: Duke University Press, 1998)
- Levit, Herschel, Views of Rome: Then and Now (New York: Dover Publication, Inc., 1976)
- Lowenthal, David, *The Past is a Foreign Country* (Cambridge: CUP, 1997)
- Lumley, Robert, and John Foot, *Italian Cityscapes: Culture and Urban Change in Contemporary Italy* (Exeter: Exeter University Press, 2004)
- Mac an Ghaill, Máirtín, ed., *Understanding Masculinities: Social Relations and Cultural Arenas* (Buckingham: Open University Press, 2000)

- MacKinnon, Kenneth, *Representing Men: Maleness and Masculinity in the Media* (London: Arnold, Hodder Headline Group, 2003)
- Malossi, Gianinno, ed., *Volare: The Icon of Italy in Global Culture* (New York: Monacelli Press, 1999)
- Mason, Peter, Lives of Images (London: Reaktion, 2001)
- Moretti, Franco, Atlas of the European Novel, 1800–1900 (London: Verso, 1998)
- Mumford, Lewis, *The City In History: Its Origins, Its Transformations, and Its Prospects*(New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1961)

  —— *The Culture of Cities* (London: Secker & Warburg, 1940)
- Notaro, Anna, 'Telling Imperial Histories: Contests of Narrativity and Representation in Post Unification Rome 1870–1911', Leverhulme Research Project 1995–1997, Royal Holloway, University of London <a href="http://www.notarofam.com/annawork/paisano/">http://www.notarofam.com/annawork/paisano/</a> [accessed 5 October 2013]
- Perks, Robert, and A. Thompson, eds, *The Oral History Reader* (London: Routledge, 1997)
- Riegl, Alois, 'The Modern Cult of Monuments: Its Essence and Its Development' [1903], trans. by Karen Bruckner with Karen Williams, in *Historical and Philosophical Issues in the Conservation of Cultural Heritage*, ed. by Nicholas Stanley Price, M. Kirby Talley, Jr, and Alessandra Melucco Vaccaro ((Los Angeles: Getty Conservation Institute, 1996), pp. 69-83
- Rossi, Aldo, *The Architecture of the City* [1966], trans. by Diane Ghirardo and Joan Ockman (Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press, 1982)
- Said, Edward, *Orientalism* (London: Routledge, 1978)
- Schürer, Ernst, Manford Keune, and Philip Jenkins, eds, *The Berlin Wall: Representations and Perspectives* (New York: Peter Lang, 1996)
- Sebald, Winfried Georg, *Austerlitz*, trans. by Anthea Bell (London: Penguin, 2001)
- Shepard, Odell, *The Lore of the Unicorn* [1930] (London: Senate House, 1996)
- Shields, Rob, *An English Précis of Henri Lefebvre's 'La Production de l'espace'* (Brighton: Urban and Regional Studies, University of Sussex, 1988)
- The Open University, Course A219, Exploring the Classical World (2006)
- The Oxford Companion to Classical Civilization, ed. by Simon Hornblower and Antony Spawforth (Oxford: OUP, 2004)
- *The Oxford Companion to Classical Literature*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn, ed. by M. C. Howatson (Oxford: OUP, 1989)
- Tobia, Bruno, *L'altare della patria* (Bologna: Il mulino, 1998)
- Turner, Louis, and John Ash, *The Golden Hordes: International Tourism and the Pleasure Periphery* (London: Constable, 1975)
- Urry, John, *The Tourist Gaze*, 2<sup>nd</sup> edn (London: Sage Publications, 2002)

White, Hayden, 'The Fictions of Factual Representation', in *The Houses of History: A Critical Reader in Twentieth-Century History and Theory*, ed. by Anna Green and Kathleen Troup (Manchester: MUP, 1999), pp. 214-28

# **General Websites** (Footnote references updated when relevant, and possible)

```
<a href="http://www.aceaspa.it">http://www.aceaspa.it</a>
<a href="http://www.allposters.com">http://www.allposters.com</a>
<a href="http://www.arachne.uni-koeln.de/arachne/index">http://www.arachne.uni-koeln.de/arachne/index</a>
<a href="https://www.archive.org/details/texts">https://www.archive.org/details/texts</a>
<a href="http://www.archivioluce.com/">http://www.archivioluce.com/</a>
<a href="http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it">http://www.archiviostorico.corriere.it</a>
<a href="http://www.biblhertz.it">http://www.biblhertz.it</a>
<a href="http://www.cinecittastudios.it/en/studios">http://www.cinecittastudios.it/en/studios</a>
<a href="http://www.enotes.com/oxford-art-encyclopedia">http://www.enotes.com/oxford-art-encyclopedia</a>
<a href="http://www.europeana.eu">http://www.europeana.eu</a>
<a href="http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/pliny-natihist-rome.html">http://www.fordham.edu/halsall/ancient/pliny-natihist-rome.html</a>
<a href="http://www.fotosearch.com">http://www.fotosearch.com</a>
<a href="http://www.googlescholar">http://www.googlescholar</a>
<a href="http://www.grafica.arti.beniculturali.it">http://www.grafica.arti.beniculturali.it</a>
<a href="http://www.gutenberg.org/catalog/">http://www.gutenberg.org/catalog/</a>
<a href="http://www3.iath.virginia.edu/waters/article/html">http://www3.iath.virginia.edu/waters/article/html</a> (also for Waters of Rome Journal)
<a href="http://www.ilsuonodellefontanediroma.com">http://www.ilsuonodellefontanediroma.com</a>
<a href="http://www.imdb.com">http://www.imdb.com</a>
<a href="http://www.inlibroveritas.net">http://www.inlibroveritas.net</a>
<a href="http://www.it.wikinews.org">http://www.it.wikinews.org</a>
<a href="http://www.larepubblica.it">http://www.larepubblica.it</a>
<a href="http://www.let.leidenuniv.nl">http://www.let.leidenuniv.nl</a>
<a href="http://www.letrs.indiana.edu">http://www.letrs.indiana.edu</a>
<a href="http://www.letteraturaitaliana.net">http://www.letteraturaitaliana.net</a>>
<a href="http://www.maryevans.com">http://www.maryevans.com</a>
<a href="http://www.moviemaps.org">http://www.moviemaps.org</a>
<a href="http://www.musicweb.uk.net">http://www.musicweb.uk.net</a>
<a href="http://www.oldpoetry.com">http://www.oldpoetry.com</a>
<a href="http://www.periodici.librari.benicultural.it">http://www.periodici.librari.benicultural.it</a>
<a href="http://www.peroni.it">http://www.peroni.it</a>
<a href="http://www.readingitaly.com">http://www.readingitaly.com</a>
<a href="http://www.romeartlovers">http://www.romeartlovers</a>
<a href="http://www.romeguide.it">http://www.romeguide.it</a>
<a href="http://www.uk.sagepub.com">http://www.uk.sagepub.com</a> (for Memory Studies Journal)
```

- <a href="http://www.thememorynetwork.net">http://www.thememorynetwork.net</a>
- <a href="http://www.trovacinema.repubblica.it">http://www.trovacinema.repubblica.it</a>
- <a href="http://www.uniroma1.it">http://www.uniroma1.it</a>
- <a href="http://www.unwto.org/facts">http://www.unwto.org/facts">
- <a href="http://www.wga.hu">
- <a href="http://www.wikipedia.org">http://www.wikipedia.org</a>
- <a href="http://www.youtube.com">http://www.youtube.com</a>